5-1997

Service-Learning and Evaluation: A Brief Review of Issues and the Literature

Madeleine S. Hengel
University of Minnesota

Robert D. Shumer
University of Minnesota

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.unomaha.edu/slcebibliography

Part of the Service Learning Commons

Recommended Citation
https://digitalcommons.unomaha.edu/slcebibliography/2
A "Link" Piece: Connecting Theory With Practice

Service-Learning and Evaluation

A Brief Review of Resources and Readings

By
Madeleine S. Hengel, Ph.D. Candidate
Robert D. Shumer, Ph.D.

© May 1997

The National Service-Learning Cooperative is a collaborative project between the National Youth Leadership Council, the University of Minnesota and thirteen other organizations and institutions, funded by the Corporation for National Service under Cooperative Agreement No. CA-001.
Service-Learning and Evaluation

A Brief Review of Issues and the Literature

A “Link” Piece: Connecting Theory With Practice

One of the most frequently requested topics for information at the National Service-Learning Cooperative Clearinghouse is evaluation. Practitioners want to know what to do and how to do it. Graduate students want to know what has been done and how they can do evaluation. Program administrators want to know how evaluation can assist them in making the case for and expanding service programs.

The good news is there is more than enough information available to answer all these requests. There are literally volumes of work on almost every conceivable aspect of evaluation. The bad news: There is too much information available for anybody to make much sense of it in just a few pages. There are entire doctoral programs on the study of evaluation, so it is unrealistic for anyone to believe that a person can become really knowledgeable about evaluation through a workshop or a single source of information.

The purpose of this document is to attempt to provide some guidance to those who are exploring the connections between service-learning and evaluation. Common sources for obtaining the listings appears at the end of the document.

We will define the categories by highlighting the questions that come from the field to frame the topic. Here goes!

**Question 1:** What do I need to know about the important issues involved in evaluating my service-learning program?

**Question 2:** Do you have a model of evaluation I can look at?

**Question 3:** Do you have an instrument I can use?

**Question 4:** If you can’t send me the answer (an instrument or completed design), where can I go for help?

**Question 5:** Are there studies that “prove” (usually quantitative studies) service-learning is effective?

**Question 6:** What programs are out there for evaluation?

**Question 7:** Who has done evaluation/assessment of service-learning and how can I contact them?
**Question 1:** What do I need to know about the important issues involved in evaluating my service-learning program?

*Why Should Assessment Be based on a Vision of Learning?*
M. Kulieke, J. Bakker, C. Collins, T. Fennimore, C. Fine, J. Herman, B.F. Jones, L. Raack, M.B. Tinzmann
A web document which may be printed from http://www.ncrel.org/sdrs/areas/rp1_esys/assess.htm (part of Pathways home page on Alternative Assessment).
Describes the four Guidebooks, focusing on assessment for New Learning. Describes the major changes in testing and assessment, gives school-based examples, defines multiple abilities and skills, how to implement multidimensional assessment.

*Evaluating a New Service-Learning Program*
The chapter summarizes a recommendation to the faculty of a small liberal arts college regarding it's service-learning program. Deals with the design, the faculty, student responses, community sites used.

*Impacts and Effects of Service Topic Bibliography*
Robin Vue-Benson & Robert Shumer
National Service Learning Clearinghouse, 1995
Lists research and reports which address the impact of service as an instructional strategy. A total of 57 citations are organized as follows: Section 1) Social and Psychological Outcomes; 2) Intellectual, Academic Achievement and School Behavior Outcomes; 3) Social/Psychological and Intellectual/Academic Outcomes; 4) Literature Reviews; and 5) Examples of Service Program Evaluation. Citations are annotated and include information about where to obtain the resource.
Website: http://www.nicsl.coled.umn.edu

*Educational Leadership, V54 n4*
December, 1996-January 1997
Articles on designing authentic assessments, learning from performance assessments in Math, Performance-Based Education, etc.
ASCD publication, bi-monthly
Website of ASCD: http://www.ascd.org/

*List of Research Resources*
National Service-Learning Clearinghouse
NSLC shelf list of research resources. Title, author, citation information and whether it is a dissertation, master's thesis or other research listed. Resources have been cataloged and entered into the NSLC database and is not meant to be comprehensive.
http://www.nicsl.coled.umn.edu
The Changing Face of Testing and Assessment: Problems and Solutions
Donald L. Hymes and others, 1991
ED 339 726 (ERIC)
A 106-page report which reviews the current state of testing and summarizes the issues and concerns surrounding their usage. The search for alternatives and the ways these alternative assessments are being used is also discussed. The report includes a summary of a survey involving 239 national school leaders. $14.95 plus $3.50 for postage and handling; discounts for multiple copies.
American Association of School Administrators

Performance Assessment: What's Out There and How Useful Is It Really?
Northwest Regional Educational Laboratory, 1991
A 65-page research paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association offers observations about the state and usefulness of alternative assessments, particularly performance-based ones. It includes annotated bibliographies of 117 articles about mathematics, reading, and portfolio assessments and reference charts. $9.90 plus postage.
Availability:
ERIC (EDRS)--333051

Question 2: Do you have a model of evaluation I can look at?

Evaluation: the Key to Improving Service-Learning Programs
Marybeth Neal, Minnesota State Department of Education
Robert Shumer, University of Minnesota, Department of Vocational Education
Reviews evaluation as a concept and process. Chapter one defines evaluation, outlines the role of the evaluator, relates evaluation to service learning and discusses resistance to the evaluation process. The second chapter provides evaluation plans, illustrating them with five separate cases. Chapter three provides five evaluation models and the final chapter reviews preparation.
Availability:
National Service Learning Cooperative Clearinghouse

Students as Evaluators. A Model for Program Evaluation
Patricia Campbell, Susan Edgar
Availability:
Document available from UnCover: Order at 1-800-787-7979

Educational Leadership, V49 n8, May, 1992
Availability:
Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development (ASCD)
CRESST Performance Assessment Models: Assessing Content Area Explanations
Handbook from the Center for Research on Evaluation, Standards, and Student Testing presents assessment models for secondary-level history and chemistry and specifications for duplicating the technique with other topics and subject matter areas. The processes for training rater, scoring the assessments, and reporting results are described. $10.00 plus $2.50 postage and handling. from UCLA/CRESST

Question 3: Do you have an instrument I can use?

Instruments and Scoring Guide of the Experiential Education Evaluation Project
Dan Conrad, Diane Hedin
Center for Youth Development and Research, General Mills Foundation
Rockefeller Family Fund, Spencer Foundation
As a result of the Experiential Education Evaluation Project, the publication identified instruments used to measure and assess experiential learning programs. The following information is given for each instrument: rationale for its inclusion in the study; precise issues or outcomes designed to measure validity and reliability data; and directions on how to score. Descriptions of assessment tools are organized according to four categories: Instruments on Social Development (Social and Personal Responsibility Scale, Semantic differential on Attitudes toward Others, Semantic Differential on Community Participation, and Career Exploration Scale); Instruments on Psychological Development (Rosenberg Self Esteem Scale and Janis Field Feelings of Inadequacy Scale); Instruments on Intellectual Development (Problem Solving Inventory); and Instruments on Differential Program Impact (Characteristics of a Community Field Experience Checklist, Experiential Educational Questionnaire). The appendix contains the complete Experiential Education Questionnaire, pretest and posttest
Availability:
ERIC (EDRS) or the National Service Learning Clearinghouse

in Education and Urban Society, Special Issue V26 n 2.
Richard J. Kraft
Availability:
Sage Publications, Inc.
2455 Teller Road
Thousand Oaks CA  91320
Phone: 805-499-0721

Leadership Participant Survey-I.
Richard F. Rohs
University of Georgia, College of Agriculture, Cooperative Extension Service
Monograph, evaluation instrument, 8 pages
Impacts and Effects of Service Topic Bibliography
Robin Vue-Benson & Robert Shumer
National Service Learning Clearinghouse, 1995
Lists research and reports which address the impact of service as an instructional strategy. A total of 57 citations are organized as follows: Section 1) Social and Psychological Outcomes; 2) Intellectual, Academic Achievement and School Behavior Outcomes; 3) Social/Psychological and Intellectual/Academic Outcomes; 4) Literature Reviews; and 5) Examples of Service Program Evaluation. Citations are annotated and include information about where to obtain the resource.
Availability: The National Service Learning Clearinghouse (on website)

Performance and Portfolio Assessment for Language Minority Students
Lorraine Valdez Pierce and J. Michael O'Malley, 1992
Program information guide (#9) describes performance assessment procedures and a portfolio assessment framework for monitoring the language development of language minority students in the upper elementary and middle grades. $3.50.
Availability: National Clearinghouse for Bilingual Education
1118 22nd St. NW
Washington, DC 20037
And from ERIC (EDRS)--ED346747

Question 4: If you can't send me the answer (an instrument or completed design), where can I go for help?

Pathways to School Improvement Website
e-mail info@ncrel.org.
http://www.ncrel.org/sdrs/areas/as0cont.htm
Holdings on the website:
Critical Issues in Assessment: Rethinking assessment and its role in supporting educational reform; integrating assessment and instruction in ways that support learning; reporting assessment results. More are being developed.
Additional resources on this website take you to: Alternative Assessment Instruments Bank, a searchable database developed by the Regional Educational Laboratories, of alternative assessment tools; the CRESST homepage, web server of the National Center for Research on Evaluation, Standards and Student testing. Includes newsletter text, video and audio products; The ERIC Clearinghouse on Assessment and Evaluation, the home page of the Clearinghouse allows searching of the ERIC database and three assessment instrument databases. Contains links to other web sites, and the ERIC Publications on assessment.

ERIC descriptors and Identifiers list holds concepts related to Alternative Assessment. These are handy when you need to query on the ERIC search engine.
Website: http://www.aspensys.com/eric
subject-specific ERIC Clearinghouses 800-LET-ERIC
e-mail acceric@inet.ed.gov
Alternative Assessment(Identifier)-Assessment in some form other than multiple choice, standardized tests, e.g. constructed responses, open-ended essays with no single correct answer,
portfolios that are collections of students' work over time, and project work that involves collaboration with peers.

**Authentic Assessment** (Identifier) - Student assessment in which knowledges and skills are measured using the real world environment, rather than standardized tests.

**Informal Assessment** (Descriptor) - Appraisal of an individual or group's status or growth by means other than standardized instruments. (term dates officially to 1977)

**Performance Based Evaluation** - No official working definition in ERIC; however, this one is from the Office of Technology Assessment of the US Congress (1992): Performance Assessment is testing that requires a student to create an answer or a product that demonstrates his or her knowledge or skills.

**Portfolio Assessment** (Descriptor) - Systematic collection of a student's work samples, records of observation, test results, etc., over a period of time for the purpose of evaluating student growth and achievement - used occasionally with populations other than students. (term dates officially from 1994).

**Portfolios** (Background Materials), (Descriptor) - Collections of records, letters of reference, work samples, etc., documenting skills, capabilities, and past experiences. (term dates officially from 1978).

**ERIC Clearinghouse on Assessment and Evaluation:**
http://www.lib.ncsu.edu/disciplines/015-ERIC-EducationalReso.html

On the Internet, go to the Special resources section to access the Educational Testing Service Test Collection database, the Buros Test Review Locator, etc.

This clearinghouse, 1 of 16 within the US Department of Education's Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) system, acquires, selects, and abstracts information on educational testing and evaluation, including measurement devices, research design, and methodology. In addition, the Clearinghouse produces information analysis products; disseminates complimentary ERIC products, such as digests, newsletters, and brochures; and provides free reference and referral services and search strategy consultation.

Located at:
The Catholic University of America
209 O'Boyle Hall,
Washington, DC 20064-3893
202-319-5120

**The Council of Chief State School Officers State Education Assessment Center (CCSSO)**
The Council established the State Education Assessment Center to improve the quality and comparability of data on education, including state-by-state achievement data, indicators of quality and performance assessment of teachers and students. Projects have been conducted in mathematics, reading, science, geography, and history; a project on the arts is now underway.
One Massachusetts Avenue NW, Suite 700
Washington, DC 20001-1431
202-408-5505
http://www.ccsso.org/index.html

**National Center for Research on Evaluation, Standards and Student Testing (CRESST)**
OERI-funded research center undertakes research and development projects to improve student testing and evaluation practices. CRESST is particularly interested in issues related to the validity of performance-based assessments. CRESST's findings are disseminated through a newsletter and technical reports and on their website.
Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development (ASCD)
Network on Authentic Assessment
ASCD sponsors special interest groups called networks to help curriculum developers and supervisors exchange ideas, solve problems, and work collaboratively on issues of mutual concern. Various networks offer newsletters, computer bulletin boards, and workshops. The network on authentic assessment is facilitated by:
Katherine Busick
Pacific Educational Laboratory, Suite 1409,
1164 Bishop Street,
Honolulu, HI 96812
808-532-1900

National Research Center on Student Learning
OERI-funded national center explores how thinking and reasoning skills can be taught and examines how content in various subjects, particularly mathematics, science and social studies, is learned. The center also investigates exemplary teaching practices and ways to teach students how to become competent thinkers, learners, and problem solvers. Research information is disseminated through a newsletter and technical reports.
University of Pittsburgh
Learning Research and Development Center
3939 O'Hara Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15260
412-624-7020

Northwest Regional Educational Laboratory (NWREL)
URL: http://www.ncrel.org/
Regional educational laboratory, one of 10 such OERI-funded labs located across the country, operates the Center for Applied Performance Testing. The purpose of this program is to help schools to achieve better assessment of student outcomes and use assessment and evaluation of information more effectively. NWREL also maintains a collection of tests and offers a video training series on assessment for teachers and administrators.
101 S. Main St.
Portland, OR 97204
503-275-9500

**Question 5:** Are there studies that “prove” (usually quantitative studies) service-learning is effective?

*Construction of an Instrument to Assess the Service-Learning Model: Establishing Concurrent Validity and Internal Reliability*
Christopher Anthony Payne
202 page monograph, non-academic research report, 1992
Availability: University Microfilms International (UMI)
Complex, Performance-Based Assessment: Expectations and Validation Criteria
Article from the Nov. 1991 Education Researcher, V20, n8, pp 15-21. Addresses validity issues surrounding performance-based assessment. The authors present a set of criteria by which to judge performance-based assessments, including consequences, fairness, transfer-generallizability, cognitive complexity, content quality, content coverage, meaningfulness, and cost efficiency. Check your library or order a reprint from:
University Microfilms International (UMI)

ERIC Digests.
A series of two-page research syntheses on various topics related to performance assessment. Single copies of the following Digests are available free while supplies last:
“The Case for Authentic Assessment,” Grant Wiggins, 1990, ERIC 328611
“Authentic Mathematics Assessment,” Tej Pandey, 1990, ERIC 354245
“Authentic Reading Assessment,” Peggy Dutcher, 1990, ERIC 328607
“Authentic Writing Assessment,” Carmen Chapman, 1990, ERIC 328606
“Assessing Civics Education,” Lawrence Rudner, 1991, ERIC 338698
Send self-addressed envelope to the ERIC Clearinghouse on Assessment and Evaluation.
The Catholic University of America
209 O’Boyle Hall
Washington, DC 20064-3893
202-319-5120

Handbook for Local Goals Reports: Building A Community of Learners
Laura Lancaster and Leslie Lawrence, Eds, 1992 ERIC 349634
A handbook designed to help community leaders and citizens develop ways to measure their progress toward achieving the National Education Goals. It suggests a range of measures and indicators for each goal as well as resource organizations offering additional information. Free Availability:
The National Education Goals Panel
1850 M Street, Suite 270
Washington, DC 20036
202-632-0952

Florida Learn & Serve: 1994-1995 Outcome Data
A 10 page report discussing the methodology, Background, findings and limitations of the data, and the Florida Learn & Serve K-12 programs. Attachments include Guidelines for L & S Final Reports, detail on the projects Form, a questionnaire, example and key to abbreviations used in the report.
Availability:
Florida Learn and Serve K-12, Center for Civic Education and Service
930 W Park Avenue
Tallahassee, FL 32306-2059
Phone: 904-644-3174, Fax 904-644-3362
Question 6: What service-learning evaluation programs are out there?

*Evaluation of Two Alternative Programs for Junior High School Students*
Janet Malvin
Pacific Institute for Research and Evaluation, 1992, 24 pages
Based on the alternatives approach to drug abuse prevention, two service opportunity courses were offered to 8th and 9th grade students. Students in Cross-Age Tutoring were taught tutoring and communication skills and spent one period, 4 days per week tutoring elementary students. Students in School Store (a service opportunity developed for this study) were taught business and interpersonal skills and operated an on-campus store. Students who volunteered for either course were matched and one student from each pair was randomly assigned to receive the course while the other served as a control. All students were pre- and post-tested via a self-reporting Student Questionnaire, observations and interviews, and most students participated in follow-up testing 1 year later. Affective and drug-specific measures were collected with positive effects of the courses hypothesized for self-esteem, attitudes toward school, attendance, locus of control and discipline problems. Results indicated negligible effects for either course, although students rated the course favorably. Discussion of the results in terms of shortcomings of the courses themselves and limitations of the school-based model of alternatives to drug abuse and calls into question the efficacy of incorporating service opportunity prevention strategies within the school curriculum.

Availability:
ERIC (EDRS)--221606

Carl I. Fertman, Joanne Long
Pennsylvania Service Learning Evaluation Network
Monograph, non-academic research report, 88 pages.
Availability:
Pennsylvania Service Learning Resource and Evaluation Network
5D21 Forbes Quadrangle, University of Pittsburgh
Pittsburgh, PA 15260
Phone: 412-648-7196, Fax: 412-648-7198

*Evaluating and Working with Community Agencies: A Guide for the Principal*
Carl I. Fertman, NASSP Bulletin, V72 n506 pp9-14
Serial article, nonclassroom guides, 1988
Schools can initiate cooperative relationships with community agencies and help them develop programs to meet student needs. To help administrators assess the helping potential of various agencies, this article offers guidelines for considering agency staff, accreditation, references, professional and ethical standards, insurance coverage, resources, service linkages, and evaluation methods.
Availability:
ERIC (EDRS)--EJ370196 or UMI or UnCover
Evaluation of the Effects of a Personal Empowerment Program for Adolescents
Carl I. Fertman, Nancy H. Chubb
Monograph, non-academic research report, 1990, 20 pages. The ecological perspective holds that community and school activities are a rare product of interaction among adolescents, communities, families and schools. This study was designed to assess the outcomes of a personal empowerment program. The sample consisted of 25 male and 27 female 9th grade students. They took a pre-test and received a total activities score which represented the degree to which they were involved in organized activities at school and in their communities. Subjects were selected from the middle range of activity participation and then randomly assigned to the experimental or control group. 19 students completed a 1 week summer workshop on personal empowerment with follow-up sessions during the school year. The summer workshop consisted of small and large group activities focused on leadership, communications, assertiveness, stress management and decisionmaking. Student took a post-test 6 months following the week long workshop. Results indicated that the effect of the personal empowerment program was to maintain the experimental groups’ level of activity participation while the control group decreased its level of participation. No significant differences were found at post-test for locus of control or self-esteem. The value of the findings in general is that participation in activities, at least by adolescents with moderate activity involvement, can be affected, even through a fairly simple and short intervention.
Availability:
ERIC (EDRS)--317930

Florida Learn and Serve 1994-1995 Projects
Joe Follman, Stephanie Kadel, Eds., 1995, 126 page monograph, directory or catalog Florida State Dept of Education, Florida State University, Center for Civic Education and Service and the Corporation for National Service. Provides descriptions of 91 programs which received Learn and Serve America Sub-grants for 1994-95. Each description includes the project title, school district, address, phone, fax, contact name, award amount, number of participants, grade level, school type, and narrative description. An appendix reviews the grant program and process for applications which were due May, 1995. Availability:
Florida Learn and Serve K-12, Center for Civic Education and Service 930 W Park Avenue Tallahassee, FL 32306-2059 Phone: 904-644-3174, Fax 904-644-3362

Joe Follman, James Watkins Southeastern Regional Vision for Education, Office of Educational Research and Improvement. Monograph, classroom guide for the instructor, 1994, 108 pages. Defining service-learning as the formal integration of public service into student instruction and learning, this guide provides teachers with ideas for narrowing the gap between what students do in school and what they will do after they leave school. The example activities, derived from actual projects, demonstrate the nearly limitless range of possibilities for service-learning. The guide is divided into four sections. The first section provides examples of interdisciplinary projects, by grade level: Intergenerational projects, tutoring and mentoring projects, environmental and recycling projects, school improvement projects, and others. The second section offers single-discipline projects, by
subject and grade level. The third section offers practical information on the steps involved in establishing service learning programs the fourth section contains descriptions of useful publication on service-learning and annotated lists of organizations at the local, state, regional, and national levels that can provide information and resources to people interested in initiating or expanding service learning. Throughout the guide, “Program Profiles” provide fuller descriptions of exemplary service-learning programs in schools and organizations in the southeastern United States and across the country. Appendices contain standards for service learning, an exercise for identifying nearby service opportunities, a sample interdisciplinary planning form, and other information. Contains a 123-item bibliography.

Availability:
SERVE Florida
345 Magnolia Dr. Suite 23
Tallahassee, FL 32301
Phone: 800-352-6001

Question 7: Who has done evaluation/assessment of service-learning and how can I contact them?
http://ericae2.educ.cua.edu/intboda.htm#ese has the homepages of the organizations listed below, in addition these may be listed in the suggested readings above in this document.

American Educational Research Association (AERA)
URL: http://aera.net/
AERA is a professional organization comprised of scholars in all of the social sciences related to educational Research.

ERIC Clearinghouse on Assessment and Evaluation (ERIC/AE)
At the ERIC/AE Web and Gopher sites, you will find measurement and evaluation news; full text resources including books, essays (including 31 Assessment Essays), and newsletters on assessment and evaluation; test schedules for major standardized tests; the Test Locator; places to search ERIC databases; descriptions of major testing projects; materials pertaining to Goals 2000 and world class standards; and pointers to other sites containing assessment and evaluation information.

NAEP - National Assessment of Educational Progress
Described by its governing board as, “The Nation’s Report Card,” which is the only nationally representative and continuing assessment of what America’s students know and can do in various academic subject.”

National Center for Research on Evaluation, Standards, and Student Testing (CRESST)
URL: http://crest96.cse.ucla.edu/index.html
Cresst offers searchable newsletters and technical reports, a unique and large database of alternative assessments, and descriptions of its available products.
University of California, Los Angeles Graduate School of Education
405 Hilgard Avenue
Los Angeles, CA 90024-1522
310-206-1532
Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development (ASCD)
URL: http://www.ascd.org/
1250 N. Pitt St.,
Alexandria, VA 22314-1453
800-933-2723

American Association of School Administrators
URL: http://www.aasa.org/
1801 North Moore Street
Arlington, MA 22209-9988

ERIC Documents (EDRS)
URL: http://ousd.k12.ca.us/netday/links/Partnerships/eric-chess.html
The U.S. Department of Education’s Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) collects resources in education which might not normally have a wide area of dissemination. The ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS) provides both microfiche and paper copy reproductions of these documents. To order you will need the ERIC Document number (ED or EJ) which can be found at the end of the citation of those documents reproduced by EDRS.
Address:
ERIC Document Reproduction Service
http://edrs.com/
7420 Fullerton Road, Suite 110
Springfield, VA 22153-2852
800-443-ERIC

University Microfilm International (UMI)
URL: http://www.umi.com/
300 North Zeeb Road 3801 E. Florida, Suite 200
P.O. Box 1346 Denver, CO 80210
Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 1-800-369-8745
1-800-521-0600 ext. 2888 sos@carl.org

National Service Learning Cooperative Clearinghouse
URL: http://www.nicsl.coled.umn.edu
1954 Buford Ave., University of Minnesota
Room 460, Vocational And Technical Education Building
St. Paul, Minnesota 55108
Phone: 1-800-808-SERVE
E-Mail: SERVE@maroon.tc.umn.edu