9-2023

THE EXPLORATION OF THE DEVELOPMENTAL IMPACT OF FIRST LANGUAGE MAINTENANCE OF ENGLISH LEARNERS IN DUAL LANGUAGE PROGRAMS: A MODIFIED META-ANALYSIS

Emma Dobson

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.unomaha.edu/edleadstudent
Please take our feedback survey at: https://unomaha.az1.qualtrics.com/jfe/form/SV_8cchtFmpDyGfBLE
THE EXPLORATION OF THE DEVELOPMENTAL IMPACT OF FIRST LANGUAGE MAINTENANCE OF ENGLISH LEARNERS IN DUAL LANGUAGE PROGRAMS: A MODIFIED META-ANALYSIS

By

Emma Dobson

A DISSERTATION

Presented to the Faculty of The Graduate College at the University of Nebraska In Partial Fulfillment of Requirements For the Degree of Doctor of Education Major: Educational Leadership Under the Supervision of Dr. Elliott Ostler

Omaha, Nebraska

September, 2023

Supervisory Committee:

Elliott Ostler
Kay Kaiser
Jeanne Surface
Melissa Cast-Brede
THE EXPLORATION OF THE DEVELOPMENTAL IMPACT OF FIRST LANGUAGE MAINTENANCE OF ENGLISH LEARNERS IN DUAL LANGUAGE PROGRAMS: A MODIFIED META-ANALYSIS

Emma Dobson, Ed.D
University of Nebraska, 2023
Advisor: Dr. Elliott Ostler

Abstract
Some public schools are failing English Learners (Calderón, 2011). English Learners are not maintaining their first language and therefore historically lag behind their English-only peers (Johnson, 2022). Failure to maintain first language negatively affects intellectual, educational, personal, social, and economic development. No area of second language research has received as much attention and remained as elusive as the influence of the first language (Jarvis, 2000). This modified mini meta-analysis investigates the developmental impact of first language maintenance of English learners in Dual Language Programs. This study seeks to improve understanding of the most effective ways to educate ELs. It is evident that dual language programs are one of the most effective models for teaching ELs, as dual language programs focus on first language maintenance. This study will answer questions about how to move forward and provide the best educational model for the increasing numbers of English Learners while examining intellectual, educational, personal, social, and economic development.

Keywords: English Learners, first language, dual language programs, intellectual development, educational development, personal development, social development, economic development
Copyright 2023, Emma Dobson
Acknowledgements

I thank my dissertation chair, Elliott Ostler, and my committee, Kay Kaiser, Jeanne Surface, and Melissa Cast-Brede for their assistance, support, and mentorship throughout this process.
# Table of Contents

**Abstract** ................................................................................................................................. *ii*

**Acknowledgements** ................................................................................................................ *ii*

**Chapter 1: The Problem** ........................................................................................................ *1*
  - Introduction ........................................................................................................................... *1*
  - Description of the Modified Meta-Analysis Process ............................................................. *3*
  - Framework ............................................................................................................................ *4*
  - Research Questions ............................................................................................................... *6*
  - Definitions ........................................................................................................................... *7*

**Chapter 2: Literature Review** .................................................................................................. *169*
  - Summary of Data Collected ............................................................................................... *169*
  - Summary of Data by Research Question .......................................................................... *216*
  - Decision Making ................................................................................................................ *271*

**Chapter 3: Data Analysis** ......................................................................................................... *275*

**Chapter 4: Findings and Recommendations** .......................................................................... *392*
  - Conclusions ......................................................................................................................... *409*
  - Intellectual Development ................................................................................................... *409*
  - Educational Development .................................................................................................. *409*
  - Personal Development ....................................................................................................... *409*
  - Social Development .......................................................................................................... *409*
  - Economic Development ..................................................................................................... *409*
  - Discussion .......................................................................................................................... *411*
  - Recommendations ............................................................................................................. *413*

**References** ................................................................................................................................ *415*
Chapter 1: The Problem

Introduction

Since 1990, the United States has experienced the greatest influx of immigrants in its history. In fact, by the year 2050 whites will no longer constitute the majority of the population. Today, 4.9 million public school children are English Learners (ELs). They currently account for 10.3% of all public-school students (National Center for Education Statistics, 2023). By 2025, it is estimated that ELs will make up 25% of the public-school student population (National Education Association, 2020). If ELs are expected to make up one fourth of the public school population in just two years, it is critical to consider the models of instruction that best educate our English Learners.

One model of instruction that is commonly used with English Learners is dual language instruction. Dual language instruction is a model of instruction in which students are learning their grade level content in two languages simultaneously. Across the nation, there are over 800 dual language programs. Most dual language programs use Spanish as the partner language with English, however, there are also programs in Mandarin, Cantonese, Korean, Japanese, Arabic, Russian, German, French, Portuguese, and Italian (Lindholm-Leary, 2013).

Dual language education is for all students. Although the program was created to help English Language Learners (English Learners) acquire English proficiency by teaching them first in their home language, it is also now a popular program for students that speak only English and for students that speak languages other than Spanish and English. Home language can be defined as the language that students speak at home with their families or may also be called their first language, native language, or mother tongue. Dual language education is also a possible option for students with a disability.

The original idea of dual language education is based around the language acquisition theory which states that young children tend to acquire language naturally through consistent time
spent in a target language (Aktan-Erciyes, 2021). In order to learn a second language, children need comprehensible input that they can grasp at their stage of language development (Krashen & Terrell, 1983). When students are learning in a dual language program they are supported in their home language and provided comprehensible input in their second language at their current stage of development throughout their schooling. Research shows that home language skills predict second language learning (Kaushanskaya et al., 2012). This means that students with a strong home language foundation generally score higher on tests of English proficiency (Murphy, 2014).

Evidence indicates that dual language instruction improves the achievement gap between English Learners and English-Proficient students (Jesús, 2008). Recent meta-analyses have shown that educational programs that systematically incorporate English Learners home language result in levels of academic success, including achievement in literacy and math (Genesee, 2020). In addition to academic achievement, students in dual language programs exhibit higher self-esteem and self-confidence, increased cognitive stimulation, increased problem solving and creativity, appreciation for diversity, higher levels of engagement and fewer disciplinary referrals compared to their peers in English only programs (Thomas & Collier, 2010).

Dual language instruction upholds the theory that primary language literacy among English Learners supports second language acquisition, and that fluency in multiple languages is superior to fluency in only one (Sleeter & Stillman, 2005). Many districts that implement dual language choose to implement it because it is more effective than traditional English as a Second Language Instruction (ESL) (Murphy, 2014). In true bilingual education, literacy and competence continue to grow in both languages, while in traditional ESL education, literacy and competence only grow in English (Murphy, 2014).

Some public schools are failing English Learners (Calderón, 2011). English Learners are not maintaining their first language and therefore historically lag behind their English-only peers (Johnson, 2022). Failure to maintain first language negatively affects intellectual, educational,
personal, social, and economic development. No area of second language research has received as much attention and remained as elusive as the influence of the first language (Jarvis, 2000). Perhaps a modified meta-analysis investigating the developmental impact of first language maintenance of English learners in Dual Language Programs could effectively address this problem.

This study seeks to improve understanding of the most effective ways to educate ELs, considering the development of the whole child. Rather than focusing on attaining English language proficiency as quickly as possible, it’s necessary to consider the intellectual, educational, personal, social, and economic development of the child. It is evident that dual language programs are one of the most effective models for teaching ELs, as dual language programs focus on first language maintenance. This study will answer questions about how to move forward and provide the best educational model for the increasing numbers of English Learners while examining intellectual, educational, personal, social, and economic development.

Description of the Modified Meta-Analysis Process

This study is different than a typical dissertation. I determined that a modified meta-analysis is the best way to answer my questions because it gives me the opportunity to explore all the existing research. I plan to scour the research, implement a strategic filtering process, and examine the commonalities and overlaps in the research in order to make conclusions.

This study does not follow the traditional layout of a typical dissertation. This modified meta-analysis contains four chapters. Chapter one describes the problem. This section includes an introduction to the problem and topic of study, a description of the meta-analysis process including the organization, the unique framework, the research questions with operational definitions, data collection and the analytic profile. Within data collection, I describe the three steps I use to filter the data collected. The data collected in this dissertation is research articles. The filtering process includes multiple iterations of a table containing all of the research I
collected. Chapter two reviews the literature. The data collected is summarized by each research question in this chapter. Chapter three describes the in depth data analysis. Lastly, Chapter four includes findings and recommendations.

This study does not follow the traditional meta-analysis process, which is why I have called it a Modified Meta-Analysis. The modification lies primarily in the filtering process and the multiple interactions of cross comparison of literature. Statistical results are not compared directly among or across various studies but rather thematic comparisons that exist across a broad range of literature sources and are explored across multiple filters. This type of modification will be valuable to me because it gives me the opportunity to evaluate all existing related literature I can find, compare findings, and ultimately pull themes to answer my questions.

**Framework**

In lieu of a framework, I am using a modified meta-analysis process to overlap all possible lenses. My way of looking at the research is to look at everything currently existing related to my area of research. The framework emerges in two stages. The first stage includes the general framework and understanding of English Learner Education and Dual Language Programs as provided in the introduction. The first stage includes the five areas of development, intellectual, educational, personal, social, and economic. The second stage of the framework emerges as the data is filtered in three stages and across the five areas. Within the five areas of development or categories of research, I was able to further organize the research based on common themes. Below is a visual representation of the framework.
The Exploration of the Developmental Impact of First Language Maintenance of English Learners in Dual Language Programs: A Modified Meta Analysis Investigation

English Learner Education

Dual Language Programs

Intellectual Development
- Cognitive Skills
- Culture of Intellectualism
- Executive Function

Educational Development
- Literacy Development
- School/College Readiness
- Academic Achievement
- Language Acquisition

Personal Development
- Sense of Identity
- Self Confidence
- Cultural Awareness
- Critical Consciousness

Social Development
- Social Network
- Relationships with friends and family
- Social Competence
- Social Flexibility

Economic Development
- Cultural Awareness
- Labor Market
- Global Economy
Research Questions

The research states the importance of maintaining the first language and the effectiveness of dual language programs in supporting the first language while learning English and developing language proficiency. The goal of this modified meta-analysis is to explore historical interactivity of findings in literature that heretofore have not been recognized. In order to do this I will examine how dual language programs support ELs in maintaining their first language, using the lens of intellectual development, educational development, personal development, social development, and economic development. The overarching question is the following:

- How do dual language programs support English Learners in maintaining their first language?

Maintaining the first language is important for English Learners in the areas of intellectual, educational, personal, social, and economic development. These five areas will be used to examine the impact of dual language programming and development, and how they may or may not impact maintenance of the first language. The following questions are posed:

1. How does participation in a dual language program impact the intellectual development of English Learners?

2. How does participation in a dual language program impact the educational development of English Learners?

3. How does the participation in a dual language program impact the personal development of English Learners?

4. How does the participation in a dual language program impact the social development of English Learners?

5. How does the participation in a dual language program impact the economic development of English Learners?
Definitions

In order to answer the research questions, it is first necessary to define each area of development for the purposes of this modified meta-analysis.

1. Intellectual Development: The growth of a child’s ability to think or reason. Intellectual development includes how they organize their minds, ideas, and thoughts to make sense of the world they live in (Fraser Health, 2023). Intellectual development includes cognitive skills and executive function.

2. Educational Development: The growth of a child within an educational or school setting. Educational development includes academic achievement, school readiness, literacy development, and language acquisition.

3. Personal Development: The growth of a child’s self-concept, their motivations to achieve or to socialize, their values and goals, their coping styles, and their sense of responsibility and conscientiousness. Personal development includes sense of identity, self-confidence, cultural awareness, and critical consciousness.

4. Social Development: The process of interacting with others and building relationships with others. Social development includes social networks, relationships with family and friends, social competence, and social flexibility.

5. Economic Development: The process of creating wealth, utilizing community benefits, and understanding the interaction between governments and citizens, to improve quality of life.

Data Collection

The data in this modified meta-analysis is literature. I collected and ran over 250 articles through multiple phases of filtering/processing within and across the five areas of development as a way to extract meaningful interactivity. These articles were chosen to be included because they related to one of the following topics: dual language education, bilingual education, English
Learner Programs, first language maintenance, intellectual development of English learners, educational development of English learners, personal development of English learners, social development of English learners, and economic development of English learners. Although I originally intended to only include research articles, I also included news articles as those articles gave overviews of current trends in literature and thus connected me to more research articles.

I expected to find research about English learners and their second language acquisition. I also expected to find research relating to different types of English Learner programs, not necessarily dual language education. I was correct in assuming that there is limited research in the areas of intellectual, educational, personal, social, and economic development of English Learners specific to dual language. For this reason, I included all research that related to the intellectual, educational, personal, social, and economic development of English Learners knowing that ultimately it could help me answer my research questions. My intention is to use the five lenses to examine the impact of dual language programming and development and how that may or may not impact maintenance of the first language.

**Data Filtering**

In the data filtering stage of reviewing research, I used thematic recognition and a systematic combination of similar themes and findings. I then examined the themes, combinations, and findings for overlaps within the five elements.

As I examined the 250 articles, I filtered the data in stages. In stage 1, I filtered the data from the articles based on the five areas of development. Within each area of development, I highlighted important findings and then extracted common language from those findings. These became my themes within the areas of development. In stage 2, I noted key findings from each article within the common themes. The key findings are highlighted in the table related to their common theme. The color code is the following: yellow=intellectual, gray=educational, green=personal, blue=social, purple=economic. The third stage of filtering the data included
removing any extra data that is not applicable to the research questions and sorting the data into like themes. I rearranged some of the articles based on the relevant findings to each theme. The next section goes through each stage of filtering the data with more detail.

**Stage 1 Data Filtering**

In the first stage of filtering, I read articles, highlighted key findings or information, and circled thematic topics or common language related to the area of development. I used this system to determine if the findings in the article fit best in the intellectual development category, educational development category, personal development category, social development category or the economic development category. In some cases, the articles contained findings that related to multiple categories. In this case, I placed the articles in all of the categories. I noted in which categories I placed the article and reviewed the circled thematic topics that related to the area of development. After doing this with all of the articles, I compiled a list of the thematic topics that related to the area of development and chose the most common ones to be the themes within the areas of development. These themes were phrases that other researchers commonly used in their articles. On the table included below, you will see the area of development listed in bold font and the themes underneath that were common in the articles I reviewed, and therefore became my theme headings. The table contains the title of the article sorted into the theme and area of development.

**Intellectual Development**

Within the element of intellectual development, three themes emerged: cognitive skills, the culture of intellectualism, and the executive function of the brain. Cognitive skills can be defined as the core skills your brain uses to think, read, learn, remember, reason, and pay attention. The culture of intellectualism can be defined as active engagement in learning and the promotion of higher order thinking skills. The executive function of the brain includes the mental
processes that enable us to plan, focus attention, remember instructions, and juggle multiple tasks successfully.

**Educational Development**

Within the element of educational development, four themes emerged: academic achievement, college readiness, literacy development, and language acquisition. Academic achievement can be defined as the extent to which a student has attained their educational goals. College readiness can be defined as the set of skills, behaviors, and knowledge a student should have before enrollment in their first year of college. Literacy development is defined as the process of learning words, sounds, and language. Children develop literacy skills in order to learn to read and write. Language acquisition can be defined as the process by which humans acquire the capacity to perceive and comprehend language, as well as to produce and use words and sentences to communicate.

**Personal Development**

Within the element of personal development, four themes emerged: a sense of identity, self-confidence, cultural awareness, and critical consciousness. A sense of identity can be defined as your overarching sense and view of yourself. Cultural awareness can be defined as your understanding of the differences between yourself and other people from different backgrounds, especially differences in attitudes and values. Self-confidence can be defined as a feeling of trust in one’s abilities, qualities, and judgment. Critical consciousness is the ability to recognize and analyze systems of inequality and the commitment to take action against these systems. Critical consciousness can be a gateway to academic motivation and achievement for marginalized students.
Social Development

Within the element of social development, four themes emerged: social network, relationships with family and friends, social competence, and social flexibility. Social network can be defined as a network of social interactions and personal relationships. Relationships with family and friends can be defined as the connection between yourself and family and friends. Social competence consists of social, emotional, cognitive, and behavioral skills needed for successful social adaptations. Social flexibility is the ability to adapt to different social situations.

Economic Development

Within the element of economic development, three themes emerged: cultural awareness, labor market, and the global economy. Cultural awareness can be defined as your understanding of the differences between yourself and other people from different backgrounds, especially differences in attitudes and values. The labor market is defined as the availability of employment and labor, in terms of supply and demand. The global economy can be defined as the sum of activities that take place both within a country and between different countries.

The table below shows the categorization of each research article.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cognitive Skills</th>
<th>Culture of Intellectualism</th>
<th>Executive Function of the brain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Successes and Challenges in Dual Language Education</td>
<td>Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language</td>
<td>L1 and L1 Picture Naming in Mandarin-English Bilinguals: A Test of Bilingual Dual Coding Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis Calls for DL Pre-K for Young English Learners</td>
<td>A Template Analysis of Teacher Agency at an Academically Successful Dual Language School</td>
<td>Rethinking Bilingual Instruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Education of Dual Language Learners: An Efficacy Study of the Nuestros Niño’s School Readiness Professional Development Program</td>
<td>Leveraging Language(s): Reframing Rhetoric’s of Fear with Narratives of Agency and Hope</td>
<td>Executive functions in two-way dual-language education: A mechanism for academic performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the Needs of English Language Learners with Disability in Urban Settings</td>
<td>Bringing the Outside in: Negotiating knowledge and agency in multilingual learning contexts</td>
<td>Bilingual Cognition and Growth Mindset: A Review of Cognitive Flexibility and Its Implications for Dual-Language Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Focus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rethinking Bilingual Instruction</td>
<td>Mother Tongue, a Necessary Step to Intellectual Development</td>
<td>Different features of bilingualism in relation to executive functioning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language Programs</td>
<td>A Longitudinal Study of Bilingual Development in Infants</td>
<td>Investigating the effects of language-switching frequency on attentional and executive functioning in proficient bilinguals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenyan Curriculum Reforms and Mother Tongue Education</td>
<td>Why Bilinguals Are Smarter</td>
<td>Bilingualism and executive functioning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rising to the bilingual challenge: self-reported experiences of managing life with two languages</td>
<td>The role of native-language instruction in bilingual education</td>
<td>Is bilingualism associated with enhanced executive functioning in adults? A meta-analytic review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The cognitive advantages of bilingualism: A focus on visual-spatial memory and executive functioning</td>
<td>Content Framing of Bilingual Process Development of Primary School-Aged Children’s Intellectual Abilities</td>
<td>Interactions between levels of attention ability and levels of bilingualism in children’s executive functioning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive advantage in children enrolled in a second-language elementary school program for one year</td>
<td>First Language As A Resource in Additive Bilingual Education</td>
<td>Balanced bilingualism and executive functioning in children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive advantages in adult Turkish bilingual immigrants- a question of the chicken or the egg</td>
<td>Maturation of executive functioning skills in early sequential bilingualism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What cognitive processes are likely to be exercised by bilingualism and does this exercise lead to extra-linguistic cognitive benefits?</td>
<td>Bilingualism narrows socioeconomic disparities in executive functions and self-regulatory behaviors during early childhood: Evidence from the early childhood longitudinal study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingualism enriches the poor: Enhanced cognitive control in low-income minority children</td>
<td>Should the search for bilingual advantages in executive functioning continue?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Contribution of Bilingualism to Cognitive Functioning and Regional Brain Volume in Normal and Abnormal Aging</td>
<td>The effects of bilingualism on toddlers’ executive functioning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingualism: Pathway to cognitive reserve</td>
<td>Revisiting theoretical and causal explanations for the bilingual advantage in executive functioning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive effects of bilingualism: An evolving perspective</td>
<td>The impact of bilingualism on executive functions and working memory in adults</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifying the causal link: Two approaches toward understanding the relationship toward bilingualism and cognitive control</td>
<td>Parents report fewer executive functioning problems and repetitive behaviors in young dual-language speakers with autism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive mechanism underlying performance differences between monolinguals and bilinguals</td>
<td>Word mapping and executive functioning in young monolingual and bilingual children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Development</td>
<td>Academic Achievement</td>
<td>School/College Readiness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Template Analysis of Teacher Agency at an Academically Successful Dual Language School</td>
<td>The Academic Preparedness of Latino Students in Dual Language and Transitional Bilingual Education Programs</td>
<td>The Effect of Dual Language and Transitional-Bilingual Education Instructional Models on Spanish Proficiency for English Learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting the Needs of English Language Learners with Disability in Urban Settings</td>
<td>Conceptualizing preschool dual-language immersion education at Bobcat Canyon School</td>
<td>Effective Instruction for English Learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rethinking Bilingual Instruction</td>
<td>School readiness in language minority dual language learners in Japan: Language, executive function, and theory of mind</td>
<td>The Promise of Two Language Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive functions in two-way dual-language education: A mechanism for academic performance</td>
<td>A Comparative Study on the College Readiness of Bilingual Learners in Transitional Bilingual and Dual Language Programs</td>
<td>The Effects of Prekindergarten for Spanish-speaking dual language learners: Evidence from California’s Prekindergarten Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Academic Preparedness of Latino Students in Dual Language and Transitional Bilingual Education Programs</td>
<td>Pro: All students benefit from dual-language programs</td>
<td>The Additive Advantage and Bilingual Programs in a Large Urban District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual Language Education: A Promising 50:50 Model</td>
<td>Habla Conmigo: Teachers’ Spanish Talk and Latine Dual Language Learners’ School Readiness Skills</td>
<td>Language proficiency and competence: upper elementary students in a dual-language bilingual education program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A longitudinal study for the social and academic competence of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children</td>
<td>Self-regulation development among young Spanish-English Language Learners</td>
<td>Improving English Language Arts Instruction in Indiana Dual Language Bilingual Education Classrooms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placement of former English language learners in middle schools: general education or dual language?</td>
<td>Supporting Dual Language Learners through Culturally Responsive Early Childhood Family Education Programs</td>
<td>The Linguistic Garden: A case study of emergent bilingual’s participation, positioning, identity development in a dual language program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contesting math as the universal language: a longitudinal study of dual language bilingual education language allocation</td>
<td>School Readiness in Language-Minority Dual Language Learners in Japan: Language, Executive Function and Theory of Mind</td>
<td>Writing their way into talk: emergent bilinguals’ emergent literacy practices as pathways to peer interaction and oral language growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingualism, Biliteracy, Biculturalism, and Critical Consciousness for All: Proposing a Fourth Fundamental Goal for Two-Way Dual Language Education</td>
<td>Classroom Language Contexts as Predictors of Latinx Preschool Dual Language Learners’ School Readiness</td>
<td>Double-voicing and rubber ducks: the dominance of English in the imaginative play of two bilingual sisters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual Language Programs: An Exploration of Bilingual Students’ Academic Achievement, Language Proficiencies, and Engagement Using a Mixed Methods Approach</td>
<td>Teacher Characteristics That Play a Role in the Language, Literacy and Math Development of Dual Language Learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Language and Literacy Together: Supporting Grammatical Development in Dual Language Learners With Risk for Language and Learning Difficulties</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A preliminary study of the relationship between working memory, language experience, and grammatical skill in dual language learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fostering greater equity for emergent bilinguals through dual language programming</td>
<td>Preparing Young Dual Language Learners for School Readiness: Early Childhood Teacher Beliefs Regarding School Readiness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teacher Characteristics That Play a Role in the Language, Literacy, and Math Development of Dual Language Learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understanding language acquisition: Neural theory of language</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic and English Language Outcomes for DLLS as a Function of the School Bilingual Education Mode:: The role of Two-Way Immersion and Home Language Support</td>
<td>Examining heterogeneity among Latino Dual Language Learners’ School Readiness Profiles of English and Spanish at the end of Head Starts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Impact of Home Literacy on Bilingual Vocabulary Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Early Literacy Strategies for Parents of Young Dual Language Learners: A descriptive Study and Integrative Review</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latino Parents in Dual Language Immersion Programs: Why Are They So Satisfied?</td>
<td>Change in Language and Literacy Knowledge for Spanish-English Dual Language Learners at School-Entry: Analyses from Three Studies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Distributed L1 and L2 Language-Learning Environments of Dual Language Learners Across Home and School Settings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits of Dual Language Immersion on the Academic Achievement of English Language Learners</td>
<td>The Language and Literacy Development of Young Dual Language Learners: A Critical Review</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Working Memory and Linguistic Performance of Dual Language Learners with and Without Developmental Language Disorders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic Achievement of Students in Dual Language</td>
<td>Engineering Design in Dual Language: How Teachers Leveraged Biliteracy Practices to Add Engineering Disciplinary Literacy Practices</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dynamic Assessment Language Tasks and the Prediction of Performance on Year-End Language Skills in Preschool Dual Language Learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Versus Peer Grit: Influence on Later Individual Literacy Achievement of Dual Language Learners</td>
<td>Preschool Teachers’ Language and Literacy Practices with Dual Language Learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peer Effects on Early Language Development in Dual Language Learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Effects of Spanish English Dual Language Immersion on Student Achievement in Science and Mathematics</td>
<td>Beating the Odds: A Longitudinal Investigation of Low-Income Dual-Language and Monolingual Children’s English Language and Literacy Performance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Relationship Among Home Language Use, Parental Beliefs, and Spanish-Speaking children’s vocabulary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual Language Programs: Language and Access</td>
<td>Dual Language Learners and Four Areas of Early Childhood Learning and Development: What Do We Know and What Do We Need to Learn?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Specificity Principle in Young Dual Language Learners’ English Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic Development of Head Start Children: Role of Dual Language Learning Status</td>
<td>Phonetic discrimination, phonological awareness, and pre-literacy skills in Spanish-English dual language preschoolers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cognitive Control and the Phonological Awareness in the Acquisition of Second Language Vocabulary within the Spanish-English Dual Immersion Context</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effects of an Elementary Dual Language Immersion School Program on Junior High School Achievement</td>
<td>Influences of the home language and literacy environment on Spanish and English vocabulary growth among dual language learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dual Language Input and the Impact of Language Acquisition on Early Lexical Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Details</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successes Spur Push for Dual-Language Classes</td>
<td>Effects of transitional bilingual education on Spanish-speaking preschoolers’ literacy and language development: year 2 results</td>
<td>The Dimensionality of Oral Language in Kindergarten Spanish-English Dual Language Learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic Achievement and Wellbeing of Dual Language Learners: Evidence form a Busing Program</td>
<td>Supporting Positive Language and Literacy Outcomes for Young Dual Language Learners</td>
<td>Assessment of English Language Acquisition in young Dual Language Learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four Essential Questions About Dual Language Education</td>
<td>Advancing Early Literacy for All Children: Implications of the NELP Report for Dual-Language Learners</td>
<td>English Narrative Language Growth Across the School Year: Young Spanish-English Dual Language Learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caught Between Two Languages</td>
<td>A culturally and Linguistically Responsive Vocabulary Approach for Young Latino Dual Language Learners</td>
<td>The Dimensionality of Spanish in Young Spanish-English Dual-Language Learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portland Study Points to Reading Gains from Dual Language Programs</td>
<td>Language and Literacy Instruction in Preschool Classes that Serve Latino Dual Language Learners</td>
<td>Teaching (Bi) Multilingual Learners: Connecting Languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Succeeding with Latino Students</td>
<td>Being bilingual, being a reader: Prekindergarten dual language learners’ reading identities</td>
<td>The Developing Bilingual Brain: What Parents and Teachers Should Know and Do</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual Language Proficiency and the Educational Attainment of Latinos</td>
<td>Dual Language Development of Latino Children: Effect of Instructional Program Type and the Home and School Language Environment</td>
<td>A Narrative Format Design to Improve Language Acquisition Through Social Interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study to Examine Achievement of Bilingual Students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Personal Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sense of Identity</th>
<th>Cultural Awareness</th>
<th>Self Confidence</th>
<th>Critical Consciousness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Warm WELLcome for Language Learners</td>
<td>A Template Analysis of Teacher Agency at an Academically Successful Dual Language School</td>
<td>Learners’ Attitudes Toward “English-Only Institutional Policies: Language Use Outside the Classroom”</td>
<td>Vernacular Spanish as a promoter of critical consciousness in dual language bilingual education classrooms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultivating Pride in Bilingual Students: Orgullo Colectivo</td>
<td>More Than Being in Class: Adolescents’ Ethnolinguistic Insights in a Two-Way Dual Language Program</td>
<td>Equity perspectives and restrictionism policies: Tensions in dual language bilingual education</td>
<td>Remodeling dual language programs: Teachers enact agency as critically conscious language policy makers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivating English learners by helping them visualize their</td>
<td>Teacher-researchers promoting cultural learning in an intercultural</td>
<td>From Learner to Teacher Assistant: Community Based Service-</td>
<td>Two Dual Language Preschool Teachers’ Critical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideal L2 Self: lessons from two motivational programs</td>
<td>kindergarten in Aotearoa New Zealand</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning in a Dual-Language Classroom</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consciousness of Their Roles As Language Policy Makers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First language attrition</td>
<td>View of parents preferring to raise a bilingual child</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Foreign Language Effect on the Self-Serving Bias: A Field</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ciencias Bilingues: How Dual Language Teachers Cultivate Equity in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual Language Classrooms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Linguistic Garden: A case study of emergent bilingual’s</td>
<td>Principals’ Facilitation of English Language Learning in Public Schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>participation, positioning, identity development in a dual language</td>
<td>Self-Reported Biliteracy and Self-Esteem: A study of Mexican-American 8th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>program</td>
<td>Graders</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identity and Agency Among Heritage Learners</td>
<td>Translanguaging Together: Building Bilingual Identities con Nuevos Amigos</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second Language Orientation and Self-Determination Theory: A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Perceptions of Sociocultural Competence in Dual Language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consciousness of Their Roles As Language Policy Makers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructing Identities: How two emergent bilinguals create</td>
<td>Cultural Awareness Knowledge and the Teaching of Spanish to Native Speakers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>linguistic agency in elementary school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feeling their way towards justice: The embodied</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stance taking and Heritage Language Production: The Untold</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotionally Conscious Bilingual Teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voices From the Field</td>
<td>Benefits of Foreign Language Learning and Bilingualism: An Analysis of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Language Learners</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Young Dual Language Learners to Be Writers: Rethinking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Treasures: A Dual-Language Book Project</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching English as a Second Language Through the Lens of Identity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examining the Role of A Dual Language Immersion Program’s Language</td>
<td>Latino English Language Learners:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programme’s Language Program’s Language Ideologies in Scaffolding</td>
<td>Facing Obstacles Bigger than Language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive Learner Identities in Dual Language Learners</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negotiating an Identity to Achieve In English: Investigating The</td>
<td>Revisiting Educational Programs that Develop Linguistic and Cultural</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic Identities of Young Language Learners</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linguistical and Cultural Issues in Developing Disciplinary Literacy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Network</strong></td>
<td><strong>Relationships with family and friends</strong></td>
<td><strong>Social Competence</strong></td>
<td><strong>Social Flexibility</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rethinking Bilingual Instruction</td>
<td>Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language Programs</td>
<td>Social competence of bilingual and monolingual native English-speaking preschoolers: a comparison of parent and teacher perspectives.</td>
<td>Bilingual children adapt to the needs of their communication partners, monolinguals do not</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language Programs</td>
<td>A qualitative study of the play of dual language learners in an English-Speaking preschool</td>
<td>Bilingual children judge moral, social, and language violations as less transgressive than monolingual children</td>
<td>Does bilingualism really affect social flexibility?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual development and social networks of British-born Chinese children</td>
<td>Creating Classroom Communities in linguistically diverse settings: teacher directed, classroom level factor effects on peer dynamics</td>
<td>The impact of early social interactions on later language development in Spanish-English bilingual infants</td>
<td>Bilinguals’ social flexibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenging School Segregation in the Twenty-first Century: How Districts can Leverage Dual Language Education to Increase School and Classroom Diversity</td>
<td>Writing their way into talk: emergent bilinguals’ emergent literacy practices as pathways to peer interaction and oral language growth</td>
<td>Social competence, cultural orientations, and gender differences: a study of Mandarin-English bilingual preschoolers</td>
<td>Bilingual Speakers’ Cognitive Development in Childhood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Languages Across Borders: Social Network Development in An Adolescent Two-Way Dual Language Program</td>
<td>Bilingualism for all: Raciolinguistic Perspectives on Dual Language Education in the United States</td>
<td>A longitudinal study of the social and academic competence of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children</td>
<td>Bilingual and Monolingual Children Prefer native-Accented Speakers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Network Analysis</td>
<td>Understanding, Connection, and Identification: Friendship Features of Bilingual Spanish-English Speaking Undergraduates</td>
<td>The social and cultural contexts of second language acquisition in young children</td>
<td>Bilingualism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tell Me Who Your Friends Are and I Might be Able to Tell You What Languages You Speak: Social Network Analysis, Bilingualism, and Identity</td>
<td>Transactional relationships Between Latino’s Friendship Quality and Academic Achievement During the Transition to Middle School</td>
<td>Longitudinal Social and Communication Outcomes in Children with Autism Raised in Bi/Multilingual Environments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language Adjustment of International Students in the US: A Social Network Analysis on the Effects of Language resources, Language norm, and technology</td>
<td>Using the Linguistic Experiences of Youth And Their Families As A Curriculum: The Language Box Project</td>
<td>An exploratory longitudinal study of social and language outcomes in children with autism in bilingual home environments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language networks and social status among Mexican Americans</td>
<td>Bilingualism in Autism: Language learning profiles and social experiences</td>
<td>Emotion Understanding in Bilingual Preschoolers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Power of Bilingualism</td>
<td>Engaging Linguistically diverse families in classroom programs using their home language</td>
<td>The Relationship Among Child Resilient Attributes, Acculturation, Bilingualism, and Social Competence of Hispanic American preschool children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creating Classroom Communities in Linguistically Diverse Settings: Teacher-Directed, Classroom-Level Factor Effects on Peer Dynamics</td>
<td>The social and cultural contexts of second language acquisition in young children</td>
<td>Cultural Context As a Biasing Factor For Language Activation in Bilinguals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Generation Status, Social Capital and the Routes out of High School</td>
<td>Effect of Language Context on Ratings of Shy and Unsociable Behaviors in English Language Learner Children</td>
<td>Language and Social Development in a Multilingual Classroom: A Dinosaur Project Enriched with Block Play</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Communication skills of bilingual children</td>
<td>Social Validity in Early Language Interventions for Dual Language Learners: A Systematic Review of the Literature</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Economic Development**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural Awareness</th>
<th>Labor Market</th>
<th>Global Economy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Una Búsqueda de la Equidad y la Justicia: District Leaders Attempt to Expand Dual Language Bilingual Education for Equity</td>
<td>Rising to the bilingual challenge: self-reported experiences of managing life with two languages</td>
<td>Raciolingustic ideology and Spanish-English bilingualism on the US labor market: An analysis of online job advertisements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The key to global understanding: world languages education—why schools need to adapt</td>
<td>BilingualismBoosts US Labor Market</td>
<td>In Quest for Bilingual Grads, Schools Push Dual Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Awareness on a Bilingual Education</td>
<td>Rethinking Bilingual Instruction</td>
<td>Going Global: Can Dual-Language Programs Save Bilingual Education?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Source</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Multilingualism-as-a-Resource Orientation in Dual Language Education</td>
<td>Gender, Bilingualism, and the Early Occupational Careers of Second-Generation Mexicans in the South</td>
<td>Families and Educators Supporting Bilingualism in Early Childhood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using Mother Tongues as Building Blocks in Childhood Education</td>
<td>Economic Advantages of Multilingualism</td>
<td>Economic Advantages of Multilingualism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Awareness Knowledge and the Teaching of Spanish to Native Speakers</td>
<td>Is there really a labor market advantage to being bilingual in the US?</td>
<td>The economic value of bilingualism in the United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Key to Global Understanding: Why Schools Need to Adapt</td>
<td>The demand for Multilingual Human Capital in the US labor Market</td>
<td>Expanding bilingualism and biliteracy through a student-centered culturally relevant pedagogy: An innovation gap analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-constructing meaning in international meetings—an approach to plurilingual interactions</td>
<td>A raciolinguistic analysis of the neoliberal promotion of dual language education in a new Latinx South state</td>
<td>They see me different...like an immigrant cause of how I sound: Perceived difference, limitations, and naturalizations of race and language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language awareness and (Critical) cultural awareness—relationships, comparisons, and contrasts</td>
<td>A Love Letter to Language</td>
<td>Lifespan multilingual education, a long-term investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural identity and language: a proposed framework for cultural globalization and glocalization</td>
<td>English Skills, Earnings, and the Occupational Sorting of Mexican Americans Along the US-Mexican border</td>
<td>How to raise a global kid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual assistants and cultural awareness</td>
<td>The Promise of English: Linguistic Capital and the Neoliberal Workers in the South Korean Job Market</td>
<td>Rebranding bilingualism: The shifting discourses of language education policy in California’s 2016 election</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development in children of immigrant families</td>
<td>Paths to Mobility: The Mexican Second Generation At Work in A new Destination</td>
<td>Becoming Global Citizens through Bilingualism: English learning in the lives of University Students in China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attending to the third goal</td>
<td>Sociospatial Practices of Hispanic Youth Navigating Their Labor Market Opportunities</td>
<td>“Glocalization”: Going Beyond the Dichotomy of Global versus Local Through Additive Multilingualism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bamboo bridges or barriers? Exploring advantages of bilingualism among Asians in the US labor market through the lens of superdiversity</td>
<td>Cultural and Linguistic Ambidexterity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latinxs’ bilingualism at work in the US: Profit for whom?</td>
<td>Discourses, Practices, and Realities of Multilingualism in Higher Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elite multilingualism: discourses, practices, and debates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why language learning matters</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village is more global, language is more vital</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The American Evolution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Stage 2 Data Filtering

The next stage of the data filtering includes noting key findings from each article within the common themes. The key findings are highlighted related to their common theme. The color code is the following: yellow=intellectual, gray=educational, green=personal, blue=social, purple=economic. In order to organize this information, I continued utilizing the areas of development headings and then the themes within each area of development. In the table you will see the area of development and the theme with its assigned color. I then put each article previously sorted into the theme and area of development on the left column, and added the key information and findings on the right. In some cases I wasn’t sure if the information would end up relating or impacting my study, but left the information so that I could make the final decision at a later step.
## Intellectual Development

### Cognitive Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Analysis Calls for DL Pre-K for Young English Learners                 | • Young English-language learners still developing oral and literacy skills in their home languages benefit most from early-childhood programs that regularly expose them to both languages  
• By 2020, preschool-age children in the US who are exposed to or use a language other than English at home will outnumber their monolingual English-speaking peers  
• Young children learning two languages demonstrate school readiness factors: strong social-emotional development and “executive function” skills, such as listening and following directions  
• The recommendations are crystal clear and unequivocal that supporting the home language, as well as English, is the best thing for young dual language learners |
| Early Education of Dual Language Learners: An Efficacy Study of the Nuestros Niño’s School Readiness Professional Development Program | • The purpose of the experimental study was to assess the efficacy of the Nuestros Niño’s School Readiness Professional Development Program  
• 56 preschool teachers and 340 Spanish English DLLs from early childhood programs in California, Florida, and North Carolina participated in the study  
• Results indicate that the NNSR program has positive effects on the overall quality of early childhood classroom practices and on practices specifically focused on DLLs  
• DLLs in treatment classrooms showed greater gains in expressive vocabulary in English than DLLs in control classrooms, and when assessment in Spanish, gains were higher in receptive vocabulary, alphabet knowledge, writing and early math |
| Meeting the Needs of English Language Learners with Disability in Urban Settings | • The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth (Carrasquillo & Rodriguez, 2002; Paneque & Barbetta, 2006; Rodriguez, Parmar, & Signer, 2001)  
• The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth (Carrasquillo & Rodriguez, 2002; Paneque & Barbetta, 2006; Rodriguez, Parmar, & Signer, 2001)  
• For English Learners with disabilities to succeed in bilingual special education programs, they need to be part of a school that promotes bilingualism and provides students with exemplary instructional practices |
| Rethinking Bilingual Instruction                                         | • Researchers have now identified cognitive advantages for bilingual children that include enhanced executive function of the brain, resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001; Diaz & Klinger, 1991); increased short term memory (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013); and enhanced problem solving skills  
• These advantages are explained in part by the bilingual brain’s greater flexibility and ability to exclude competing stimuli as a result of having to constantly distinguish between two or more languages |
| Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language Programs | • This study, which included a total of 788 fifth-eighth grade students who had participated in a Spanish-English (n=645) or Mandarin English (n=143) dual language program, surveyed students’ language proficiencies ratings of bilingualism and social and cognitive functioning  
• Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward |
| Kenyan Curriculum Reforms and Mother Tongue Education | Maintenance and development of language and literacy skills in one’s mother tongue (MT) plays a critical role in facilitating second language (L2) learning, developing additive bilingualism and continuous cognitive development |
| Rising to the bilingual challenge: self-reported experiences of managing life with two languages | Numerous studies have demonstrated the bilingual cognitive advantage with regard to: (1) metalinguistic awareness (the ability to dissociate between meaning and form and explicitly talk about the language structure) (e.g. Bialystok et al. 2010); (2) executive functions (inhibition, switching/shifting, updating, monitoring) (see a summary by Dong and Li 2015); and (3) cognitive reserve (the protection mechanism against a cognitive decline related to elderly dementia and Alzheimer’s disease) (e.g. Schweizer et al. 2012)  
Bialystok (1992) provided evidence that bilinguals perform better than monolinguals on the Embedded Figures Test. Also, as demonstrated by Kovács and Mehler (2009), bilingual infants are better able to switch responses after a rule change in a head turn paradigm.  
This study aimed to learn about the perspective of bilinguals: all 92 participants agreed unanimously that knowing a second language is advantageous.  
This beneficial effect was attributed to five major categories: (1) sociocultural (e.g. ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world); (2) economic (e.g. better job prospects and ability to grow professionally also in other countries); (3) personal (personal development, learning new things and learning additional languages); (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to obtain information from a large number of sources and the multilingual world we live in); and finally (5) cognitive/enriching (e.g. a challenge/training for the brain, which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease, an ability to express oneself in more ways along with an ability to notice/think differently and to widen horizons). |
| Bilingualism, biliteracy, and cognitive effects: A review paper | Positive effects of bilingualism: Metalinguistic awareness and cognitive control in two languages and in non-language related tasks have been reported as bilingual-specific advantages.  
Negative effects of bilingualism: bilinguals were found to lag behind monolinguals in some areas of language use. The main ones included verbal fluency, receptive vocabulary and lexical access.  
Biliteracy: One consistent finding in terms of the effects of reading in two languages has been the higher phonological awareness and processing ability found in biliterate bilinguals with two alphabetic languages such as English and Spanish |
| Cognitive advantage in children enrolled in a second-language elementary school program for one year | A large number of studies (see reviews in Bialystok, 2005, and in Costa, Hernández, Costa-Faidella & Sebastián- Gallés, 2009) have shown that early bilingualism acquired through the family or the social community can positively influence cognitive development, particularly attentional and executive functioning, in children (Bialystok, 1999; Bialystok & Martin, 2004; Carlson & Meltzoff, 2008; Martin-Rhee & Bialystok, 2008) and adults, and even infants as young as and even in bilingual infants as young as seven months old (Kovács & Mehler, 2009) or 24 months old (Poulin-Dubois, Blaye, Coutya & Bialystok, 2011). |
- The positive impact of bilingualism has been observed over a variety of specific cognitive domains: for example, better flexibility in a symbol reorganization task (Peal & Lambert, 1962), superior performance at inhibiting distractors in a number concept task (Bialystok & Codd, 1997), superior symbolic representation and attentional inhibition skills in appearance–reality tasks (Bialystok & Senman, 2004).
- In order to communicate properly, bilinguals have to choose one of two bivalent competing languages while suppressing the other one – this reasoning could help to understand why they outperform monolinguals on an interference inhibition task typically consisting in selectively paying attention to one feature while inhibiting interference from another feature, such as the computerized Simon task (Martin-Rhee & Bialystok, 2008) or the Attentional Network Task (ANT – Fan, McCandliss, Sommer, Raz & Posner, 2002) (Costa et al., 2008, 2009).
- The purpose of the present study was to determine to what extent bilingualism acquired through an early L2 immersion school program might have a positive impact on attentional and executive functioning similar to that of early family or community bilingualism.
- Findings: results showed that the immersion group performed better (more specifically, faster) than the monolingual group on tasks assessing alerting, auditory selective attention, divided attention, and mental flexibility, but not on tasks assessing response inhibition, as predicted. However, contrary to our hypothesis, no difference was found between the two groups on the interference inhibition task.
- Conclusion: already after a period of three years, an L2 immersion school experience produces some of the attentional and executive benefits associated with early highly proficient bilingualism, although possibly not for exactly the same reasons.

Cognitive advantages in adult Turkish bilingual immigrants- a question of the chicken or the egg
- Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed.
- The current study indicates that bilingual Turkish immigrants have better executive functioning and episodic memory compared to Turkish immigrant monolinguals. Whether this is due to the effects of bilingualism or reflects inherent cognitive abilities in those able to acquire bilingualism in later life remains to be resolved.

Bilingualism enriches the poor: Enhanced cognitive control in low-income minority children
- This study explored whether the cognitive advantage associated with bilingualism in executive functioning extends to young immigrant children challenged by poverty and, if it does, which specific processes are most affected.
- In the study, carried out in Europe, 40 Portuguese-Luxembourgish bilingual children from low-income immigrant families in Luxembourg and 40 matched monolingual children from Portugal completed visuospatial tests of working memory, abstract reasoning, selective attention, and interference suppression. Two broad cognitive factors of executive functioning-representation (abstract reasoning and working memory) and control (selective attention and interference suppression) — emerged from principal component analysis.
- Whereas there were no group differences in representation, the bilinguals performed significantly better than did the monolinguals in control. These results demonstrate, first, that the bilingual advantage is neither confounded with, nor limited by socioeconomic and cultural factors and, second, that separable aspects of executive functioning are differentially affected by bilingualism. The bilingual...
| The Contribution of Bilingualism to Cognitive Functioning and Regional Brain Volume in Normal and Abnormal Aging | Examined the association between bilingualism, executive function and brain volume in older monolinguals and bilinguals who spoke English, Spanish, or both, and were cognitively normal or diagnosed with Mild Cognitive Impairment or dementia.  
- Gray matter volume was higher in language and EF brain regions among bilinguals, but no differences were found in memory regions.  
- Neuropsychological performance did not vary across language groups over time; however, bilinguals exhibited reduced Stroop interference and lower score on Digit Span Backwards and category fluency. Higher scores on Digit Span Backwards were associated with a younger age of English acquisition, and a greater degree of balanced bilingualism was associated with lower scores in category fluency.  
- The initial age of cognitive decline did not differ between language groups. The influence of bilingualism appears to be reflected in increased GMV in language and EF regions, and to a lesser degree, in EF. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bilingualism: Pathway to cognitive reserve</td>
<td>This paper evaluates evidence supporting the claim that bilingualism contributes to cognitive reserve. Four types of evidence are presented: (i) brain and cognitive function in healthy aging, (ii) age of onset of symptoms of dementia, (iii) relation between clinical level and neuropathology for patients, and (iv) rate of cognitive decline in later stages of dementia. In all cases, bilinguals revealed patterns that were consistent with the interpretation of protection from cognitive reserve when compared with monolinguals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive effects of bilingualism: An evolving perspective</td>
<td>The study provided the first credible evidence that rather than being a negative force, bilingualism might instead have significant positive outcomes. Although there were problems with the Peal and Lambert study (the language groups may not have been equivalent in socioeconomic status or intelligence and the measures were broadly based intelligence tests), the results created interest in the possibility that bilingualism could affect nonverbal cognition and that the effect could be positive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifying the causal link: Two approaches toward understanding the relationship toward bilingualism and cognitive control</td>
<td>Paap, Johnson, and Sawi's (2015) review raises a number of methodological issues with the current literature concerning bilingualism and cognitive advantages in executive functions. While the review has focused on providing counterevidence to a positive relationship between the two, we think that what should be the single most important message may have gotten lost in the article: more work needs to focus on identifying and describing the causal link between bilingual experience and cognitive control, as opposed to work just reporting correlations between the two.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Cognitive mechanism underlying performance differences between monolinguals and bilinguals | Lifelong experience with multiple languages is believed to produce a number of executive function advantages including enhanced top-down control, improved attention, and greater working memory capacity.  
- This bilingual advantage is generally believed to be the result of having multiple lexical representations in each language that compete for selection.  
- More specifically, the control that is required to select the relevant from the irrelevant language in any given context is believed to require cognitive control, and practicing this control leads to enhanced executive functioning. |
| **Is bilingualism related to a cognitive advantage in children?** | • However, the specific underlying mechanisms of language control, including inhibition, monitoring, attention, and disengagement, that lead to enhanced executive functioning are still largely unknown.  
• This is partly due to the complex nature of both language and domain general executive functions, which are multi-faceted.  
• The present meta-analysis examines the bilingual advantage in EF of children aged 18 years and under for different components of inhibition (hot; rewarding stimuli/cold; neutral stimuli), attention, switching, monitoring, working memory, and planning in 143 independent group comparisons comprising 583 EF effect sizes.  
• The bilingual advantage in overall EF was significant, albeit marginal \( (g \approx 0.06) \), and there were indications of publication bias. A moderator analysis showed significant group differences on EF in favor of bilinguals for studies of children from middle-class socioeconomic backgrounds and studies from one specific lab.  
• The EF components of cold inhibition, switching, and monitoring expressed significant bilingual advantages, but monitoring and cold inhibition were affected by publication bias.  
• Thus, given the small mean effect size and small-study effects, this meta-analysis gives little support for a bilingual advantage on overall EF. Still, also after the moderator analysis, there was a large heterogeneity of true effects and a large amount of unexplained heterogeneity in the effect sizes.  
• Thus, there might be bilingual advantages (or disadvantages) under conditions that this study is not able to identify through the analysis of 12 moderators. |

| **Bilingualism: the good, the bad, the indifferent** | • The paper summarizes research showing that bilingualism affects linguistic and cognitive performance across the lifespan.  
• The effect on linguistic performance is generally seen as a deficit in which bilingual children control a smaller vocabulary than their monolingual peers and bilingual adults perform more poorly on rapid lexical retrieval tasks.  
• The effect on cognitive performance is to enhance executive functioning and to protect against the decline of executive control in aging.  
• These effects interact to produce a complex pattern regarding the effect of bilingualism on memory performance.  
• Memory tasks based primarily on verbal recall are performed more poorly by bilinguals but memory tasks based primarily on executive control are performed better by bilinguals.  
• Speculations regarding the mechanism responsible for these effects are described. |

| **Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language** | • This study included a total of 788 fifth through eighth grade students who had participated in a Spanish English or Mandarin-English dual language program, surveyed students’ language proficiencies, ratings of bilingualism, and social and cognitive functioning.  
• DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual.  
• There were significant group difference according to the target program model (90:10) vs (50:50), level of bilingualism, and whether students were native target language or English speakers. |

| **A Template Analysis of Teacher Agency at an Academically** | • Purpose of this research was to identify both the factors that inform teachers’ sense of agency (antecedents) and the instructional behaviors that result from that sense of agency (manifestations). |
Successful Dual Language School

- Research questions: What are the characteristics of teacher agency at an academically successful dual language school?
- Figure 4 on page 19

Leveraging Language(s): Reframing Rhetoric’s of Fear with Narratives of Agency and Hope

- Manuel’s story: multiple languages, literacies and discourses that he negotiates on a regular basis.
- Recognizing the sociopolitical discourses of race and immigration status, among others, that marginalize English learners encourages the co-construction of critical knowledges that recognize and sustain the multiple languages, identities, and literacies of minoritized students.
- If we fear our immigrant students and their languages, how might this play out in our classrooms? If we fear black and brown people and their cultural practices, how might we treat black and brown students in our classrooms? How we answer these questions will ultimately mediate how we interpret educational policies that attempt to standardize our students—and, as Freire and Macedo (1987) posited, how we read, write, and transform our world.
- Constructing literacy as empowering and transformative, especially in times of generalized fear and anxiety, requires interrogating the knowledge and practices that are explicitly and implicitly valued in schools and in educational research, in ways that offset the linear and positivist influence of traditional epistemologies (Banks, 1993)

Bringing the Outside in: Negotiating knowledge and agency in multilingual learning contexts

- Extension of Baynham’s discussion of student agency and interrogate the “bringing the outside in” metaphor to explore some of the following issues (a) what is being brought in, who brings it in and what responses it triggers; (b) what kinds of resources are being negotiated, via what types of activities and modalities; (c) what kinds of values are attached to different types of resources, practices and preferences and in what ways they index broader processes of social reproduction and (d) what kind of agency is being called upon by different actors, what are the different discursive spaces that emerge and what are the constraints and possibilities imposed/offered by different learning contexts.
- Language and literacy practices are interwoven with classroom, institutional and policy arrangements (Poveda & Relano, Simpson,
Lytra), interact with dominant language norms and broader societal discourses (Møller & Jørgensen, Madsen), are used to negotiate and perform a range of personal and social identities (Simpson, Møller & Jørgensen, Poveda & Relano, Madsen) and create discursive spaces for the articulation of agency (Jessel et al., Simpson, Lytra) across a range of formal and informal learning contexts.

### Mother Tongue, a Necessary Step to Intellectual Development

- The intimate link between language and cognitive development forms the core of this present article. It focuses on the important contribution of mother tongue in the process of cognitive development.
- Two major theories of development: Piaget and Vygotsky's views are investigated in relation to language. It is concluded that, although thought is the base, language intellectualizes it to a great deal.
- Problem with Piaget's theory: children need more than experiences with the environment; they also need to interact socially.
- Vygotsky: we construct reality. Without words to think and communicate, our lives would be very different from what it is.

### Why Bilinguals Are Smarter

- A bilingual speaker’s brain has two active language systems even when he is using only one language. That creates situations in which one system obstructs the other. But this interference turns out to be a blessing, not a handicap, because it forces the brain to resolve internal conflict, which gives the mind a workout that strengthens its cognitive muscles.
- Evidence from a number of studies demonstrates that “the bilingual experience improves the brain’s so-called executive function — a command system that directs the attention processes that we use for planning, solving problems, and performing various other mentally demanding tasks. These processes include ignoring distractions to stay focused, switching attention willfully from one thing to another and holding information in mind — like remembering a sequence of directions while driving.”
- The key difference between bilinguals and monolinguals may be more basic: a heightened ability to monitor the environment. “Bilinguals have to switch languages quite often — you may talk to your father in one language and to your mother in another language,” said Albert Costa, a researcher at the University of Pompeu Fabra in Spain. “It requires keeping track of changes around you in the same way that we monitor our surroundings when driving.”

### The role of native-language instruction in bilingual education

- Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, positive self-concept, a negative self-concept is detrimental to learning, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child.
- Importance of the native language: use of native language enhances learning; fund of language has a circular relationship with intellect, use of language for discovery, Failure to allow sufficient language development before the transition will result in a child’s being unable to cope with anything but the most shallow levels of learning and will affect that child’s future capability for learning.
- “The extent to which a person develops his or her intellectual capacity depends greatly on the extent of language acquisition and use.’
- Not only can we prevent academic retardation and negative self-concepts through the use of native language instruction, but the
child’s whole future capability for learning can be effectively enhanced

### Executive Function of the Brain

| L1 and L1 Picture Naming in Mandarin-English Bilinguals: A Test of Bilingual Dual Coding Theory | • This study examined the nature of bilinguals’ conceptual representations and the links from these representations to words in L1 and L2. Specifically, it tested an assumption of the Bilingual Dual Coding Theory that conceptual representations include image representations, and that learning two languages in separate contexts can result in differences in referential images for L1 and L2.  
  • Mandarin–English participants named aloud culturally-biased images and culturally-unbiased filler images presented on a computer screen in both Mandarin (L1) and English (L2).  
  • Culturally biased images were named significantly faster in the culturally-congruent language than in the incongruent language.  
  • These findings indicate that some image representations are more strongly connected to one language than the other, providing support for the Bilingual Dual Coding Theory. |
|---|---|
| Rethinking Bilingual Instruction | • Researchers have now identified cognitive advantages for bilingual children that include enhanced executive function of the brain, resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001; Diaz & Klinger, 1991); increased short-term memory (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013); and enhanced problem-solving skills (Lauchlan, Parisi, & Fadda, 2013).  
  • These advantages are explained in part by the bilingual brain’s greater flexibility and ability to exclude competing stimuli as a result of having to constantly distinguish between two or more languages. |
| Executive functions in two-way dual-language education: A mechanism for academic performance | • This study examined the possibility that enhanced executive functions through second-language exposure underlie the academic benefits of dual-language education in a rural, low-income, sample of elementary school students.  
  • Executive functions are the top-down processes that are required for effortful cognition such as reasoning, problem-solving, and planning and include the core components of inhibition, interference control, working memory, and cognitive flexibility (Diamond, 2013). Executive functions are positively correlated to both socio-economic status (SES; e.g., Nesbitt et al., 2013) and academic performance (for review, see Serpell & Esposito, 2016).  
  • The researchers propose that two-way dual-language education fosters executive functions similar to the advantage found in bilingual individuals and that well-developed executive functions are a mechanism for an academic advantage.  
  • In the present cross-sectional study, the researchers recruited a sample of primary and intermediate elementary students in either two-way dual-language education (Spanish/English) or mainstream English education in an area of rural poverty within the same schools.  
  • The participating school system provided academic data. Parents provided information about the home environment and family demographics. Researchers met with students individually to measure executive functions as well as variables that permitted us to create a matched-sample of students in two-way dual-language education and the mainstream English model.  
  • The present study had four research questions: 1) is there an academic advantage for children enrolled in two-way dual-language compared to mainstream English education in an area of rural poverty; 2) is the second-language experience provided through a 50/50 two-way dual-language education model sufficient to benefit
executive functions; and, if so, 3) is there evidence that executive functions are a mechanism through which the academic advantage for two-way dual-language participants emerges? Relatedly, 4) does the pattern of results in a full-sample analyses replicate in a matched-sample controlling for participant intelligence and family demographics?

- The pattern of results supported an academic advantage for intermediate TWDL students. The advantage in executive functions was less robust, emerging for TWDL students in behavioral ratings but not in computerized measures. Using the behavioral rating measure of executive functions and a standardized measure of math performance, we did find evidence for executive functions as a mechanism supporting the academic advantage.
- While there were few differences between those in TWDL and mainstream education in the computerized measures of executive functions, the behavioral rating measure revealed a significant difference between education models such that children in the TWDL program exhibited fewer indicators of executive dysfunction in the classroom. The difference was present at both the primary and the intermediate level.
- The results did indicate that the academic advantage found on the standardized math assessment for children at the intermediate level of the TWDL program was mediated by executive functions behaviors exhibited in the classroom.
- The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels, yet the academic advantage was only present in the intermediate students.

Bilingual Cognition and Growth Mindset: A Review of Cognitive Flexibility and Its Implications for Dual-Language Education

- This research reviews two areas of research that have implications for educational policy, and also have theoretical implications for early cognitive development.
- The first area focuses on cognitive flexibility in bilingual populations. The second area focuses on growth mindset.
- The researchers highlight the parallels in these constructs, arguing that **bilinguals may be uniquely receptive to growth mindset interventions due to their increased cognitive flexibility**.
- The researchers identify specific ways that growth mindset interventions could be applied to support dual-language learners.
- The researchers argue that future research in both areas may provide researchers and educators with a better understanding of early cognitive development in bilingual populations and the emergence of growth mindset in all populations.

Different features of bilingualism in relation to executive functioning

- Criticism have been raised that studies demonstrating a bilingual advantage often suffer from small sample sizes, and do not control for fluid intelligence as a possible confound.
- Taking those suggested factors into account, focusing on older bilingual age groups, and investigating the potential effects of linguistic distances, this study aimed to improve the interpretations of the bilinguals’ advantages.
- Measures of inhibition (Flanker, Stroop, Simon task) and switching (Number-letter, Color-Shape, Local-global task) were collected in participants in the ages 50–75 years ($n = 193$).
- Despite a large study sample, results did not support any beneficial effects related to improve processing costs in executive functioning.
- Sub- analyses of the two different language groups (Swedish–Finnish / Swedish–English) intended to investigate the effect of linguistic distances did not change this outcome.
- Future studies exploring the potential long-term term effects of bilingualism would benefit from identifying tests of cognitive control with greater ecological validity and include other measures of cognitive functioning. Language learning interventions may also be a promising tool for future research.

**Investigating the effects of language-switching frequency on attentional and executive functioning in proficient bilinguals**

- Recent studies have proposed that the executive advantages associated with bilingualism may stem from language-switching frequency rather than from bilingualism per se (see, for example, Prior and Gollan, 2011).
- Barbu et al. (2018) showed that high-frequency switchers (HFLSs) outperformed low-frequency switchers (LFLSs) on a mental flexibility task but not on alertness or response inhibition tasks.
- The aim of the present study was to replicate these results as well as to compare proficient (HFLSs and LFLSs) to a control group of monolingual participants. Two groups of proficient bilingual adults (30 HFLSs and 21 LFLSs) and a group of 28 monolinguals participated in the study.
  - The results showed superior mental flexibility skills in HFLSs compared to (LFLSs) and monolinguals; furthermore, the two latter groups showed no difference in mental flexibility skills.
  - These results provide novel support for the hypothesis that the so-called bilingual advantage is, in fact, a result of language-switching habits.

**Bilingualism and executive functioning**

- This book examines the hypothesis that using two languages leads to the enhancement of domain-general executive functioning (EF) and argues that either the bilingual advantage does not exist or is restricted to very specific circumstances.
- The conclusion extends to situations where EF is referred to as self-control, self-regulation, self-discipline, attention-control, impulse control, inhibitory control, cognitive control, and willpower.
  - Empirical evidence does not support a bilingual advantage on EF that is distinguishable from zero.
  - This includes new data that compares tests of the bilingual advantage hypothesis based on self-reports of cognitive control to performance-based measures of EF.

**Is bilingualism associated with enhanced executive functioning in adults? A meta-analytic review**

- Because of enduring experience of managing two languages, bilinguals have been argued to develop superior executive functioning compared with monolinguals.
- Despite extensive investigation, there is, however, no consensus regarding the existence of such a bilingual advantage.
- Researchers synthesized comparisons of bilinguals’ and monolinguals’ performance in six executive domains using 891 effect sizes from 152 studies on adults.
- Researchers also included unpublished data and considered the potential influence of a number of study, task, and participant-related variables.
  - Before correcting estimates for observed publication bias, the analyses revealed a very small bilingual advantage for inhibition, shifting, and working memory, but not for monitoring or attention.
  - No evidence for a bilingual advantage remained after correcting for bias.
  - For verbal fluency, our analyses indicated a small bilingual disadvantage, possibly reflecting less exposure for each individual language when using two languages in a balanced manner.
  - Moreover, moderator analyses did not support theoretical presuppositions concerning the bilingual advantage.
Researchers conclude that the available evidence does not provide systematic support for the widely held notion that bilingualism is associated with benefits in cognitive control functions in adults.

**Interactions between levels of attention ability and levels of bilingualism in children’s executive functioning**

- Attention difficulty is associated with poor performance on executive functioning (EF) tasks, yet EF is enhanced in bilingual children.
- However, no research to date has investigated the possible interaction between bilingualism and attention ability in children to determine the consequences for EF when both are present.
- Researchers assessed a sample of typically developing children who were 8 to 11 years old for their ability in attention control and level of bilingualism on the basis of questionnaires completed by parents and teachers.
- Children performed three tasks requiring aspects of EF: stop signal task (inhibition), flanker task (interference control), and frogs matrices task (spatial working memory).
- Results from hierarchical regressions confirmed that both attention ability and bilingualism contributed to performance on the EF tasks.
- Attention ability was a stronger predictor for an inhibition task, namely stop signal, and bilingualism a stronger predictor for an interference task, namely flanker.
- Furthermore, these results allow us to discuss the relation between EF and attention ability.
- Consistent with previous literature, poor attention was associated with poorer EF and greater degree of bilingualism was associated with better EF performance across all tasks.
- Interactions showed that each of bilingualism and attention ability is primary for different EF tasks.

**Balanced bilingualism and executive functioning in children**

- The extant research suggests bilingualism is associated with enhanced cognitive effects, most evident in attention and executive functioning (EF).
- The current study examined the contributions of balance in the bilingualism (Spanish English) of children to performance-based measures and caregiver ratings of EF.
- Participants included 30 bilingual children.
- Balance in children’s bilingualism was correlated with caregiver ratings of task initiation.
- After controlling for demographic variables, balance in bilingualism significantly accounted for 37% of the variance in ratings of children’s task initiation.
- Additional research is needed regarding associations between dual-language exposure, linguistic competence, and cognitive development in children.

**Maturation of executive functioning skills in early sequential bilingualism**

- Previous research has demonstrated that being bilingual from birth is advantageous for the development of skills of social cognition, executive functioning, and metalinguistic awareness due to bilingual children’s extensive experience of processing and manipulating two linguistic systems.
- The present study investigated whether these cognitive advantages are also evident in sequential bilinguals, i.e., children who began the acquisition of their second language later in childhood.
- Monolingual English- and English-speaking children acquiring Welsh as a second language matched in age (M age:.4.6), and English receptive vocabulary completed three tasks of attentional control, metalinguistic awareness, and meta representation.
- Sequential bilinguals outperformed monolinguals in the task of attentional control, while no differences were found in the metalinguistic awareness and meta representation tasks.
- These findings suggest that attentional control is the first cognitive component advantaged by early sequential bilingualism and further highlight the benefits of second language exposure in the context of early formal education.

### Bilingualism narrows socioeconomic disparities in executive functions and self-regulatory behaviors during early childhood: Evidence from the early childhood longitudinal study

- Socioeconomic status (SES) and bilingualism have been shown to influence executive functioning during early childhood.
- Less is known, however, about how the two factors interact within an individual.
- By analyzing a nationally representative sample of approximately 18,200 children who were tracked from ages 5 to 7 across four waves, both higher SES and bilingualism were found to account for greater performance on the inhibition and shifting aspects of executive functions (EF) and self-regulatory behaviors in classroom.
- However, only SES reliably predicted verbal working memory.
- Furthermore, bilingualism moderated the effects of SES by ameliorating the detrimental consequences of low-SES on EF and self-regulatory behaviors.
- These findings underscore bilingualism’s power to enrich executive functioning and self-regulatory behaviors, especially among underprivileged children.

### Should the search for bilingual advantages in executive functioning continue?

- View: bilingual advantages in EF either do not exist or are restricted to very specific and undetermined circumstances
- Studies reporting significant bilingual advantages are typically underpowered and that less than a handful of labs have invested in studies with large samples sizes.
- We should rely on theory-based studies.
- Neuroscience will be the key that unlocks the elusive relationship between bilingual language control and general cognitive control.

### Bilingual advantages in executive functioning: Evidence form a low-income sample

- Recent research suggests that bilinguals might exhibit advantages in several areas of executive function, including working memory, inhibitory control, and attentional control.
- Few studies have examined potential bilingual advantages within lower socioeconomic status (SES) populations. This article addresses this gap in the literature by investigating whether low-SES Spanish–English bilingual preschoolers exhibited advantages in executive function relative to two monolingual control groups (English, Spanish).
- Across three experiments, bilingual children exhibited superior performance on two different measures of visual–spatial memory, as well as measures of inhibitory and attentional control.
- These results suggest that bilinguals exhibit broad advantages in executive function during the preschool years, and these advantages are evident within a disadvantaged, low-SES population.

### The effects of bilingualism on toddlers’ executive functioning

- Bilingual children have been shown to outperform monolingual children on tasks measuring executive functioning skills.
- This advantage is usually attributed to bilinguals’ extensive practice in exercising selective attention and cognitive flexibility during language use because both languages are active when one of them is being used.
- This article examined whether this advantage is observed in 24-month-olds who have had much less experience in language production.
• A battery of executive functioning tasks and the cognitive scale of the Bayley test were administered to 63 monolingual and bilingual children.
  • Native bilingual children performed significantly better than monolingual children on the Stroop task, with no difference between groups on the other tasks, confirming the specificity of bilingual effects to conflict tasks reported in older children.
  • These results demonstrate that bilingual advantages in executive control emerge at an age not previously shown.

Revisiting theoretical and causal explanations for the bilingual advantage in executive functioning

• Bilinguals' routine deployment of selective attention and inhibition in the domain of language is assumed to hone these executive processes to such an extent that far transfer of attentional control to non-linguistic domains ultimately occurs. Hence, bilinguals are expected to outperform monolinguals on non-linguistic executive functioning tasks.
• Paap, Johnson, and Sawi (2015) provide several compelling arguments for why the empirical evidence in support of a bilingual advantage in executive functioning is shaky.
• Many monolinguals might not differ fundamentally from bilinguals in terms of their reliance on executive control processes during lexical access.
• Links between bilingualism and executive functioning may, at least in part, arise because superior executive functioning is a cause rather than a consequence of bilingualism.
• Moreover, given that individuals tend to seek out environments and pursuits that best suit their cognitive strengths (Haworth et al., 2010), superior executive functioning might predict which individuals are likely to seek out language learning opportunities in the first place.

The impact of bilingualism on executive functions and working memory in adults

• A bilingual advantage in a form of a better performance of bilinguals in tasks tapping into executive function abilities has been reported repeatedly in the literature.
• Recent research defends that this advantage does not stem from bilingualism, but from uncontrolled factors or imperfectly matched samples.
• This study explores the potential impact of bilingualism on executive functioning abilities by testing large groups of young adult bilinguals and monolinguals in the tasks that were most extensively used when the advantages were reported.
• Importantly, the recently identified factors that could be disrupting the between groups comparisons were controlled for, and both groups were matched.
  • Researchers found no differences between groups in their performance.
  • Additional bootstrapping analyses indicated that, when the bilingual advantage appeared, it very often co-occurred with unmatched socio-demographic factors.
  • The evidence presented here indicates that the bilingual advantage might indeed be caused by spurious uncontrolled factors rather than bilingualism per se.
  • Secondly, bilingualism has been argued to potentially affect working memory also. Therefore, these researchers tested the same participants in both a forward and a backward version of a visual and an auditory working memory task.
  • Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions.

Parents report fewer executive functioning problems and repetitive behaviors in young

• More dual language learners (DLLs) are being identified early with autism spectrum disorder (ASD). However, many families are still being advised against dual language exposure, despite a lack of evidence of negative impacts on language development in ASD.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| dual-language speakers with autism | • Research in typically developing children has noted advantages for bilinguals in domains such as executive functioning and social skills, but less is known about the effects in ASD.  
• The present study evaluated differences in executive functioning and social communication in young children (n = 55) with ASD.  
• Dual-language learners with ASD had significantly fewer parent reported executive functioning problems and repetitive behaviors; parent-reported social communication skills were generally comparable across groups.  
• Our findings indicate that the bilingual advantage in executive functioning may extend to children with neurodevelopmental conditions. |
| Word mapping and executive functioning in young monolingual and bilingual children | • The effect of bilingualism on the cognitive skills of young children was investigated by comparing performance of 162 children who belonged to one of two age groups (approximately 3- and 4.5-year-olds) and one of three language groups on a series of tasks examining executive control and word mapping.  
• The children were monolingual English speakers, monolingual French speakers, or bilinguals who spoke English and one of a large number of other languages.  
• Monolinguals obtained higher scores than bilinguals on a receptive vocabulary test and were more likely to demonstrate the mutual exclusivity constraint, especially at the younger ages.  
• However, bilinguals obtained higher scores than both groups of monolinguals on three tests of executive functioning: Luria’s tapping task measuring response inhibition, the opposite worlds task requiring children to assign incongruent labels to a sequence of animal pictures, and reverse categorization in which children needed to reclassify a set of objects into incongruent categories after an initial classification.  
• There were no differences between the groups in the attentional network’s flanker task requiring executive control to ignore a misleading cue.  
• This evidence for a bilingual advantage in aspects of executive functioning at an earlier age than previously reported is discussed in terms of the possibility that bilingual language production may not be the only source of these developmental effects. |
| Do Spanish-English bilingual children outperform monolingual English-speaking children on executive function tasks in early childhood? A propensity score analysis | • Despite much research examining whether bilingual individuals demonstrate superior executive function (EF) skills compared to monolinguals, the purported bilingual advantage remains controversial.  
• One potential reason for discrepant findings across studies examining the bilingual advantage is the difficulty in matching monolingual and bilingual groups on important confounding variables that are related to EF.  
• To address this limitation of prior research, these researchers used a propensity score matching approach to evaluate the presence of the bilingual advantage in the Early Childhood Longitudinal Study, Kindergarten Class of 2010–2011.  
• Consistent with recent theories of EF development; these researchers hypothesized that before matching, they would observe bilingual advantages on report- but not performance-based measures of EF.  
• However, they expected that after matching bilingual and monolingual children on a comprehensive set of covariates there would be no group differences in EF.  
• The researchers matched bilingual Spanish-English and monolingual English kindergarteners on a comprehensive set of child- and school-level covariates and conducted a sensitivity analysis to evaluate whether results were sensitive to unobserved confounds. |
After matching groups (n = 252 matched pairs of monolingual and bilingual children), bilinguals had greater teacher-rated inhibitory control and attentional focus than did monolinguals; however, only the effect for inhibitory control was robust to unobserved confounds.

- No effects of bilingualism were observed for performance-based measures of working memory or cognitive flexibility. Results are discussed in the context of recent theoretical models of EF development in early childhood.
- Recent theory suggests that children’s engagement in goal-directed behavior (e.g., sharing toys with friends) directly influences their cognitive development.
- In addition, there is debate over the extent to which the unique experiences of bilingual children afford advantages in cognitive development.
- Our findings suggest that young bilingual children’s unique experiences lead to greater ability to use cognitive skills to engage in goal-directed behavior, when compared to monolingual children.
- Therefore, bilingualism may have important influences on cognitive development that can help support children’s success in school and beyond.
- Advanced inhibitory control skills have been found in bilingual speakers as compared to monolingual controls (Bialystok, 1999).
- These researchers examined whether this effect is generalized to an unstudied language group (Spanish-English bilingual) and multiple measures of executive function by administering a battery of tasks to 50 kindergarten children drawn from three language groups: native bilinguals, monolinguals (English), and English speakers enrolled in second-language immersion kindergarten.
- Despite having significantly lower verbal scores and parent education/income level, Spanish-English bilingual children’s raw scores did not differ from their peers.
- After statistically controlling for these factors and age, native bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function battery than both other groups.
- Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call for managing conflicting attentional demands (Conflict tasks); there was no advantage on impulse-control (Delay tasks).
- These results advance our understanding of both the generalizability and specificity of the compensatory effects of bilingual experience for children’s cognitive development.

### Bilingual experience and executive functioning in young children

- Advanced inhibitory control skills have been found in bilingual speakers as compared to monolingual controls (Bialystok, 1999).
- These researchers examined whether this effect is generalized to an unstudied language group (Spanish-English bilingual) and multiple measures of executive function by administering a battery of tasks to 50 kindergarten children drawn from three language groups: native bilinguals, monolinguals (English), and English speakers enrolled in second-language immersion kindergarten.
- Despite having significantly lower verbal scores and parent education/income level, Spanish-English bilingual children’s raw scores did not differ from their peers.
- After statistically controlling for these factors and age, native bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function battery than both other groups.
- Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call for managing conflicting attentional demands (Conflict tasks); there was no advantage on impulse-control (Delay tasks).
- These results advance our understanding of both the generalizability and specificity of the compensatory effects of bilingual experience for children’s cognitive development.

### Educational Development

#### Academic Achievement

- Research from a variety of studies demonstrates that:
  a) students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized reading and mathematics tests
  b) they score similar to their statewide peers by about grade 5-7, if not sooner
  c) English Learners close the achievement gap with NES students in English-Only classrooms by about fifth grade;
  d) They achieve at or above grade level in reading (and math) tests measured in the partner language

- DLE middle and high school students are:
  a) as or more likely to be enrolled in higher level math courses.
  b) as or more likely to pass the high school exit exam.
  c) less likely to drop out of school
  d) more likely to close the gap with NES peers by the end of high school
• English Learners were as or more likely to be classified by state assessments as proficient in English if they were participating in DLE programs than if they were enrolled in English mainstream programs.

• These findings have emerged from a variety of studies with different authors in different parts of the country, with different types of communities and socio-economic backgrounds, and with students of different ethnic, linguistic, socioeconomic, and special needs.

A Template Analysis of Teacher Agency at an Academically Successful Dual Language School

• Using Bandura’s (1989) notion of human agency, this case study examined the characteristics of teacher agency at an academically successful DL elementary school.

• The purpose of this research was to identify both the factors that inform teachers’ sense of agency (antenecedents) and the instructional behaviors that result from that sense of agency (manifestations).

• The research question that guided the study was: What are the characteristics of teacher agency at an academically successful dual language school?

• Given the teachers’ critical role in student achievement (Wright, Horn, & Sanders, 1997), examination of successful teachers can result in an enhanced understanding of effective teaching practices.

• These findings are significant because they acknowledge and inform the work of educators.

Meeting the Needs of English Language Learners with Disability in Urban Settings

• The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth.

• For English Learners with disabilities to succeed in bilingual special education programs, they need to be part of a school that promotes bilingualism and provides students with exemplary instructional practices.

• It is important that teachers understand prevention programs and prereferral strategies to avoid inappropriate placement in special education. It is also critical for teachers to understand stages in primary and second language acquisition and development.

Rethinking Bilingual Instruction

• Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages.
- Small-scale studies have shown the advantages of dual language programs (Genesee, Lindholm-Leary, Saunders, & Christian, 2006).
- Recently reliable long-term data became available when Umansky and Reardon (2014) followed children assigned to English-only, bilingual, and two-way dual language programs in a large western district from kindergarten to high school.
- Students who remained in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake students assigned to English-only programs at about the 5th grade; by high school, they were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured, including English language arts scores and reclassification to English-proficient status.
- Researchers were able to control for student background variables, including socioeconomic status, ethnicity, and English proficiency outside of school.

### Executive functions in two-way dual-language education: A mechanism for academic performance

- Multiple studies indicate that children in bilingual education models (including dual-language and immersion models) have academic outcomes that match or even exceed those of their peers in mainstream education models, especially in later elementary grades.
- For example, Marian et al. (2013) investigated the academic achievement of students in grades 3, 4, or 5 (approximately ages 8–10 years), a portion of which were enrolled in a two-way dual-language program. They found an advantage in academic performance in math across all three grade levels and reading in 3rd grade.
- Similarly, Watzinger-Tharp, Swenson, and Mayne (2018) examined growth in over 2000 4th grade students in either mainstream English education or a dual-language education model (comprised of both one-way and two-way models across three partner languages). In a matched-sample of mainstream and dual-language students, the dual-language students showed greater growth in math achievement across the 4th grade year.
- In a metanalysis of 10 studies reporting academic performance for students in one-way or two-way dual-language programs compared to mainstream programs, Hill (2018) determined the effect to be null. The results indicated a small positive effect that Hill proposed could be easily nullified by the inclusion of a few studies with even small negative effects.
- Attrition, he reports, is likely to positively affect the socio-economic status of the group because low-income families are more transitory and more likely to relocate, leaving predominantly higher socioeconomic status students in the program.

### The Academic Preparedness of Latino Students in Dual Language and Transitional Bilingual Education Programs

- This causal-comparative study analyzed the college readiness of Latino English Learners educated in two different bilingual education programs, Transitional Bilingual (TB) and Dual Language (DL), by examining science and mathematics scores on the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the ACT.
- A statistically significant difference was found in the performance of the participants in the areas of mathematics and science via a series of t-tests.
- The descriptive statistics report that DL participants had a 29.6% higher probability in science and a 15.2% higher probability in mathematics of being college ready, per the Texas Uniform Admission Policy.
- Overall, DL participants outperformed TB participants.

### Dual Language Education: A Promising 50:50 Model

- Two basic dual language models are the 90-10 model and the 50-50 model.
- This article describes a unique 50-50 model that divides the language of instruction by content area as well as by time.
| The model has been successfully implemented in regions with high concentrations of Latino students. |
| It does not require a 50-50 balance of native English speakers and native Spanish speakers. |
| Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics. |

| A longitudinal study for the social and academic competence of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children |
| This longitudinal study was conducted to gain understanding of the social–emotional and academic development of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children. |
| In Study 1, the authors combined cognitive, psychosocial, and cultural-linguistic factors to determine profiles of social competence as measured by peer play. A person-centered analysis of 207 Hispanic American preschoolers (ages 4 and 5 years) yielded 6 distinct profiles, 2 of which were socially competent and 1 of which was vulnerable. |
| Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development. |
| In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were associated with later academic achievement and growth of English proficiency. Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism. |

| Placement of former English language learners in middle schools: general education or dual language? |
| Historically, many educators have attempted to help English Language Learners (English Learners) develop sufficient English skills to be reclassified so that they can be placed in general-education classrooms. |
| At present, educators increasingly favor a policy of placing former English Learners in dual language settings. |
| But it remains unclear whether former English Learners in middle schools perform better academically in general-education (GE) or dual language (DL) classrooms. |
| Research was conducted to compare former English Learners placed in GE settings and those who remained in DL classrooms on state tests in English Language Arts (ELA) and math (n = 99) at the middle-school level. |
| In both subjects, DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. |
| Calling into question policies favoring placement of former English Learners in GE classes, the results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. |

| Contesting math as the universal language: a longitudinal study of dual language bilingual education language allocation |
| In this study, researchers used a quasi-experimental, longitudinal design to examine the English language arts (ELA) and mathematics test scores of emergent bilinguals (EBs) in DLBE 50:50 models versus English as a second language (ESL) models in Indiana over four academic school years. |
| With a focus on the midwestern U.S., researchers bring attention to a less-studied area where the EB population is more recent, but quickly growing. |
| Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. |
The discussion and implications caution the English as a second language, bilingual, and dual language bilingual education fields to conduct a comprehensive analysis of content allocation and content complexity in relationship to language designation, instead of solely focusing on the overall language allocation of the DLBE program model.

### Dual Language Programs: An Exploration of Bilingual Students’ Academic Achievement, Language Proficiencies, and Engagement Using a Mixed Methods Approach

- Employing a mixed-methods research design, this study examines how a newly designed dual language program in an urban school advances language proficiencies among Spanish-English bilingual 6th graders in relation to content area achievement as measured on NYS standardized tests in English Language Arts and Math.
- It further investigates how students’ emotional (school identification) and behavioral engagement (language learning commitment) relate to bilingual language proficiencies.
- The results drawn from both quantitative and qualitative data indicate that bilingual students benefitted from attending a dual language program. It contributes positively to students’ academic achievement, bilingual school identification and commitment to language learning.
- With respect to language development, the study found that English proficiency in productive skills was positively correlated with standardized test scores.
- Spanish proficiency was positively correlated with students’ commitment to language learning.
- Spanish and English languages play different but equally important functions in the dual language program.
- However, students, face challenges in sustaining learning the two languages in school; researchers show that students experience a gradual language shift from Spanish to English.
- The study underscores the potential benefits of a multilingual proficiency perspective theory among the students and in preparing bilingual teachers.

### Fostering greater equity for emergent bilinguals through dual language programming

- Research shows that long-term DL programs can close achievement gaps between English-proficient speakers and emergent bilinguals after five years, while short-term bilingual or English-only transitional programs close only about half of that gap (Collier & Thomas, 2017).
- Additional research finds that DL programming improves academic outcomes for traditionally under-served groups while fostering diverse learning environments for all learners.
- Students in DL programs outperform students who participate in non-DL programs.
- In North Carolina, DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level.
- Internationally, research shows the most powerful predictor of academic achievement for emergent bilinguals is the sustained development of the students’ home language through the school curriculum.
- By promoting bilingualism, the DL approach acknowledges that fluency in multiple languages is an asset to be developed, rather than a deficit to overcome.
- Within an asset-focused context, students have an opportunity to build linguistic capital, defined as “the intellectual and social skills attained through communication experiences in more than one language and/or style”

### Academic and English Language Outcomes for DLLs as a Function of the School Bilingual Education Mode: The role of Two-Way Immersion and Home Language Support

- This study assesses the long-term linguistic and academic outcomes associated with different bilingual language education models for low-income dual language learners (DLLs) residing in a bilingual, bicultural context.
- As part of the Miami School Readiness Project (MSRP), researchers analyzed the impact of program model on gains in English language
Proficiency and 5th grade standardized achievement in reading and math and grade point average (GPA) for five cohorts of DLLs followed throughout elementary school.

- Participants had been enrolled in public pre-K programs or received childcare subsidies to attend center- or family-childcare from 2002 to 2007 in Miami-Dade County, Florida (N = 20,870).
- Controlling for several student-level background variables correlated with educational outcomes, correlational and multiple regression analyses revealed that bilingual, rather than monolingual, forms of instruction were associated with acquiring English faster and superior performance in all measures of 5th grade academic achievement.
- Importantly, two-way immersion models that support the home language and culture and integrate language majority and minority learners were associated with faster English acquisition, which mediated the link between Two-Way Immersion (TWI) programs and higher GPAs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Latino Parents in Dual Language Immersion Programs: Why Are They So Satisfied?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Educators (school administrators, teachers, district officials, etc.) often use parental satisfaction ‘as one indicator of school success or one outcome of school effectiveness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Parent satisfaction is particularly attended to in educational settings where participation is voluntary (such as magnet or charter schools, for example).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- This article examines Latino parental satisfaction in four Oregon dual language immersion (DLI) schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- If past research, and these findings, are accurate, then researchers and educators can convincingly conclude that Latino parents are highly satisfied with bilingual education programs in general, and DLI programs, and there is no need for improvement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- This article argues that uncritically reporting high levels Latino parental satisfaction in bilingual programs can lead educators to become complacent to these parents’ concerns.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Latino parental satisfaction must be viewed through multiple lenses in order to avoid silencing their voices in DLI settings.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefits of Dual Language Immersion on the Academic Achievement of English Language Learners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- This pilot study compares the overall academic achievement in the area of language arts literacy among elementary bilingual students enrolled in either Dual Language: Two-Way Immersion programs or in an Early Exit, Transitional Bilingual program in a large urban public school district.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- By analyzing the results of curriculum-based measures in the area of word decoding and overall reading comprehension, this study shows that students who have continuously enrolled in a Dual Language: Two Way Immersion Bilingual Program reveal higher academic achievement than students enrolled in an Early Exit, Transitional Bilingual program, from kindergarten to third grade.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Achievement of Students in Dual Language Immersion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- This article reports on a study that investigated achievement in math of third and fourth grade dual language immersion (DLI) students, building on research that has demonstrated the academic achievement of students who receive content instruction predominantly in the target language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- This study expands the scope and methodology of prior research by including one-way programs in three languages (Chinese, French and Spanish) and two-way Spanish-English programs; and by relying on propensity matching to mitigate possible effects of school and student differences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- In the third-grade study, researchers compared students’ math scores in relation to their English Language Arts (ELA) achievement to control for pre-existing differences between DLI and non-DLI students.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Individual Versus Peer Grit: Influence on Later Individual Literacy Achievement of Dual Language Learners

- The objective of this short-term longitudinal study was to examine individual versus classroom peer effects of grit on later individual literacy achievement in elementary school.
- The dual language learner, largely Latina/o sample included students from the 3rd through the 5th grades.
- Participants completed a literacy achievement performance task at 3 time points over 4 months, in addition to student-reported grit at the first time point.
- Classroom peer grit, not individual grit, was a strong, significant predictor of an individual’s later literacy achievement, adjusting for previous literacy achievement, age, gender, home language, and classroom clusters.

### The Effects of Spanish English Dual Language Immersion on Student Achievement in Science and Mathematics

- In this study, researchers present quantitative findings on the effects of English-Spanish dual language immersion on student achievement in science and mathematics in grades 3, 4, and 5.
- The research aims to present empirical evidence documenting the impact of dual language immersion, reveal analytical techniques utilizing nonparametric measure of similar and comparative analysis, and discuss the benefits and common misconceptions associated with dual language immersion as well as implications for serving disadvantaged students and their success in STEM education.
- Dual language programs promote positive academic and social outcomes for all students and particularly for English language learners.
- Much of the progress of dual language programs is informed by Cummins’ (1979) developmental interdependence theory which posits that for students entering school with a home language (L1) that is different from the language of schooling (L2), their academic attainment is determined by a correlation between L1 and L2 competence and socio-cultural factors pertaining to the school and community. Cummins theorized that if L1 Spanish-speaking students enter an English-only L2 school environment at a young age with only rudimentary cognitive linguistic structures, their academic attainment will be limited since they lack a strong L1 base to build on and their development of English L2 will not keep pace with native English-speaking peers.
- Genessee et al. (2006) refer to L1 and L2 development as drawing from a "common underlying reservoir of literacy abilities" (p. 77). The most successful programs fill this reservoir by building proficiencies in both L1 and L2.
- When put together well, dual language programs can have a profound impact on student outcomes. Clarkson (2007) writes that "the
| Academic Development of Head Start Children: Role of Dual Language Learning Status | Using a large longitudinal dataset including children who attended Head Start over two years, this study examined academic growth trajectories during the period between Head Start entry and kindergarten (2.5 years), and whether those growth trajectories differ by children’s dual language learning status. Analyses comparing three groups of children (i.e., Spanish-English bilinguals, Spanish-English emergent bilinguals [EBs], and English monolinguals) showed three noteworthy findings. First, bilinguals entering Head Start with English proficiency showed similar developmental trajectories in vocabulary and math to those of monolinguals. Second, EBs entering Head Start with limited English proficiency presented the lowest baseline skills in vocabulary and math. Whereas the initial vocabulary gaps generally persisted over time, gaps in math between EBs and monolinguals narrowed by kindergarten. Third, no difference was found between bilinguals and EBs in their Spanish vocabulary development. Results highlight needs for additional instructional support and resources for EBs especially in their vocabulary development. |
| Effects of an Elementary Dual Language Immersion School Program on Junior High School Achievement | The purpose of this study was to analyze the effects of a two-way immersion elementary school program on academic achievement at the end of the elementary school and the end of the first year of junior high school. Longitudinal high stakes test data in reading, writing, and mathematics were collected on native English speakers and native Spanish speakers from the two-way immersion program and on matched controls through the use of an ex post facto quasieperimental design. Findings suggest consistent support for the two-way immersion program over matched control students across all three achievement areas. It appears the greatest effect for native English speakers may be in reading, while native Spanish speakers may benefit more in writing and mathematics. Limitations to generalizability and causal inferences due to the small sample sizes and inherent weaknesses of the research design are noted. |
| Successes Spur Push for Dual-Language Classes | Thomas & Collier have found that in the North Carolina districts with two-way, dual-language instruction, students score statistically significantly higher in reading in 4th grade than their nondual-language peers, a pattern that continues through 8th grade. By 5th grade, dual language students score about the same as their monolingual peers a grade ahead of them, an advantage that lasts through 8th grade. The same pattern plays out in math, with 5th-grade dual-language students scoring as high as non-program peers in 6th grade. Two groups of students are benefitting the most from dual language instruction: English language learners and African-American students. |
- For English-learners in dual language programs, reading scores in all the tested grades are much higher than for English Learners who are not in a dual-language program, according to the study.

### Academic Achievement and Wellbeing of Dual Language Learners: Evidence from a Busing Program

- Researchers exploit exogenous variation from a school desegregation policy to investigate the determinants of academic achievement and wellbeing of dual language learners.
- The policy buses some school starters with low host-country language proficiency from schools with many dual language learners, higher total budget for dual language learning and higher per-pupil spending to schools with fewer dual language learners but lower total budget for dual language learning and per-pupil spending.
- Assignment to busing is exogenous conditional on three observed individual characteristics, hence researchers compare bused and non-bused pupils conditional on these characteristics.
- Researchers find that assignment to forced busing has a negative effect on the academic performance and wellbeing of dual language learners, which is at odds with findings for school desegregation in the US.

### Four Essential Questions About Dual Language Education

- With the growing emphasis on a competitive global economy, support is increasing for dual language programs (DLPs) geared toward preparing students in bilingual and multilingual education.
- When properly implemented, DLPs are an effective way to improve academic achievement for all students (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).
- Though there is growing interest in implementing DLPs, the concept of DLPs is not clearly understood, and many teachers have questions and misunderstandings about them.
- Data has demonstrated that DLPs have benefited both English Learners and native English-speaking students in obtaining higher levels of academic achievement in all areas, as compared to their counterparts in mainstream classrooms.
- **Bilingual individuals have higher cognitive abilities, mental elasticity, and metalinguistic awareness** (August, Goldenberg, & Rueda, 2010).
- In states with high numbers of English Learners, such as Arizona, implementing a two-way 50/50 model can be beneficial for the academic achievement of all students involved in such programs.

### Portland Study Points to Reading Gains from Dual Language Programs

- A new study from RAND Education and the American Councils for International Education in conjunction with the Portland Public Schools has examined the effects of dual-language immersion (DU) on student achievement.
- The study covered DU programs in Spanish, Japanese, Mandarin Chinese, Russian, and Vietnamese, and included two-way programs, where half the students in the program were native speakers of English and the other half native speakers of the partner (non-English) language.
- The study found that:
  - Students randomly assigned to immersion outperformed their peers in English reading by about seven months in fifth grade and nine months in eighth grade.
  - There was no statistically significant benefit, but also no detriment, for math and science performance.
  - There were no clear differences in immersion effects by native language.
  - Reading effects for students whose native language matches the classroom partner language appear as high as or higher than for native English speakers.
  - There is suggestive but not statistically significant evidence that the immersion benefit in reading is higher for students in Spanish immersion programs, and that modest math benefits are higher for
students in the less commonly taught languages (Japanese, Mandarin, and Russian)

- Immersion students have three-point lower rates of classification as English Language Learners (English Learners) by sixth grade, and this effect is larger (14 points) if students' native language matches the classroom partner language.
- On average, immersion students reach intermediate levels of partner-language proficiency by eighth grade, with somewhat higher performance in Spanish and Chinese (intermediate mid-to-high) than in Japanese (intermediate low-to-mid).

**Succeeding with Latino Students**

- Studies show that Latino students still are seen as disadvantaged because of their language and culture.
- If the number of Latino students in your school is high, dual language programs can increase their academic achievement while also developing their biliteracy and bilingual skills (Reyes and Halcon 2001; Gomez 2005).
- With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students' future marketable skills.

**School/College Readiness**

**The Academic Preparedness of Latino Students in Dual Language and Transitional Bilingual Education Programs**

- This causal-comparative study analyzed the college readiness of Latino English Learners educated in two different bilingual education programs, Transitional Bilingual (TB) and Dual Language (DL), by examining science and mathematics scores on the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the ACT.
- A statistically significant difference was found in the performance of the participants in the areas of mathematics and science via a series of t-tests.
- The descriptive statistics report that DL participants had a 29.6% higher probability in science and a 15.2% higher probability in mathematics of being college ready, per the Texas Uniform Admissions Policy.
- Overall, DL participants outperformed TB participants.

**Conceptualizing preschool dual-language immersion education at Bobcat Canyon School**

- This study examined how parents, teachers, and administrators conceptualized dual-language immersion (DLI) education and its goals at Bobcat Canyon School (BCS, pseudonym), a private preschool in the Southwestern USA where 64% students were White and 36% were students of color.
- Through interviews with 15 parents, eight teachers, and two school administrators, the study exposed a conceptual confusion among the school community about what DLI education is and that BCS advertised a DLI brand without appropriate understanding and implementation.
- The analysis revealed that with a framework of neoliberal linguistic instrumentalism, the preschool conceptualized its DLI as an enriching context for students to obtain a cognitive, social, and academic edge. Cognitive development, social competencies, and school readiness were primary goals while bilingualism/biliteracy was a secondary bonus if achieved.
- The study exposed the need for the field to establish unique objectives and models of DLI at the preschool level and educate all stakeholders on the short- and long-term effects of DLI education.
- The study calls for promoting the historical mission of DLI in private programs and all existing DLI programs to examine their conceptual underpinnings.

**School readiness in language minority dual language learners in Japan: Language, executive function, and theory of mind**

- The present study investigated school readiness in Brazilian (Portuguese-Japanese dual language learner or DLL) 5-year-olds in Japan (1) by examining their language skills, executive function (EF), and theory of mind (ToM) in comparison to their monolingual
peers and (2) by investigating the developmental relations between these three skills.

- DLLs scored lower than monolinguals in Japanese language skills, specifically in receptive vocabulary and the understanding of complement clauses in Japanese.
- DLLs and monolinguals performed similarly in EF, particularly in inhibitory control tasks measuring interference suppression and response inhibition.
- However, monolinguals outperformed DLLs in ToM tasks assessing false belief understanding.
- Finally, DLLs’ interference suppression and understanding of complement clauses were both positively related to their false belief understanding.
- In conclusion, DLLs had school readiness difficulties in Japanese language skills and ToM, but not in EF, compared to their Japanese monolingual peers.
- Furthermore, the positive relationship of language and EF skills with ToM development, which is commonly reported in monolingual children, extended to an understudied population of DLLs in this study.

A Comparative Study on the College Readiness of Bilingual Learners in Transitional Bilingual and Dual Language Programs

- This study compared the performance of bilingual learners, educated in either a Transitional Bilingual (TB) or Dual Language (DL) program, on the Reading and English portions of the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the American College Test (ACT).
- A statistically significant difference was found on the t-tests run for the Reading (p > .000) and English (p > .000) portions of the ACT exam.
- Outlined in the Texas Uniform Admission Policy (TUAP) are recommended minimum scores students should meet in order to be deemed “college ready.” In the area of Reading, the TB comparison group (10.8%) had less than the DL comparison group (51.8%) meet the recommended minimum score outlined in the TUAP.
- Similar findings were found on the English portion of the ACT exam.
- A smaller percentage of participants in the TB comparison group (9%) meet the TUAP recommended minimum score for English than the DL comparison group (59.1%).
- By and large, DL participants outperformed the TB participants in this study.

Pro: All students benefit from dual-language programs

- The idea behind the immersion program is to get students from different backgrounds to work together while simultaneously aiding each other in communication.
- The benefits of a program include improved college readiness for all students involved -- not just the English Language Learners, who are largely Spanish speakers in the Crossroads, said Alejandro Mojica, the Victoria school district’s newly hired Bilingual and ESL Learning director.
- "Both groups of students would benefit from each other," said Mojica, a Columbia native. "Research shows that by the time they reach high school, these students are more college-ready than their peers who didn't participate in an immersion program."

Habla Conmigo: Teachers' Spanish Talk and Latino Dual Language Learners' School Readiness Skills

- Research Findings: Preschool is a critical period during which children’s development and learning exert a long-lasting impact on their school adjustment and academic outcomes.
- Although research on monolingual English-speaking children has identified elements of high-quality preschool experiences that can serve as the foundation for teaching all young children, educators
recognize that the current knowledge may be insufficient to promote dual language learners’ (DLLs) optimal learning.

- An area in which more research is needed to better serve DLLs in the preschool setting concerns how teachers use their students’ home language in the classroom.
- Using multilevel modeling, this study examined the specific ways teachers use students’ home language (Spanish) in their various verbal exchanges in the classroom (i.e., giving directions, requesting language, providing, and eliciting contextualized information, and providing and eliciting decontextualized information).
- These conversations with Latino DLLs, as measured by the Language Interaction Snapshot, uniquely contributed to students’ language and social skills at the end of the Head Start academic year.
  - Results revealed statistically significant relations between teachers’ Spanish talk and DLLs’ social outcomes.
  - Specifically, teachers’ Spanish talk with DLLs and DLLs’ initial English and Spanish skills were positively associated with the latter’s interactive peer play behaviors, whereas DLLs’ initial English skills were negatively associated with their disconnected peer play behaviors.
  - Practice or Policy: Implications for promoting more equitable language learning environments in preschool and for teacher professional development, as well as potential directions for future research investigating DLLs’ school readiness skills, are discussed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self-regulation development among young Spanish-English Language Learners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Despite strong evidence self-regulation skills are critical for school readiness, there remains a dearth of longitudinal studies that describe developmental trajectories of self-regulation, particularly among low-resource and underrepresented populations such as Spanish-English dual-language learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The present study examined individual differences in trajectories of self-regulation among 459 Spanish-English dual-language learners who were Hispanic from 4 different samples and 3 geographic locations in the United States.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-regulation was assessed in all samples using repeated administration of the Head-Toes-Knees-Shoulders (HTKS) task from early childhood through early elementary school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results of latent growth curve analyses revealed that growth was best represented by quadratic trajectories.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latent class growth analyses captured significant individual differences in self-regulation trajectories.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One group of children (41%) started with higher HTKS scores and displayed rapid early growth in performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A similar percentage of children (41%) displayed intermediate growth in self-regulation, starting with lower HTKS scores but displaying rapid growth commencing around 4.5 years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finally, about 18% of the sample did not display growth in HTKS performance until after entry to elementary school, around age 6 years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls were half as likely as boys to be in this later developing group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likewise, children from families at the upper end of the socioeconomic distribution in this low-income sample were significantly less likely to be in the later developing group relative to children from families with lower SES.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study findings indicate the importance of monitoring growth rates in self-regulation as a means of identifying children at risk for entering school without the requisite self-regulation skills.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Dual Language Learners through Culturally Responsive Early Childhood Family Education Programs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attending preschool may be particularly advantageous for DLLs for several reasons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First, achievement gaps are already established when DLLs enter kindergarten without having attended a preschool program, such as</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
being less able to recognize English letters, count to 20, or write their names compared with their English-dominant peers (Ansari, 2018).

- Second, preschool attendance promotes the native or first language (L1) and the target or second language (L2; English) and literacy development (Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016; Phillips et al., 2017).
- Academic language and social-behavioral skills also increase when DLLs attend public preschool programs (Ansari & López, 2015).
- Gains in English proficiency, reading achievement and math performance have also been demonstrated (Halle et al., 2012).
- Attending formalized preschool environments can raise literacy and math scores for DLL children while reducing inequality in kindergarten (Barnett et al., 2020; Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016).

### Classroom Language Contexts as Predictors of Latinx Preschool Dual Language Learners’ School Readiness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Key Takeaways</th>
<th>Research Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family Engagement</td>
<td>Predicts later positive learning outcomes, such as social, behavioral,</td>
<td>Delpalma &amp; Ferrina, 2019; Duncan &amp; Magnuson, 2013; Me &amp; Restrepo, 2019; Powell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>literacy, and mathematics skills</td>
<td>et al., 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Enhances the quality and quantity of learning experiences, such as increasing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the amount of time parents read with their children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funds of Knowledge</td>
<td>Include home knowledge, cultural practices, lived experiences, family</td>
<td>Bustamante &amp; Hedman, 2020; Gonzalez et al., 2005; Murphy et al., 2014; Souto-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>support networks, and biculturality</td>
<td>Manning, 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Enable practitioners to capitalize on the skills and resources that DLL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>families possess to create effective ECE programs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culturally Responsive Practices</td>
<td>Engage families in critical literacy within a social justice framework,</td>
<td>Bennett et al., 2018; Grant &amp; Rui, 2019; Jain et al., 2019; Lee et al, 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>multilingual literature, and culturally responsive print-rich environments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Incorporate multiple perspectives about issues, foster nurturing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>adult-child relationships, and include culturally authentic learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>experiences</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family-Centered Practices</td>
<td>Build trust and respect with families who are culturally, linguistically,</td>
<td>Division for Early Childhood, 2020; Jain et al., 2019; Rossetti et al., 2018;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and socioeconomically diverse</td>
<td>Suarez-Orozco et al, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Engage families in ways that are culturally respectful, safe, and supportive</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Empowerment</td>
<td>Centers on positive outcomes for families, such as achieving positive</td>
<td>Division for Early Childhood, 2020; Mueller, 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>differences in parenting skills, parent-child relationships, and child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>behavior</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Includes opportunities and experiences for parents that strengthen their</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>existing knowledge and promote the development of new skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shared Decision Making</td>
<td>Includes meaningful dialogue and the development of mutually agreed upon</td>
<td>DEC, 2020; Jain et al., 2019; Rossetti et al., 2018; Zepeda et al, 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>upon outcomes and goals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Families create action plans with the assistance of their child’s teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>or social worker</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- The present study examined the relations between teacher-child interactions, teachers’ Spanish use, classroom linguistic composition, and the school readiness skills of low-income, Latinx, Spanish-speaking dual language learners (DLLs), controlling for home and teacher background characteristics, with a national probability sample of Head Start children (i.e., from the Family and Child Experiences Survey [FACES, 2009]).

- Findings revealed that Head Start classrooms with higher concentrations of DLLs had teachers who reported lower average levels of children’s cooperative behavior.

- DLL students in classrooms where teachers used more Spanish for instruction and demonstrated more emotionally supportive teacher-child interactions were found to have higher average scores on measures of approaches to learning.

- Implications and directions for future research related to classroom language contexts are discussed.

### Teacher Characteristics That Play a Role in the Language, Literacy and Math Development of Dual Language Learners

- The increasing diversity in classrooms throughout the U.S. calls for teachers who are culturally competent and have quality professional development in working with dual language learners (DLLs) in order to ensure children from diverse groups are receiving equitable and high-quality education.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preparation of Young Dual Language Learners for School Readiness: Early Childhood Teacher Beliefs Regarding School Readiness</th>
<th>This study focuses on teacher characteristics that play a significant role in the development of young children’s bilingual abilities with regard to language, literacy, and math. Researchers examined the school readiness skills of 217 Latino DLLs attending Head Start taking into account specific teacher characteristics that may impact the development of readiness skills. Different teacher characteristics have different effects on the developmental outcomes. Amount of training had a positive significant effect on several children’s outcomes in English and in Spanish. The years of experience a teacher had working in classrooms with DLLs had a positive effect on children’s English spelling skills. Teachers’ cultural competency rating had a positive effect on receptive language and literacy in Spanish.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rethinking Bilingual Education</td>
<td>Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages. Umansky and Reardon (2014) followed children assigned to English-only, bilingual, and two-way dual language programs in a large western district from kindergarten to high school. Children in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake students in English-only programs at about 5th grade; by high school, they were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examining heterogeneity among Latino Dual Language Learners’ School Readiness Profiles of English and Spanish at the end of Head Starts</td>
<td>Emerging research shows there is substantial heterogeneity in the English and Spanish language and literacy proficiencies of dual language learners (DLLs) in U.S. preschools. This work is extended in this paper by examining within-group variability in 320 Spanish-English speaking DLLs’ cognitive, linguistic, literacy, and mathematics skills at the end of prekindergarten (M = 5.22 years old). Using latent profile analysis (a type of mixture modeling), four profiles of DLLs were identified. Most DLLs were classified as English Dominant, followed by Balanced Average, Spanish Dominant, and Balanced Low, respectively. In general, the Balanced Average profile outperformed the other profiles in English and Spanish, and their norm-referenced standard scores provide additional evidence that bilingual development is not associated with educational risk.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literacy Development</td>
<td>The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis.

• ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression).

• However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills.

• In light of research linking proficiency in the home language with achievement in English language skills and content learning, dual-language instruction appears to be more effective than transitional-bilingual education, although the advantage is limited to the facilitation of home-language verbal expression associated with the dual-language model.

**Effective Instruction for English Learners**

• During 2007–08, more than 5.3 million English learners made up 10.6 percent of the nation’s K–12 public school enrollment. Wide and persistent achievement disparities between these English learners and English-proficient students show clearly, say the authors, that schools must address the language, literacy, and academic needs of English learners more effectively.

• Based on the studies presented here, Calderón, Slavin, and Sánchez assert that the quality of instruction is what matters most in educating English learners.

• They highlight comprehensive reform models, as well as individual components of these models: school structures and leadership; language and literacy instruction; integration of language, literacy, and content instruction in secondary schools; cooperative learning; professional development; parent and family support teams; tutoring; and monitoring implementation and outcomes.

**The Promise of Two Language Education**

• Education policymakers have fiercely debated the relative merits of teaching English Learners in English versus teaching them in a bilingual setting.

• Research in cognitive science suggests that because languages share core underlying structures, students who first acquire a strong foundation in one language are better equipped to learn a second language (Cummins, 2000; Genesee, Geva, Dressler, & Kamil, 2008; Goldenberg, 1996, 2008).

• Another argument is that English Learners in English immersion programs spend too much time early in their schooling in classrooms where they comprehend little of what goes on (Duff, 2001).

• A third group of arguments for bilingual instruction stresses the importance of maintaining students’ native languages. They point to research showing that bilingualism generates social benefits like reduced discrimination, improved self-esteem, and stronger cross-group relationships (Cho, 2000; Wright & Tropp, 2005); economic benefits through increased global communication (Callahan & Gándara, 2014); and cognitive health benefits, such as better executive functioning and lower incidences of Alzheimer’s disease (Adesope, Lavin, Thompson, & Ungerleider, 2010; Bialystok, 2011; Carlson & Meltzoff, 2008).

• Those who favor English immersion instruction argue that students need to learn English quickly, so they don’t fall behind their peers academically.

• We analyzed data on eight cohorts of English language learners who were each assigned to one of the four different instructional programs, using up to 10 years of data for each cohort.

• We compared students in the four programs on three different outcomes: students’ English language acquisition (as measured by...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Effects of Prekindergarten for Spanish-speaking dual language</td>
<td>- The impact of California’s transitional kindergarten program on Spanish-speaking dual language learners was examined through two studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>learners: Evidence from California’s Prekindergarten Program</td>
<td>- Participants in the two studies included (1) the statewide population of students who met study inclusion criteria and took the California English Language Development Test and (2) a sample of students (n=1868) in 20 school districts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Findings indicate that Tk had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social-emotional skills or executive function.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry as compared to Spanish speaking dual language learners who do not attend.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Additive Advantage and Bilingual Programs in a Large Urban District</td>
<td>- The current study analyzes the relationship between elementary school reading achievement and participation in the following language acquisition programs—transitional bilingual, developmental, two-way bilingual immersion, and English immersion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- With a focus on the achievement of Spanish dominant English learners, the study uses multilevel models to examine Spanish and English reading outcomes for evidence of an ‘‘additive advantage’’ associated with programs that pursue full proficiency in students’ home language and English.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Set in a large urban school district in Texas, this research finds that participants in the most additive program, two-way, earned the highest Grade 5 English reading performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- In contrast, students in transitional and two-way programs demonstrated similar Spanish reading growth, and developmental students had significantly slower growth than transitional students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language proficiency and competence: upper elementary students in a</td>
<td>- Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dual-language bilingual education program</td>
<td>- Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Multiple regression results show that both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. These effects remained significant even after controlling for students’ English speaking/writing proficiency;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Moreover, both Cantonese and English writing proficiency were positively related to students’ classroom competence;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Additionally, higher English reading proficiency was positively associated with peer competence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improving English Language Arts Instruction in Indiana Dual Language Bilingual Education Classrooms</td>
<td>This paper reports on a mixed methods systematic classroom observation study as part of a federally funded project to improve instruction for English language learners (English Learners) in Indiana Dual Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) classrooms. Participating DLBE teachers received professional development through online English Learner licensure and DLBE certificate coursework along with on-site sociocultural instructional coaching. Participants include 15 teachers (7 treatment DLBE teachers; 8 comparison non-DLBE teachers). We observed and video recorded each teacher’s English language arts (ELA) block four times over 18 months to examine changes over time and determine the impact of the coursework and coaching on their instructional practices. Using the Sheltered Instruction Observation Protocol (SIOP), we compare the scores of the two groups over time. Researchers also provide analytic classroom vignettes for six of the eight SIOP components to illustrate how treatment teachers’ instruction improved over time. The findings generally demonstrate that the treatment led to improvements in the overall quality of sheltered ELA instruction of the DLBE teachers, but also reveal areas in need of more attention within DLBE teacher professional development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Linguistic Garden: A case study of emergent bilingual’s participation, positioning, identity development in a dual language program</td>
<td>Drawing upon sociocultural theories of learning and social constructivist theories of identity development, this article defines learning and identity as outcomes of participation in order to investigate how an emergent bilingual in elementary school, Roselyn, has opportunities to participate in school-based activities and how these structured shifts in her learning and identity. Drawing upon a unique data set that aligned 18 months of student interviews with student observations, findings indicate how Roselyn’s shifts in participation lend insight to how she was able to construct identities of herself as a learner in general, and more specifically as a Latina language learner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing their way into talk: emergent bilinguals’ emergent literacy practices as pathways to peer interaction and oral language growth</td>
<td>This paper explores the idea that young children’s emergent literacy practices can be tools for mediating peer interaction, and that, therefore, literacy, even in its earliest stages, can support oral language development, particularly for emergent bilinguals. The paper draws on data collected during a year-long ethnographic study of 11 Nepali- and Turkish-speaking three- and four-year-old’s learning English in their first year of school. Using neo-Vygotskian activity theory as a guide, this paper examines the children’s classroom literacy practices, particularly around writing and the alphabet, in order to understand, first, how literacy functioned as a socially embedded activity for these students (sometimes in ways that contrasted with the official literacy practices of the classroom), and second, how that activity facilitated students’ interaction across language backgrounds. Finally, this paper offers a genetic analysis, or an analysis across time, of how students’ interactions with multimodal composing functioned as contexts for emergent bilinguals’ oral language development, and in particular, vocabulary acquisition.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Double-voiceing and rubber ducks: the dominance of English in the imaginative play of two bilingual sisters | Through analysis of a video recording of two bilingual siblings playing with rubber ducks, this article explores the concept that imaginative play can serve as a potential site for language shift. The article argues that the siblings use English as a means to ‘double voice’ (Bakhtin, M. M. (1981[1963]). The Dialogic Imagination (C. Emerson and M. Holquist). Austin: University of Texas Press) their
imaginary narrative, thus transmuting the adult world and demarcating their play from the ongoing interaction with their mother.

- By triangulating this micro interactional analysis with interviews with the siblings’ mother and Irish immersion pre-school leader, the paper further argues that the dominance of English in imaginative play may relate in part to the pro-Irish Family Language Policy (FLP) enacted by their mother and the robust Irish language ethos of the pre-school; in other words, the siblings’ sense of agency is heightened by using English, the language they are not ‘supposed’ to speak.
- The paper concludes by discussing the conundrum this explanation poses for language maintenance efforts, as it is only through initiatives such as pro-minority language FLPs and minority language immersion classrooms that children are able to acquire the minority language in the first place.

| Language and Literacy Together: Supporting Grammatical Development in Dual Language Learners with Risk for Language and Learning Difficulties | Purpose: Early Interventions in Reading (Vaughn et al., 2006), the only literacy intervention with demonstrated effectiveness for U.S. dual language learners, was enhanced to support the development of oral language (vocabulary, grammar, and narrative) and literacy, which we refer to as “Language and Literacy Together.” The primary focus of this study is to understand the extent to which grammatical skills of bilinguals with risk for language and/or reading difficulties improve in the Language and Literacy Together intervention.
- Method: Fifteen first-grade dual language learners with risk for language and/or reading difficulties participated in an enhanced version of Early Interventions in Reading in Spanish. Children completed pre- and postintervention evaluations in Spanish and English, including grammatical testing from the Bilingual English Spanish Oral Screener (Peña et al., 2008) and narrative evaluation Test of Narrative Language story prompts (Gillam & Pearson, 2004; Gillam et al., n.d.). Data from six comparison participants with typical language skills who completed pre- and post-testing demonstrate the stability of the measures.
- Results: The intervention group made gains in English and Spanish as evidenced by significant increases in their cloze and sentence repetition accuracy on the Bilingual English Spanish Oral Screener Morphosyntax subtest. They increased productivity on their narratives in Spanish and English as indexed by mean length of utterance in words but did not make gains in their overall grammaticality.
- Conclusions: Structured intervention that includes an emphasis on grammatical elements in the context of a broader intervention can lead to change in the production of morphosyntax evident in both elicited constructions and narrative productivity as measured by mean length of utterance in words.

| Teacher Characteristics That Play a Role in the Language, Literacy, and Math Development of Dual Language Learners | The increasing diversity in classrooms throughout the U.S. calls for teachers who are culturally competent and have quality professional development in working with dual language learners (DLLs) in order to ensure children from diverse groups are receiving equitable and high-quality education.
- This study focuses on teacher characteristics that play a significant role in the development of young children’s bilingual abilities with regard to language, literacy, and math.
- We examined the school readiness skills of 217 Latino DLLs attending Head Start taking into account specific teacher characteristics that may impact the development of readiness skills.
- Different teacher characteristics have different effects on the developmental outcomes. |
| The Impact of Home Literacy on Bilingual Vocabulary Development | • For bilingual children, home literacy experiences contribute to the development of both languages.  
• In this study, survey data were gathered on the frequency of home literacy activities in two languages for forty-two early elementary.  
• Students in a French-English dual language immersion program.  
• Using growth modeling, this study focuses on the effects of print and media exposure on the students’ vocabulary development.  
• Findings suggest no effect of English literacy activities on English baseline vocabulary, whereas there was a positive effect of French literacy activities on French baseline vocabulary.  
• Home language status was a significant factor in French, but not English, vocabulary growth.  
• Results imply that regardless of home language background, for children to develop vocabulary skills in a language other than English, emphasis should be placed on home literacy activities in that language. |
| Change in Language and Literacy Knowledge for Spanish-English Dual Language Learners at School-Entry: Analyses from Three Studies | • Over 30% of children in the US are dual language learners who are learning two languages.  
• Few have simultaneously examined development of skills in both languages for children in preschool.  
• The purpose of this study was to examine the language and literacy skills in both Spanish and English in secondary data analyses of three studies of DLL children.  
• Hierarchical linear model analyses compared acquisition of language skills in English and Spanish in three studies.  
• Using language and time as nesting factors, these models allow for direct contrast of level and rate of acquisition across languages.  
• Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills.  
• Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills.  
• Cross-language relations were observed in literacy. |
| The Language and Literacy Development of Young Dual Language Learners: A Critical Review | • The number of children living in the United States who are learning two languages is increasing greatly. However, relatively little research has been conducted on the language and literacy development of dual language learners (DLLs), particularly during the early childhood years.  
• To summarize the extant literature and guide future research, a critical analysis of the literature was conducted. A search of major databases for studies on young typically developing DLLs between 2000 and 2011 yielded 182 peer reviewed articles.  
• Findings about DLL children’s developmental trajectories in the various areas of language and literacy are presented.  
• Much of these findings should be considered preliminary because there were few areas where multiple studies were conducted.  
• Conclusions were reached when sufficient evidence existed in a particular area.  
• First, the research shows that DLLs have two separate language systems early in life.
| Engineering Design in Dual Language: How Teachers Leveraged Biliteracy Practices to Add Engineering Disciplinary Literacy Practices | In this two-year ethnographic study, researchers explored engineering teaching and learning in fourth-grade, dual language (DL) classrooms.  
Researchers discuss the biliterate disciplinary practices in these classrooms, examining data (field notes, interviews, artifacts, audio, and video recordings) gathered at a school on the US-Mexico border.  
The purpose is to highlight how DL teachers collaborated to create an inquiry-based learning environment that fostered biliteracy as a resource for adding new disciplinary literacy practices.  
Researchers designed experiences where their emergent bilingual students were able to leverage their existing biliterate repertoires to engage in and learn engineering design.  
The environment teachers promoted the development of engineering disciplinary literacies in two languages. |
|---|---|
| Preschool Teachers' Language and Literacy Practices with Dual Language Learners | The purposes of this study were to (a) examine the degree to which teachers used linguistically responsive practices to support the language and literacy development of Spanish-speaking Dual Language Learners (DLL) and (b) to investigate the associations between these practices and select teacher-level factors.  
The sample consisted of 72 preschool teachers. Observational data were collected on practices. Teachers self-reported on language and culture beliefs, Spanish-speaking ability, and classroom composition.  
Results indicated that teachers, including those who spoke Spanish, used few linguistically responsive practices to support preschool DLLs.  
Only Spanish-speaking ability was related to practices.  
Implications for targeted professional development are discussed. |
| Beating the Odds: A Longitudinal Investigation of Low-Income Dual-Language and Monolingual Children’s English Language and Literacy Performance | The current study reports on the results of a longitudinal investigation of the language and early literacy development of a sample of dual-language learners (DLLs) and monolingual English speakers from low-income families who received an Early Reading First intervention during their Head Start preschool year.  
A total of 62 children who entered and remained in the same school district were followed from kindergarten through 2nd grade.  
The results indicate that both the DLLs and monolingual English speakers in the study showed similar developmental trajectories on receptive vocabulary, story recall, decoding, and letter and word identification from preschool through the 2nd grade.  
Furthermore, at the end of 2nd grade, the 2 groups’ vocabulary, story recall, reading fluency, decoding, and letter and word identification performances were similar and within the normal range for children their age.  
Practice or Policy: The study’s findings suggest that a strong preschool language and literacy program can reduce the English language gap between DLLs and monolingual English speakers from low-income families. |
| Dual Language Learners and Four Areas of Early Childhood Learning and Development: | Dual language learners are a steadily growing student population in several countries, including the United States – and especially in early childhood. |
### What Do we Know and What Do We Need to Learn?
- Consequently, any efforts to develop strong early childhood programming must include practices which support multiple areas of DLLs’ development.
- From a domain-specific lens, the researcher synthesizes the empirical literature on instructional practices for supporting young DLLs’ learning and development in four areas: language and literacy, social emotional, science, and mathematics.
- Through this synthesis, the researcher identifies practices such as drawing upon DLLs’ home languages during language and literacy instruction.
- The researcher also offers ideas for next steps in the research, including developing lines of research for supporting DLLs’ learning in math and science.

### Phonetic discrimination, phonological awareness, and pre-literacy skills in Spanish-English dual language preschoolers
- The current study explores variation in phonemic representation among Spanish-English dual language learners (DLLs, n = 60) who were dominant in English or in Spanish.
- Children were given a phonetic discrimination task with speech sounds that: 1) occur in English and Spanish, 2) are exclusive to English, and 3) are exclusive to Russian, during Fall (age m = 57 months) and Spring (age m = 62 months, n = 42).
- In Fall, English-dominant DLLs discriminated more accurately than Spanish-dominant DLLs between English-Spanish phones and English-exclusive phones.
- Both groups discriminated Russian phones at or close to chance.
- In Spring, however, groups no longer differed in discriminating English-exclusive phones and both groups discriminated Russian phones above chance.
- Additionally, joint English-Spanish and English-exclusive phonetic discrimination predicted children’s phonological awareness in both groups.
- Results demonstrate plasticity in early childhood through diverse language exposure and suggest that phonemic representation begins to emerge driven by lexical restructuring.

### Influences of the home language and literacy environment on Spanish and English vocabulary growth among dual language learners
- Little is known regarding the extent to which aspects of the home language and literacy environment (HLE) promote growth in language skills among dual language learners (DLLs).
- Therefore, the purpose of this study was to evaluate which aspects of the HLE significantly predict growth in English and Spanish vocabulary among Spanish-speaking DLLs. 944 Spanish-speaking DLLs (51.6% female; mean age = 53.77 months) completed assessments of English and Spanish vocabulary at 4 time points across 2 academic years.
- Parents completed a survey of the HLE that included information on language exposure, reading exposure, and family reading habits.
- Results indicated that specific literacy-related practices, including availability of books in the home, language read to the child, and parental reading skills were significant predictors of growth in children’s Spanish and English vocabulary knowledge, even after controlling children’s initial level of language skills and family socioeconomic status.

### Effects of transitional bilingual education on Spanish-speaking preschoolers’ literacy and language development: year 2 results
- Year 2 findings are reported from a longitudinal, experimental-control study involving 31 Spanish speaking preschoolers (aged 38–48 months) randomly assigned to two Head Start classrooms.
- In Year 1, classrooms differed only in the language of instruction, with teachers using only Spanish in one classroom and only English in the other.
- In Year 2, an experimental transitional bilingual education (TBE) model was implemented, with English being gradually introduced in the TBE classroom until a ratio of 30:70 English-to-Spanish was achieved, and Spanish being gradually introduced in the...
predominantly English (PE) classroom until a ratio of 70:30 English-to-Spanish was achieved.

- Year 2 results were consistent with Year 1, with the TBE classroom exceeding the PE classroom on all Spanish measures of language and literacy development and no significant differences favoring the PE classroom.
- Results also indicated that Year 2 trajectories were conditional on first-year’s effects, suggesting that sustained growth in dual language learner’s early literacy may depend on early intervention among 3-year-old preschoolers.

 Supporting Positive Language and Literacy Outcomes for Young Dual Language Learners: Introduction

- The 5 articles that constitute this special section follow a roundtable meeting that took place on April 16–17, 2008 in Washington, DC, on the topic of supporting positive language and literacy outcomes for young dual language learners (DLLs; 0–5 years of age).
- The 2-day meeting in Washington was the outcome of planning efforts by prominent researchers and representatives from several federal agencies interested in articulating the many complex and challenging research issues on language and literacy development that are particular to young culturally and linguistically diverse children.
- Researchers maintain that high-quality early childhood programs can support academic success for DLLs, but this alone is not enough: Instructional practices should address some of the unique and specific needs of this population.

 Advancing Early Literacy for All Children: Implications of the NELP Report for Dual-Language Learners

- The authors examine the implications and limitations of the National Early Literacy Panel report on the early care of young children who are dual-language learners (DLLs).
- They examine the relevance of the report for DLLs, particularly the practice in this and other national synthesis reports of extrapolating implications for the education of young DLLs based on a broader population of children.
- The article addresses the existing gaps in knowledge about literacy practices—knowledge that is central to the development of sound and appropriate educational policies and practices that support DLLs’ full development as language and literacy learners.

 A culturally and Linguistically Responsive Vocabulary Approach for Young Latino Dual Language Learners

- Purpose: This study examined the role of the language of vocabulary instruction in promoting English vocabulary in preschool Latino dual language learners (DLLs). The authors compared the effectiveness of delivering a single evidence-informed vocabulary approach using English as the language of vocabulary instruction (English culturally responsive [ECR]) versus using a bilingual modality that strategically combined Spanish and English (culturally and linguistically responsive [CLR]).
- Method: Forty-two DLL Spanish-speaking preschoolers were randomly assigned to the ECR group (n = 22) or CLR group (n = 20). Thirty English words were presented during small-group shared readings in their preschools 3 times a week for 5 weeks. Multilevel models were used to examine group differences in post instruction scores on 2 Spanish and 2 English vocabulary assessments at instruction end and follow-up.
- Results: Children receiving instruction in the CLR bilingual modality had significantly higher posttest scores (than those receiving the ECR English-only instruction) on Spanish and English vocabulary assessments at instruction end and on the Spanish vocabulary assessment at follow-up, even after controlling for reinstruction scores.
- Conclusions: The results provide additional evidence of the benefits of strategically combining the first and second language to promote English and Spanish vocabulary development in this population. Future directions for research and clinical applications are discussed.
### Language and Literacy Instruction in Preschool Classes that Serve Latino Dual Language Learners

- The present investigation builds off prior empirical work to describe the quality of the language and literacy instruction Latino dual language learning (DLL) children receive in Head Start.
- Specifically, researchers measured the frequency and duration of language and literacy lessons in classes that enrolled large numbers of Latino DLLs.
- Researchers also investigated children’s opportunities to participate in high-quality language and literacy experiences as a part of their everyday instructional experience. In total researchers observed 398 lessons in 20 classes.
- Results revealed (a) that the frequency and duration of instruction was variable, with some children enrolled in classes that implemented language- and literacy-based lessons for 23 min (10%) of the 4-h day and others in classes that fit in up to 82 min (34%) of instruction per day; (b) when language and literacy instruction occurred in these classes, it was most frequently delivered in a whole group and featured an instructional style that was characterized by the teacher directing the children to answer basic questions with a one- or two-word response; and (c) that high-quality instruction, which we operationalized as instruction that promoted language development, was predicted by characteristic features of the lessons—not features of the classroom.
- These results provide information that is useful to inform the design of policy- and practice-based interventions that might improve the characteristics of the language and literacy environments that serve Latino DLL children.

### Language Acquisition

#### The Effect of Dual Language and Transitional-Bilingual Education Instructional Models on Spanish Proficiency for English Learners

- The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school.
- In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis.
- ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills.
- In light of research linking proficiency in the home language with achievement in English language skills and content learning, dual-language instruction appears to be more effective than transitional-bilingual education, although the advantage is limited to the facilitation of home-language verbal expression associated with the dual-language model.

#### Cultivating Space for the Language Boomerang: The Interplay of Two Languages as Academic Resources

- Grounded in sociocultural theory, this study uses an ecological approach to examine how student interactions within a dual-language school context may offer affordances for increased linguistic and conceptual understanding.
- Using qualitative analysis of student discourse, this paper focuses on data from recorded interactions between pairs of fifth-grade students engaged in writing activities (in English and Spanish).
- Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language.
- This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. This study urges future research to more closely consider reciprocal affordances for language learning among bilingual learners and seeks to bridge insight across the fields of second language acquisition and bilingualism.

| Contributions of Oral narrative Skills to English Reading in Spanish-English Latino/a Dual Language Learners |
| Purpose: The study examined the contributions of Spanish and English oral narrative skills to English reading among 95 early elementary dual language learners (DLLs) from Spanish-speaking homes in the United States. This sample of first- and third-grade DLL children attended Spanish–English dual language immersion programs and received language and literacy instruction in both English and Spanish. |
| Method: All participants completed a storytelling task in both languages and two English reading tests in decoding and reading comprehension. The story narratives were analyzed for microstructures (number of different new words, lexical diversity \[D\], mean length of utterance, subordination index \[SI\]) using the Computerized Language Analysis program. The narrative sample were also evaluated for macrostructures (i.e., discourse-level features) using the Narrative Scoring Scheme. |
| Results: Grade, English D, and Spanish SI significantly predicted English reading. Grade level was the strongest predictor of the three for both decoding and comprehension. However, Spanish SI was more robust than English D for decoding whereas English D was a stronger predictor than Spanish SI for comprehension. |
| Conclusions: Young DLL children’s oral narrative skills in English as well as in their home language Spanish contributed to their English reading outcomes. The study further specified the contributions of narrative elements to different reading skills. Microstructural elements appeared to play a stronger role in English reading than macrostructural elements for DLLs in dual language programs in early elementary grades. The results provided support for the simple view of reading and the linguistic interdependence hypothesis. The results also implicated that maintaining young DLL children’s home language skills may be beneficial, rather than harmful, to their English reading development. |

| The Effects of Prekindergarten for Spanish-speaking dual language learners: Evidence from California’s Prekindergarten Program |
| The impact of California’s transitional kindergarten program on Spanish-speaking dual language learners was examined through two studies. |
| Participants in the two studies included: (1) the statewide population of students who met study inclusion criteria \(n = 45,010\) and took the California English Language Development Test (CELDT), and (2) a sample of students \(n = 1868\) in 20 school districts. |
| Findings indicate that TK had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social–emotional skills or executive function. |
| The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry, as compared to Spanish-speaking dual language learners who do not attend. |

| The role of mother tongue literacy in language learning and mathematical learning: Is there a multilingual benefit for both? |
| The present study examines the multilingual benefit in relation to language learning and mathematical learning. |
| The objective is to assess whether speakers of three or more languages, depending on language profile and personal histories, show significant advantages in language learning and/or mathematical learning, and whether mother tongue literacy can be
associated with their performance in Math and English language tests.

- Participants are all multilinguals with knowledge of French as an L1 or as a non-native language. Three core groups were examined: (a) School multilinguals (n = 449), typically French L1 speakers with knowledge of two additional languages learned in a formal school context; (b) Multilinguals with Literacy in the home language (n = 45) and Multilinguals without Literacy in the home language (n = 113).
- All participants were given a Math test, an English language test and a questionnaire. A questionnaire for parents was also used.
- Results suggest a positive role of mother tongue literacy in language learning as well as mathematical learning.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Does variation in early childhood education matter more for dual language learners’ than for monolingual children’s language development?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Can early childhood education (ECE) support the societal language development of children from linguistically diverse backgrounds?  
  - This study examined how existing variation in classroom interaction quality (CLASS Pre-K), classroom compositing (percentages of children from low-income backgrounds and dual language learners [DLLs]), and duration of attending German ECE were related to language trajectories from 30 to 73months of age (n=4519 children in 154 classrooms). DLL status served as a focal moderator and parental education was considered as an additional moderator.  
  - Age-based growth models revealed interactions between DLL status and ECE characteristics. There were numerous intercept effects that endured over the age span studied. Interaction quality (emotional support) and classroom composition (percentage of DLLs) were related only to DLLs’ German language growth  
  - Parental education did not moderate ECE effects. Hence, the observed range of variation in German ECE may matter for DLLs’ societal language development but may be of less relevance for monolingual children. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher’s use of linguistic scaffolding to support the academic language development of first-grade emergent bilingual students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Research suggests that teachers need to scaffold emergent bilingual students as they develop the complex language associated with school success.  
  - This may especially be true in dual language settings, where children are learning two languages simultaneously.  
  - In this study, therefore, I investigate the linguistic scaffolding practices of first-grade dual language teachers as they support academic language development for their Spanish dominant students.  
  - Academic language is viewed not only as a set of linguistic components but also as a way of accomplishing certain functions and participating in context-reduced communication.  
  - Findings indicate that teachers engage in scaffolding both within and across lessons, providing insights into ways teachers can support academic language development for emergent bilingual students in general. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The impact of early social interactions on later language development in Spanish-English bilingual infants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - This study tested the impact of child-directed language input on language development in Spanish–English bilingual infants (N = 25, 11- and 14-month-olds from the Seattle metropolitan area), across languages and independently for each language, controlling for socioeconomic status.  
  - Language input was characterized by social interaction variables, defined in terms of speech style (“parentese” vs. standard speech) and social context (one-on-one vs. group).  
  - Correlations between parentese one-on-one and productive vocabulary at 24 months (n = 18) were found across languages and in each language independently.  
  - Differences are highlighted between previously published monolingual samples, which used the same methods as the current study of bilingual infants. |
• The results also suggest cultural effects on language input and language development in bilingual and bicultural infants.

Moderators of Language Acquisition Models and Reading Achievement for English Language Learners: The Role of Emotional Warmth and Instructional Support

• Research Questions: The present study examined the following research questions: (1) What teacher behaviors and student-level characteristics predict student achievement? (2) Do teacher behaviors moderate the relationship between language acquisition models and English Learners’ achievement?

• Research Design: Sources of data in this study consist of student demographic variables and reading achievement for 995 students and classroom observation data using the Classroom Assessment Scoring System collected across 46 classrooms in an urban school district in Wisconsin. Hierarchical linear modeling was used to address the research questions.

• Results: A two-level hierarchical linear modeling analysis revealed that prior achievement, Hispanic and African American ethnicity, and eligibility for free lunch contributed significantly to the model, but gender did not. Teachers contributed markedly to student reading outcomes when they (1) incorporated student perspectives into instruction; (2) promoted autonomy and responsibility; (3) provided instructional opportunities to support higher level thinking; and (4) applied instruction to real-life applications. Cross-level interactions indicate that emotional warmth was particularly salient for English Learners in dual language immersion, whereas instructional support moderated the relationship between developmental bilingual education and reading achievement. Implications for teachers of students who are at risk for school failure are discussed.

• Conclusions/Recommendations: Findings from the present study suggest that developing teachers’ emotional warmth and instructional support is particularly salient for teachers of English Learners, who must possess qualities associated with good teaching, both in general (such as content knowledge and pedagogical skills) and, more specifically, for English Learners (proficiency in bilingual education methods).

A preliminary study of the relationship between working memory, language experience, and grammatical skill in dual language learners

• Purpose: This study examined the relationship between verbal short-term and working memory, language experience, and English tense-marking skill in Spanish L1-English L2 dual language learners (DLLs).

• Methodology: Ten Spanish-English DLLs, in kindergarten and first grade, participated in the study. Children completed the Test of Early Grammatical Impairment, a narrative retell task in English, and verbal memory tasks. Parents provided information regarding language input and output in the home and school environment.

• Data and analysis: Correlational analyses were conducted to examine relationships between English and Spanish input/output, forward and backward digit span, assessed in English and Spanish, and the accurate and productive use of English tense morphemes in various linguistic contexts.

• Conclusions: Study outcomes indicated varied use of English tense morphemes among DLLs. Additionally, a strong, positive association was found between the use of a variety of distinct tense forms and verbal working memory performance.

• Originality: This study is the first investigation to examine verbal short-term and working memory and home language experience to advance our understanding of the specific child internal and external factors that may account for the variability in tense marking during English second language acquisition.

• Significance: This research provides further insight to the effects of individual differences on the acquisition of second language grammatical skill during childhood.
| Understanding language acquisition: Neural theory of language | • This paper aims to discuss old and contemporary perspectives in understanding language acquisition taking into account the neural theory of language.  
• Discussing a recent theory by Kuhl (2010), neural substrates of first language learning will be put forward (Berwick et al., 2013). Neural substrates of phonetic learning, word learning, sentence processing, and syntax development are separately discussed.  
• As a novel window to look into language learning in a greater detail, second language learning in relation to the theories of language acquisition is further discussed.  
• Second language learning and dual vs. single coding structure relating to language acquisition are discussed in relation to the theories that have previously been explained.  
• Finally, a discussion of contemporary issues in understanding both first and second language acquisition in relation to bilingualism is presented.  
• In sum, investigating language acquisition requires a multidisciplinary approach taking psychology, linguistics, and cognitive neuroscience of language into account is necessary. |
| Early Literacy Strategies for Parents of Young Dual Language Learners: A descriptive Study and Integrative Review | • There is a large and growing population of dual language learners (DLLs) represented in early intervention programs in the United States, the majority of whom are from Spanish-speaking families.  
• To adequately serve these families, educators and speech–language pathologists must work closely with parents and provide them with culturally responsive strategies and activities that align with their language background and interaction styles.  
• The purpose of this convergent parallel mixed-methods study was to identify culturally consistent early literacy strategies specifically for parents of 2- to 3-year-old DLLs.  
• Findings from a descriptive study that included 94 young DLLs and their parents engaged in a book-reading task plus findings from an integrative literature review were converged to identify potential parent-implemented strategies that may support early literacy in young DLLs.  
• From this process, a total of 26 strategies were identified in the categories of enhanced interaction, engagement with texts or storybooks, questioning behaviors, and other language enhancement.  
• Fifteen of the strategies had compelling strength based on available work. Use of these strategies in pilot programs and future treatment studies is recommended. |
| The Distributed L1 and L2 Language-Learning Environments of Dual Language Learners Across Home and School Settings | • Purpose: This study explored the language-learning environments of typically developing dual language learners (DLLs) who learned Cantonese (first language [L1]) at home and English (second language [L2]) in preschool settings through direct and indirect measures.  
• Method: Nine typically developing Cantonese–English DLLs participated in this study. Participants’ daylong activities were audio-recorded using the digital language processor of the Language Environment Analysis system. A manual coding scheme was developed to examine the audio recordings with the focus of the amount of L1 and L2 used by participants, adults, and their peers across home and school settings. In addition, participants’ language use was indirectly examined using parent questionnaires, teacher reports, and classroom observations.  
• Results: The results of the audio recordings showed that Cantonese was the primary language used at home, and both Cantonese and English were used in school settings, consistent with the parent and teacher reports. Correlation analyses revealed that the amount of L1 used by the participants was associated with the L1 used by their
peers: and the amount of L2 used by participants was positively related to the L2 used by adults at home.

Conclusions: The findings illustrate how parent/teacher reports and daylong audio recordings could complement each other in the investigation of DLLs’ language-learning environments.

| Working Memory and Linguistic Performance of Dual Language Learners With and Without Developmental Language Disorders | • Purpose: This research note describes the use of working memory measures as potential indicators of developmental language disorders (DLD) in preschool age dual language learners from Spanish-speaking backgrounds. This report is an extension of early work, completed by the same authors that described the diagnostic accuracy of a Spanish nonword repetition task.
  
• Method: One hundred thirty Spanish-speaking families with preschool-age children participated; 37 children had DLD, and 93 were typically developing. Families were recruited from early childhood programs in three states in the western region of the United States. Working memory and linguistic measures were collected from the children; parents completed a vocabulary checklist and reported on their child’s longest utterances.
  
• Results: Nonverbal working memory was not associated with other measures, but verbal working memory was associated with linguistic measures. Although there were no group differences on nonverbal working memory, group differences (DLD vs. typical development) were detected on verbal working memory and linguistic measures. Verbal working memory combined with vocabulary scores resulted in 79% of cases correctly classified.
  
• Conclusions: Working memory tasks yielded different results depending on the type of task (verbal vs. nonverbal). Outcomes from this study showed that a nonverbal working memory task (hand movement) was not useful in distinguishing preschool-age dual language children with DLD from typical peers, but a verbal working memory task (nonword repetition) may be useful if combined with other more robust linguistic measures. |

| Dynamic Assessment Language Tasks and the Prediction of Performance on Year-End Language Skills in Preschool Dual Language Learners | • Purpose: Early identification is a key element for accessing appropriate services for preschool children with language impairment. However, there is a high risk of misidentifying typically developing dual language learners as having language impairment if inappropriate tools designed for monolingual children are used. In this study of children with bilingual exposure, we explored performance on brief dynamic assessment (DA) language tasks using graduated prompting because this approach has potential applications for screening. We asked if children’s performance on DA language tasks earlier in the year was related to their performance on a year-end language achievement measure.
  
• Method: Twenty 4-year-old children from Spanish-speaking homes attending Head Start preschools in the southwestern United States completed three DA graduated prompting language tasks 3–6 months prior to the Head Start preschools’ year-end achievement testing. The DA tasks, Novel Adjective Learning, Similarities in Function, and Prediction, were administered in Spanish, but correct responses in English or Spanish were accepted. The year-end achievement measure, the Learning Accomplishment Profile–Third Edition (LAP3), was administered by the children’s Head Start teachers, who also credited correct responses in either language.
  
• Results: Children’s performance on two of the three DA language tasks was significantly and positively related to year-end LAP3 language scores, and there was a moderate and significant relationship for one of the DA tasks, even when controlling for age and initial LAP3 scores.
  
• Conclusions: Although the relationship of performance on DA with year-end performance varies across tasks, the findings indicate potential for using a graduated prompting approach to language
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Effects on Early Language Development in Dual Language Learners</strong>&lt;br&gt;• This study investigated the vocabulary development of children (N = 547) from linguistically and socioeconomically diverse classrooms in Germany from age 3 in preschool to age 7 in Grade 1.&lt;br&gt;• The results showed that for dual language learners (DLLs, n = 107) growth rates in their German majority language skills varied over classrooms.&lt;br&gt;• Compared to monolingual children, DLLs improved faster in classrooms with higher peer level skills in the majority language than DLLs in classrooms with lower peer-level skills (controlling for socioeconomic status and classroom quality).&lt;br&gt;• DLLs showed stronger growth dynamics than monolingual children during later preschool stages.&lt;br&gt;• The findings highlight the role of preschool peers in DLLs’ acquisition of the majority language before entering elementary school.</td>
<td>screening with young dual language learners. Further research is needed to select the best tasks for administration in a graduated prompting framework and determine accuracy of identification of language impairment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Relationship Among Home Language Use, Parental Beliefs, and Spanish-Speaking children’s vocabulary</strong>&lt;br&gt;• This study investigated the relationship among home language use, parents’ beliefs about dual language development, and Spanish speaking children’s vocabulary knowledge. Parents (n = 162) completed a questionnaire about their home language use and beliefs about dual language development, and elementary-age children (N = 190) – Kindergarten (Mage = 5.71, SD = .56), second grade (Mage = 7.52, SD = .31), and fourth grade (Mage = 9.35, SD = .45) – completed conceptually-scored vocabulary assessments.&lt;br&gt;• Principal component analyses revealed that Spanish-speaking parents’ beliefs about dual language development are heterogeneous.&lt;br&gt;• Further, parents’ beliefs can be characterized differently.&lt;br&gt;• according to their children’s English proficiency designations and grade levels.&lt;br&gt;• Structural equation modeling analyses revealed that the Bilingual Facility parental belief factor was associated with home language use practices, which in turn were associated with children’s vocabulary.&lt;br&gt;• However, this association only applied to limited English proficient students and their parents. These results underscore the importance of attending to Spanish-speaking parents’ beliefs, as they appear to relate to home language use practices and, importantly, they also relate to their children’s vocabulary achievement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Specificity Principle in Young Dual Language Learners’ English Development</strong>&lt;br&gt;• This study employs the Specificity Principle to examine the relative impacts of external (input quantity at home and at school, number of books and reading frequency at home, teachers’ degree and experience, language usage, socioeconomic status) and internal factors (children’s working memory, nonverbal intelligence, learning-related social-skills, chronological age, gender) on children’s English-language development in phonological awareness (PA), receptive vocabulary (RV), and word reading (WR).&lt;br&gt;• Altogether, 736 four- to five-year-old Singaporean Mandarin-English speaking kindergarteners were assessed twice longitudinally. Their English-language PA, RV, and WR development was predicted using the eight external factors and five internal factors with Bayesian least absolute shrinkage and selection operators.&lt;br&gt;• Internal factors explained more variance than external factors in all three language domains. External factors had their largest impact on RV.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cognitive Control and the Phonological Awareness in the Acquisition of Second Language</strong>&lt;br&gt;• Studies that have examined the role of cognitive control in the acquisition of second language vocabulary in dual language learners are rare.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Vocabulary within the Spanish-English Dual Immersion Context

- First and second language vocabulary, phonological awareness and cognitive control were assessed in Spanish-English dual language learners (kindergarten-4th grade; half native-English and half native-Spanish) from a Spanish-English immersion program in the US.
- Children included were from monolingual homes and acquired their second language in school. Children’s first language vocabulary was strongly and negatively correlated with their second language vocabulary.
- Although performance on the cognitive control task was positively associated with first language receptive vocabulary and phonological awareness, it was children’s sound segmenting skills (i.e., elision) that uniquely predicted both their first and second language vocabulary scores.
- In addition, mediation regression analyses revealed that the relation between first and second language vocabulary was mediated by phonological awareness.
- Overall, our findings highlight the importance of sound segmenting skills in second language vocabulary acquisition.

### Dual Language Input and the Impact of Language Acquisition on Early Lexical Development

- Researchers examined properties of the input and the environment that characterize bilingual exposure in 11-month-old infants with a regular exposure to French and an additional language, and their possible effects on receptive vocabulary size.
- Using a diary method, researchers found that a majority of the families roughly followed a one-parent-one-language approach.
- Yet, the two languages co-occurred to various extents within the same half-hour both within and across speakers.
- Researchers used exploratory correlation analyses to examine potential effects of the dual input on the size of infants’ vocabularies.
- The results revealed some evidence for an impact of language separation by speakers.

### The Dimensionality of Oral Language in Kindergarten Spanish-English Dual Language Learners

- Purpose: The purpose of this study was to examine the latent dimensionality of language in dual language learners (DLLs) who spoke Spanish as their native language and were learning English as their second language.
- Method: Participants included 259 Spanish–English DLLs attending kindergarten. In the spring of their kindergarten year, children completed vocabulary, grammar, listening comprehension, and higher-level language measures (comprehension monitoring and inferencing) in Spanish and English.
- Results: Two models with similar fits best describe the data. The first was a bifactor model with a single general language factor “l,” plus 2 additional language factors, 1 for Spanish and 1 for English. The second model was a 4-factor model, 1 for English that included all English language measures and 3 additional factors that included Spanish vocabulary, Spanish grammar, and Spanish higher-level language.
- Conclusions: These results indicate that a general language ability may underlie development in both Spanish and English. In contrast to a unidimensional structure found for monolingual English-speaking kindergarteners, oral language appears to be multidimensional in Spanish–English DLL kindergarteners, but multidimensionality is reflected in Spanish, not English.

### English Narrative Language Growth Across the School Year: Young Spanish-English Dual Language Learners

- This study aimed to describe the narrative retell performance of dual language learners (DLLs) in the fall and spring of the school year and examine predictive relationships.
- Participants included 74 DLLs in kindergarten and first grade from low socioeconomic backgrounds. Microstructural measures included number of different words (NDW), words per minute (WPM), and verb accuracy. Macrostructural measures included number of total story elements and number of different types of story elements.
### Path analysis models were used to test the relations among variables.
- Findings indicated that narrative measures were sensitive to developmental differences across the school year. Fall NDW performance in narrative retells was moderately related to both spring NDW and the total number of macrostructural elements in the spring. Spring WPM was uniquely predicted by fall WPM.
- Authors concluded that narrative retells are sensitive to developmental differences across a school year for DLLs.
- Findings support the use of narrative retell measures as a promising tool to examine and describe English language growth of young DLLs within a school year.

### The Dimensionality of Spanish in Young Spanish-English Dual-Language Learners
- **Purpose:** The purpose of this study was to examine the latent dimensionality of language in dual language learners (DLLs) who spoke Spanish as their native language and were learning English as their second language.
- **Method:** Participants included 259 Spanish–English DLLs attending kindergarten. In the spring of their kindergarten year, children completed vocabulary, grammar, listening comprehension, and higher-level language measures (comprehension monitoring and inferencing) in Spanish and English.
- **Results:** Two models with similar fits best describe the data. The first was a bifactor model with a single general language factor “L,” plus 2 additional language factors, 1 for Spanish and 1 for English. The second model was a 4-factor model, 1 for English that included all English language measures and 3 additional factors that included Spanish vocabulary, Spanish grammar, and Spanish higher-level language.
- **Conclusions:** These results indicate that a general language ability may underlie development in both Spanish and English. In contrast to a unidimensional structure found for monolingual English-speaking kindergarteners, oral language appears to be multidimensional in Spanish–English DLL kindergarteners, but multidimensionality is reflected in Spanish, not English.

### Teaching (Bi) Multilingual Learners: Connecting Languages
- **Two language children now constitute 10% of the total population of US public schools, they reside in every state, and the overwhelming majority are US born (National Center for Education Statistics, 2020).**
- **30% of students age 8 and under have a significant influence of a language other than English in the home (Carey, 2021).**
- **Current program options fall into two broad categories: (1) those that use English only as a medium of instruction and (2) those that offer some form of bilingual instruction utilizing a language other than English (LOTE) for some part of the school’s educational program.**
- **Although the research is clear that utilization of students’ non-English languages in bilingual education programs is beneficial to academic achievement Umansky & Reardon, 2014; Valentino & Reardon, 2015), these programs have been highly politicized over time to the point that few EB students have access to bilingual programs and sadly, English medium programs rarely make use of children’s non-English languages.**
- **While dual language bilingual programs have been growing in number and stature over the past decade, going from about 300 in 2000 to over 3,000 in 2020 (Lan & Richards, 2020), because of the growth of the population of emerging bilingual learners, in general, and the growth.**
- **We start this paper by reaffirming that the research overwhelmingly establishes that emerging bilingual children are best served in school when both of their languages are used for instruction (Goldenberg & Wagner, 2015; Umansky & Reardon, 2014; Valentino & Reardon, 2015).**
### Purpose of this paper

Purpose of this paper is to discuss how languages other than English (LOTEs) can be used to help emerging bilingual children, whether they are in English medium or bilingual programs.

Regardless of program model, bilingual learners always have all of their linguistic resources available to them. These resources form a unified and inseparable whole that is the foundation of a powerful form of cultural capital that can, and should, be leveraged to accelerate and enhance learning (Bourdieu, 1991).

Our research indicates that adherence to these guidelines in Spanish–English bilingual education settings results in significant language and literacy achievement for Spanish–English Bilingual learners (Hopewell & Escamilla, 2013; Solder-González et al., 2012, 2016; Sparrow et al., 2014).

One of the most important attributes of emerging bilingual learners is that they come to school with two languages.

Using LOTEs in instructional contexts enhances opportunities to learn and exhibits concretely that two languages are cognitive advantages not problems to be remedied.

We cannot and should not teach them as if they were monolingual English speakers and/or if the LOTE is irrelevant to literacy acquisition.

---

### Being bilingual, being a reader: Prekindergarten dual language learners’ reading identities

This study explores the interplay between early reading, identity, and bilingualism.

**Reading identities, or understandings about what reading is and whom one is as a reader, have been linked to reading achievement and the development of reading skills.**

Only a small portion of the overall research on reading identities has include dual language learners.

This exploratory study provides a description of the reading identities of three dual language learners in prekindergarten. Data include child-centered interviews, child and classroom observations, teacher interviews and a family questionnaire.

Methods centered on the use of child-oriented data collection protocols, and the inclusion of children in the interpretation of their own work and language. Through the exploration of three cases, this study documents the ways that reading identities were constructed, taken up and expressed by the participants.

This study provides evidence that dual language learners are actively constructing ideas about reading, bilingualism/ biliteracy, and whom they are as readers as they learn to read.

These findings show that framing early reading in an identity perspective presents opportunities to look more holistically at the language and reading practices of dual language learners as they learn to read and navigate two or more languages at home and school.

### The Developing Bilingual Brain: What Parents and Teachers Should Know and Do

The field of neuroscience is now providing research findings about how the bilingual brain functions that can be used to promote richer and more successful dual-language development.

This article summarizes recent research, then provides practical applications for parents and teachers of emergent bilinguals.

Key understandings about how the brain processes first and subsequent languages are translated into ways to enrich instruction and family-based language and literacy experiences.

**Personality, cognitive strategies, and metalinguistic skills are important factors related to the acquisition and use of language (Michael and Gollan 2005).**

Bilinguals have been shown to have “increased density of grey matter in the left inferior parietal cortex” (Bialystok 2009, p. 3) that is more pronounced among those with more L2 proficiency.
- Simultaneous bilingual brains evidence more white matter density (in the anterior cingulate) than sequential bilinguals (Mohades et al. 2015).
- Bilinguals show better executive function (a variety of more sophisticated processing including inhibition and decision-making) and metalinguistic awareness (knowing how language works) (Adesope et al. 2010).
- Studies support a domain-general processing advantage (e.g., attention, recall, associations) in bilinguals (Barac et al. 2014) with greater accuracy, better reaction times on nonverbal tasks, more fluid switching, and stronger performances on working memory tasks (Ransdell et al. 2001), perhaps developing a specialized form of long-term working memory that can support reading and writing.
- These processing strengths indicate greater cognitive flexibility and may relate to increased cognitive reserve (Bialystok 2011), being bilingual may also increase “understanding of other people, their mental and knowledge states” (Barac et al. 2014) or what is known as “theory of mind” (Goetz 2003).
- Because bilingual learners often interact with different language providers, they appear to develop sociolinguistic awareness more readily.
- They may better understand the arbitrary nature of language (Cook 1997) and that users employ language to communicate their mental states in various ways and for different purposes.

### Dual Language Development of Latino Children: Effect of Instructional Program Type and the Home and School Language Environment

- Latino dual language children typically enter school with a wide range of proficiencies in Spanish and English, many with low proficiency in both languages, yet do make gains in one or both languages during their first school years.
- Dual language development is associated with how language is used at home and school, as well as the type of instructional program children receive at school.
- The present study investigates how changes in both Spanish and English proficiencies of Latino, second-generation immigrant children (n = 163) from kindergarten to second grade relate to instructional program type as well as language use at home and school.
- A series of MANCOVAs demonstrated significant dual language gains in children who were in bilingual classrooms and schools where Spanish was used among the teachers, students, and staff.
- Furthermore, only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages.
- Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education.

### A Narrative Format Design to Improve Language Acquisition Through Social Interaction

- Researchers present a research design devoted to create opportunities of learning and development through social interaction.
- The study is part of a EU project called SOFT (School and family together for the immigrant children integration) that aims to favor linguistic and social integration of children through language learning activities that connect families and schools.
- Cultural and linguistic diversities are considered as elements promoting learning and cooperation among different social actors: children, teachers, parents, researchers, and schools. In the present paper, researchers discuss two aspects: 1) how the pedagogical design named. Narrative format can establish a peculiar social interaction in the classroom and how, in a developmental perspective, it offers a real opportunity of cognitive and social skills improvement; 2) how social interactions between school and families
help teachers, pupils and parents to develop an awareness of their roles and strengthen their collaboration.

- Researchers involved 15 teachers and 169 children (aged 3-7 years old) of three classes of primary schools and two kindergarten classes in Switzerland, proposing a design that provides pedagogical materials and activities devoted to teach/learn English and German language.
- The main questions of the study are the following: How teachers implement the pedagogical design in order to involve children in activities based on an unknown language? How does the narrative format help children learn to speak the new language and to enable the integration between teachers, children, and parents?
- The results of our study show that the design researchers have implemented can create conditions that facilitate and imitate the natural (informal, discursive) acquisition of languages.

### Personal Development

#### Sense of Identity

**A Warm Welcome for Language Learners**

- Three scaffolds to support English Learners in finding the links and seeing the connections between the phrases, sentences, and paragraphs of the texts they read.
- 1) Highlight the appeal of appositives. Teach students to use digital or actual highlighters to capture the information contained within commas or set aside by em-dashes.
- 2) Use passages from news articles and have students practice underlining the subjects of sentences so they can make guided comparisons between the word choices that appear at the beginning, middle and end of an article.
- 3) To support students in constructing meaning by forming cohesive inferences, a strategy called anaphoric cueing has been shown to increase passage comprehension for students with significant reading comprehension difficulties, including English Learners. Anaphoric cueing entails signaling the presence of a pronoun to the reader by underlining and guiding the student to draw an arrow back to specify its antecedent.

**Becoming Spanish Learners: Identity and Interaction Among Multilingual Children in a Spanish-English Classroom**

- This article explores the interactional co-construction of identities among two first-grade students learning Spanish as a third language in a Spanish-English dual language classroom.
- Drawing on ethnographic and interactional data, the article focuses on a single interaction between these two “Spanish learners” and two of their Spanish-speaking classmates that took place within the context of a classroom literacy event.
- Analysis involved examining the sequential organization of talk, as well as identifying the particular linguistic resources that speakers recruited in their conversational turns.
- Findings showcase the interactional mechanisms by which students’ identities were variously asserted, contested, and negotiated in everyday classroom talk.

- Their identity formation always took place within the context of joint social activity—in the presence of and in relation to their classmates.
- However, as a reflection of the dynamic back-and-forth processes of contestation and negotiation involved in identity formation, Malik continued to position (and reposition) himself as competent—as an emergent Spanish speaker and an emergent multilingual.
- By focusing in depth on a single example of classroom interaction, the researchers’ purpose has been to illustrate the intersubjective back-and-forth dynamic that was central to identity formation among these particular children.
- There is a larger context at play here, and attention to how individual speech events such as this one connects with other speech events.
across time and space (Wortham & Reyes, 2015) is necessary if we are to more fully understand the itineraries of identity (Bucholtz et al., 2012) that students like Alicia and Malik envision, enact, resist, and pursue in their everyday interactions.

- Researchers maintain that this particular focus on classroom talk—at this particular level of granularity—is warranted precisely because of how this single classroom interaction both reflects and helps constitute larger interactional patterns and broader social structure.

### Cultivating Pride in Bilingual Students: Orgullo Colectivo

- Shifting to an asset-based approach to encourage bilingualism required a cultural as well as academic changes.
- Perception change: they needed to change the perception of activities and resources in Spanish (or any language other than English) from that of a crutch to a challenge, from intervention to enrichment, from something that brings about shame to something that produced pride, orgullo.
- To close the opportunity gap for English learners, they realized they needed new strategies and curriculum models, but also needed to change the way they thought about bilingualism within the school community.

- Identity formation is one of the key components of adolescence and linguistic identity is critical to that process. For English learners to reach higher levels of achievement, they had to see themselves as high achievers in the first place—and in their first language.
- To achieve this, they focused on shifting to an asset-based mindset, with the long-term goal of turning the transitional bilingual education program into a dual language program.
- Students reported that being bilingual is a big part of their identity. Morton has embraced bilingualism as part of the school’s collective identity.

### More Than Being in Class: Adolescents’ Ethnolinguistic Insights in a Two-Way Dual Language Program

- Much of the debate regarding outcomes of various types of dual-language programs has focused on linguistic and academic results, and with good reason: improving the educational outcomes of language minorities and supporting societal multilingualism are vital goals.
- More rarely explored, however, are these programs’ ethnolinguistic outcomes: he ways in which they provide students with insights into themselves, language, language learning processes and others.

- This study used interview and audio data to examine ways in which adolescents reported learning about themselves, language and its learning and others through participation in an extracurricular high school program for Spanish-dominant English language learners (English Learners) and English-dominant Spanish language learners (SLLs).
- Findings suggest the program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources.
- Patterns of learning were largely consonant with students’ sociolinguistic positioning in schools as language minority or majority speakers.

### Motivating English learners by helping them visualize their Ideal L2 Self: lessons from two motivational programs

- This study presents a structural relationship model that integrates English language learners’ motivation with their online self-regulation.
- Two questionnaires, Online Language Learning Motivation (OLLM) and Online Self-regulated English Learning (OSEL), were developed and administered to 293 Chinese university students. The results indicated that OLLM consists of five factors, namely online language learning experience, cultural interest, instrumentality-promotion, instrumentality-prevention, and others’ expectations.
- Meanwhile, OSEL is composed of six factors: goal setting, time management, environment structuring, help seeking, task strategies, and self-evaluation.

- The path analysis revealed that students with a positive future image of their language learning and an intrinsic interest in English culture tended to have better self-regulatory capacity in online learning environments.

- In contrast, students who learn English so as to avoid negative academic results might be less motivated to carry out online self-regulated learning.

- Also worthy of note is the negative association between L2 learners’ previous online learning experience and their online self-regulatory efforts.

- Learners with positive online learning experiences tended to be more flexible and independent in their self-regulatory learning process.

- Related pedagogical implications are discussed, such as motivating learners to visualize a successful future self, improving their inherent interest in learning English, and designing more effective online tasks.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Linguistic Garden: A case study of emergent bilingual’s participation, positioning, identity development in a dual language program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Drawing upon sociocultural theories of learning and social constructivist theories of identity development, this article defines learning and identity as outcomes of participation in order to investigate how an emergent bilingual in elementary school, Roselyn, has opportunities to participate in school-based activities and how these structured shifts in her learning and identity.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructing Identities: How two emergent bilinguals create linguistic agency in elementary school</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emergent bilinguals’ engagement and participation with learning is closely connected to the identities they are able to construct in this learning.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- This paper presents a model for understanding how young emergent bilinguals begin to construct identities with language and learning across school-based activities.

- Drawing upon Holland, Lachiotte, Skinner & Cain’s (1998) framework of how identities are shaped across figured worlds, and Nasir & Hand’s (2006, 2008) notion of practice-linked identities in school-based contexts, the model identifies the ways in which three components—context, subject positioning, and agency—play a critical role in how emergent bilinguals in a Spanish-English dual language, elementary school program begin to construct identities with learning and language.

- In juxtaposing the experiences of two emergent bilinguals, data highlights how these students used language in novel ways to assert a level of agency to become active participants in school-based activities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Researching the Complex Nature of Identity and learning: positioning, agency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identities are dynamic, constantly shifting processes of self-understanding mediated by local and institutional repertoires, behaviors, resources and enacted through one’s positioning in practice.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- This definition considers identities as both ideas, as well as actions in terms of how the learner becomes a participant in activities.

- A tension in studying identities is that the researcher must collect data that encompasses both observable actions and how the learner reflects on these actions.

- Drawing upon positioning theory, this paper presents a methodological approach to study this tension.
Data from a study of emergent bilinguals in elementary school is used to understand how learners’ identities are shaped during the nascent years of school. This paper argues that certain methodological approaches should be used to research the identities of young emergent bilinguals. Specifically, data must document four components of learning and identity as represented in Figure 2. These components include the learners’: positioning across interactions; access to tools, resources and/or artifacts; access to agency and subject positions to act; and reflections of this dynamic. Identities though are also mediated by the cultural practices, social norms, storylines of the larger community and institutions in question. Findings complicated Oscar’s presented identity (Nasir, 2010) as a quiet and passive learner who faced academic struggles to become proficient in English, but nonetheless gravitated towards the language. While initial classroom observations did reflect these characteristics, in using varied approaches, data revealed a student who used his bilingualism in thoughtful and proficient ways to support his academic growth. Findings indicate how multiple approaches must be used to understand the bidirectional relationship language learning holds with identity development. Interviews need to align with observations to provide a more complete interpretation of learners’ behaviors. Multiple interview approaches should be used, and observations need to document interactions outside the classroom context.

By triangulating interviews with observations across school-based activities, and in using multiple cycles of analysis, revealed the tensions in Oscar’s identities with learning and language as a fifth grade emergent bilingual. It is through this process where different vantage points were illuminated.

“You Can Talk in Español!” An Ethnographic Case Study of An African American Emergent Bilingual and Biliterate Identity

This ethnographic case study explores the dynamic and fluid development of one African American student’s bilingual/biliterate identity through her enrollment in a Spanish-English Dual Language Education program. Researchers integrated the frameworks of identity in interaction and monoglossic and raciolinguistic language ideologies to understand how this student approached her Spanish language and literacy development from kindergarten to grade 5. The study documents the fluid nature of the focal student, Tamara’s identity as she journeyed from a Spanish enthusiast in kindergarten who embraced her emerging bilingualism/biliteracy to a student who seemed to question her identity as Spanish literate person. Researchers examined her response to developing bilingualism and biliteracy and identified three paradoxical influences, or doublebinds, in how she was differently positioned across multiple interactions as a bilingual African American student. Tamara’s journey reveals that African American students like her DLE programs with already rich, flexible linguistic repertoires along with the openness and capacity to extend those repertoires. Before and during kindergarten Tamara was afforded many opportunities to develop and affirm her emergent bilingual/biliterate identity as a learner, language broker, and teacher. Tamara employed the relational process of adequation, downplaying differences among her and her peers’ language practices and racialized identities and instead foregrounding their similarities as friends with emerging bilingual capacities.
### Teaching Young Dual Language Learners to Be Writers: Rethinking Writing Instruction Through the Lens of Identity

- For young dual language learners (DLLs) the process of learning to write and use language expressively differs from that of children who are monolingual English speakers.
- These differences often remain unaddressed in curricula and in writing instruction.
- Despite a recent “identity turn” (Moje & Luke, 2009, p. 415) in the literacy field that has shifted attention to how children’s identities shape writing practices and motivations for writing, common frameworks for understanding identity in literacy processes have been used only in a limited way to consider identities of both young children and DLLs.
- This article reports relevant theory and research on the writing identities of young DLLs to explicate a framework of writing instruction that is informed by these understandings.
- This framework provides a model for elementary-grade instruction that supports the language acquisition and writing development of DLLs, including positive self-identification with writing.

### Family Treasures: A Dual-Language Book Project Negotiating Language, Literacy, Culture, and Identity

- This article advances a framework for early language and literacy development among young English language learners (English Learners).
- A dual language book project undertaken in partnership with a local elementary school provides a context within which to address children’s need to negotiate language, culture, and identity as they transition and make meaning from their home language (L1) to English and the language of school (L2) and back.
- Using objects of cultural and personal relevance that the children brought from home, stories of “Family Treasures” were generated from the original telling in the L1 into English in small-group contexts, transcribed, illustrated, and uploaded to a Web site for permanent sharing, rereading, and exchange.
- These booklets also provided an opportunity for identity formation, pride of family and culture, and the acquisition of rudimentary technology skills, which all work to motivate and engage young learners in the development of early literacy.

### Rethinking Bilingual Education

- Maintaining home language appears to strengthen students’ sense of self and to increase educational motivation among adolescents (Lee et al., 2021; Zarate, Bhimji, & Reese, 2005).

### The Effects of Spanish English Dual Language Immersion on Student Achievement in Science and Math

- In addition to language background, students’ culture must be taken into account in designing a successful dual language program.
- In order to support student success, Cummins’ (1979, p. 240) states the school program must be geared to the needs of individual children.
they are to attain an additive form of bilingualism involving fluent literacy skills in L1 and L2. If the process of instruction is to be meaningful it must reflect the child’s cultural experiences and build upon his competencies.

### Cultural Awareness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A Template Analysis of Teacher Agency at an Academically Successful Dual Language School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Mainstream models of bilingual education view English language learners (English Learners) from a deficiency perspective and engage in the practice of subtractive schooling, which strips the learner of cultural capital that could benefit him or her in terms of educational achievement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Conversely, the dual-language (DL) model is additive in nature, seeking to add English to the student’s body of knowledge while at the same time maintaining the first language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Evidence suggests that DL programs have the potential to foster both significant academic achievement and increased cultural awareness in the students they serve.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Moreover, researchers have found a pervasive “culture of intellectualism” present in schools with effective DL programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This culture is characterized by active engagement in learning, including the free exchange of ideas and the promotion of higher order thinking skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• As such, DL programs offer both language-majority and language-minority learners the opportunity to reach advanced levels of academic achievement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• As with any educational program, teachers play a crucial role in the success or failure of these programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Successful DL teachers must draw from a variety of sources to make decisions about instruction in their classrooms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• By building on Bandura’s theory of human agency and applying it specifically to DL teachers, these findings can be used to inform the successful implementation and maintenance of new DL programs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Equity for Students Learning English in Dual Language Bilingual Education: Persistent Challenges and Promising Practices</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• This special issue of TESOL Quarterly examines the equity challenges and promises of dual language bilingual education (DLBE) for students learning English as an additional language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• As demographic change and transnational connections develop more awareness and desire for multilingualism, there has been an explosion of DLBE in schools throughout the world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Although research confirms the effectiveness of well-implemented dual language programs, studies also find persistent and pervasive inequalities, which are explored in this issue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• On the one hand, there is a global push toward English as a lingua franca that denies education in students’ native languages; on the other hand, there is not equal access or opportunity to English as a global language of power through English-bilingual education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ideologies and discourses of monolingualism and accountability for English learning continue to impact DLBE policy and practice as well as dehumanize language-minoritized youth who are learning English.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• At the same time, research reported in this issue documents the pride, joy, and multilingual capacities of children and their families, as well as the possibilities for DLBE when we hold programs accountable for bilingual outcomes and avoid “equity traps.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A two-way Spanish-English program in the midwestern United States, where Mariana Pacheco and Colleen Hamilton aimed to transform the discourses that typically oppress Spanish-speaking bilingual students and their languages.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| • Framed by theories of bilanguaging love (Mignolo, 2012), careful ethnographic detail foregrounds Latinx students’ unique sensitivities.
More Than Being in Class: Adolescents’ Ethnolinguistic Insights in a Two-Way Dual Language Program

- Much of the debate regarding outcomes of various types of dual-language program has focused on linguistic and academic results, and with good reason: improving the educational outcomes of language minorities and supporting societal multilingualism are vital goals.
- More rarely explored, however, are these programs’ ethnolinguistic outcomes: the ways in which they provide students with insights into themselves, language, language learning processes and others.
- This study uses interview and audio data to examine ways in which adolescents reported learning about themselves, language and its learning and others through participation in an extracurricular high school program for Spanish-dominant English language learners (English Learners) and English-dominant Spanish language learners (SLLs).
- Findings suggest the program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources.
- Patterns of learning were largely consonant with students’ sociolinguistic positioning in schools as language minority or majority speakers.

Multiple Pathways to Multilingual Investment: A Collective Case Study of Self-Identified Mexican Students in the US

- The children of immigrants are the fastest growing population in U.S. schools at the same time there is increased anti-immigrant discourse, creating a unique linguistic ecology for its students.
- These multinational, multilingual, and multicultural students often encounter mononational, monolingual, and monocultural ideologies in their schools and communities.
- The result is that potentially hybridized learning contexts turn into sites of struggle for continued positive multilingual identities and investments.
- This multiple case study implemented surveys and interviews to explore the factors that contribute to the high multilingual investment of three self-identifying Mexican students residing in the U.S.
- Findings indicate that strong family relationships, formal coursework in Spanish, as well as a strong ethnic identity as Mexicans are interrelated factors that contribute to their high multilingual investment.
- In turn, this study suggests there are multiple pathways for Spanish-speakers residing in the U.S. to maintain, develop, and regularly use their Spanish abilities even in English hegemonic contexts.
- Dual language education is a powerful factor, but formal Spanish courses at the secondary and post-secondary level are also equally strong contributors when dual language education is not available.
- Furthermore, years of schooling in Mexico can counter monolingual educational contexts that adolescents often encounter.
- Implications for how educators may further facilitate positive and powerful multilingual identities and investments with their students along the educational pipeline are explored with a specific attention to Spanish language programming and raciolinguistic ideologies.

Teacher-researchers promoting cultural learning in an intercultural kindergarten in Aotearoa New Zealand

- This article discusses six teaching strategies identified by teacher-researchers as supporting their goal to improve learning and teaching for all children in the intercultural setting of a kindergarten in Aotearoa New Zealand.
- As a Centre of Innovation, the kindergarten received government funding for a 3-year action research project focused on the
| View of parents preferring to raise a bilingual child | participation of Samoan children, who also attended a nearby Samoan language immersion early childhood setting.  
- The program was guided by two perspectives: the sociocultural philosophy that underpins the early childhood curriculum, and an additive approach to bilingual education that provides support for first-language maintenance as well as building English language competence.  
- The six strategies are illustrated with data extracts focused on language and literacy learning and discussed with reference to the sociocultural concepts of construction and cultural tools.  
- It is proposed that a core strategy ‘Teachers help children to revisit their learning experiences’ sustains children’s engagement in learning, in conjunction with several mediators: interactions with peers and teachers, as well as cultural, community and center resources.  
- The findings suggest that children actively engage in knowledge creation through these mediators and that cultural learning outcomes occur for both children and adults.  
- This study aimed to compare the views of parents living in their own country or abroad on raising bilingual children.  
- At the end of the study, researchers found that parents from both groups gave similar answers to the questions regarding the definition of bilingualism and the age for starting bilingual education; however, they gave similar but also different answers to the questions about their reasons for raising their children bilingually, how they raise them bilingually, and the advantages and disadvantages of being bilingual.  
- Furthermore, we found that parents living in their own country attribute more meaning to raising children bilingually.  
- We believe that this finding stems from the fact that parents living abroad mostly raise their children bilingually out of obligation whereas those living in their own country do so voluntarily and deliberately. |
| Translanguaging Together: Building Bilingual Identities con Nuevos Amigos | As the U.S. population grows more varied, public schools are faced with the challenge of meeting the needs of an increasing population of culturally and linguistically diverse students.  
- Schools in the United States are often the first point of contact for new immigrant students as they work to facilitate their integration and socialization into American society.  
- Aiding these immigrants in learning English has become one of the primary focuses of schools and is a major challenge for principals.  
- The authors discuss programmatic models for English Learners that are currently being used in schools and relate factors that principals need to consider when selecting a model to use to help English Learners.  
- The characteristics of effective English Learner models are presented in order to give principals an upper hand in addressing the growing number of students needing English Language Learning support.  
- The authors also point out that for any English Learner program to be effective, the school must have a quality professional development program coupled with strong immigrant parent involvement. |
| Cultural Awareness Knowledge and the Teaching of Spanish to Native Speakers | This article discusses the importance of cultural awareness knowledge for teachers who teach Spanish to native speakers.  
- The article is taken from a study that investigated pedagogical content knowledge, subject matter knowledge, and cultural awareness knowledge.  
- The article discusses culturally relevant theory in relation to teaching students who are of a different culture/ethnicity than the teacher.  
- In addition, it discusses the significance of beliefs teachers have about students and their abilities. |
- The article discusses how teachers' beliefs about students can affect how those students are taught.
- The results of the survey suggest that it is important for teachers to make cultural connections with their students. The results also suggested that teachers perceive cultural awareness knowledge is important to effective teaching as well as interpersonal knowledge as defined by Collinson ("Becoming"). Additionally.
- The attitudes and beliefs that teachers have towards minorities, towards non-prestige languages, toward poverty, have an effect on how teachers teach (see Ennis, Cothran, and Loftus; Hollingsworth; Hoy and Murphy, 2001; Nespor). Hancock quotes Brown in saying that research suggests that empathy, the capacity to relate emotionally to someone else, may contribute to the success of language learners.
- In order to be an effective and successful teacher, that teacher must know her/his students intimately. The teacher must be able to talk about each individual student's strengths and weaknesses and be able and willing to do whatever it takes to ensure that student's academic success.

### The Key to Global Understanding: World Languages Education—Why Schools Need to Adapt

- This review article is a plea for the education community to reconsider the place of world languages teaching within the schools. With globalization, languages education should be one of the strategic goals of public as well as private education.
- The article reviews research on the best age level for learning a language, the assets of bilingualism, the problems that arise from lack of recognition for other languages and cultures, the ways to change current language education, and the integration of international language policies.
- The literature reviewed points at how the issues discussed can be resolved to increase global understanding.
- Bilingual learning affects attitudes and beliefs about language learning and other cultures:
  - Language learners develop a more positive attitude toward the target language and/or the speakers of that language.
  - Lipton’s surveys (2004) comprise a series of studies that demonstrate, among other factors, that children who have studied a world language develop a sense of cultural pluralism (openness to and appreciation of other cultures) and have an improved self-concept and sense of achievement in school. The ability to easily switch between languages makes children feel competent, and it increases self-esteem (Rubio, 2007).
  - Other advantages of learning another language can include the following: passing on part of one’s heritage to children, bridging generations and improving communication within the family and with the extended family, building international links, experiencing two cultures, being able to compare values and worldviews, and becoming biliterate (Marcos, 1998).
- Language educational economics is a newly developed field of study, born from the understanding that language educational policies have economic implications (Breton, 1998).
- Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu's language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006).
- At a time of semi globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs.
- On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in
• Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005).

• Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language:

  • Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture.

  • Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade.

  • Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad.

  • Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.

  • Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad range of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).

  • Increasing chances of entry into college or graduate school. World languages and cultures are part of what an educated person should know.

  • Appreciating international literature, music, and film. Translation is subject to the interpretation of the translator. The world’s literary and artistic works have been written in various languages. Some elements do not have equivalents in other languages.

  • Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.

  • Increasing understanding of oneself and one’s culture. Viewing one’s value system through the eyes of others is, put simply, valuable. Monolingual views of the world limit the perspective. There are aspects of one’s life and culture that are accepted as universal truths until another way of thinking has been encountered.

  • Making lifelong friends. Bilingualism increases the number of people with whom one can interact. Interest in other cultures helps one connect deeply with other people around the world.

Skutnab-Kangas (2000) differentiates educational settings in terms of their strength in promoting high levels of bi- or multilingualism and bi- or multiliteracy. Some characteristics of the strong forms of additive bilingual education are as follows:

• Mother tongue maintenance: Linguistic minority children with a lower status L1 receive instruction in their L1 with a view to maintaining and developing skills in this language and developing pride in their cultural identity.

• Immersion: Linguistic minority children with a high-status language are instructed through the medium of a world/minority language in classes consisting entirely of L2 learners.

• Dual language: A mixed group of linguistic minority and majority students are taught through the medium of the learners’ L1 and L2, with the dominant language taught as a subject.

• Alternate days: A mixed group of linguistic minority and majority students are taught using their L1 and L2 on alternate days.

• Plural multilingual: Students with different L1s are taught the curriculum through the medium of their L1 with an L2 taught as a world language in grade 1. This then increasingly becomes the medium of instruction in later years when other L2s are also offered as world languages. (p. 146)
| Benefits of Foreign Language Learning and Bilingualism: An Analysis of Published Empirical Research 2012-2019 | • The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society.  
• This analysis of research published from 2012-2019 extends Fox et al.’s analysis of research published from 2005 to 2011 (Part I).  
• The 100 empirical studies in Part II, drawn from seven data bases, were conducted in multiple countries. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity.  
• Results report multiple cognitive benefits of language study and bimultilingualism, particularly later in life, including enhancement of cognitive flexibility, higher cognitive reserve in advanced age, and delay in the onset of dementia.  
• Other results underscore the importance of early and sustained language learning and support for L1 literacy development.  
• Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence.  
• This research illustrates the importance of establishing cross-/interdisciplinary research and sharing results with language advocates, policy makers, and legislators. |
| English Language Learners Visualization of Identities in Transformation in an Imagined World | • This paper investigates the ‘imagined’ English language learner (English Learner) identities of Korean undergraduates in comparison with the construction of their ‘past/current’ identities.  
• In an environment of globalization and accelerated development of technology, South Koreans view English as a crucial medium to obtain success.  
• In this educational and societal context, this study examines how English Learners view their imagined English Learner identities and communities through their drawings and written descriptions.  
• Grounded in the notion of imagined communities and identity, the study explores how 159 Korean undergraduate students present their expected or desired transformation of identity and communities taking place through English learning.  
• A multimodal analysis was employed to unravel the multifaceted, composite, and fluid attributes of English Learner identity from its visual and narrative elements.  
• The findings yield insights into the purposes, orientations, and dispositions of EFL learners, their beliefs about imagined English-speaker identities, and their awareness of the broader global, intercultural context.  
• Concentrating on the transformation in the relational aspect of English Learner identity, the study discusses the weight and affordances of English and its relation to English Learners’ imagined English Learner identity and further demonstrates their language and cultural awareness in the globalized setting. |
| Cultural Awareness, Listening Comprehension, Listening Motivation, and Attitude Among EFL Learners: A Gender-Based Mixed Method Study | • The current research investigated the effects of cultural awareness on listening comprehension and listening motivation of EFL learners.  
• Also, this research investigated the perspectives of EFL students towards having English cultural awareness.  
• Seventy-five EFL learners from three English intact classes were chosen as the subjects of this study.  
• A listening motivation test and a listening comprehension test were given to the three classes. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Latino English Language Learners: Facing Obstacles Bigger than Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Ideally, English Learners would learn in communities where their culture and language are valued, such as dual language classrooms where content and language arts are taught both in English and Spanish.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The benefits of such models include accelerated academic progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• With such limited multicultural influences and resources, classroom teachers become primarily responsible for educating English Learners in ways that value diversity in culture, language, and experience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Developing teachers' cultural sensitivity is the foundation for bridging the gap between cultures.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Revisiting Educational Programs that Develop Linguistic and Cultural Awareness for All Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• National laws, court rulings, and policy guidance help ensure that English Learners (ELs) have equitable access to a meaningful education amidst an ever-increasing diverse linguistic and multicultural demographic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Research has shown that dual-language programs for elementary age students and newcomer centers for recent immigrant arrivals at the secondary level are effective in fostering student academic success, linguistic growth, and multicultural understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• While these programs are becoming more common in Texas and other states, there has been a reluctance to implement them in some areas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This manuscript provides a detailed description of these program models and discusses relevant research related to their implementation and benefit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• An openness to implementing newcomer centers and dual language programs infused with culturally and linguistically responsive teaching and learning will provide not only success for all learners, but also engage ELs and native English speakers in interaction to promote one united country for all.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Engaging Linguistically diverse families in classroom programs using their home language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A crucial step in supporting students who may be put at risk involves an understanding of, and respect for, the literacy activities of the family and communities in which the child lives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Involve linguistically diverse families in the literacy classroom

**Self Confidence**

Learners’ Attitudes Toward “English-Only Institutional Policies: Language Use Outside the Classroom”

- It is commonly believed that intensive English programs (IEP) are designed to immerse learners in an English-speaking environment to help them effectively develop their language skills.
- Therefore, despite countless studies on the importance of a learner’s first language (L1) in second language learning, some IEPs enforce English-only policies that prohibit L1 use both in and beyond the classroom.
- Knowing students’ attitudes toward such policies is essential; however, research says very little to help us understand students’ perspectives.
  
  • Thus, in this study, IEP students of various proficiency levels and L1 backgrounds described their attitudes toward the institutional English-only policy at an intensive English program associated with a large U.S. university. Data were collected through a survey (n = 158), interviews (n = 6), and focus groups (n = 4).
  
  • Positive attitudes included feeling that the English-only policy helped students to improve their English proficiency, prepare them for the high demands of using English proficiency in real-world interaction, and demonstrate respect for other students and teachers who cannot understand their first.
  
  • Several aspects of the policy were perceived negatively, including the ways teachers dealt with students speaking their L1 outside the classroom, methods of punishment that could impact students’ grades, the unconditional character of the policy that denied learners their agency, and the lack of systematic implementation. Based on these findings, suggestions are provided for designing institutional environments that could more effectively maximize target language use rather than demoralize learners.

Using the Mother tongue in Foreign Language Learning: Secondary School Students in Kazakhstan

- One of the notable behaviors of individuals during the teaching of foreign languages is the use of the first language as an integral part of the learning-teaching process.
- This situation can also negatively affect the learning of a foreign language.
- The aim of this study is to determine the reasons why secondary-school students in Kazakhstan feel the need to use their first language (Kazakh or Russian) in foreign language classes where they are studying English.
- The research, based on the general screening model, was conducted in Astana, the capital of Kazakhstan, in three middle schools with a group of 296 11th grade students.
- The data was obtained by using an attitude scale consisting of four factors which was developed by Ocak, Kuru and Ozchalishan (2010).
- The scale factor-loads varied between 0.35-0.85; and reliability was found to be Alpha=0.71.
- According to the findings, students avoid the use of the foreign languages they study; have motivation problems; have a fear of being criticized by teachers; have a fear of being teased by classmates; tease their friends; and don’t believe in themselves enough. It is therefore necessary to take measures to increase the self-confidence of students; and a more English-speaking environment should be established.

Masking, mediators, and agency: bilingual children and learning to read

- This paper begins with a discussion of some of the key insights of recent sociocultural research that consider bilingual children and learning to read and culminates in a discussion of Syncretic Literacy Studies (SLS).
- It then presents data from an ethnographic study that focused on the learning experiences of a small group of Year Three Bangladeshi-heritage pupils during 1 year of their schooling in order to
problematize some of the claims made in recent sociocultural work and in SLS, particularly the focus on children’s agency.

- The findings from the study suggest that there are limits to children’s agency that are not recognized in recent work and in SLS; (b) that identity has an important role to play: children can successfully mask what they cannot do as readers in order to present a particular identity in the mainstream classroom; and (c) that the access some children have to mediators may be limited and can change over time.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>From Learner to Teacher Assistant: Community Based Service-Learning in a Dual-Language Classroom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The Challenge: Community-based service-learning (CBSL) experiences require that second language learners use language with sensitivity and flexibility, which is often challenging for intermediate students. How does the scaffolded instruction in dual-language classrooms support the language development of both the young classroom learners and their university partners? How can universities and schools collaborate to create CBSL opportunities?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The growth of Latinx populations in the United States has resulted in an increasing number of community-based service-learning (CBSL) opportunities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In particular, the steady growth in Spanish-English dual-language school and the accompanying staff shortages position elementary classrooms as meaningful settings in which to develop relationships between postsecondary L2 Spanish learners and Spanish-speaking children and adults.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This qualitative study investigated a CBSL program in which L2 Spanish learners at an urban university served as weekly teaching assistants at a local dual-language elementary school. Data were collected from 55 reflective blog entries, two focus group sessions, and interviews with four teaching assistants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The L2 Spanish learners reported that the experience supported their language acquisition by (1) providing oral language practice outside of class, (2) facilitating linguistic self-confidence, (3) fostering metacognitive reflection, and (4) transforming motivation and attitudes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Implications are provided regarding ways that the dual-language classrooms setting holds promise for engaging L2 Spanish learners at various levels in CBSL.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Foreign Language Effect on the Self-Serving Bias: A Field Experiment in the High School Classroom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The rise of bilingual education triggers an important question: which language is preferred for a particular school activity? Our field experiment (n = 120) shows that students (aged 13±15) who process feedback in non-native English have greater self-serving bias than students who process feedback in their native Dutch.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• By contrast, literature on the foreign-language emotionality effect suggests a weaker self-serving bias in the non-native language, so our result adds nuance to that literature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The result is important to schools as it suggests that teachers may be able to reduce students’ defensiveness and demotivation by communicating negative feedback in the native language, and teachers may be able to increase students’ confidence and motivation by communicating positive feedback in the foreign language.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Second Language Orientation and Self-Determination Theory: A structural Analysis of the Factors Affecting Language Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The purpose of the present study is two-fold. First, the present study examines statistical similarity between the integrative and instrumental orientation and Self-Determination Theory subtypes of motivation using chi-square invariance test. Second, based on the results of the chi-square invariance test, the present study further investigates the structural relationships among factors affecting second language achievement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Results of the chi-square invariance test evidence a statistical similarity between the instrumental orientation and external regulation, whereas similarity between the integrative orientation and intrinsic motivation did not reach the point of statistical significance.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Results of the structural analyses demonstrate that intrinsic motivation was the strongest determinant of learners' self-confidence and motivation to learn a second language.

It is also found that intrinsic motivation was only indirectly related to second language achievement through the mediating effects of motivation and self-confidence.

### The effect of ethnic identity and bilingual confidence on Chinese youth's self-esteem

This study examines the interrelated issues of private and public domains of self-esteem, ethnic identity formation, and bilingual confidence among youth of a minority group in a city in western Canada.

- 110 Chinese students aged 11-18 from a Chinese-language school were randomly surveyed.
- Most items of the instrument are derived from the Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale, the Cultural-Free Self-Esteem Inventories, and the Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure.
- Participants' self-confidence with the English and Chinese languages is also investigated.
- Zero-Order correlate analysis and a two-way MACOVA controlling for GPA are used to examine potential factors that influence Chinese youth's global academic, and social self-esteem.

The results confirm the importance of ethnic identity on minority youth's global self-esteem.

Self-confidence with bilingual proficiency has a great effect on Chinese Youth's global, academic, and social self-esteem.

### The Effects of Self-Confidence in Bilingual Abilities on the Language Use: Perspectives on Pasifika language Use in South Auckland

This paper considers speakers' differing degrees of self-confidence in their bilingual abilities and their effects on reported language use and observed patterns of language choice.

- One hundred and twenty individuals from New Zealand's four largest Pasifika communities Samoan, Cook Islands, Tongan and Niuean reported on their self confidence in both their community language (CL) and English, and on the basis of these responses, five speaker types are distinguished.
- Analysis of their demographic profiles reveals differences with respect to first language, language of the childhood home and language of primary education. First language, for example, is an important variable for distinguishing those with limited self-confidence in their CL.
- Primary education singles out those who view themselves as English dominant (EDs), while differing CL use at home distinguishes CL dominant bilinguals (CDs), dual high proficiency speakers (DHPs) and English dominants (EDs).

The findings show how analyses based on speakers' self-confidence in bilingual abilities provide a community-friendly tool for describing patterns of language use and explaining the effects of social variables on language proficiency.

### Critical Consciousness

Vernacular Spanish as a promoter of critical consciousness in dual language bilingual education classrooms

Historically, Spanish-speaking students have not been allowed to use their home and community linguistic practices in their schooling in the U.S., even in most Spanish-English dual language bilingual education (DLBE) programs, which require standard Spanish with strict language separation policies.

These pedagogical practices have led to the reproduction of deficit language ideologies in DLBE classrooms that may harm students.

In this essay, researchers call for programs to adopt vernacular forms of Spanish, including translanguaging practices, in bilingual and biliteracy instruction in order to meet the needs of Spanish-speaking students and combat deficit language ideologies and practices.

From a critical pedagogical perspective, deliberate inclusion of vernacular Spanish (and translanguaging) in bilingualism and biliteracy is an ideal means to develop critical consciousness for
### Bilingualism, Biliteracy, Biculturalism, and Critical Consciousness for All: Proposing a Fourth Fundamental Goal for Two-Way Dual Language Education

- Although TWDL programs are designed to integrate students from diverse language, culture, and race backgrounds, equity is unfortunately still a challenge in TWDL classrooms and schools.
- Researchers argue that centering critical consciousness—by fostering among teachers, parents, and children an awareness of the structural oppression that surrounds us and a readiness to take action to correct it—can support increased equity and social justice in TWDL education.
- Researchers elaborate four elements of critical consciousness: interrogating power, critical listening, historicizing schools, and embracing discomfort.
- Researchers describe how critical consciousness impacts and radicalizes the other three core goals, in turn supporting the development of more successful, equitable, and socially just TWDL schools.

### Remodeling dual language programs: Teachers enact agency as critically conscious language policy makers

- Dual language (DL) programs experience many tensions stemming from English hegemony in its curriculum, instruction, and assessment.
- These tensions often work in concert to usurp the three goals of DL programs to develop bilingualism, biliteracy, and bicultural competence while achieving grade level standards for its students.
- Subsequently, there is need to understand how DL teachers can and do enact agency as language policymakers to create DL programs that truly accomplishes its three-fold goals.
- Using a case study method with two DL programs within different schools, the researchers explore how 13 Spanish- and English-medium DL teachers perceive their agency and display critical consciousness, by b) acknowledging program tensions and c) acting to remodel their programs.
- Interviews, surveys, and focus group data from teachers and administrators reveal that DL teachers report a lack of perceived agency in their role as language policymakers.
- Simultaneously, these DL teachers demonstrate a keen awareness of the hegemonic tensions ubiquitous to DL programs.
- Some teachers covertly remodel their programs to meet students' holistic needs.
- Researchers suggest this nuanced understanding of collective agency provides a foundation to prepare DL teachers and administrators to jointly name tensions and take action by openly remodeling programs to best serve their students.

### Preparing Critically Conscious Dual-Language Teachers: Recognizing and Interrupting Dominant Ideologies

- Due to the preK–12 student growth, the exponential growth of dual-language programs, and the gentrification of dual-language education, the need for critically conscious dual-language teachers is undeniably vital today.
- Institutions of higher education, in particular colleges of education, find themselves at the center of a transformative era, in both theory and practice, with respect to dual-language teacher preparation.
- Currently, dual-language teacher educators’ conversations revolve around the challenge in identifying, naming, and confronting pressing issues related to the preparation of dual language teachers and their readiness to meet the demands created by the proliferation of dual language schools across the nation.
- This article centers on the fundamental matters of recognizing and interrupting dominant ideologies and hegemonic practices that have made their way into dual-language classrooms by explicitly addressing how a teacher’s ideology, sociocultural/linguistic funds of
Two Dual Language Preschool Teachers’ Critical Consciousness of Their Roles As Language Policy Makers

- This paper explores how two dual language preschool teachers demonstrated critical consciousness in their dual language education (DLE) classroom in Arizona.
- DLE has historically been grounded in equity for language minoritized students and promises to support students’ bilingualism, biliteracy, sociocultural competence, and academic achievement.
- However, inequities within DLE have been a social justice concern hindering DLE’s goals.
- Arguing the role of teachers’ critical consciousness in addressing inequities in DLE, we used Spolky’s language policy theory to understand teachers’ language policies in their classroom. In this ethnographic study, data was collected through interviews, participant observation, and recording classroom instruction.
- Utilizing the constant-comparative method, we identified two themes—critical reflection and action—exhibiting the teachers’ critical consciousness as language policymakers in their classrooms.
- The teachers reflected on the DLE’s value for students and the power hierarchies among English and Spanish and the speakers of those languages.
- Their actions were toward promoting bilingualism, challenging English hegemony, and creating an inclusive and social justice-oriented learning community. Our study contributes to preschool DLE literature by documenting the teachers’ challenges regarding how larger oppressive beliefs related to language and race influenced students’ language use and the teachers’ actions to dismantle such challenges.

Ciencias Bilingües: How Dual Language Teachers Cultivate Equity in Dual Language Classrooms

- The purpose of this study is to document how K-8 critically conscious, dual language, science teachers (CCDLSTs) working with bilingual learners (BLs) practice their critical consciousness via the four tenets of dual language education: ideological clarity, pedagogical perspective and clarity, access for all, and equitable spaces (IPAE).
- This paper is informed by the fourth tenet and research question: How do CCDLSTs create equitable spaces in science learning environments?
- Previous research offers limited information on how dual language, science teachers practice their critical consciousness.
- Given the era of Common Core State Standards and the number of BLs left with underprepared teachers, this study advances an understanding of what CCDLSTs are doing in classrooms to draw upon the assets of BLs while implementing the Next Generation Science Standards (NGSS).
- A phenomenological qualitative design was used to gather interview and observational data of how six CCDLSTs working in Southern California public schools employed a critically conscious pedagogy in a Spanish/English dual language setting while creating access to science content with equity at the core.
- Findings include research-based examples of the instructional processes CCDLSTs used in their classrooms to create equity while teaching science in dual language classrooms.

Si no estás defendiendo tus alumnus, que estás haciendo en el salón? A Mexican Immigrant Teacher’s Journey to Critical Consciousness

- Currently, there is limited research examining the barriers that immigrant professionals experience when becoming a bilingual teacher in the United States.
- This study examines the trajectory of a Mexican national, trained as a teacher in his home country, who became a bilingual dual-language educator in a Central Texas school district.
• Drawing on a critical pedagogy framework and a series of narrative life history interviews, researchers explore how this teacher’s personal and professional experiences in Mexico and then in the United States—particularly in the professional communities of a master’s degree program and a language revitalization Saturday school—helped him (co)construct a strong cultural and linguistic identity. Researchers track how these experiences further impacted his desire to expand his sphere of influence and work toward transformative change for fellow teachers.
• We conclude with implications for teaching, leadership, identity construction, and teacher preparation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Network</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rethinking Bilingual Instruction
• Bilingual students have larger social networks that can help them navigate both school and community contexts (Zhou & Bankston, 1998)

Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language Programs
• Considerable research documents students’ outcomes in dual language (DL) programs, but there is little examination of students’ perceptions of bilingualism and its impact on students’ cognitive functioning and social relationships, especially with comparative studies across different target languages and student backgrounds.
• This study, which included a total of 788 fifth- through eighth-grade students who had participated in a Spanish-English (n = 645) or Mandarin-English (n = 143) dual language program, surveyed students’ language proficiencies, ratings of bilingualism, and social and cognitive functioning.
• Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual.
• However, there were significant group differences according to target language, program model (90:10 vs. 50:50), level of bilingualism, and whether students were native target language or English speakers.

Bilingual development and social networks of British-born Chinese children
• This paper is concerned with L1 maintenance in an L2 environment specifically focusing on the interaction of social-network ties and language choice among the Chinese community in Tyneside in the northeast of England, a community that has been characterized by a shift from Chinese-dominant usage in 3 generations.
• The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of network ties rather than morphology of the network.
• Fieldwork with 34 children and their families is reported.
• A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer.
• However, in all other peer interactions, regardless of family ties, a mixed code and/or English was more frequently used.
• Children who had the opportunity to use Chinese (without code mixing) to a close family member or a friend of the older generation were regularly more proficient in their Cantonese than those who did not.
• This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction.
### Challenging School Segregation in the Twenty-first Century: How Districts can Leverage Dual Language Education to Increase School and Classroom Diversity

- Nationally, schools are increasingly segregated by race and poverty as a result of demographic shifts and a changing legal and political landscape.
- Based on evidence that students benefit academically and socially from attending integrating settings, many school districts are exploring options for providing diverse learning experiences.
- Researchers examine dual language education as a means for promoting ethnically, racially, and linguistically diverse learning experiences.
- First, researchers describe the various advantages of dual language both in general and specifically to the creation of diverse schools and classrooms.
- Next, researchers provide recommendations for how districts can effectively implement dual language education in a manner that also advances diversity goals.
- Dual-language schools can be incredibly effective at ensuring students of different backgrounds learn in the same classroom rather than just superficially enroll in the same school.
- By the very nature of dual language, students are often in a classroom with children of differing backgrounds.
- Dual language education can allow teachers to “position” students and families from diverse linguistic backgrounds as language and culture brokers for English-speaking peers and families (DeMatthews, Izquierdo, and Knight 2017; Lee, Hill-Bonnet, and Raley 2011; Palmer 2008).
- Being dual language helps to promote healthy multigenerational, multicultural, and multilingual communities, because it allows schools to connect with a historically marginalized community whose first language is not English as well as the grassroots organizations that are engaged in advocacy and community development work (Fránquiz, Salazar, and DeNicolo 2011; Wiemelt and Welton 2015).
- Dual-language education has the added advantage that the model makes racial and ethnic diversity a classroom asset, which in turn promotes even greater benefits on student learning and socialization.
- Dual language offers an avenue for districts interested in navigating these obstacles and can be an excellent way to concurrently foster diversity in the classroom and improve a variety of social and academic outcomes for the entire student body.

### Languages Across Borders: Social Network Development in An Adolescent Two-Way Dual Language Program

- Background/Context: Two-way dual-language programs have become an increasingly popular educational model in the United States for language minority and majority speakers, with a small but growing number of programs at the high school level. Little is known, however, about how adolescents’ social networks develop in the contexts of these programs.
- Purpose/Objective: This study examines how a two-way, dual language enrichment program for Spanish-language learner and English-language learner adolescents influenced students’ social networks with peers of different cultural and linguistic backgrounds.
- Setting: The program took place in a south-Atlantic state at a suburban/rural high school that has substantial within-school linguistic segregation.
- Population/Participants: Program participants included 20 students: 10 English-dominant learners of Spanish, and 10 Spanish-dominant learners of English.
- Intervention/Program: The two-way dual-language program was a voluntary extracurricular program in which adolescent Spanish-dominant English Learners and English-dominant SLLs participated in collaborative and student-led bilingual activities designed to foster the sharing of cross-linguistic expertise and cross-cultural knowledge over a seven-month period.
| **Tell Me Who Your Friends Are and I Might be Able to Tell You What Languages You Speak: Social Network Analysis, Bilingualism, and Identity** | **Social network analysis has proved particularly useful in explaining why speakers in bilingual communities maintain or change their language behavior.**
| | Researchers have employed this sociolinguistic tool to investigate language shift and maintenance among longstanding stable bilingual communities. |
| | An underlying assumption in this analysis is that language, particularly the first language or mother tongue, is an integral part of collective identities, such as national, ethnic, or cultural identities, and that maintenance of language across generations is a key factor to the maintenance of such identities. |
| | Certain bilingual communities may maintain this language ideology; however, multilingual communities present a more complex picture of the situation and may thus offer a challenge to the underlying assumptions of social network analysis. |
| | This article discusses the application of social network analysis to multilingual communities by taking a point of departure in the Filipino community in Oslo, the capital of Norway, with a view towards understanding linguistic and cultural maintenance. |
| | Results from the analyses provide support for the importance of social network in understanding language choice and cultural and linguistic maintenance; however, there were some notable exceptions. In this article we discuss language ideologies and the relationship between language and identity as complementary sources of explanation for language choice and language maintenance in this relatively speaking newly established multilingual community. |
| **Noting and Other Language Management Processes of a Learner of Japanese in His Bilingual Social Networks** | **This case study examines the language problems that are noted and further managed by a Japanese language learner studying at an Australian university.**
| | Through the use of interviews as well as the analysis of the learner’s natural conversation, the study mainly focuses on some major factors that affect these management processes. To date, there has been little research on noting and other management processes in out-of-class natural contexts, in particular that on presentational problems noted by foreign language learners. |
| | Utilizing an approach that incorporates language management theory and activity theory, this study reveals that these problems seem to be perceived and managed seriously by the learner in his conversation. |
- The findings also indicate that one of the major factors that affect the learner’s language management processes is a contradiction that emerges between two activities of the communities where the learner and his interactants are situated.
- This contradiction, in turn, seems to lead to a number of other contradictions between the three interactants’ goals of the conversation, which possibly affect the learner’s evaluations of language deviations and consequent adjustments in complex ways.
- Other factors include the learner’s L2 use history, such as formal Japanese study, which might contribute to his correctness-oriented approach, and the strength of indication of each participant’s preference for English or Japanese.

| Bilingual development and social networks of British born Chinese children | This paper is concerned with L1 maintenance in an L2 environment specifically focusing on the interaction of social-network ties and language choice among the Chinese community in Tyneside in the northeast of England, a community that has been characterized by a shift from Chinese-dominant usage in 3 generations.
- The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of network ties rather than morphology of the network.
- Fieldwork with 34 children and their families is reported.
- A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer.
- However, in all other peer interactions, regardless of family ties, a mixed code and/or English was more frequently used.
- Children who had the opportunity to use Chinese (without code mixing) to a close family member or a friend of the older generation were regularly more proficient in their Cantonese than those who did not.
- This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction. |

| Language networks and social status among Mexican Americans | A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks.
- This reciprocal relationship is simultaneously a force of assimilation and of dissimilation.
- Interpersonal networks are a concrete basis of both culture and social structure. Family, friends, and acquaintances reinforce the beliefs, arts, and institutions of a culture (Greeley, 1974; Yancy and Erikson, 1977) and transmit the advantages, aspirations, and opportunities of a social structure (e.g., Duncan, Haller, and Portes, 1971).
- Through their common basis in the associations among people, the cultural and socioeconomic realms influence each other.
- Placement and action in one realm is simultaneously placement and action in the other.
- In this study we explore the impact of interlocking cultural and socioeconomic networks amid status attainment and assimilation among the Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas. |

| Creating Classroom Communities in Linguistically Diverse Settings: Teacher-Directed, Classroom-Level Factor Effects on Peer Dynamics | Employing a social capital framework, this study investigates teachers’ role in influencing the peer dynamics between English learners (ELs) and their non-EL peers.
- Participants include 713 students (211 English Learners). |
- Observed teacher-student interaction quality and teacher self-reports of their peer network management were used to operationalize the teacher-directed, classroom-level factors.

- Peer nominations of friendships within the classroom were used to operationalize students’ same-language-status (bonding capital) and cross-language-status (bridging capital) friendships.

- Multilevel models reveal teachers’ reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners.

- For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generation Status, Social Capital, and the Routes out of High School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>This study investigates immigrant-native differences in the activities of adolescents 2 years after their sophomore year of high school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researchers employ longitudinal data for the modeling of duration, nativity and generation differences in education and employment activities during late adolescence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researchers ask if the same human and social capital characteristics employed as explanations for nativity differences in achievement are predictive of high school participation versus other activities such as labor force participation within a cohort of adolescents.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Despite their lower levels of human capital and lower previous academic performance, recent immigrants who arrive in the United States as adolescents are more likely than those who arrive earlier or those born in the United States to persevere in high school. |
| Access to familial social capital and attitudinal measures help explain some of this effect. As for those who do leave school early, socioeconomic status and language background play a role in the activities respondents pursue. While recent immigrants are more likely to persevere in high school, once they leave they are no more likely to pursue additional education than their U.S. born counterparts. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationships with Family and Friends</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Considerable research documents students’ outcomes in dual language (DL) programs, but there is little examination of students’ perceptions of bilingualism and its impact on students’ cognitive functioning and social relationships, especially with comparative studies across different target languages and student backgrounds.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| This study, which included a total of 788 fifth through eighth-grade students who had participated in a Spanish-English (n = 645) or Mandarin-English (n = 143) dual language program, surveyed students’ language proficiencies, ratings of bilingualism, and social and cognitive functioning. |

| Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual. |

| However, there were significant group differences according to target language, program model (90:10 vs. 50:50), level of bilingualism, and whether students were native target language or English speakers. |

| Little research has been conducted on the play of children of very low English proficiency within English-speaking preschool classrooms. |

| In the present investigation, we recorded and described the naturalistic free play of four dual language learners (DLLs) and... |
compared their interactions to those of four English-speaking children.

- Units of interaction were identified, transcribed, named, and categorized. Illustrative transcriptions of individual interactions were selected and probed more deeply.
- The trustworthiness of the investigation was established by triangulating these qualitative findings with a quantitative measure of children’s social participation in play.
- Findings indicate that DLLs play and talk with peers less frequently, interact in less sustained and positive ways, and are more reliant on teachers to support their play than their English-speaking peers. Implications for scaffolding DLLs’ play in classrooms and for future research are presented.

**Creating Classroom Communities in linguistically diverse settings: teacher directed, classroom level factor effects on peer dynamics**

- Employing a social capital framework, this study investigates teachers’ role in influencing the peer dynamics between English learners (ELs) and their non-EL peers. Participants include 713 students (211 English Learners).
- Observed teacher-student interaction quality and teacher self-reports of their peer network management were used to operationalize the teacher-directed, classroom-level factors.
  - Peer nominations of friendships within the classroom were used to operationalize students’ same-language-status (bonding capital) and cross-language-status (bridging capital) friendships.
  - Multilevel models reveal teachers’ reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners.
  - For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships.

**Writing their way into talk: emergent bilinguals’ emergent literacy practices as pathways to peer interaction and oral language growth**

- This paper explores the idea that young children’s emergent literacy practices can be tools for mediating peer interaction, and that, therefore, literacy, even in its earliest stages, can support oral language development, particularly for emergent bilinguals.
- The paper draws on data collected during a year-long ethnographic study of 11 Nepali- and Turkish-speaking three- and four-year-old’s learning English in their first year of school.
- Using neo-Vygotskian activity theory as a guide, this paper examines the children’s classroom literacy practices, particularly around writing and the alphabet, in order to understand, first, how literacy functioned as a socially embedded activity for these students (sometimes in ways that contrasted with the official literacy practices of the classroom), and second, how that activity facilitated students’ interaction across language backgrounds.
- This paper offers a genetic analysis, or an analysis across time, of how students’ interactions with multimodal composing functioned as contexts for emergent bilinguals’ oral language development, and in particular, vocabulary acquisition.

**Understanding, Connection, and Identification: Friendship Features of Bilingual Spanish-English Speaking Undergraduates**

- Bilingual undergraduates may have closer friendships with other bilinguals than with monolinguals.
- This study investigated this hypothesis and explored the friendship features of 46 bilingual Spanish and English-speaking undergraduates by combining quantitative analyses of surveys and qualitative analyses of interviews.
- Survey results indicated that participants rated their friendships with bilinguals to be more secure, closer, and to provide more help and companionship than their friendships with monolinguals.
- During interviews, participants described understanding, connection, and identification with their bilingual friends.
### Transactional relationships between Latino’s friendship quality and academic achievement during the transition to middle school

- These features were considered reasons for their friendships with other bilinguals and reasons for their greater quality.
- Bilingual friendships also helped bilingual undergraduates navigate a challenging sociopolitical context and have pride in their ethnolinguistic identity.

- **This study investigates whether friendship quality, academic achievement, and mastery goal orientation predict each other across the transition to middle school.**
- Participants were 146 Latino students (75 girls) followed from the end of elementary school through the first year of middle school.
- Measures included positive and negative friendship quality, mastery goal orientation, and grade point averages (GPAs) at three time periods. In general, Latino adolescents showed stable academic achievement and did not decline in any of the measures from elementary school to middle school.
- Cross-lagged path analyses revealed a bidirectional and negative relationship between negative friendship quality and academic achievement across the transition to middle school.
- Positive friendship quality predicted mastery goal orientation decreases for girls.
- Both gender and bilingual status were analyzed and showed significant relations in our models. Results supported the social interaction perspective more than the social bonding perspective of friendship quality.

### Language choice and identity construction of Azerbaijani bilinguals in family and friendship domains

- This study investigates Azerbaijani bilinguals’ language choice and identity construction processes in family and friendship domains.
- Individual interviews were conducted with 19 (11 male, 8 female) participants. The emerged themes were classified under three categories, i.e., age, gender, and language ideologies.
- The findings revealed that language attitudes and ideologies are the main reason for Azerbaijani bilinguals’ language choice in family and friendship domains. Farsi as the national language and the only language of education is considered important symbolic power compared to Azerbaijani Turkish language.
- The findings of the study also showed that age and gender in family domain and gender in friendship domain are influential factors in Azerbaijani bilinguals’ language choice.
- Azerbaijani bilingual females use Azerbaijani Turkish to speak to their older family members while they choose Farsi to speak to other family members. Azerbaijani bilingual males choose Azerbaijani Turkish to speak to their older family members, their brothers, and their male friends but they speak in Farsi to their female family members and female friends as well as their children.

### Bilingualism in Autism: Language learning profiles and social experiences

- Bilingualism changes how people relate to others and lead their lives. This is particularly relevant in autism, where social interaction presents challenges.
- Understanding the overlap between the social variations of bilingualism and autism could unveil new ways to support autistic people.
- This research aims to understand the language learning and social experiences of mono-, bi- and multilingual autistic people.
- A total of 297 autistic adults (mean age = 32.4 years) completed an online questionnaire including general demographic, language history and social life quality self-rating items.
- The sample included 89 monolingual English speakers, 98 bilinguals, and 110 multilinguals, with a wide range of language profiles.
- Regression models were used to analyze how bilingualism variables predicted social life quality ratings.
| Rethinking Bilingual Education | Preserving the home language reduces cultural dissonance between children and parents, reinforcing parental authority and thus reducing behavior problems (Portes & Hao, 2002; Portes & Rumbaut, 2001) |
| Engaging Linguistically diverse families in classroom programs using their home language | Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000). A crucial step in supporting students who may be put at risk involves an understanding of, and respect for, the literacy activities of the family and communities in which the child lives. Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children. Involve linguistically diverse families in the literacy classroom |
| Social Competence | Effective peer interaction is fundamental to social development, cognitive development, and academic success. Young children’s early exposure to and development of social competence begins in the home and is further developed upon entry into early childhood programs. In the United States, where early childhood programs serve increasingly diverse families, discrepancies between families and teachers in relation to the social competencies valued may exist. This study compares parent and teacher perspectives of children’s social competence (i.e., social skills and problem behaviors) and whether similarities and differences in perspectives are associated with children’s classification as an emergent bilingual or monolingual native English speaker. Findings indicate statistically significant differences in parent and teacher ratings on the empathy, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for bilingual children and on the empathy, self-control, internalizing, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for monolingual English-speaking children. |
| Bilingual children judge moral, social, and language violations as less transgressive than monolingual children | Learning the rules and expectations that govern our social interactions is one of the major challenges of development. The current study examined whether bilingualism is associated with differences in children’s developing social knowledge. Researchers presented 54 4- to 6-year-old monolingual and bilingual children with vignettes of moral transgressions (e.g., hitting), social transgressions (e.g., wearing pants on one’s head), and language transgressions (e.g., calling a common object by a nonsense word) and asked about their permissibility. In line with previous research findings, results demonstrate that all children evaluated moral violations more harshly than conventional violations. |
- Notably, however, bilingual children were more permissive of violations across moral, social, and language domains than monolingual children.
- These findings yield new insights into the role of early experience in the development of social knowledge.
- We propose that bilinguals’ unique linguistic and social experiences influence their understanding of moral and conventional rules.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The impact of early social interactions on later language development in Spanish-English bilingual infants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• This study tested the impact of child-directed language input on language development in Spanish–English bilingual infants (N = 25, 11- and 14-month-olds from the Seattle metropolitan area), across languages and independently for each language, controlling for socioeconomic status.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Language input was characterized by social interaction variables, defined in terms of speech style (“parentese” vs. standard speech) and social context (one-on-one vs. group).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Correlations between parentese one-on-one and productive vocabulary at 24 months (n = 18) were found across languages and in each language independently.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Differences are highlighted between previously published monolingual samples, which used the same methods as the current study of bilingual infants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The results also suggest cultural effects on language input and language development in bilingual and bicultural infants.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social competence, cultural orientations, and gender differences: a study of Mandarin-English bilingual preschoolers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• This study investigated whether host and heritage cultural orientations were associated with Chinese preschoolers’ social competence and whether such associations varied across gender in Western contexts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ninety-six Chinese-Australian children aged 36–69 months from 15 childcare centers in Sydney participated in the study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The General Ethnicity Questionnaires were modified to obtain a parent report of children’s orientation to the host and heritage cultures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Social competence was assessed using teacher reports on the Behavior Assessment System for Children-2 (BASC-2) with four composite scales: Externalizing, Internalizing, Behavioral Symptoms and Adaptive Skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Host culture orientation was negatively associated with Internalizing, Behavioral Symptoms and positively with Adaptive Skills in the overall sample.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• When analyzed by gender, host cultural orientation was found to be positively associated with Adaptive Skills for boys and girls and negatively associated with Externalizing and Behavioral Symptoms only in girls.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Heritage cultural orientation was not associated with the BASC-2 composites either in the overall sample or by gender.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The results indicate that host culture has a stronger relationship with social competence than heritage culture, particularly for girls.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A longitudinal study of the social and academic competence of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• This longitudinal study was conducted to gain understanding of the social–emotional and academic development of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In Study 1, the authors combined cognitive, psychosocial, and cultural-linguistic factors to determine profiles of social competence as measured by peer play.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A person-centered analysis of 207 Hispanic American preschoolers (ages 4 and 5 years) yielded 6 distinct profiles, 2 of which were socially competent and 1 of which was vulnerable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development. In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| The social and cultural contexts of second language acquisition in young children | The aim of the present study was to examine the social behavior and competence of children, ages 3–6 as they progressed through the stages of second language acquisition in a dual-immersion program in English and Mandarin.  
- Over 100 2–3 hour classroom observations were made during the school year.  
- Teachers’ evaluations of children’s social competence and behavior were collected at the beginning and end of the school year.  
- Results suggest that girls had more social adjustment difficulties than boys.  
- However, as language skills increased, adjustment difficulties decreased significantly among all children. |
|-----------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| Longitudinal Social and Communication Outcomes in Children with Autism Raised in Bi/Multilingual Environments | Globally, there are more bilingual speakers than monolingual speakers; however, scant research evidence exists regarding social communication development and outcomes for bilingual children with autism spectrum disorder (ASD).  
- A stronger evidence base will facilitate health professionals and educators providing accurate recommendations regarding language use.  
- This study employed a longitudinal cohort design to compare social and communication skills, at baseline and over 12 months, for 60 monolingual and 60 bilingual children with ASD receiving community based early intervention.  
- Researchers found few differences at intake, and no difference in the magnitude of change over 12 months for this cohort.  
- Findings support the notion that there is no basis on which to discourage home language use with bilingual children with ASD. |
| Social Competence and Language Skills in Mandarin-English bilingual preschoolers: The moderation effect of emotion regulation | Research Findings: The main aim of this study was to examine whether language skills and emotion regulation are associated with social competence and whether the relationship between English skills and social competence is moderated by emotion regulation in Mandarin–English bilingual preschoolers.  
- The language skills of 96 children ages 36–69 months from Australian childcare centers were assessed using standardized English and Mandarin tests.  
- Social competence was assessed using teacher reports on the Behavior Assessment System for Children–2 (BASC-2) with 4 composite scales: Externalizing, Internalizing, Behavioral Symptoms, and Adaptive Skills.  
- Positive emotion regulation and emotion dysregulation were assessed using the disappointing gift task and teacher report on the Emotion Regulation Checklist.  
- The results show that positive emotion regulation, emotion dysregulation, English skills, and Mandarin skills were associated with different composites of the BASC-2; the relationships between English skills and Behavioral Symptoms were moderated by positive emotion regulation; and English skills and Adaptive Skills were moderated by emotion dysregulation.  
- Practice or Policy: Discussion of the results includes new considerations for a focus on emotion regulation as well as language to promote social competence in bilingual children. |
| An exploratory longitudinal study of social and language outcomes in children with autism in bilingual home environments | Little is known about outcomes of early intervention for children with autism spectrum disorder reared in bilingual homes.  
- There are concerns that social communication deficits among children with autism spectrum disorder may reduce the |
| Cognitive, Social Communication and Social Skills Development in Monolingual and Bilingual Children with Autism Spectrum Disorders in a Multiethnic-Lingual Context- A comparative study | The study investigated the effect of language intervention on equal numbers of participants (n=20) in both study groups, monolingual (English only) and bilingual (English and anyone of the Mother Tongue Language) children with autism spectrum disorders, aged between 4.0 and 6.11 years, in Singapore. Each participant received language intervention for six months. The total raw score of cognitive, social communication and social skills in AEPS were computed at the baseline, after twenty-four weeks of language intervention and at week 27. The results revealed statistically significant improvement in the developmental skills in both the study groups, but no significance was indicated between the groups. The study indicated that bilingual exposure in children with autism spectrum disorders does not have any negative impact. |
| Emotion Understanding in Bilingual Preschoolers | The effects of bilingualism on child development have been extensively examined in last decades. Research reveals that simultaneous use of two or more languages affects child’s language development, cognitive and social skills. The current study focuses on the so-far understudied theory of emotion understanding in bilingual children. A cohort of 593 bilingual and monolingual 5–6-year-olds took the Russian version of the Test of Emotion Comprehension (TEC) that assesses three components of emotion understanding: emotion understanding of external causes of emotions, reflective causes of emotions; and mental causes of emotions. Our results revealed no group differences between overall emotion understanding and understanding of external and reflective causes of emotions. However, monolingual children had a slightly better understanding of mental causes of emotions compared to bilingual children, when controlling for age, gender, and non-verbal intelligence. These results suggest that children growing up in bilingual environments might require more time and/or language/culture exposure to master the ability to understand mental causes of emotions, considering cultural differences, as well as the semantic and lexical differences in emotion labelling and emotion expression in each language. |
| The social and cultural contexts of second language acquisition in young children | • The aim of the present study was to examine the social behavior and competence of children, ages 3–6 as they progressed through the stages of second language acquisition in a dual-immersion program in English and Mandarin.  
• Over 100 2–3-hour classroom observations were made during the school year.  
• Teachers’ evaluations of children’s social competence and behavior were collected at the beginning and end of the school year.  
• Results suggest that girls had more social adjustment difficulties than boys.  
• However, as language skills increased, adjustment difficulties decreased significantly among all children. |
| Cultural Context as a Biasing Factor For Language Activation in Bilinguals | • Two studies investigated how cultural context and familiarity impact lexical access in Korean–English bilingual and English monolingual adults. ERPs were recorded while participants decided whether a word and picture matched or not. Pictures depicted versions of objects that were prototypically associated with North American Korean culture and named in either English or Korean, creating culturally congruent and incongruent trials.  
• For bilinguals, culturally congruent trials facilitated responding but ERP results showed that images from both cultures were processed similarly.  
• For monolinguals, culturally incongruent pairs produced longer RTs and larger N400s than congruent items, indicating more effortful processing.  
• Thus, an unfamiliar culture impeded linguistic processing for monolinguals but facilitated it for bilinguals familiar with that culture.  
• Study 2 presented images that were more or less familiar and both groups replicated the pattern for monolinguals in Study 1. Therefore, in Study 1 monolinguals responded to familiarity but bilinguals responded to culture. |
| Effect of Language Context on Ratings of Shy and Unsociable Behaviors in English Language Learner Children | • Purpose: The primary goal of this study was to explore the effect of language context on the socially withdrawn behaviors of school-age children who are English language learners (English Learners) from middle- to high–socioeconomic status (SES) backgrounds. This is one of the 1st studies to address the frequently confused concepts of shyness and unsociability as independent constructs within the English Learner population. The authors of this study also investigated the feasibility of an experimental parent and child questionnaire that examines shyness and unsociability across native-language and English-speaking contexts.  
• Method: Children and mothers (34 of whom were English Learners and 37 of whom were native English speakers) were administered an experimental questionnaire examining the children’s shy and unsociable behavior in native-language and English-speaking contexts.  
• Results: Children and mothers in the English Learner group reported significantly higher ratings of shy behavior in English speaking versus native-language contexts, whereas unsociable ratings did not differ across language contexts.  
• Conclusions: Shyness and unsociability are distinguishable behaviors in English Learner children, and researchers should consider these constructs when examining withdrawal. In addition, examining English Learner children’s behavior across language contexts provides a valuable method for investigating language-influenced behavioral problems. This study demonstrates the need for service providers to evaluate behavior across subtype and language context before pathologizing withdrawal in English Learner children. |
**Language and Social Development in a Multilingual Classroom: A Dinosaur Project Enriched with Block Play**

- The ASM early childhood program is based on a constructivist philosophy, with play at the center of the curriculum.
- The program focuses on social, emotional, cognitive, and physical development, and language acquisition, with a balance between teacher-centered and child centered activities.
- The goal of the project approach is to foster young children’s thinking, self-awareness, senses, emotions, community membership, and aesthetic experiences (Katz & Chard 2000).
- By webbing, organizing, using recorded observations, and engaging children in ongoing small group discussions, teachers gain insight into how they might explore and challenge children’s preexisting notions.
- They provide active visual, verbal, and kinesthetic modeling to help children become proficient learners of the target language.
- The natural approach theory (Krashen, Terrell, & Candlin 1996) of second language acquisition highlights the link between language and social development among young children who are dual language learners. According to this approach, learning a new language is based on four principles: comprehensible input, production, communicative goals, and inquiry topics.
- With the implementation of the natural approach, the dinosaur study and facilitated block play gave dual language learners many opportunities to acquire a new language, develop social skills, and improve communication abilities.
- Once teachers identified the barriers to children playing and talking together, we created a classroom environment that supported development of social, communication, and language skills.
- When teachers reflect on their ongoing practices and integrate theories that best support children’s learning, they grow professionally. As their reflections lead to use of more effective teaching practices, children benefit too. The end result is an inspiring atmosphere in which the children communicate and socialize, showing respect, acceptance, collaboration, and pride in their play and work.

**Social Validity in Early Language Interventions for Dual Language Learners: A Systematic Review of the Literature**

- The social validity of intervention research has been emphasized in special education and related fields for decades. There is relatively little focus on social validity that considers culturally and linguistically diverse populations.
- Eleven articles met the inclusionary criteria for this systematic review and were evaluated to describe social validity in early language intervention research—specifically with young (birth through 5 years) dual language learners (DLLs).
  - Researchers examined how social validity was considered and addressed, how social validity was measured, and the results of social validity assessments. Definitions of social validity were generally vague, and researchers in most studies only considered social validity post intervention rather than prior to starting or during the interventions. Participants generally viewed interventions positively, but incomplete data were often reported.

**Social Flexibility**

- Researchers explored the ability of children to adapt their communication to the needs of their communication partner.
- Monolingual and bilingual 3-year-old children (N = 110) observed two puppets looking for puzzle pieces.
- One puppet showed its appreciation of the children’s help, the other puppet wanted to solve the puzzle on its own.
- The children’s communicative acts were coded in terms of level of ostension (how obviously they indicated the hiding place of the puzzle piece) and level of information (how clearly they indicated the location).
Monolinguals and bilinguals were equally helpful and informative. In contrast, only bilingual children adapted their level of ostension selectively between the two puppets. These findings point to the greater skills of bilinguals to adapt their communication accordingly.

Does bilingualism really affect social flexibility?

- What are the collateral effects of using two languages on a regular basis? Does bilingualism have an impact on cognitive domains other than language, such as attention, mentalizing, and creativity?
- The studies exploring these issues usually compare the performances of bilinguals and monolinguals in tasks related to various mental constructs (e.g., inhibition, monitoring, etc.).
- Regardless of whether one has a well-articulated theory to hypothesize an effect of bilingualism, research exploring differences between groups of individuals (e.g., women vs. men; African Americans vs. Caucasian Americans) needs to be conducted with special care given the results’ potential social consequences.
- Here we discuss recent results by Ikizer and Ramirez-Esparza (2017), suggesting that bilinguals are more socially flexible than monolinguals.
- We argue that their arguments are not theoretically sound and that their observations are not compelling enough.

Bilinguals’ social flexibility

- Is bilingualism better than monolingualism? Previous work shows that bilinguals have an advantage over monolinguals in cognitive flexibility, the ability to shift between different mental sets.
- In this study, researchers explore if bilingualism also provides an advantage in social flexibility, which we define as the ability to (a) switch with ease and adapt between different social environments and (b) accurately read social cues in the environment.
- Data was collected from 465 monolinguals and 206 bilinguals.
- Bilinguals reported higher social flexibility than monolinguals. Mediation analyses demonstrated that bilinguals’ social flexibility gave them an advantage over monolinguals in the self-reported frequency of social interactions.
- This study reports the first evidence of a social flexibility advantage of bilinguals, and it suggests that as bilinguals alternate between two languages, they might also alternate between two cultural worlds, providing tools to adapt to different social environments and facilitating the frequency of social interactions.

Bilingual and Monolingual Children Prefer Native-Accented Speakers

- Adults and young children prefer to affiliate with some individuals rather than others.
- Studies have shown that monolingual children show in-group biases for individuals who speak their native language without a foreign accent (Kinzler et al., 2007).
- Some studies have suggested that bilingual children are less influenced than monolinguals by language variety when attributing personality traits to different speakers, which could indicate that bilinguals have fewer in-group biases and perhaps greater social flexibility. (Souza et al., 2013)
- However, no previous studies have compared monolingual and bilingual children’s reactions to speakers with unfamiliar foreign accents.
- In the present study, we investigated the social preferences of 5-year-old English and French monolinguals and English French bilinguals.
- Contrary to our predictions, both monolingual and bilingual preschoolers preferred to be friends with native-accented speakers over speakers who spoke their dominant language with an unfamiliar foreign accent.
- This result suggests that both monolingual and bilingual children have strong preferences for in-group members who use a familiar language variety, and that bilingualism does not lead to generalized social flexibility.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Development</th>
<th>Cultural Awareness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Una Búsqueda de la Equidad y la Justicia: District Leaders Attempt to Expand Dual Language Bilingual Education for Equity** | • This case examines one district’s attempts to enhance and rework its approach to dual language bilingual education (DLBE). Upon her hire at “Triton Public Schools,” the new coordinator for language services noticed that Spanish-speaking students designated as English Learners (ELs) had inequitable access to the district’s only DLBE school, and that other programs designed for them did not result in as high academic achievement as DLBE.  
• Conversations by district leadership to make significant changes in their approach to DLBE resulted in public outcry and confusion from educators, as well as Spanish- and English-speaking parents. Our discussion centers on how to employ courageous and social justice-minded leadership to enhance equity, access, and high academic achievement for marginalized student populations in bilingual education. |
| **Leadership for Social Justice and Sustainability: A Historical Case Study of a High-Performing Dual Language School along the U.S.-Mexico Border** | • This qualitative case study is focused on one high-performing urban elementary school that worked to address inequities within the school and community for two decades partly through dual language education.  
• This neighborhood public school has been one of the district’s highest performers for the prior 15 years, was one of the first schools in the nation to develop a dual language program for students classified as English learner (EL) students, and more recently merged with one of the district’s lowest performing and under-enrolled schools to expand access to a high-quality and culturally sustaining education.  
• Key findings from this case highlight intersections between social justice leadership and leadership for school improvement that promote organizational innovation, learning, and sustainability. |
| **The key to global understanding: world languages education—why schools need to adapt** | • Language educational economics is a newly developed field of study, born from the understanding that language educational policies have economic implications (Breton, 1998).  
• Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006).  
• At a time of semi globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs.  
• On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005).  
• Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language:  
• Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture.  
• Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade.  
• Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad.  
• Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.  
• Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public... |
| **Cultural Awareness on a Bilingual Education** | • The purpose of this study is to investigate how a bilingual education program would protect the cultural inheritance, linguistic knowledge, ethnic and religious identity of minority peoples.
  • This study utilized an explanatory sequential mixed method, conducted in two phases: a quantitative phase followed by a qualitative phase.
  • Both quantitative and qualitative data reflected that a bilingual education program could increase the educational success of students and contribute to social justice including equal educational rights.
  • Such a system might also increase brotherhood between different ethnic groups in society and perhaps resolve the conflicts among them.
  • A bilingual education program for minority people is essential for equal access to education. It solves conflicts between different ethnic groups and brings happiness to the society. |
| **A Multilingualism-as-a-Resource Orientation in Dual Language Education** | • Dual language educators and program planners rely on the concept of 'language as a resource' as a foundational principle of dual language education (DLE).
  • Traditionally, the term has been juxtaposed to viewing language as a problem and treating students’ home linguistic and cultural experiences as a deficit rather than an asset for teaching and learning in school.
  • In this article, we argue that a “multilingualism as a resource” orientation is needed as a new or additional paradigm in order to re-imagine DLE within the current context and to respond to the increased diversity within DLE programs.
  • We use Duverger’s model that considers language allocation decisions at the macro, meso, and micro levels as a lens to examine the multilingualism-as-a-resource orientation.
  • Drawing on examples at the program model, curricular, and interactional level, we illustrate both the importance as well as the challenging dynamics that emerge as sociopolitical context, language use, and status intersect in the context of two-way immersion programs. |
| **Using Mother Tongues as Building Blocks in Childhood Education** | • When you devalue home languages by, for instance, using just English with students who speak another language at home, you stifle learning and community engagement.
  • Some language laws, like Arizona’s English-only law and Russia’s law banning instruction in minority languages like Bashkir and Tatar (effective September 1, 2013), silence students and jeopardize the success of entire communities.
  • Language is the foundation for all learning, including interpersonal communication, reading, writing, and the core content we expect children to know. Children’s language also mirrors what they know, and how they categorize information and conceptualize their world. How children respond, talk, read, and/or write also signals their readiness for various skills and content learning. Language is, in fact,
## Cultural Awareness Knowledge and the Teaching of Spanish to Native Speakers

- This article discusses the importance of cultural awareness knowledge for teachers who teach Spanish to native speakers.
- The article is taken from a study that investigated pedagogical content knowledge, subject matter knowledge, and cultural awareness knowledge.
- The article discusses culturally relevant theory in relation to teaching students who are of a different culture/ethnicity than the teacher. In addition, it discusses the significance of beliefs teachers have about students and their abilities.
- Furthermore, it discusses how teachers' beliefs about students can affect how those students are taught.

## Benefits of foreign language learning and bilingualism: An analysis of published empirical research 2012-2019

- The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society.
- This analysis of research published from 2012-2019 extends Fox et al.’s analysis of research published from 2005 to 2011 (Part I).
- The 100 empirical studies in Part II, drawn from seven data bases, were conducted in multiple countries.
- Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity.
- Results report multiple cognitive benefits of language study and bimultilingualism, particularly later in life, including enhancement of cognitive flexibility, higher cognitive reserve in advanced age, and delay in the onset of dementia.
- Other results underscore the importance of early and sustained language learning and support for L1 literacy development.
- Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence.
- This research illustrates the importance of establishing cross-/interdisciplinary research and sharing results with language advocates, policy makers, and legislators.

Co-constructing meaning in international meetings- an approach to plurilingual interactions
- Communication in international meetings represents a challenge for the participants, who need to make choices about the language(s) they use to co-construct meaning and guarantee the success of their work.
- In this context, plurilingual interactions may offer an invaluable opportunity for power balanced relations and intercultural flexibility.
- In this paper, we present an analysis of a plurilingual corpus based on the intercomprehension (IC) approach.
- We will analyze the IC strategies at work by characterizing the specific features that appear in this context and stressing the essential role of interproduction skills for the success of communication processes.
- This will allow us to determine the impact of IC in the accomplishment of successful intercultural and interlinguistic encounters as well as its contribution to pluricultural (lifelong) education.

Cultural identity and language: a proposed framework for cultural globalization and glocalization
- This paper attempts to define cultural globalization and cultural glocalisation in terms of cultural identity (CI) and language. Homogenization, heterogenization and glocalisation are three possible ways to face the challenge of cultural globalization but glocalisation may be the most realistic solution as it seems to be the way to a better quality of life.
- The process of exporting CIs to other nations is cultural globalization while adaptation of incoming foreign CIs to suit local needs is cultural glocalization. Language is a CI in the domain of lifestyles as well as carrier of CIs of institutional systems and spiritual values.
- Incoming foreign languages and foreign CIs often cause changes in local CIs. This is an interactive process as changes of any CIs may lead to alterations of other CIs.
- To be an effective communicator in this multilingual world, people have to develop multilingual and multicultural competencies.
- The experience of Hong Kong and Singapore in glocalisation of Mandarin and the rapid growth in the number of Mandarin learners and speakers all over the world indicate the potential for development of Mandarin into an international language after English.

Bilingual assistants and cultural awareness
- Children from all over the world who migrate with their families to London are introduced to the educational system at any point in the year, many without speaking English.
- Teacher training aimed at preparing teachers to work with children from diverse backgrounds is still scarce or inadequate and bilingual assistants or English as an Additional Language (EAL) teachers are employed by some schools to provide support to these children.
- In this article, the researcher discusses how bilingual assistants' cultural knowledge of children’s backgrounds can enhance their learning and process of adaptation.

Self-Regulatory Development in children of immigrant families
- A central theme of acculturative specificity is the heterogeneity of the immigrant experience.
- This study integrated this application of the Specificity Principle with intergenerational transmission models of self-regulation and
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identified both common and specific pathways in the self-regulatory development of Chinese American children in immigrant families (N = 169, Mage = 9.2 years).</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Consistent with intergenerational transmission models, results indicated associations between parents’ and children’s effortful control, with the mediation of these associations via authoritarian parenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Parental education, family income, and children’s bilingual proficiency were also uniquely associated with children’s executive function and effortful control.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Together, findings provide new directions for research with ethnic minority immigrant families, and underscore the utility of within-group approaches in advancing research on ethnic minority children’s development.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Attending to the third goal Cross-Cultural competence and identity development in two-way immersion programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In two-way immersion (TWI) programs in the United States, the development of student cross-cultural competence is one of three primary goals, along with academic achievement and bilingualism and biliteracy.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• However, as “the third goal,” cross-cultural outcomes have received less scholarly attention.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In this article, we briefly review the literature on cross-cultural outcomes for students in TWI programs and highlight a consistent focus on the self in these studies, particularly as it relates to student identity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• As cross-cultural competence begins with awareness of the self within the socially and culturally diverse classrooms that TWI provides, we assert that scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• We offer brief descriptions of three theoretical frameworks that hold promise for scholars considering student identity development within TWI, and close with suggestions for further research.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Labor Market

### Rising to the bilingual challenge: self-reported experiences of managing life with two languages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Numerous studies have demonstrated the bilingual cognitive advantage with regard to: (1) metalinguistic awareness (the ability to dissociate between meaning and form and explicitly talk about the language structure) (e.g. Bialystok et al. 2010); (2) executive functions (inhibition, switching/shifting, updating, monitoring) (see a summary by Dong and Li 2015); and (3) cognitive reserve (the protection mechanism against a cognitive decline related to elderly dementia and Alzheimer’s disease) (e.g. Schweizer et al. 2012)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Bialystok (1992) provided evidence that bilinguals perform better than monolinguals on the Embedded Figures Test. Also, as demonstrated by Kovács and Mehler (2009), bilingual infants are better able to switch responses after a rule change in a head turn paradigm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This study aimed to learn about the perspective of bilinguals: all 92 participants agreed unanimously that knowing a second language is advantageous.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| • This beneficial effect was attributed to five major categories: (1) sociocultural (e.g. ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world); (2) economic (e.g. better job prospects and ability to grow professionally also in other countries); (3) personal (personal development, learning new things and learning additional languages); (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to obtain information from a large number of sources and the multilingual world we live in) and finally (5) cognitive/enriching’ (e.g. a challenge/training for the brain, which
leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease, an ability to express oneself in more ways along with an ability to notice/think differently and to widen horizons).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Raciolinguistic ideology and Spanish-English bilingualism on the US labor market: An analysis of online job advertisements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • A recent surge of findings on bilingual cognitive advantage has attracted attention from both researchers and the media.  
  • An advantage has been demonstrated with regard to, inter alia, inhibiting, switching, monitoring, and updating.  
  • However, Paap et al. argue that the advantage does not exist or is only limited to executive functioning.  
  • Both sides of the debate are well grounded in research. Nevertheless, what seems to be missing from the current discussion is the voice of bilingual speakers, that is, how they manage life with two languages and if they perceive any cognitive, social or economic advantages or indeed, disadvantages of knowing two languages more than one language.  
  • Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face.  
  • Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words language mixing were explored.  
  • It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bilingualism Boosts US Labor Market</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English, according to a study carried out by the Civil Rights Project at University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA) and Educational Testing Service (ETS).  
  • “Balanced bilinguals,” those who understand, speak, read, and write in both English and the language of the home: Earn more—$2,000-$5,000 annually compared to their English-only peers; Go to college at higher rates, which dramatically increases earnings; Have more social networks.  
  • Gandara notes a U.S. News & World Report article that argued that maintaining and teaching languages others than English will be key to the success of the nation’s schools in the coming century.  
  • “Equally Important, though, is the finding that transitional bilingual instruction that leaves behind the native language is not where the payoff is; it is in maintaining immigrant languages.  
  • Bilinguals may not always be paid more, but they often are and frequently get hired over monolinguals with similar credentials.  
  • “Americans for whom English is not their first language face unique obstacles on their path to academic and economic success,” says Michael Nettles, senior VP of ETS’s Policy Evaluation and Research Center, who commissioned the research and paper. “This report highlights the benefits that can accrue to all students through dual-language programs.” |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rethinking Bilingual Instruction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • The Bilingual Advantage: Language, Literacy, and the US Labor Market  
  • Lucrecia Santibanez and Maria Estela Zarate compared Asian and Latino students who self-reported that they were moderately bilingual or high use bilinguals with those who called themselves monolingual. They found that the bilingual students from both groups were more likely to graduate from high school and go to college. Among Latinos, high-use bilingual students were also significantly more
likely to go directly to four-year colleges than those who were monolingual.

- Ruben Rumbaut examined the effects of bilingualism on more than 6,000 young people in their mid to late 20s. He distinguished among limited, moderate, and fluent bilingual and non-bilingual people across a range of ethnicities. He found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased.

- Diana A. Porras, Jungeyon Ee, and Patricia Gandara surveyed almost 300 large, medium, and small businesses in California, across all sectors of the economy, asking employers whether they had a preference for hiring bilingual employees and if so, whether they compensated them for their language skills. Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred bilingual employees if their skills were comparable to those of monolingual employees. This confirmed that in California, bilingual employees are in high demand and have a hiring advantage over those who are monolingual.

Gender, Bilingualism, and the Early Occupational Careers of Second-Generation Mexicans in the South

- Following two decades of Mexican migration to the southern United States, the second generation is entering the labor market.
- Researchers analyze the early occupational careers of fifty-eight second-generation young adults in Dalton, Georgia, a global carpet-manufacturing center.
- Researchers find intergenerational occupational mobility, with children of Mexican immigrants deploying human-capital skills to access better jobs than their parents.
- However, the Mexican second generation faces opportunity ladders structured along gender lines, with women working in services and men laboring as bilingual supervisors and crew leaders in the carpet industry.
- While bilingual skills play a critical role in the employment paths that members of the second generation have started to chart, their use of bilingualism is also shaped by gender dynamic in the workplace.

Economic Advantages of Multilingualism

- In a new economic analysis, CRP/PDC co-director Dr. Patricia Gandara and co-author Sylvia Acevedo visit the issue of bilingual education from an economic perspective.
- The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries.
- Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English.
- "In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage."

Is there really a labor market advantage to being bilingual in the US?

- Although it is commonly thought that people who are bilingual have an advantage in the labor market, studies on this topic have not borne out this perception.
- The literature, in fact, has found an earnings penalty is associated with bilingualism—people who are bilingual often make less than people who are monolingual in similar jobs.
- This report reviews those studies and introduces a new set of studies that found different outcomes for bilingual people in terms of education and earnings.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The demand for Multilingual Human Capital in the US labor Market</td>
<td>• In this report the researcher examines why the prior and present studies differ so greatly and what this means for education policy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• This article presents the results of a 2014 survey of more than 2,100 U.S. employers on their requirements for multilingual employees.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The survey found a significant discrepancy: On the one hand, 93% of respondents “value[d] employees who...are able to work effectively with customers, clients, and businesses from a range of different countries and cultures.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• On the other, 66% of respondents reported identifying foreign language skills in the hiring process, 41% reported giving advantage to multilingual applicants, and only 10% of respondents indicated that new hires “needed to speak at least one language besides English.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• In addition, the survey revealed employer characteristics related to demand for language ability: Industries with the greatest demand were government and public administration, information services, educational services, health care, and the administrative sector.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Language skills were sought in combination with other skill sets, notably customer service, sales, vendor management, and marketing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Finally, the survey identified college majors sought in conjunction with foreign language ability.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The study is unique in its size; its coverage of small, medium, and large businesses; and its focus on college recruitment and hiring.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The results are critical to educational programs seeking to understand the value of language in the job market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A raciolinguistic analysis of the neoliberal promotion of dual language education in a new Latinx South state</td>
<td>• Dual language (DL) programs in the United States are increasingly promoted as a promising model that serves both language majority and minoritized children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• However, many researchers also question whether the programs are truly serving the language minoritized students or are these programs only treating their language as a resource to serve the already privileged group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Using structural topic modeling and critical discourse analysis, this study employs a raciolinguistic perspective to unpack the ideologies underlying the discourses in over 200 DL programs in a new Latinx South state of the United States.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Our findings show that DL programs are promoted as a model that brings cognitive and employment benefits to its students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Moreover, private corporate power has a strong existence and influence on the establishment, staffing, and promotion of DL programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The benefits to English speaking students are highlighted, while the interests of language minoritized children are largely ignored in the discourse.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Love Letter to Language</td>
<td>• “I am me; my personality does not change depending on the words I speak. Yet, languages act like filters, exaggerating or downplaying different sides of my character. I become more direct or carefree depending on the language I am speaking.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• “For me, learning language is not about memorizing a dictionary, it’s a way of building self-confidence, self-awareness, and community.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Skills, Earnings, and the Occupational Sorting of Mexican Americans Along the US-Mexican border</td>
<td>• While English proficiency enhances labor market outcomes, its role in minority-language regions remains largely unexplored.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Employing the U.S. Mexico border as a minority-language region, researchers analyzed whether English skills differently affect the earnings and occupational sorting of Mexican Americans along the border relative to their non-border peers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Researchers found comparable English deficiency earnings penalties for Mexican immigrants, suggesting that this group responds to English-specific regional wage gaps.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Promise of English: Linguistic Capital and the Neoliberal Workers in the South Korean Job Market</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| - English is often assumed to be a key to material success and social inclusion, and this belief commonly works to justify the global dominance of English, glossing over and rationalizing broader social inequalities.  
- This paper extends the discussion of this fallacy of 'the promise of English' to the domain of the South Korean job market, where skills in the English language play a major role in determining one's access to white-collar jobs. Since the 1990s, different modes of English language testing have emerged as popular means for evaluating job applicants for Korean corporations, constantly upgrading the criteria for 'good English'.  
- Through a discussion of how such changes are linked with the conception of self in the neoliberal workplace and how evaluation of linguistic competence is always a matter of social and ideological interpretation, this paper demonstrates why, in the Korean job market, the fulfillment of the promise of English is constantly deferred. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paths to Mobility: The Mexican Second Generation at Work in A new Destination</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Prior studies have shown that children of Mexican immigrants face structural challenges that threaten to obstruct their economic success in young adulthood.  
- Drawing on 58 interviews with upwardly mobile young adult children of Mexican immigrants in a new immigrant destination in the U.S. South, I examine how a group of second-generation Mexicans has made occupational gains during their early employment careers.  
- They activated three resources in mobility promoting ways given the demographic, economic, and social characteristics of their community.  
- The resources include parental support, advice, and guidance from extrafamilial mentors, and bilingualism in English and Spanish. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sociospatial Practices of Hispanic Youth Navigating Their Labor Market Opportunities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Hispanic youth are entering the U.S. labor market in increasing numbers.  
- Their experiences and outcomes can teach us about the degree to which Hispanic migrants and their children are successfully integrating into U.S. society.  
- While we know about the disadvantages Hispanic immigrant youth face in securing professional careers, less is known about the strategies they use to navigate their labor market options in response to these obstacles and as a way to express their agency.  
- Using data collected from interviews, questionnaires, mental maps, and journals with Hispanic immigrant youth, this article demonstrates the social and spatial strategies Hispanic immigrant youth employ to access work.  
- Such strategies include leveraging institutional and familial connections, advertising their bilingualism, working close to home, and navigating stereotypes.  
- Insight into these strategies can help educators, policy makers, and immigrant families determine how best to support Hispanic immigrant youth as they transition from school to work. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bamboo bridges or barriers? Exploring advantages of bilingualism among Asians in the US labor market through the lens of superdiversity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - The number of Asian immigrants in the United States has increased remarkably over the past decades and now accounts for nearly 30% of all immigrants in the country.  
- Acknowledging diversity among Asians, this study explores advantages of Asian bilingualism in the American labor market by attending to employment status and personal earnings through the lens of superdiversity. |
### A series of logistic and ordinary least squared regression analyses of the 2011–2015 American Community Survey (ACS) data shows that substantial differences exist across different ethnic groups among Asians.

- Bilingual advantages appear in most Asian groups when predicting both employment status and personal earnings, and the benefits tend to be more salient in the results of earnings analysis.
- The findings indicate that native-language literacy skill is a more momentous variable than the other variables in the model and that bilingual advantages stand out among Asian Indians and Chinese/Taiwanese more substantially compared to other Asians. Immense gender gaps also exist between Asian males and females in terms of economic well-being, and such gaps are more conspicuous in personal earnings than in employment status.

### Latinxs’ bilingualism at work in the US: Profit for whom?

- In the current context of a globalized economy, bilingualism is increasingly portrayed as a resource for corporations and for workers competing for jobs in today’s slim market.
- In this paper researchers analyze the economic value of languages other than English in the US, Spanish in particular.
- Working from a political economy perspective and drawing from current theoretical approaches to language and labor under neoliberalism, researchers examine the reproduction of the discursive trope of language profit in the corporate world and educational spaces, and then analyze the narratives and trajectories of young Latinx workers in New York.

- The marginalized position of Latinxs in the social structure and the racialization of their linguistic practice result in a linguistic exploitation that remains unchallenged in the US.
- Researchers conclude that today’s celebrations of bilingualism, which follow a capitalist logic, perpetuate a hierarchy of languages and speakers that is detrimental to racialized minorities.

### Global Economy

### Raciolingustic ideology and Spanish-English bilingualism on the US labor market: An analysis of online job advertisements

- A recent surge of findings on bilingual cognitive advantage has attracted attention from both researchers and the media.
- An advantage has been demonstrated with regard to, inter alia, inhibiting, switching, monitoring, and updating.
- However, Paap et al. argue that the advantage does not exist or is only limited to executive functioning.
- Both sides of the debate are well grounded in research. Nevertheless, what seems to be missing from the current discussion is the voice of bilingual speakers, that is, how they manage life with two languages and if they perceive any cognitive, social or economic advantages or indeed, disadvantages of knowing two languages more than one language.
- Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face.
- Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words language mixing were explored.
- It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives.

### Multiple Pathways to Multilingual Investment: A Collective Case Study of Self-Identified Mexican Students in the US

- The children of immigrants are the fastest growing population in U.S. schools at the same time there is increased anti-immigrant discourse, creating a unique linguistic ecology for its students.
- These multinational, multilingual, and multicultural students often encounter mononational, monolingual, and monicultural ideologies in their schools and communities.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>In Quest for Bilingual Grads, Schools Push Dual Language</strong></td>
<td>The result is that potentially hybridized learning contexts turn into sites of struggle for continued positive multilingual identities and investments. This multiple case study implemented surveys and interviews to explore the factors that contribute to the high multilingual investment of three self-identifying Mexican students residing in the U.S. Findings indicate that strong family relationships, formal coursework in Spanish, as well as a strong ethnic identity as Mexicans are interrelated factors that contribute to their high multilingual investment. In turn, this study suggests there are multiple pathways for Spanish-speakers residing in the U.S. to maintain, develop, and regularly use their Spanish abilities even in English hegemonic contexts. Dual language education is a powerful factor, but formal Spanish courses at the secondary and post-secondary level are also equally strong contributors when dual language education is not available. Furthermore, years of schooling in Mexico can counter monolingual educational contexts that adolescents often encounter. Implications for how educators may further facilitate positive and powerful multilingual identities and investments with their students along the educational pipeline are explored with a specific attention to Spanish language programming and raciolinguistic ideologies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Going Global: Can Dual-Language Programs Save Bilingual Education?</strong></td>
<td>For decades, two factors drove the demand for dual-language education: a desire to preserve native languages and recognition that dual-language learning can boost overall achievement for English-language learners. Now, a growing number of states also see bilingualism as key to accessing the global economy, as evidenced by the surging popularity of the &quot;seal of biliteracy&quot;—a special recognition for graduates who demonstrate fluency in two or more languages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Families and Educators Supporting Bilingualism in Early Childhood</strong></td>
<td>Given the general attack on bilingual education in the United States, dual-language education has surfaced as a prominent alternative for those groups who wish to use immigrant students’ heritage language in schooling. Dual-language immersion (DLI) programs differ from traditional bilingual approaches to the extent that their classrooms consist of both language-majority and language-minority students and both languages are taught, usually for an equal amount of time. Lindholm-Leary (2001) argued that DLI programs have the potential to “eradicate the negative status of bilingualism in the U.S.” because they combine “maintenance bilingual education and immersion education models in an integrated classroom composed of both language majority and language minority students with the goal of full bilingualism and biliteracy.” The benefits of bilingual education have long been characterized in terms of advantages for a global economy. Although aware of the pitfalls of this association, many (e.g., Krashen, as cited in Crawford, 2001; MacSwan, 1998; Tse, 2001) have attempted to emphasize the economic advantages of bilingual education by stressing the “great importance of bilingualism in our modern global community” (MacSwan, 1998, p. 9). “In an era of globalization, a society that has access to multilingual and multicultural resources is advantaged in its ability to play an important social and economic role on the world stage” (p. 7). Highlighting this perspective, bilingualism and bilingual education can be viewed as a way to serve students and nations in the inevitable move toward an interconnected multilingual world.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Families and Educators Supporting Bilingualism in Early Childhood**   | This article explores the strategies that three Latino families in the U.S. employed in raising their children bilingually in Spanish and English. It also looks at their rationale for bilingualism as well as the
challenges the parents failed to anticipate in implementing their strategies.
- The data were gleaned from comparative case studies over a three-year period.
- The families wanted their children to be bilingual because they believed in the cognitive and economic advantages of bilingualism and that bilingualism would help maintain the families’ roots.
- To maintain the native language, the families planned to speak and support the Spanish language at home and relegated the teaching of English to the school.
- While two of the families expressed concerns about their children not being proficient in English by the time they entered school, only one of the families anticipated some of the challenges that their daughter would face in learning and maintaining Spanish.
- In fact, the results of the study indicated that attaining productive bilingualism (the ability to speak the minority language) presented the three young girls with more difficulties than being proficient in English.

Economic Advantages of Multilingualism
- In a new economic analysis, CRP/PDC co-director Dr. Patricia Gandara and co-author Sylvia Acevedo visit the issue of bilingual education from an economic perspective.
- The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries.
- Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English.
- “In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage.”

The economic value of bilingualism in the United States
- Given that bilingual education has been under assault for most of its modern existence in the United States, many bilingual educators have acquiesced to transitional bilingual education: the use of the primary language only until English is firmly established.
- While this placated some critics, the research now demonstrates that this is not in the best interest of the students.
- Although past research has found no real economic benefit for bilinguals in the U.S. labor market, the new research reviewed here comes to the opposite conclusion: Full literacy in another language brings substantial economic benefit.
- Moreover, the failure to nurture these linguistic skills in the children of immigrants exacts a cost to the earnings of these potentially bilingual/biliterate students.

Becoming Citizens of the World
- To compete successfully in the global marketplace, both U.S.-based multinational corporations as well as small businesses increasingly need employees with knowledge of foreign languages and cultures to market products to customers around the globe and to work effectively with foreign employees and partners in other countries.
- Asia Society (2002) and National Geographic-Roper (2002) indicated that, compared with students in nine other industrialized countries, U.S. students lack knowledge of world geography, history, and current events.
- And shockingly few U.S. students learn languages that large numbers of people speak, such as Chinese (1.3 billion speakers) and Arabic (246 million speakers).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lifespan multilingual education, a long-term investment</th>
<th>The United States must create its own education response to globalization, which should include raising standards, increasing high school and college graduation rates, and modernizing and internationalizing the curriculum.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It is estimated that over the next decades, the number of older adults will reach record levels worldwide.</td>
<td>It is estimated that over the next decades, the number of older adults will reach record levels worldwide.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With the increasing age, the prevalence of neurodegenerative diseases, such as Alzheimer's disease, is also estimated to increase.</td>
<td>With the increasing age, the prevalence of neurodegenerative diseases, such as Alzheimer's disease, is also estimated to increase.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Therefore, protecting older adults from the age-related effects of cognitive decline is one of the greatest challenges of the next following decades, since these will increase pressure on families, health, and education systems, and, above all, economies on a global scale.</td>
<td>Therefore, protecting older adults from the age-related effects of cognitive decline is one of the greatest challenges of the next following decades, since these will increase pressure on families, health, and education systems, and, above all, economies on a global scale.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is a growing body of evidence emphasizing the beneficial effects of bilingualism acting as a safeguard against cognitive decline linked to the aging process.</td>
<td>There is a growing body of evidence emphasizing the beneficial effects of bilingualism acting as a safeguard against cognitive decline linked to the aging process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building on this evidence, this paper reviews the latest studies which examine the effects of bilingualism on cognition in older age and investigates whether foreign language learning at a later stage in life can constitute an optimal solution for building cognitive reserve, as it is scientifically proven that language learning engages an extensive brain network that is known to overlap with the brain regions negatively affected by the ageing process.</td>
<td>Building on this evidence, this paper reviews the latest studies which examine the effects of bilingualism on cognition in older age and investigates whether foreign language learning at a later stage in life can constitute an optimal solution for building cognitive reserve, as it is scientifically proven that language learning engages an extensive brain network that is known to overlap with the brain regions negatively affected by the ageing process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This paper aims to highlight the importance of lifelong bilingualism and, using a different perspective, to promote lifespan multilingual education.</td>
<td>This paper aims to highlight the importance of lifelong bilingualism and, using a different perspective, to promote lifespan multilingual education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to raise a global kid</td>
<td>If our children don't learn--now--to achieve a comfort level with foreign people, foreign languages, and foreign lands, this argument goes, America's competitive position in the world will continue to erode, and their future livelihood and that of subsequent generations will be in jeopardy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rogers is hardly the only person who sees things this way. &quot;In this global economy, the line between domestic and international issues is increasingly blurred, with the world's economies, societies, and people interconnected as never before,&quot; said U.S. Education Secretary Arne Duncan in remarks in the spring of 2010 at the Asia Society in New York. &quot;I am worried that in this interconnected world, our country risks being disconnected from the contributions of other countries and cultures.&quot;</td>
<td>Rogers is hardly the only person who sees things this way. &quot;In this global economy, the line between domestic and international issues is increasingly blurred, with the world's economies, societies, and people interconnected as never before,&quot; said U.S. Education Secretary Arne Duncan in remarks in the spring of 2010 at the Asia Society in New York. &quot;I am worried that in this interconnected world, our country risks being disconnected from the contributions of other countries and cultures.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>America is so far utterly failing to produce a generation of global citizens.</td>
<td>America is so far utterly failing to produce a generation of global citizens.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For parents who want to give their children global experience while keeping them safely on the straight and narrow American path of PSATs, SATs, and stellar extracurriculars, there's an ever-growing field of options. Immersion schools have exploded over the past 40 years, growing from none in 1970 to 440 today, according to the Center for Applied Linguistics, and Mandarin, especially, is seen among type-A parents as a twofor: a child who learns Mandarin starting at 5 increases her brain capacity and is exposed to the culture of the future through language. (One mom in San Francisco laughs when she recalls that her daughter learned about Rosa Parks and the Montgomery bus boycott in Chinese.)</td>
<td>For parents who want to give their children global experience while keeping them safely on the straight and narrow American path of PSATs, SATs, and stellar extracurriculars, there's an ever-growing field of options. Immersion schools have exploded over the past 40 years, growing from none in 1970 to 440 today, according to the Center for Applied Linguistics, and Mandarin, especially, is seen among type-A parents as a twofor: a child who learns Mandarin starting at 5 increases her brain capacity and is exposed to the culture of the future through language. (One mom in San Francisco laughs when she recalls that her daughter learned about Rosa Parks and the Montgomery bus boycott in Chinese.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebranding bilingualism: The shifting discusses of language education policy in California’s 2016 election</td>
<td>Using the methods of critical discourse analysis, we examine California Proposition 227, English Language in Public Schools (1998), and its repeal measure, Proposition 58, the California Education for a Global Economy Initiative (2016).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through comparative analyses of framing, keywords, spatial and temporal markers, actors, and legislative titles, we illustrate a discursive shift.</td>
<td>Through comparative analyses of framing, keywords, spatial and temporal markers, actors, and legislative titles, we illustrate a discursive shift.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• While Proposition 227 presented bilingual education as a threat to children’s—and, by proxy, the nation’s—well-being (a language as problem orientation), Proposition 58 represents multilingual education as key to students’ future economic success and to the state and nation’s continued global economic advantage (a language as resource orientation).

• We argue that Proposition 58’s approach to “marketing” multilingual education may have contributed to its passing in November 2016, a result that we celebrate. At the same time, we raise questions about whether policies framed within one discursive regime (e.g., neoliberalism and global human capital) can eventually serve the aims of another (e.g., equity, plurality, and social justice), or whether discourse is destiny in policy making.

Becoming Global Citizens through Bilingualism: English learning in the lives of University Students in China

• The ongoing globalization has led to a tremendous expansion of the English language.

• With China striving to become part of the world economy since the late 1970’s, there has been a great emphasis placed on the education of young people to become a world citizen with fluent English.

• “Being a global citizen” is having strong interests in global issues, cultivating the understanding and appreciation of diverse values, and enhancing country’s competitiveness.

• All this however needs to be realized through communication in English, the world language.

• Improving communicative competence among Chinese learners of English depends on how English is learnt in the FL classroom and how it gets practiced outside the classroom.

• Data drawn from English corners, English clubs and English church all show that those informal learning settings have a complementary role to play especially when the formal English classroom is found having various deficits. Data also confirm that informal settings offer the opportunity to close the gap between L1 and L2 learning processes, and nurture learners’ communicative competence through social intercourse and intercultural exchanges.

• Moreover, EFL learning is inherently intercultural, which facilitate cross cultural.

• perspectives through bilingualism and bridges over the indigenous cultural traditions and the western democratic values.

“Glocalization”: Going Beyond the Dichotomy of Global versus Local Through Additive Multilingualism

• This article interrogates the notion of “glocalization” (Moja, 2004, based on Castells, 2001) as a concept that seeks to integrate the local and the global to address both the need for social justice and the need to participate in a global market economy.

• The article argues that the relation between the global and the local cannot be explored without acknowledging the inequality inherent in this relation.

• The concept of glocalization is examined in the arena of language and education by theorizing a dual-medium undergraduate degree offered in English and an Indigenous African language (Sesotho as Leboa) at the University of Limpopo.

• This degree curricularizes the principle of additive bilingualism, which both challenges the domination of English (as an expression of cultural imperialism) yet makes it available as a right to students from hugely impoverished schooling backgrounds.

• The degree simultaneously promotes Sesotho as Leboa as a language of high-level cognition, knowledge construction, and dissemination; and, therefore, places it on par with English.

• In addition, the article briefly focuses on the concept of “translanguaging” as one of the resources used by our students to access scientific knowledge.
### Cultural and Linguistic Ambidexterity
- The University of Texas at El Paso is a unique incubator for bilingual and multilingual students sought after by employers in a global economy.
- It might sound like a no-brainer that being bilingual or multilingual helps students planning engineering and just about any other career. But it is certainly true and is becoming more important the economies of nations become more intertwined. What's more being able to go beyond mere language ability and understand cultural distinctions are extra advantages.
- Students say that being bilingual gives them more options on campus and off.

### Discourses, Practices, and Realities of Multilingualism in Higher Education
- This Perspectives article explores the changing sociolinguistic realities of Canadian postsecondary institutions focusing on tensions and contradictions around two prominent discourses: internationalization and indigenization of higher education.
- In doing so, researchers focus on a common challenge: English dominance in Canadian universities.
- This linguistic hegemony persists in a time of Truth and Reconciliation and indigenization of education as well as within the intensified discourse of internationalization in the new global political economy.
- As professors of language education in two prairie province universities, these researchers draw on examples from their own contexts and consider the potential mismatches between positive discourses about multilingualism and practices and structural realities that do not support on-the-ground multilingualism.
- They situate their discussion within a larger social, political economic context of contemporary colonialism and capitalism.
- Their goal is to introduce a critique of the ongoing role Canadian universities play in producing seller colonialism and English monolingualism as well as to provide suggestions to engage more meaningfully with multilingualism in today’s higher education across Canada.

### Elite multilingualism: discourses, practices, and debates
- In the introduction to the special issue ‘Elite Multilingualism: Discourses, practices, and debates’, researchers focus on ‘elite multilingualism’ as a means to provide a window into the complex layers and nuances of today’s multilingual, mobile, and global society.
- The researchers’ aims here are to provide an empirical and conceptual discussion of a growing language-centered elitism.
- Researchers also aim to expand current scholarship on the construction, valuation and instrumentalization of multilingualism, and its consequences for the formation of social boundaries and inequalities.
- Researchers first discuss major concepts such as the notion of elite/ness and multilingualism, commodification, authenticity and hierarchies and the linguistic market in a global knowledge economy.
- Researchers also discuss the critical sociolinguistic, discourse and ethnographic approaches that frame this special issue and go on to outline the diverse manifestations of elite multilingualism in different educational and social settings.
- Finally, researchers conclude by reflecting on the value of the concept of elite multilingualism as a social practice and argue for the importance of examining the lived experience of multilinguals on the ground.

### Why language learning matters
- To thrive in a global economy and a multicultural society, US students need fluency in at least one language other than English.
- Even schools in third world countries are more effective than US schools at producing students who demonstrate foreign language proficiency.
Research shows that multilingual societies have a competitive advantage over societies in international trade (Helliwell, 1999).

- Economic success and security in the US depend on our ability to understand the information we gather.
- Many Americans need to interact regularly with people who are unlikely to know English.
- Not only does the omission of language and cultural education leave US students behind their peers in other countries, but also it exacerbates the achievement gap within the US.

**Village is more global, language is more vital**

- In the current stumbling economy, job seekers are leveraging every qualification they can think of to sway potential employers. And with immigrants continuing to flood into New York, long the city of immigrants, and its suburbs, speaking a second language is a talent that matters in almost any field.
- In the global economy, American companies increasingly are realizing the benefits of a multilingual workforce.

### Stage 3 Data Filtering

The third stage of filtering the data includes removing any extra data that is not applicable to the research questions and sorting the data into like themes. I rearranged some of the articles based on the relevant findings to each theme. In order to do this, I moved the highlighted information to the correct section and included relevant information necessary to understand the finding. I deleted all excess information that did not relate to the key finding from the research.

The table below follows the same organization as the previous table. This table includes the most relevant information to each area of development and theme.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Analysis Calls for DL Pre-K for Young English Learners                | • Young English-language learners still developing oral and literacy skills in their home languages benefit most from early-childhood programs that regularly expose them to both languages;  
• Supporting the home language, as well as English, is the best thing for young dual language learners. |
| Early Education of Dual Language Learners: An Efficacy Study of the Nuestros Niño’s School Readiness Professional Development Program | • DLLs in treatment classrooms showed greater gains in expressive vocabulary in English than DLLs in control classrooms, and when assessment in Spanish, gains were higher in receptive vocabulary, alphabet knowledge, writing and early math |
| Meeting the Needs of English Language Learners with Disability in Urban Settings | • The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth (Carrasquillo & Rodriguez, 2002; Paneque & Barbeta, 2006; Rodriguez, Parmar, & Signer, 2001)  
• For English Learners with disabilities to succeed in bilingual special education programs, they need to be part of a school that promotes bilingualism and provides students with exemplary instructional practices. |
| Benefits of Foreign Language Learning and Bilingualism: An Analysis of Published Empirical Research 2012-2019 | • Results report multiple cognitive benefits of language study and bilingualism, particularly later in life, including enhancement of cognitive flexibility, higher cognitive reserve in advanced age, and delay in the onset of dementia. |
| Rethinking Bilingual Instruction                                        | • Researchers have now identified cognitive advantages for bilingual children that include enhanced executive function of the brain, resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001; Diaz & Klinger, 1991); increased short term memory (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013); and enhanced problem-solving skills.  
• These advantages are explained in part by the bilingual brain’s greater flexibility and ability to exclude competing stimuli as a result of having to constantly distinguish between two or more languages. |
| Four Essential Questions About Dual Language Education                  | • Bilingual individuals have higher cognitive abilities, mental elasticity, and metalinguistic awareness (August, Goldenberg, & Rueda, 2010) |
| Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language Programs | • Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual. |
| Kenyan Curriculum Reforms and Mother Tongue Education                   | • Maintenance and development of language and literacy skills in one’s mother tongue (MT) plays a critical role in facilitating second language (L2) learning, developing additive bilingualism and continuous cognitive development. |
| Rising to the bilingual challenge: self-reported experiences of managing life with two languages | • Numerous studies have demonstrated the bilingual cognitive advantage with regard to: (1) metalinguistic awareness (the ability to dissociate between meaning and form and explicitly talk about the language structure) (e.g. Bialystok et al. 2010); (2) executive functions (inhibition, switching/shifting, updating, monitoring) (see a summary by Dong and Li 2015); and (3) cognitive reserve (the protection mechanism against a cognitive decline related to elderly dementia and Alzheimer’s disease) (e.g. Schweizer et al. 2012)  
• Knowing a second language is: Cognitive/’enriching’ (e.g., a challenge/training for the brain, which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease). |
| Using Mother Tongues as Building Blocks in Childhood Education | MT use also enables children to expand their thinking—to engage in cultural ways of conceptualizing (i.e., bi/multicultural thinking), which is essential in this day and age), and thus fostering expanded cognitive skills or what some researchers term higher order thinking or executive functioning.  
Carlson and Metzoff (2008), for example, found that bilingual kindergartners from low-income households—whose parents’ level of education is substantially lower than their monolingual, English-only peers—exhibit superior problem-solving skills. Such skills also enhance children’s memory, as well as their intercultural and interpersonal skills, and are associated with a lower incidence of Alzheimer’s and dementia. |
| Bilingualism, biliteracy, and cognitive effects: A review paper | Metalinguistic awareness and cognitive control in two languages and in non-language related tasks have been reported as bilingual-specific advantages.  
Negative effects of bilingualism: bilinguals were found to lag behind monolinguals in some areas of language use. The main ones included verbal fluency, receptive vocabulary, and lexical access.  
One consistent finding in terms of the effects of reading in two languages has been the higher phonological awareness and processing ability found in biliterate- bilinguals with two alphabetic languages such as English and Spanish. |
| Cognitive advantage in children enrolled in a second-language elementary school program for one year | A large number of studies (see reviews in Bialystok, 2005, and in Costa, Hernández, Costa-Faidella & Sebastián- Gallés, 2009) have shown that early bilingualism acquired through the family, or the social community can positively influence cognitive development, particularly attentional and executive functioning, in children.  
The positive impact of bilingualism has been observed over a variety of specific cognitive domains: for example, better flexibility in a symbol reorganization task (Peal & Lambert, 1962), superior performance at inhibiting distractors in a number concept task (Bialystok & Codd, 1997), superior symbolic representation and attentional inhibition skills in appearance-reality tasks (Bialystok & Senman, 2004).  
Results showed that the immersion group performed better (more specifically, faster) than the monolingual group on tasks assessing alerting, auditory selective attention, divided attention, and mental flexibility, but not on tasks assessing response inhibition, as predicted. However, contrary to our hypothesis, no difference was found between the two groups on the interference inhibition task.  
Conclusion: already after a period of three years, an L2- immersion school experience produces some of the attentional and executive benefits associated with early highly proficient bilingualism, although possibly not for exactly the same reasons. |
| Cognitive advantages in adult Turkish bilingual immigrants- a question of the chicken or the egg | Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed.  
The current study indicates that bilingual Turkish immigrants have better executive functioning and episodic memory compared to Turkish immigrant monolinguals. Whether this is due to the effects of bilingualism or reflects inherent cognitive abilities in those able to acquire bilingualism in later life remains to be resolved. |
| Bilingualism enriches the poor: Enhanced cognitive control in low-income minority children | • Whereas there were no group differences in representation, the bilinguals performed significantly better than did the monolinguals in control.  
• These results demonstrate, first, that the bilingual advantage is neither confounded with, nor limited by socioeconomic and cultural factors and, second, that separable aspects of executive functioning are differentially affected by bilingualism. The bilingual advantage lies in control but not in visuospatial representational processes. |
| --- | --- |
| The Contribution of Bilingualism to Cognitive Functioning and Regional Brain Volume in Normal and Abnormal Aging | • Gray matter volume was higher in language and EF brain regions among bilinguals, but no differences were found in memory regions.  
• The initial age of cognitive decline did not differ between language groups. The influence of bilingualism appears to be reflected in increased GMV in language and EF regions, and to a lesser degree, in EF. |
| Bilingualism: Pathway to cognitive reserve | • This paper evaluates evidence supporting the claim that bilingualism contributes to cognitive reserve. Four types of evidence are presented: (i) brain and cognitive function in healthy aging, (ii) age of onset of symptoms of dementia, (iii) relation between clinical level and neuropathology for patients, and (iv) rate of cognitive decline in later stages of dementia. In all cases, bilinguals revealed patterns that were consistent with the interpretation of protection from cognitive reserve when compared with monolinguals. |
| Cognitive effects of bilingualism: An evolving perspective | • The study provided the first credible evidence that rather than being a negative force, bilingualism might instead have significant positive outcomes. Although there were problems with the Peal and Lambert study (the language groups may not have been equivalent in socioeconomic status or intelligence and the measures were broadly based intelligence tests), the results created interest in the possibility that bilingualism could affect nonverbal cognition and that the effect could be positive. |
| Identifying the causal link: Two approaches toward understanding the relationship toward bilingualism and cognitive control | • Paap, Johnson, and Sawi's (2015) review raises a number of methodological issues with the current literature concerning bilingualism and cognitive advantages in executive functions. While the review has focused on providing counterevidence to a positive relationship between the two, we think that what should be the single most important message may have gotten lost in the article: more work needs to focus on identifying and describing the causal link between bilingual experience and cognitive control, as opposed to work just reporting correlations between the two. |
| Cognitive mechanism underlying performance differences between monolinguals and bilinguals | • Lifelong experience with multiple languages is believed to produce a number of executive function advantages including enhanced top-down control, improved attention, and greater working memory capacity.  
• More specifically, the control that is required to select the relevant from the irrelevant language in any given context is believed to require cognitive control, and practicing this control leads to enhanced executive functioning. |
| Is bilingualism related to a cognitive advantage in children? A systematic review and meta-analysis | • The bilingual advantage in overall EF was significant, albeit marginal ($g = 0.06$), and there were indications of publication bias. A moderator analysis showed significant group differences on EF in favor of bilinguals for studies of children from middle-class socioeconomic backgrounds and studies from one specific lab.  
• The EF components of cold inhibition, switching, and monitoring expressed significant bilingual advantages, but monitoring and cold inhibition were affected by publication bias. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Bilingualism: the good, the bad, the indifferent | - The paper summarizes research showing that bilingualism affects linguistic and cognitive performance across the lifespan.  
- The effect on cognitive performance is to enhance executive functioning and to protect against the decline of executive control in aging.  
- Memory tasks based primarily on verbal recall are performed more poorly by bilinguals, but memory tasks based primarily on executive control are performed better by bilinguals. |
| Culture of Intellectualism                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language | - DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual.  
- There were significant group differences according to the target program model (90:10) vs (50:50), level of bilingualism, and whether students were native target language or English speakers. |
| Mother Tongue, a Necessary Step to Intellectual Development | - The intimate link between language and cognitive development forms the core of this present article. It focuses on the important contribution of mother tongue in the process of cognitive development. |
| Why Bilinguals Are Smarter                 | - A bilingual speaker’s brain has two active language systems even when he is using only one language. That creates situations in which one system obstructs the other. But this interference turns out to be a blessing, not a handicap, because it forces the brain to resolve internal conflict, which gives the mind a workout that strengthens its cognitive muscles.  
- Evidence from a number of studies demonstrates that “the bilingual experience improves the brain’s so-called executive function — a command system that directs the attention processes that we use for planning, solving problems, and performing various other mentally demanding tasks. These processes include ignoring distractions to stay focused, switching attention willfully from one thing to another and holding information in mind — like remembering a sequence of directions while driving.”  
- The key difference between bilinguals and monolinguals may be more basic: a heightened ability to monitor the environment. |
| The role of native-language instruction in bilingual education | - Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child.  
- Importance of the native language: use of native language enhances learning, fund of language has a circular relationship with intellect, use of language for discovery, Failure to allow sufficient language development before the transition will result in a child's being unable to cope with anything but the most shallow levels of learning and will affect that child's future capability for learning. |
### Executive Function of the Brain

**Rethinking Bilingual Instruction**

- Researchers have now identified cognitive advantages for bilingual children that include enhanced executive function of the brain, resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001; Diaz & Klinger, 1991); increased short-term memory (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013); and enhanced problem-solving skills (Lauchlan, Parisi, & Fadda, 2013).
- These advantages are explained in part by the bilingual brain’s greater flexibility and ability to exclude competing stimuli as a result of having to constantly distinguish between two or more languages.

**The Developing Bilingual Brain: What Parents and Teachers Should Know and Do**

- Bilinguals have been shown to have “increased density of grey matter in the left inferior parietal cortex” (Bialystok 2009, p. 3) that is more pronounced among those with more L2 proficiency.
- Simultaneous bilingual brains evidence more white matter density (in the anterior cingulate) than sequential bilinguals (Mohades et al., 2015).
- Bilinguals show better executive function (a variety of more sophisticated processing including inhibition and decision-making) and metalinguistic awareness (knowing how language works) (Adesope et al. 2010).
- Studies support a domain-general processing advantage (e.g., attention, recall, associations) in bilinguals (Barac et al. 2014) with greater accuracy, better reaction times on nonverbal tasks, more fluid switching, and stronger performances on working memory tasks (Ransdell et al. 2001), perhaps developing a specialized form of long-term working memory that can support reading and writing.
- These processing strengths indicate greater cognitive flexibility and may relate to increased cognitive reserve (Bialystok 2011). being bilingual may also increase “understanding of other people, their mental and knowledge states” (Barac et al. 2014) or what is known as “theory of mind” (Goetz 2003).

**Executive functions in two-way dual-language education: A mechanism for academic performance**

- Executive functions are positively correlated to both socio-economic status (SES, e.g., Nesbitt et al., 2013) and academic performance (for review, see Serpell & Esposito, 2016).
- The pattern of results supported an academic advantage for intermediate TWDL students. The advantage in executive functions was less robust, emerging for TWDL students in behavioral ratings but not in computerized measures. Using the behavioral rating measure of executive functions and a standardized measure of math performance, we did find evidence for executive functions as a mechanism supporting the academic advantage.
- While there were few differences between those in TWDL and mainstream education in the computerized measures of executive functions, the behavioral rating measure revealed a significant difference between education models such that children in the TWDL program exhibited fewer indicators of executive dysfunction in the classroom. The difference was present at both the primary and the intermediate level.
- The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Bilingual Cognition and Growth Mindset: A Review of Cognitive Flexibility and Its Implications for Dual-Language Education</strong></th>
<th><strong>The researchers highlight the parallels in these constructs, arguing that bilinguals may be uniquely receptive to growth mindset interventions due to their increased cognitive flexibility.</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Investigating the effects of language-switching frequency on attentional and executive functioning in proficient bilinguals** | **Recent studies have proposed that the executive advantages associated with bilingualism may stem from language-switching frequency rather than from bilingualism per se (see, for example, Prior and Gollan, 2011).**
|  |  |
|  | **The results showed superior mental flexibility skills in HFLSs compared to (LFLSs) and monolinguals; furthermore, the two latter groups showed no difference in mental flexibility skills.**
|  | **These results provide novel support for the hypothesis that the so-called bilingual advantage is, in fact, a result of language-switching habits.** |
| **Bilingualism and executive functioning** | **This book examines the hypothesis that using two languages leads to the enhancement of domain-general executive functioning (EF) and argues that either the bilingual advantage does not exist or is restricted to very specific circumstances.**
|  | **The conclusion extends to situations where EF is referred to as self-control, self-regulation, self-discipline, attention-control, impulse control, inhibitory control, cognitive control, and willpower.**
|  | **Empirical evidence does not support a bilingual advantage on EF that is distinguishable from zero.**
|  | **This includes new data that compares tests of the bilingual advantage hypothesis based on self-reports of cognitive control to performance-based measures of EF.** |
| **Is bilingualism associated with enhanced executive functioning in adults? A meta-analytic review** | **Before correcting estimates for observed publication bias, the analyses revealed a very small bilingual advantage for inhibition, shifting, and working memory, but not for monitoring or attention.**
|  | **No evidence for a bilingual advantage remained after correcting for bias.**
|  | **For verbal fluency, our analyses indicated a small bilingual disadvantage, possibly reflecting less exposure for each individual language when using two languages in a balanced manner.**
|  | **Moreover, moderator analyses did not support theoretical presuppositions concerning the bilingual advantage.**
|  | **Researchers conclude that the available evidence does not provide systematic support for the widely held notion that bilingualism is associated with benefits in cognitive control functions in adults.** |
| **Interactions between levels of attention ability and levels of bilingualism in children’s executive functioning** | **Attention difficulty is associated with poor performance on executive functioning (EF) tasks, yet EF is enhanced in bilingual children.**
|  | **Results from hierarchical regressions confirmed that both attention ability and bilingualism contributed to performance on the EF tasks.**
|  | **Attention ability was a stronger predictor for an inhibition task, namely stop signal, and bilingualism a stronger predictor for an interference task, namely flanker.** |
| **Balanced bilingualism and executive functioning in children** | **The extant research suggests bilingualism is associated with enhanced cognitive effects, most evident in attention and executive functioning (EF).**
|  | **After controlling for demographic variables, balance in bilingualism significantly accounted for 37% of the variance in ratings of children’s task initiation.** |
| Maturation of executive functioning skills in early sequential bilingualism | • Previous research has demonstrated that being bilingual from birth is advantageous for the development of skills of social cognition, executive functioning, and metalinguistic awareness due to bilingual children’s extensive experience of processing and manipulating two linguistic systems.  
• The present study investigated whether these cognitive advantages are also evident in sequential bilinguals, i.e., children who began the acquisition of their second language later in childhood.  
• These findings suggest that attentional control is the first cognitive component advantaged by early sequential bilingualism and further highlight the benefits of second language exposure in the context of early formal education. |
|---|---|
| Bilingualism narrows socioeconomic disparities in executive functions and self-regulatory behaviors during early childhood: Evidence from the early childhood longitudinal study | • Socioeconomic status (SES) and bilingualism have been shown to influence executive functioning during early childhood.  
• Bilingualism moderated the effects of SES by ameliorating the detrimental consequences of low-SES on EF and self-regulatory behaviors.  
• These findings underscore bilingualism’s power to enrich executive functioning and self-regulatory behaviors, especially among underprivileged children. |
| Should the search for bilingual advantages in executive functioning continue? | • Neuroscience will be the key that unlocks the elusive relationship between bilingual language control and general cognitive control. |
| Bilingual advantages in executive functioning: Evidence from a low-income sample | • Recent research suggests that bilinguals might exhibit advantages in several areas of executive function, including working memory, inhibitory control, and attentional control.  
• Across three experiments, bilingual children exhibited superior performance on two different measures of visual–spatial memory, as well as measures of inhibitory and attentional control.  
• These results suggest that bilinguals exhibit broad advantages in executive function during the preschool years, and these advantages are evident within a disadvantaged, low-SES population. |
| The effects of bilingualism on toddlers’ executive functioning | • Bilingual children have been shown to outperform monolingual children on tasks measuring executive functioning skills.  
• This advantage is usually attributed to bilinguals’ extensive practice in exercising selective attention and cognitive flexibility during language use because both languages are active when one of them is being used.  
• Native bilingual children performed significantly better than monolingual children on the Stroop task, with no difference between groups on the other tasks, confirming the specificity of bilingual effects to conflict tasks reported in older children.  
• These results demonstrate that bilingual advantages in executive control emerge at an age not previously shown. |
| Revisiting theoretical and causal explanations for the bilingual advantage in executive functioning | • Bilinguals’ routine deployment of selective attention and inhibition in the domain of language is assumed to hone these executive processes to such an extent that far transfer of attentional control to non-linguistic domains ultimately occurs. Hence, bilinguals are expected to outperform monolinguals on non-linguistic executive functioning tasks.  
• Links between bilingualism and executive functioning may, at least in part, arise because superior executive functioning is a cause rather than a consequence of bilingualism.  
• Moreover, given that individuals tend to seek out environments and pursuits that best suit their cognitive strengths (Haworth et al., 2010), superior executive functioning might predict which individuals are likely to seek out language learning opportunities in the first place. |
### The impact of bilingualism on executive functions and working memory in adults
- Researchers found no differences between groups in their performance.
- The evidence presented here indicates that the bilingual advantage might indeed be caused by spurious uncontrolled factors rather than bilingualism per se.
- Secondly, bilingualism has been argued to potentially affect working memory also. Therefore, these researchers tested the same participants in both a forward and a backward version of a visual and an auditory working memory task.
- Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions.

### Parents report fewer executive functioning problems and repetitive behaviors in young dual-language speakers with autism
- Research in typically developing children has noted advantages for bilinguals in domains such as executive functioning and social skills, but less is known about the effects in ASD.
- Our findings indicate that the bilingual advantage in executive functioning may extend to children with neurodevelopmental conditions.

### Word mapping and executive functioning in young monolingual and bilingual children
- However, bilinguals obtained higher scores than both groups of monolinguals on three tests of executive functioning: Luria’s tapping task measuring response inhibition, the opposite worlds task requiring children to assign incongruent labels to a sequence of animal pictures, and reverse categorization in which children needed to reclassify a set of objects into incongruent categories after an initial classification.
- This evidence for a bilingual advantage in aspects of executive functioning at an earlier age than previously reported is discussed in terms of the possibility that bilingual language production may not be the only source of these developmental effects.

### Do Spanish-English bilingual children outperform monolingual English-speaking children on executive function tasks in early childhood? A propensity score analysis
- One potential reason for discrepant findings across studies examining the bilingual advantage is the difficulty in matching monolingual and bilingual groups on important confounding variables that are elated to EF.
- No effects of bilingualism were observed for performance-based measures of working memory or cognitive flexibility. Results are discussed in the context of recent theoretical models of EF development in early childhood.
- Recent theory suggests that children’s engagement in goal-directed behavior (e.g., sharing toys with friends) directly influences their cognitive development.
- In addition, there is debate over the extent to which the unique experiences of bilingual children afford advantages in cognitive development.
- Our findings suggest that young bilingual children’s unique experiences lead to greater ability to use cognitive skills to engage in goal-directed behavior, when compared to monolingual children.
- Therefore, bilingualism may have important influences on cognitive development that can help support children’s success in school and beyond.

### Bilingual experience and executive functioning in young children
- Advanced inhibitory control skills have been found in bilingual speakers as compared to monolingual controls (Bialystok, 1999).
- After statistically controlling for these factors and age, native bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function battery than both other groups.
- Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call for managing conflicting attentional demands (Conflict tasks); there was no advantage on impulse-control (Delay tasks).

**Educational Development**

**Academic Achievement**
### Successes and Challenges in Dual Language Education

- Research from a variety of studies demonstrates that:
  - e) students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized reading and mathematics tests;
  - f) they score similar to their statewide peers by about grade 5-7, if not sooner;
  - g) English Learners close the achievement gap with NES students in English-Only classrooms by about fifth grade;
  - h) They achieve at or above grade level in reading (and math) tests measured in the partner language;

- DLE middle and high school students are:
  - e) as or more likely to be enrolled in higher level math courses.
  - f) as or more likely to pass the high school exit exam.
  - g) less likely to drop out of school.
  - h) more likely to close the gap with NES peers by the end of high school.

### Executive functions in two-way dual-language education: A mechanism for academic performance

- Executive functions are positively correlated to both socio-economic status (SES, e.g., Nesbitt et al., 2013) and academic performance (for review, see Serpell & Esposito, 2016).

- The researchers propose that two-way dual-language education fosters executive functions similar to the advantage found in bilingual individuals and that well-developed executive functions are a mechanism for an academic advantage.

- The results did indicate that the academic advantage found on the standardized math assessment for children at the intermediate level of the TWDL program was mediated by executive functions behaviors exhibited in the classroom.

- The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels, yet the academic advantage was only present in the intermediate students.

### Meeting the Needs of English Language Learners with Disability in Urban Settings

- The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth.

- For English Learners with disabilities to succeed in bilingual special education programs, they need to be part of a school that promotes bilingualism and provides students with exemplary instructional practices.

### Rethinking Bilingual Instruction

- Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages.

- Students who remained in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake student in English-only programs at about the 5th grade; by high school, they were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured, including English language arts scores and reclassification to English-proficient status.

### Executive functions in two-way dual-language education: A mechanism for academic performance

- Multiple studies indicate that children in bilingual education models (including dual-language and immersion models) have academic outcomes that match or even exceed those of their peers in mainstream education models, especially in later elementary grades.

- For example, Marian et al. (2013) investigated the academic achievement of students in grades 3, 4, or 5 (approximately ages 8-10 years), a portion of which were enrolled in a two-way dual-language program. They found an advantage in academic performance in math across all three grade levels and reading in 3rd grade.

- Similarly, Watzinger-Tharp, Swenson, and Mayne (2018) examined growth in over 2000 4th grade students in either mainstream English education or a dual-language education model (comprised of both...
In a meta-analyses of 10 studies reporting academic performance for students in one-way or two-way dual-language programs compared to mainstream programs, Hill (2018) determined the effect to be null. The results indicated a small positive effect that Hill proposed could be easily nullified by the inclusion of a few studies with even small negative effects.

- Attrition, he reports, is likely to positively affect the socio-economic status of the group because low-income families are more transitory and more likely to relocate, leaving predominantly higher socioeconomic status students in the program.

<p>| The Academic Preparedness of Latino Students in Dual Language and Transitional Bilingual Education Programs | A statistically significant difference was found in the performance of the participants in the areas of mathematics and science via a series of t-tests. | DL participants outperformed TB participants. |
| Dual Language Education: A Promising 50:50 Model | Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics. | |
| Latino English Language Learners: Facing Obstacles Bigger than Language | Ideally, English Learners would learn in communities where their culture and language are valued, such as dual language classrooms where content and language arts are taught both in English and Spanish. | The benefits of such models include accelerated academic progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap. |
| A longitudinal study for the social and academic competence of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children | Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development. | In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were associated with later academic achievement and growth of English proficiency. Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism. |
| Placement of former English language learners in middle schools: general education or dual language? | At present, educators increasingly favor a policy of placing former English Learners in dual language settings. | But it remains unclear whether former English Learners in middle schools perform better academically in general-education (GE) or dual language (DL) classrooms. |
| | Research was conducted to compare former English Learners placed in GE settings and those who remained in DL classrooms on state tests in English Language Arts (ELA) and math (n = 99) at the middle-school level. | In both subjects, DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. |
| | In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were associated with later academic achievement and growth of English proficiency. Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism. | Calling into question policies favoring placement of former English Learners in GE classes, the results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. |
| Contesting math as the universal language: a longitudinal study of dual language bilingual education language allocation | In this study, researchers used a quasi-experimental, longitudinal design to examine the English language arts (ELA) and mathematics test scores of emergent bilinguals (EBs) in DLBE 50:50 models versus English as a second language (ESL) models in Indiana over four academic school years. | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dual Language Programs: An Exploration of Bilingual Students’ Academic Achievement, Language Proficiencies, and Engagement Using a Mixed Methods Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employing a mixed-methods research design, this study examines how a newly designed dual language program in an urban school advances language proficiencies among Spanish-English bilingual 6th graders in relation to content area achievement as measured on NYS standardized tests in English Language Arts and Math.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It further investigates how students' emotional (school identification) and behavioral engagement (language learning commitment) relate to bilingual language proficiencies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The results drawn from both quantitative and qualitative data indicate that bilingual students benefitted from attending a dual language program. It contributes positively to students’ academic achievement, bilingual school identification and commitment to language learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With respect to language development, the study found that English proficiency in productive skills was positively correlated with standardized test scores.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish proficiency was positively correlated with students' commitment to language learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish and English languages play different but equally important functions in the dual language program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>However, students, face challenges in sustaining learning the two languages in school; researchers show that students experience a gradual language shift from Spanish to English.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The study underscores the potential benefits of a multilingual proficiency perspective theory among the students and in preparing bilingual teachers.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fostering greater equity for emergent bilinguals through dual language programming</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Research shows that long-term DL programs can close achievement gaps between English-proficient speakers and emergent bilinguals after five years, while short-term bilingual or English-only transitional programs close only about half of that gap (Collier &amp; Thomas, 2017).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional research finds that DL programming improves academic outcomes for traditionally under-served groups while fostering diverse learning environments for all learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students in DL programs outperform students who participate in non-DL programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In North Carolina, DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internationally, research shows the most powerful predictor of academic achievement for emergent bilinguals is the sustained development of the students’ home language through the school curriculum.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By promoting bilingualism, the DL approach acknowledges that fluency in multiple languages is an asset to be developed, rather than a deficit to overcome.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within an asset-focused context, students have an opportunity to build linguistic capital, defined as “the intellectual and social skills attained through communication experiences in more than one language and/or style.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic and English Language Outcomes for DLLS as a Function of the School Bilingual Education Mode: The role of Two-Way Immersion and Home Language Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>This study assesses the long-term linguistic and academic outcomes associated with different bilingual language education models for low-income dual language learners (DLLs) residing in a bilingual, bicultural context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two-way immersion models that support the home language and culture and integrate language majority and minority learners were associated with faster English acquisition, which mediated the link between Two-Way Immersion (TWI) programs and higher GPAs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Benefits of Dual Language Immersion on the Academic Achievement of English Language Learners | • This pilot study compares the overall academic achievement in the area of language arts literacy among elementary bilingual students enrolled in either Dual Language: Two-Way Immersion programs or in an Early Exit, Transitional Bilingual program in a large urban public school district.  
• By analyzing the results of curriculum-based measures in the area of word decoding and overall reading comprehension, this study shows that students who have continuously enrolled in a Dual Language: Two Way Immersion Bilingual Program reveal higher academic achievement than students enrolled in an Early Exit, Transitional Bilingual program, from kindergarten to third grade. |
| Academic Achievement of Students in Dual Language Immersion | • This article reports on a study that investigated achievement in math of third and fourth grade dual language immersion (DLI) students, building on research that has demonstrated the academic achievement of students who receive content instruction predominantly in the target language.  
• This study expands the scope and methodology of prior research by including one-way programs in three languages (Chinese, French and Spanish) and two-way Spanish-English programs; and by relying on propensity matching to mitigate possible effects of school and student differences.  
• In the third-grade study, researchers compared students’ math scores in relation to their English Language Arts (ELA) achievement to control for pre-existing differences between DLI and non-DLI students.  
• DLI students who attained the same levels in ELA, and who received math instruction in a target language, performed at the same level as their non-DLI peers in third grade math tests given in English.  
• For the fourth-grade study, we compared DLI students to a propensity-matched non-DLI group. DLI students grew more in math than their counterparts not in DLI.  
• The results from this natural experiment indicate that students in a DLI program that has been implemented state-wide were able to succeed academically in math. |
| Individual Versus Peer Grit: Influence on Later Individual Literacy Achievement of Dual Language Learners | • The objective of this short-term longitudinal study was to examine individual versus classroom peer effects of grit on later individual literacy achievement in elementary school.  
• The current article found that classroom peer grit, not individual grit, was a strong predictor of individual literacy achievement 4 months later among dual language, largely Latina/o elementary school students.  
• This study holds implications for educators of dual language learners who would be interested in the conclusion that grit’s role in literacy achievement may not lie solely in an individual’s character, but also in an individual’s classroom context among dual language learner elementary schoolchildren. |
| The Effects of Spanish English Dual Language Immersion on Student Achievement in Science and Mathematics | • In this study, researchers present quantitative findings on the effects of English-Spanish dual language immersion on student achievement in science and mathematics in grades 3, 4, and 5.  
• Dual language programs promote positive academic and social outcomes for all students and particularly for English language learners.  
• When put together well, dual language programs can have a profound impact on student outcomes. Clarkson (2007) writes that "the evidence that bilingual young people, relative to monolingual controls, show greater cognitive flexibility, creativity, divergent thought and improved problem-solving abilities, is very persuasive" (pp. 192-93).  
• One effect of these cognitive advantages is increased academic achievement, including in mathematics and science. Several studies...
with students from different linguistic groups have noted improved mathematics achievement for bilingual students

### Academic Development of Head Start Children: Role of Dual Language Learning Status

- Using a large longitudinal dataset including children who attended Head Start over two years, this study examined academic growth trajectories during the period between Head Start entry and kindergarten (2.5 years), and whether those growth trajectories differ by children's dual language learning status.
- Analyses comparing three groups of children (i.e., Spanish-English bilinguals, Spanish-English emergent bilinguals [EBs], and English monolinguals) showed three noteworthy findings:
  - First, bilinguals entering Head Start with English proficiency showed similar developmental trajectories in vocabulary and math to those of monolinguals.
  - Second, EBs entering Head Start with limited English proficiency presented the lowest baseline skills in vocabulary and math. Whereas the initial vocabulary gaps generally persisted over time, gaps in math between EBs and monolinguals narrowed by kindergarten.
  - Third, no difference was found between bilinguals and EBs in their Spanish vocabulary development.

### Effects of an Elementary Dual Language Immersion School Program on Junior High School Achievement

- Findings suggest consistent support for the two-way immersion program over matched control students across all three achievement areas.
- It appears the greatest effect for native English speakers may be in reading, while native Spanish speakers may benefit more in writing and mathematics.

### Successes Spur Push for Dual-Language Classes

- Thomas & Collier have found that in the North Carolina districts with two-way, dual-language instruction, students score statistically significantly higher in reading in 4th grade than their nondual-language peers, a pattern that continues through 8th grade.
- By 5th grade, dual language students score about the same as their monolingual peers a grade ahead of them, an advantage that lasts through 8th grade.
- The same pattern plays out in math, with 5th-grade dual-language students scoring as high as non-program peers in 6th grade.
- Two groups of students are benefitting the most from dual language instruction: English language learners and African-American students.
- For English-learners in dual language programs, reading scores in all the tested grades are much higher than for English Learners who are not in a dual-language program, according to the study.

### Four Essential Questions About Dual Language Education

- When properly implemented, DLPs are an effective way to improve academic achievement for all students (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).
- Data has demonstrated that DLPs have benefited both English Learners and native English-speaking students in obtaining higher levels of academic achievement in all areas, as compared to their counterparts in mainstream classrooms.
- In states with high numbers of English Learners, such as Arizona, implementing a two-way 50/50 model can be beneficial for the academic achievement of all students involved in such programs.

### Portland Study Points to Reading Gains from Dual Language Programs

- A new study from RAND Education and the American Councils for International Education in conjunction with the Portland Public Schools has examined the effects of dual-language immersion (DU) on student achievement.
- The study covered DU programs in Spanish, Japanese, Mandarin Chinese, Russian, and Vietnamese, and included two-way programs, where half the students in the program were native speakers of English and the other half native speakers of the partner (non-English) language.
- The study found that:
**Students randomly assigned to immersion outperformed their peers in English reading by about seven months in fifth grade and nine months in eighth grade.**

- There was no statistically significant benefit, but also no detriment, for math and science performance.
- There were no clear differences in immersion effects by native language.
- Reading effects for students whose native language matches the classroom partner language appear as high as or higher than for native English speakers.
- There is suggestive but not statistically significant evidence that the immersion benefit in reading is higher for students in Spanish immersion programs, and that modest math benefits are higher for students in the less commonly taught languages (Japanese, Mandarin, and Russian)
- Immersion students have three-point lower rates of classification as English Language Learners (English Learners) by sixth grade, and this effect is larger (14 points) if students' native language matches the classroom partner language.
- On average, immersion students reach intermediate levels of partner-language proficiency by eighth grade, with somewhat higher performance in Spanish and Chinese (intermediate mid-to-high) than in Japanese (intermediate low-to-mid).

**Succeeding with Latino Students**

- If the number of Latino students in your school is high, dual language programs can increase their academic achievement while also developing their biliteracy and bilingual skills (Reyes and Halcon 2001; Gomez ffli 2005)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Academic Preparedness of Latino Students in Dual Language and Transitional Bilingual Education Programs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>School/College Readiness</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This causal-comparative study analyzed the college readiness of Latino English Learners educated in two different bilingual education programs, Transitional Bilingual (TB) and Dual Language (DL), by examining science and mathematics scores on the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the ACT:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A statistically significant difference was found in the performance of the participants in the areas of mathematics and science via a series of t-tests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The descriptive statistics report that DL participants had a 29.6% higher probability in science and a 15.2% higher probability in mathematics of being college ready, per the Texas Uniform Admission Policy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall, DL participants outperformed TB participants.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analysis Calls for DL Pre-K for Young English Learners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conceptualizing preschool dual-language immersion education at Bobcat Canyon School</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young children learning two languages demonstrate school readiness factors: strong social-emotional development and “executive function” skills, such as listening and following directions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This study examined how parents, teachers, and administrators conceptualized dual-language immersion (DLI) education and its goals at Bobcat Canyon School (BCS, pseudonym), a private preschool in the Southwestern USA where 64% students were White and 36% were students of color.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The analysis revealed that with a framework of neoliberal linguistic instrumentalism, the preschool conceptualized its DLI as an enriching context for students to obtain a cognitive, social, and academic edge. Cognitive development, social competencies, and school readiness were primary goals while bilingualism/biliteracy was a secondary bonus if achieved.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School readiness in language minority dual language learners in Japan: Language, executive function, and theory of mind</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| The present study investigated school readiness in Brazilian (Portuguese-Japanese dual language learner or DLL) 5-year-olds in Japan (1) by examining their language skills, executive function (EF), and theory of mind (ToM) in comparison to their monolingual
peers and (2) by investigating the developmental relations between these three skills.

- DLLs scored lower than monolinguals in Japanese language skills, specifically in receptive vocabulary and the understanding of complement clauses in Japanese.
- In conclusion, DLLs had school readiness difficulties in Japanese language skills and ToM, but not in EF, compared to their Japanese monolingual peers.
- Furthermore, the positive relationship of language and EF skills with ToM development, which is commonly reported in monolingual children, extended to an understudied population of DLLs in this study.

A Comparative Study on the College Readiness of Bilingual Learners in Transitional Bilingual and Dual Language Programs

- This study compared the performance of bilingual learners, educated in either a Transitional Bilingual (TB) or Dual Language (DL) program, on the Reading and English portions of the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the American College Test (ACT).
- A statistically significant difference was found on the t-tests run for the Reading (p > .000) and English (p > .000) portions of the ACT exam.
- Outlined in the Texas Uniform Admission Policy (TUAP) are recommended minimum scores students should meet in order to be deemed "college ready." In the area of Reading, the TB comparison group (10.8%) had less than the DL comparison group (51.8%) meet the recommended minimum score outlined in the TUAP.
- Similar findings were found on the English portion of the ACT exam.
- A smaller percentage of participants in the TB comparison group (9%) meet the TUAP recommended minimum score for English than the DL comparison group (59.1%).
- By and large, DL participants outperformed the TB participants in this study.

Pro: All students benefit from dual-language programs

- The idea behind the immersion program is to get students from different backgrounds to work together while simultaneously aiding each other in communication.
- The benefits of a program include improved college readiness for all students involved -- not just the English Language Learners, who are largely Spanish speakers in the Crossroads, said Alejandro Mojica, the Victoria school district's newly hired Bilingual and ESL Learning director.
- "Both groups of students would benefit from each other," said Mojica, a Columbia native. "Research shows that by the time they reach high school, these students are more college-ready than their peers who didn't participate in an immersion program."

Habla Conmigo: Teachers' Spanish Talk and Latino Dual Language Learners' School Readiness Skills

- Preschool is a critical period during which children's development and learning exert a long-lasting impact on their school adjustment and academic outcomes.
- Using multilevel modeling, this study examined the specific ways teachers use students' home language (Spanish) in their various verbal exchanges in the classroom (i.e., giving directions, requesting language, providing, and eliciting contextualized information, and providing and eliciting decontextualized information).
- These conversations with Latino DLLs, as measured by the Language Interaction Snapshot, uniquely contributed to students' language and social skills at the end of the Head Start academic year.
- Results revealed statistically significant relations between teachers' Spanish talk and DLLs' social outcomes.
- Specifically, teachers' Spanish talk with DLLs and DLLs' initial English and Spanish skills were positively associated with the latter's interactive peer play behaviors, whereas DLLs' initial English skills
were negatively associated with their disconnected peer play behaviors.

Supporting Dual Language Learners through Culturally Responsive Early Childhood Family Education Programs

- Attending preschool may be particularly advantageous for DLLs for several reasons.
- First, achievement gaps are already established when DLLs enter kindergarten without having attended a preschool program, such as being less able to recognize English letters, count to 20, or write their names compared with their English-dominant peers (Ansari, 2018).
- Second, preschool attendance promotes the native or first language (L1) and the target or second language (L2: English) and literacy development (Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016; Phillips et al., 2017).
- Academic language and social-behavioral skills also increase when DLLs attend public preschool programs (Ansari & López, 2015).
- Gains in English proficiency, reading achievement and math performance have also been demonstrated (Halle et al., 2012).
- Attending formalized preschool environments can raise literacy and math scores for DLL children while reducing inequality in kindergarten (Barnett et al., 2020; Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016).

Teacher Characteristics That Play a Role in the Language, Literacy and Math Development of Dual Language Learners

- Researchers examined the school readiness skills of 217 Latino DLLs attending Head Start taking into account specific teacher characteristics that may impact the development of readiness skills. Different teacher characteristics have different effects on the developmental outcomes.
- Amount of training had a positive significant effect on several children’s outcomes in English and in Spanish.
- The years of experience a teacher had working in classrooms with DLLs had a positive effect on children’s English spelling skills.
- Teachers’ cultural competency rating had a positive effect on receptive language and literacy in Spanish.

Rethinking Bilingual Education

- Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Examining heterogeneity among Latino Dual Language Learners’ School Readiness Profiles of English and Spanish at the end of Head Starts</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Emerging research shows there is substantial heterogeneity in the English and Spanish language and literacy proficiencies of dual language learners (DLLs) in U.S. preschools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This work is extended in this paper by examining within-group variability in 320 Spanish-English speaking DLLs’ cognitive, linguistic, literacy, and mathematics skills at the end of prekindergarten (M = 5.22 years old).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Using latent profile analysis (a type of mixture modeling), four profiles of DLLs were identified.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Most DLLs were classified as English Dominant, followed by Balanced Average, Spanish Dominant, and Balanced Low, respectively.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In general, the Balanced Average profile outperformed the other profiles in English and Spanish, and their norm-referenced standard scores provide additional evidence that bilingual development is not associated with educational risk.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Literacy Development</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Effect of Dual Language and Transitional-Bilingual Education Instructional Models on Spanish Proficiency for English Learners</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In light of research linking proficiency in the home language with achievement in English language skills and content learning, dual-language instruction appears to be more effective than transitional-bilingual education, although the advantage is limited to the facilitation of home-language verbal expression associated with the dual-language model.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Effective Instruction for English Learners</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• During 2007–08, more than 5.3 million English learners made up 10.6 percent of the nation’s K–12 public school enrollment. Wide and persistent achievement disparities between these English learners and English-proficient students show clearly, say the authors, that schools must address the language, literacy, and academic needs of English learners more effectively.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Based on the studies presented here, Calderón, Slavin, and Sánchez assert that the quality of instruction is what matters most in educating English learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• They highlight comprehensive reform models, as well as individual components of these models: school structures and leadership; language and literacy instruction; integration of language, literacy, and content instruction in secondary schools; cooperative learning; professional development; parent and family support teams; tutoring; and monitoring implementation and outcomes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| The Promise of Two Language Education | • We analyzed data on eight cohorts of English language learners who were each assigned to one of the four different instructional programs, using up to 10 years of data for each cohort.  
• We compared students in the four programs on three different outcomes: students’ English language acquisition (as measured by their performance on the California English Language Development Test); their academic performance and growth (as measured by their performance on the California Standards Tests in mathematics and English language arts); and their reclassification from English learner status to fluent English proficient status.  
• When possible, invest in high-quality two-language programs.  
• Choose among two-language programs based on community and stakeholder voice. |
| The Effects of Prekindergarten for Spanish-speaking dual language learners: Evidence from California’s Prekindergarten Program | • The impact of California’s transitional kindergarten program on Spanish-speaking dual language learners was examined through two studies.  
• Participants in the two studies included (1) the statewide population of students who met study inclusion criteria and took the California English Language Development Test and (2) a sample of students (n=1868) in 20 school districts.  
• Findings indicate that Tk had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social-emotional skills or executive function.  
• The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry as compared to Spanish speaking dual language learners who do not attend |
| The Additive Advantage and Bilingual Programs in a Large Urban District | • The current study analyzes the relationship between elementary school reading achievement and participation in the following language acquisition programs—transitional bilingual, developmental, two-way bilingual immersion, and English immersion.  
• Set in a large urban school district in Texas, this research finds that participants in the most additive program, two-way, earned the highest Grade 5 English reading performance.  
• In contrast, students in transitional and two-way programs demonstrated similar Spanish reading growth, and developmental students had significantly slower growth than transitional students. |
| Language proficiency and competence: upper elementary students in a dual-language bilingual education program | • Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S.  
• Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs.  
• Multiple regression results show that both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. These effects remained significant even after controlling for students’ English speaking/writing proficiency.  
• Moreover, both Cantonese and English writing proficiency were positively related to students’ classroom competence.  
• Additionally, higher English reading proficiency was positively associated with peer competence. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Double-voicing and rubber ducks: the dominance of English in the imaginative play of two bilingual sisters</th>
<th>• The paper concludes by discussing the conundrum this explanation poses for language maintenance efforts, as it is only through initiatives such as pro-minority language FLPs and minority language immersion classrooms that children are able to acquire the minority language in the first place.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| The Impact of Home Literacy on Bilingual Vocabulary Development | • In this study, survey data were gathered on the frequency of home literacy activities in two languages for forty-two early elementary students in a French-English dual language immersion program.  
• Using growth modeling, this study focuses on the effects of print and media exposure on the students’ vocabulary development.  
• Findings suggest no effect of English literacy activities on English baseline vocabulary, whereas there was a positive effect of French literacy activities on French baseline vocabulary.  
• Home language status was a significant factor in French, but not English, vocabulary growth.  
• Results imply that regardless of home language background, for children to develop vocabulary skills in a language other than English, emphasis should be placed on home literacy activities in that language. |
| Change in Language and Literacy Knowledge for Spanish-English Dual Language Learners at School-Entry: Analyses from Three Studies | • Over 30% of children in the US are dual language learners who are learning two languages.  
• Few have simultaneously examined development of skills in both languages for children in preschool.  
• The purpose of this study was to examine the language and literacy skills in both Spanish and English in secondary data analyses of three studies of DLL children.  
• Hierarchical linear model analyses compared acquisition of language skills in English and Spanish in three studies.  
• Using language and time as nesting factors, these models allow for direct contrast of level and rate of acquisition across languages.  
• Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills.  
• Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills. |
| The Language and Literacy Development of Young Dual Language Learners: A Critical Review | • To summarize the extant literature and guide future research, a critical analysis of the literature was conducted. A search of major databases for studies on young typically developing DLLs between 2000 and 2011 yielded 182 peer reviewed articles.  
• First, the research shows that DLLs have two separate language systems early in life.  
• Second, differences in some areas of language development, such as vocabulary, appear to exist among DLLs depending on when they were first exposed to their second language.  
• Third, DLLs’ language and literacy development may differ from that of monolinguals, although DLLs appear to catch up over time.  
• Fourth, little is known about factors that influence DLLs’ development, although the amount of language exposure to and usage of DLLs’ two languages appears to play key roles. Methodological issues are addressed, and directions for future research are discussed. |
| Beating the Odds: A Longitudinal Investigation of Low-Income Dual-Language and Monolingual Children’s English Language and Literacy Performance | • The current study reports on the results of a longitudinal investigation of the language and early literacy development of a sample of dual-language learners (DLLs) and monolingual English speakers from low-income families who received an Early Reading First intervention during their Head Start preschool year. |
### Phonetic discrimination, phonological awareness, and pre-literacy skills in Spanish-English dual language preschoolers

- A total of 62 children who entered and remained in the same school district were followed from kindergarten through 2nd grade.
- The results indicate that both the DLLs and monolingual English speakers in the study showed similar developmental trajectories on receptive vocabulary, story recall, decoding, and letter and word identification from preschool through the 2nd grade.
- Furthermore, at the end of 2nd grade, the 2 groups’ vocabulary, story recall, reading fluency, decoding, and letter and word identification performances were similar and within the normal range for children their age.
- The study’s findings suggest that a strong preschool language and literacy program can reduce the English language gap between DLLs and monolingual English speakers from low-income families.

### Influences of the home language and literacy environment on Spanish and English vocabulary growth among dual language learners

- The current study explores variation in phonemic representation among Spanish-English dual language learners (DLLs, n = 60) who were dominant in English or in Spanish.
- Children were given a phonetic discrimination task with speech sounds that: 1) occur in English and Spanish, 2) are exclusive to English, and 3) are exclusive to Russian, during Fall (age m = 57 months) and Spring (age m = 62 months, n = 42).
- In Fall, English-dominant DLLs discriminated more accurately than Spanish-dominant DLLs between English-Spanish phones and English-exclusive phones.
- In Spring, however, groups no longer differed in discriminating English-exclusive phones and both groups discriminated Russian phones above chance.
- Additionally, joint English-Spanish and English-exclusive phonetic discrimination predicted children’s phonological awareness in both groups.
- Results demonstrate plasticity in early childhood through diverse language exposure and suggest that phonemic representation begins to emerge driven by lexical restructuring.

### Effects of transitional bilingual education on Spanish-speaking preschoolers literacy and language development: year 2 results

- Year 2 findings are reported from a longitudinal, experimental-control study involving 31 Spanish speaking preschoolers (aged 38–48 months) randomly assigned to two Head Start classrooms.
- Year 2 results were consistent with Year 1, with the TBE classroom exceeding the PE classroom on all Spanish measures of language and literacy development and no significant differences favoring the PE classroom.
- Results also indicated that Year 2 trajectories were conditional on first-year effects, suggesting that sustained growth in dual language learner’s early literacy may depend on early intervention among 3-year-old preschoolers.

### A culturally and Linguistically Responsive Vocabulary Approach for Young Latino Dual Language Learners

- Purpose: This study examined the role of the language of vocabulary instruction in promoting English vocabulary in preschool Latino dual language learners (DLLs). The authors compared the effectiveness of delivering a single evidence-informed vocabulary approach using
### Language and Literacy Instruction in Preschool Classes that Serve Latino Dual Language Learners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English as the language of vocabulary instruction (English culturally responsive [ECR]) versus using a bilingual modality that strategically combined Spanish and English (culturally and linguistically responsive [CLR]).</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Method:</strong> Forty-two DLL Spanish-speaking preschoolers were randomly assigned to the ECR group ((n = 22)) or CLR group ((n = 20)). Thirty English words were presented during small-group shared readings in their preschools 3 times a week for 5 weeks. Multilevel models were used to examine group differences in post instruction scores on 2 Spanish and 2 English vocabulary assessments at instruction end and follow-up.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Results:</strong> Children receiving instruction in the CLR bilingual modality had significantly higher posttest scores (than those receiving the ECR English-only instruction) on Spanish and English vocabulary assessments at instruction end and on the Spanish vocabulary assessment at follow-up, even after controlling for preinstruction scores.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conclusions:</strong> The results provide additional evidence of the benefits of strategically combining the first and second language to promote English and Spanish vocabulary development in this population. Future directions for research and clinical applications are discussed.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Language Acquisition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Effect of Dual Language and Transitional-Bilingual Education Instructional Models on Spanish Proficiency for English Learners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills.</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Contributions of Oral narrative Skills to English Reading in Spanish-English Latino/a Dual Language Learners | • Purpose: The study examined the contributions of Spanish and English oral narrative skills to English reading among 95 early elementary dual language learners (DLLs) from Spanish-speaking homes in the United States. This sample of first- and third-grade DLL children attended Spanish–English dual language immersion programs and received language and literacy instruction in both English and Spanish.

• Method: All participants completed a storytelling task in both languages and two English reading tests in decoding and reading comprehension. The story narratives were analyzed for microstructures (number of different new words, lexical diversity [D], mean length of utterance, subordination index [SI]) using the Computerized Language Analysis program. The narrative sample were also evaluated for macrostructures (i.e., discourse-level features) using the Narrative Scoring Scheme.

• Results: Grade, English D, and Spanish SI significantly predicted English reading. Grade level was the strongest predictor of the three for both decoding and comprehension. However, Spanish SI was more robust than English D for decoding whereas English D was a stronger predictor than Spanish SI for comprehension.

• Conclusions: Young DLL children’s oral narrative skills in English as well as in their home language Spanish contributed to their English reading outcomes.

• The results also implicated that maintaining young DLL children’s home language skills may be beneficial, rather than harmful, to their English reading development. |

| The Effects of Prekindergarten for Spanish-speaking dual language learners: Evidence from California’s Prekindergarten Program | • The impact of California’s transitional kindergarten program on Spanish-speaking dual language learners was examined through two studies.

• Participants in the two studies included: (1) the statewide population of students who met study inclusion criteria (n = 45,010) and took the California English Language Development Test (CELDT), and (2) a sample of students (n = 1868) in 20 school districts.

• Findings indicate that TK had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social–emotional skills or executive function. |

| Cultivating Space for the Language Boomerang: The Interplay of Two Languages as Academic Resources | • Grounded in sociocultural theory, this study uses an ecological approach to examine how student interactions within a dual-language school context may offer affordances for increased linguistic and conceptual understanding.

• Using qualitative analysis of student discourse, this paper focuses on data from recorded interactions between pairs of fifth-grade students engaged in writing activities (in English and Spanish).

• Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language.

• This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry, as compared to Spanish-speaking dual language learners who do not attend.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The role of mother tongue literacy in language learning and mathematical learning: Is there a multilingual benefit for both?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The present study examines the multilingual benefit in relation to language learning and mathematical learning; The objective is to assess whether speakers of three or more languages, depending on language profile and personal histories, show significant advantages in language learning and/or mathematical learning, and whether mother tongue literacy can be associated with their performance in moth and English language tests; Participants are all multilinguals with knowledge of French as an L1 or as a non-native language. Three core groups were examined: (a) School multilinguals (n = 449), typically French L1 speakers with knowledge of two additional languages learned in a formal school context; (b) Multilinguals with Literacy in the home language (n = 45) and Multilinguals without Literacy in the home language (n = 113); All participants were given a math test, an English language test and a questionnaire. A questionnaire for parents was also used; Results suggest a positive role of mother tongue literacy in language learning as well as mathematical learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The impact of early social interactions on later language development in Spanish-English bilingual infants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This study tested the impact of child-directed language input on language development in Spanish–English bilingual infants (N = 25, 11- and 14-month-olds from the Seattle metropolitan area), across languages and independently for each language, controlling for socioeconomic status; Language input was characterized by social interaction variables, defined in terms of speech style (“parentese” vs. standard speech) and social context (one-on-one vs. group); Correlations between parentese one-on-one and productive vocabulary at 24 months (n = 18) were found across languages and in each language independently; The results also suggest cultural effects on language input and language development in bilingual and bicultural infants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderators of Language Acquisition Models and Reading Achievement for English Language Learners: The Role of Emotional Warmth and Instructional Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Questions: The present study examined the following research questions: (1) What teacher behaviors and student-level characteristics predict student achievement? (2) Do teacher behaviors moderate the relationship between language acquisition models and English Learners’ achievement? Research Design: Sources of data in this study consist of student demographic variables and reading achievement for 995 students and classroom observation data using the Classroom Assessment Scoring System collected across 46 classrooms in an urban school district in Wisconsin. Hierarchical linear modeling was used to address the research questions; Results: A two-level hierarchical linear modeling analysis revealed that prior achievement, Hispanic and African American ethnicity, and eligibility for free lunch contributed significantly to the model, but gender did not. Teachers contributed markedly to student reading outcomes when they (1) incorporated student perspectives into instruction; (2) promoted autonomy and responsibility; (3) provided instructional opportunities to support higher level thinking; and (4) applied instruction to real-life applications. Cross-level interactions indicate that emotional warmth was particularly salient for English Learners in dual language immersion, whereas instructional support moderated the relationship between developmental bilingual education and reading achievement.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Conclusions/Recommendations
Findings from the present study suggest that developing teachers’ emotional warmth and instructional support is particularly salient for teachers of English Learners, who must possess qualities associated with good teaching, both in general (such as content knowledge and pedagogical skills) and, more specifically, for English Learners (proficiency in bilingual education methods).

### A preliminary study of the relationship between working memory, language experience, and grammatical skill in dual language learners

**Purpose:** This study examined the relationship between verbal short-term and working memory, language experience, and English tense-marking skill in Spanish L1-English L2 dual language learners (DLLs).

**Methodology:** Ten Spanish-English DLLs, in kindergarten and first grade, participated in the study. Children completed the Test of Early Grammatical Impairment, a narrative retell task in English, and verbal memory tasks. Parents provided information regarding language input and output in the home and school environment.

**Data and analysis:** Correlational analyses were conducted to examine relationships between English and Spanish input/output, forward and backward digit span, assessed in English and Spanish, and the accurate and productive use of English tense morphemes in various linguistic contexts.

**Conclusions:** Study outcomes indicated varied use of English tense morphemes among DLLs. Additionally, a strong, positive association was found between the use of a variety of distinct tense forms and verbal working memory performance.

**Originality:** This study is the first investigation to examine verbal short-term and working memory and home language experience to advance our understanding of the specific child internal and external factors that may account for the variability in tense marking during English second language acquisition.

**Significance:** This research provides further insight to the effects of individual differences on the acquisition of second language grammatical skill during childhood.

### The Distributed L1 and L2 Language-Learning Environments of Dual Language Learners Across Home and School Settings

**Purpose:** This study explored the language-learning environments of typically developing dual language learners (DLLs) who learned Cantonese (first language [L1]) at home and English (second language [L2]) in preschool settings through direct and indirect measures.

**Method:** Nine typically developing Cantonese–English DLLs participated in this study. Participants’ daylong activities were audio-recorded using the digital language processor of the Language Environment Analysis system. A manual coding scheme was developed to examine the audio recordings with the focus of the amount of L1 and L2 used by participants, adults, and their peers across home and school settings. In addition, participants’ language use was indirectly examined using parent questionnaires, teacher reports, and classroom observations.

**Results:** The results of the audio recordings showed that Cantonese was the primary language used at home, and both Cantonese and English were used in school settings, consistent with the parent and teacher reports. Correlation analyses revealed that the amount of L1 used by the participants was associated with the L1 used by their peers; and the amount of L2 used by participants was positively related to the L2 used by adults at home.

**Conclusions:** The findings illustrate how parent/teacher reports and daylong audio recordings could complement each other in the investigation of DLLs’ language-learning environments.

### Working Memory and Linguistic Performance of Dual Language Learners With and Without

**Purpose:** This research note describes the use of working memory measures as potential indicators of developmental language disorders (DLD) in preschool age dual language learners from Spanish-English background.
Developmental Language Disorders

- Method: One hundred thirty Spanish-speaking families with preschool-age children participated; 37 children had DLD, and 93 were typically developing. Families were recruited from early childhood programs in three states in the western region of the United States. Working memory and linguistic measures were collected from the children; parents completed a vocabulary checklist and reported on their child’s longest utterances.

- Results: Nonverbal working memory was not associated with other measures, but verbal working memory was associated with linguistic measures. Although there were no group differences on nonverbal working memory, group differences (DLD vs. typical development) were detected on verbal working memory and linguistic measures. Verbal working memory combined with vocabulary scores resulted in 79% of cases correctly classified.

- Conclusions: Working memory tasks yielded different results depending on the type of task (verbal vs. nonverbal). Outcomes from this study showed that a nonverbal working memory task (hand movement) was not useful in distinguishing preschool-age dual language children with DLD from typical peers, but a verbal working memory task (nonword repetition) may be useful if combined with other more robust linguistic measures.

Dynamic Assessment Language Tasks and the Prediction of Performance on Year-End Language Skills in Preschool Dual Language Learners

- Purpose: Early identification is a key element for accessing appropriate services for preschool children with language impairment. However, there is a high risk of misidentifying typically developing dual language learners as having language impairment if inappropriate tools designed for monolingual children are used. In this study of children with bilingual exposure, we explored performance on brief dynamic assessment (DA) language tasks using graduated prompting because this approach has potential applications for screening. We asked if children’s performance on DA language tasks earlier in the year was related to their performance on a year-end language achievement measure.

- Method: Twenty 4-year-old children from Spanish-speaking homes attending Head Start preschools in the southwestern United States completed three DA graduated prompting language tasks 3–6 months prior to the Head Start preschools’ year-end achievement testing. The DA tasks, Novel Adjective Learning, Similarities in Function, and Prediction, were administered in Spanish, but correct responses in English or Spanish were accepted. The year-end achievement measure, the Learning Accomplishment Profile–Third Edition (LAP3), was administered by the children’s Head Start teachers, who also credited correct responses in either language.

- Results: Children’s performance on two of the three DA language tasks was significantly and positively related to year-end LAP3 language scores, and there was a moderate and significant relationship for one of the DA tasks, even when controlling for age and initial LAP3 scores.

- Conclusions: Although the relationship of performance on DA with year-end performance varies across tasks, the findings indicate potential for using a graduated prompting approach to language screening with young dual language learners. Further research is needed to select the best tasks for administration in a graduated prompting framework and determine accuracy of identification of language impairment.

Peer Effects on Early Language Development in Dual Language Learners

- This study investigated the vocabulary development of children (N = 547) from linguistically and socioeconomically diverse classrooms in Germany from age 3 in preschool to age 7 in Grade 1.
The results showed that for dual language learners (DLLs, n = 107) growth rates in their German majority language skills varied over classrooms.

Compared to monolingual children, DLLs improved faster in classrooms with higher peer level skills in the majority language than DLLs in classrooms with lower peer-level skills (controlling for socioeconomic status and classroom quality).

DLLs showed stronger growth dynamics than monolingual children during later preschool stages.

The findings highlight the role of preschool peers in DLLs’ acquisition of the majority language before entering elementary school.

The Dimensionality of Oral Language in Kindergarten Spanish-English Dual Language Learners

Purpose: The purpose of this study was to examine the latent dimensionality of language in dual language learners (DLLs) who spoke Spanish as their native language and were learning English as their second language.

Method: Participants included 259 Spanish–English DLLs attending kindergarten. In the spring of their kindergarten year, children completed vocabulary, grammar, listening comprehension, and higher-level language measures (comprehension monitoring and inferencing) in Spanish and English.

Results: Two models with similar fits best describe the data. The first was a bifactor model with a single general language factor “L,” plus 2 additional language factors, 1 for Spanish and 1 for English. The second model was a 4-factor model, 1 for English that included all English language measures and 3 additional factors that included Spanish vocabulary, Spanish grammar, and Spanish higher-level language.

Conclusions: These results indicate that a general language ability may underlie development in both Spanish and English. In contrast to a unidimensional structure found for monolingual English-speaking kindergarteners, oral language appears to be multidimensional in Spanish–English DLL kindergarteners, but multidimensionality is reflected in Spanish, not English.

Teaching (Bi) Multilingual Learners: Connecting Languages

Two language children now constitute 10% of the total population of US public schools, they reside in every state, and the overwhelming majority are US born (National Center for Education Statistics, 2020).

30% of students age 8 and under have a significant influence of a language other than English in the home (Carey, 2021).

Current program options fall into two broad categories: (1) those that use English only as a medium of instruction and (2) those that offer some form of bilingual instruction utilizing a language other than English (LOTE) for some part of the school’s educational program.

Although the research is clear that utilization of students’ non-English languages in bilingual education programs is beneficial to academic achievement Umansky & Reardon, 2014; Valentino & Reardon, 2015), these programs have been highly politicized over time to the point that few EB students have access to bilingual programs and sadly, English medium programs rarely make use of children’s non-English languages.

While dual language bilingual programs have been growing in number and stature over the past decade, going from about 300 in 2000 to over 3,000 in 2020 (Lan & Richards, 2020), because of the growth of the population of emerging bilingual learners, in general, and the growth.

We start this paper by reaffirming that the research overwhelmingly establishes that emerging bilingual children are best served in school when both of their languages are used for instruction (Goldenberg &
Purpose of this paper is to discuss how languages other than English (LOTEs) can be used to help emerging bilingual children, whether they are in English medium or bilingual programs.

Regardless of program model, bilingual learners always have all of their linguistic resources available to them. These resources form a unified and inseparable whole that is the foundation of a powerful form of cultural capital that can, and should, be leveraged to accelerate and enhance learning (Bourdieu, 1991).

Our research indicates that adherence to these guidelines in Spanish–English bilingual education settings results in significant language and literacy achievement for Spanish–English Bilingual learners (Hopewell & Escamilla, 2013; Soltero-González et al., 2012, 2016; Sparrow et al., 2014).

We cannot and should not teach them as if they were monolingual English speakers and/or if the LOTE is irrelevant to literacy acquisition.

The present study investigates how changes in both Spanish and English proficiencies of Latino, second-generation immigrant children (n = 163) from kindergarten to second grade relate to instructional program type as well as language use at home and school.

A series of MANCOVAs demonstrated significant dual language gains in children who were in bilingual classrooms and schools where Spanish was used among the teachers, students, and staff.

Furthermore, only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages.

Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education.

All 92 participants agreed unanimously that knowing a second language is advantageous.

Knowing two languages is beneficial in (3) personal (personal development, learning new things and learning additional languages).

Drawing upon sociocultural theories of learning and social constructivist theories of identity development, this article defines learning and identity as outcomes of participation in order to investigate how an emergent bilingual in elementary school, Roselyn, has opportunities to participate in school-based activities and how these structured shifts in her learning and identity.

Drawing upon a unique data set that aligned 18 months of student interviews with student observations, findings indicate how Roselyn’s shifts in participation lend insight to how she was able to construct identities of herself as a learner in general, and more specifically as a Latina language learner.

This article explores the interactional co-construction of identities among two first-grade students learning Spanish as a third language in a Spanish-English dual language classroom.

Drawing on ethnographic and interactional data, the article focuses on a single interaction between these two “Spanish learners” and two of their Spanish-speaking classmates that took place within the context of a classroom literacy event.

Their identity formation always took place within the context of joint social activity—in the presence of and in relation to their classmates.
By focusing in depth on a single example of classroom interaction, the researchers’ purpose has been to illustrate the intersubjective back-and-forth dynamic that was central to identity formation among these particular children.

There is a larger context at play here, and attention to how individual speech events such as this one connects with other speech events across time and space (Wortham & Reyes, 2015) is necessary if we are to more fully understand the itineraries of identity (Bucholtz et al., 2012) that students like Alicia and Malik envision, enact, resist, and pursue in their everyday interactions.

Researchers maintain that this particular focus on classroom talk—at this particular level of granularity—is warranted precisely because of how this single classroom interaction both reflects and helps constitute larger interactional patterns and broader social structure.

The Developing Bilingual Brain: What Parents and Teachers Should Know and Do

Personality, cognitive strategies, and metalinguistic skills are important factors related to the acquisition and use of language (Michael and Gollan 2005).

Using Mother Tongues as Building Blocks in Childhood Education

Language is the foundation for all learning, including interpersonal communication, reading, writing, and the core content we expect children to know. Children’s language also mirrors what they know and how they categorize information and conceptualize their world. How children respond, talk, read, and/or write also signals their readiness for various skills and content learning. Language is, in fact, the most effective means through which we assess children’s abilities and knowledge base.

The MT is the primary means through which a child makes sense of her world and connects with others—learning new words and vital context. While dialoging, she observes and engages in meaning-making, learns about proxemics (the physical distance she is expected to maintain, which varies from culture to culture), and develops communication strategies (e.g., turn-taking and conversation entry prompts).

Without continued use of the MT, a child feels lost, uprooted.

Low self-esteem and identity crises are rampant, and often lead to a high drop-out rate—all of which bode badly for a nation with an aging population that is dependent on this generation. So, we must make every effort to stop failing our children—and use of the MT and a mathematical language-building-blocks approach could be just the solution.

Attending to the third goal Cross-Cultural competence and identity development in two-way immersion programs

In this article, we briefly review the literature on cross-cultural outcomes for students in TWI programs and highlight a consistent focus on the self in these studies, particularly as it relates to student identity.

As cross-cultural competence begins with awareness of the self within the socially and culturally diverse classrooms that TWI provides, we assert that scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence.

The Linguistic Garden: A case study of emergent bilingual’s participation, positioning, identity development in a dual language program

This study explores the interplay between early reading, identity, and bilingualism.

Reading identities, or understandings about what reading is and whom one is as a reader, have been linked to reading achievement and the development of reading skills.

This exploratory study provides a description of the reading identities of three dual language learners in prekindergarten. Data include child-centered interviews, child and classroom observations, teacher interviews and a family questionnaire.
• Methods centered on the use of child-oriented data collection protocols, and the inclusion of children in the interpretation of their own work and language. Through the exploration of three cases, this study documents the ways that reading identities were constructed, taken up and expressed by the participants.

• This study provides evidence that dual language learners are actively constructing ideas about reading, bilingualism/ biliteracy, and whom they are as readers as they learn to read.

• These findings show that framing early reading in an identity perspective presents opportunities to look more holistically at the language and reading practices of dual language learners as they learn to read and navigate two or more languages at home and school.

- Leveraging Language(s): Reframing Rhetoric’s of Fear with Narratives of Agency and Hope

• Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, positive self-concept, a negative self-concept is detrimental to learning, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child.

- Leveraging Language(s): Reframing Rhetoric’s of Fear with Narratives of Agency and Hope

• Recognizing the sociopolitical discourses of race and immigration status, among others, that marginalize English learners encourages the co-construction of critical knowledges that recognize and sustain the multiple languages, identities, and literacies of minoritized students.

- Cultivating Pride in Bilingual Students: Orgullo Colectivo

• Identity formation is one of the key components of adolescence and linguistic identity is critical to that process. For English learners to reach higher levels of achievement, they had to see themselves as high achievers in the first place—and in their first language.

• To achieve this, they focused on shifting to an asset-based mindset, with the long term goal of turning the transitional bilingual education program into a dual language program.

• Students reported that being bilingual is a big part of their identity. Morton has embraced bilingualism as part of the school’s collective identity.

- More Than Being in Class: Adolescents’ Ethnolinguistic Insights in a Two-Way Dual Language Program

• This study used interview and audio data to examine ways in which adolescents reported learning about themselves, language and its learning and others through participation in an extracurricular high school program for Spanish-dominant English language learners (English Learners) and English-dominant Spanish language learners (SLLs).

• Findings suggest the program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources.

• Patterns of learning were largely consonant with students’ sociolinguistic positioning in schools as language minority or majority speakers.

- Motivating English learners by helping them visualize their Ideal L2 Self: lessons from two motivational programs.

• This study presents a structural relationship model that integrates English language learners’ motivation with their online self-regulation.

• Two questionnaires, Online Language Learning Motivation (OLLM) and Online Self-regulated English Learning (OSEL), were developed and administered to 293 Chinese university students. The results indicated that OLLM consists of five factors, namely online language learning experience, cultural interest, instrumentality-promotion, instrumentality-prevention, and others’ expectations.

• Meanwhile, OSEL is composed of six factors: goal setting, time management, environment structuring, help seeking, task strategies, and self-evaluation.
| The path analysis revealed that students with a positive future image of their language learning and an intrinsic interest in English culture tended to have better self-regulatory capacity in online learning environments. |
| Learners with positive online learning experiences tended to be more flexible and independent in their self-regulatory learning processes. |
| Related pedagogical implications are discussed, such as motivating learners to visualize a successful future self, improving their inherent interest in learning English, and designing more effective online tasks. |

| **A Love Letter to Language** |
| “I am me; my personality does not change depending on the words I speak. Yet, languages act like filters, exaggerating or downplaying different sides of my character. I become more direct or carefree depending on the language I am speaking.” |
| “For me, learning language is not about memorizing a dictionary, it’s a way of building self-confidence, self-awareness, and community.” |

| **The Linguistic Garden: A case study of emergent bilingual’s participation, positioning, identity development in a dual language program** |
| Drawing upon sociocultural theories of learning and social constructivist theories of identity development, this article defines learning and identity as outcomes of participation in order to investigate how an emergent bilingual in elementary school, Roselyn, has opportunities to participate in school-based activities and how these structured shifts in her learning and identity. |
| Drawing upon a unique data set that aligned 18 months of student interviews with student observations, findings indicate how Roselyn’s shifts in participation lend insight to how she was able to construct identities of herself as a learner in general, and more specifically as a Latina language learner. |

| **Constructing Identities: How two emergent bilinguals create linguistic agency in elementary school** |
| Emergent bilinguals’ engagement and participation with learning is closely connected to the identities they are able to construct in this learning. |
| Drawing upon Holland, Lachiotte, Skinner & Cain’s (1998) framework of how identities are shaped across figured worlds, and Nasir & Hand’s (2006, 2008) notion of practice-linked identities in school-based contexts, the model identifies the ways in which three components—context, subject positioning, and agency—play a critical role in how emergent bilinguals in a Spanish-English dual language, elementary school program begin to construct identities with learning and language. |
| In juxtaposing the experiences of two emergent bilinguals, data highlights how these students used language in novel ways to assert a level of agency to become active participants in school-based activities. |

| **Researching the Complex Nature of Identity and learning: positioning, agency** |
| Identities are dynamic, constantly shifting processes of self-understanding mediated by local and institutional repertoires, behaviors, resources and enacted through one’s positioning in practice. |
| Data from a study of emergent bilinguals in elementary school is used to understand how learners’ identities are shaped during the nascent years of school. |
| This paper argues that certain methodological approaches should be used to research the identities of young emergent bilinguals. |
| Specifically, data must document four components of learning and identity as represented in Figure 2. These components include the learners’: positioning across interactions; access to tools, resources and/or artifacts; access to agency and subject positions to act; and reflections of this dynamic. |
| Identities though are also mediated by the cultural practices, social norms, storylines of the larger community and institutions in question. |
• Findings complicated Oscar’s presented identity (Nasir, 2010) as a quiet and passive learner who faced academic struggles to become proficient in English, but nonetheless gravitated towards the language.

• While initial classroom observations did reflect these characteristics, in using varied approaches, data revealed a student who used his bilingualism in thoughtful and proficient ways to support his academic growth.

• Findings indicate how multiple approaches must be used to understand the bidirectional relationship language learning holds with identity development. Interviews need to align with observations to provide a more complete interpretation of learners’ behaviors. Multiple interview approaches should be used, and observations need to document interactions outside the classroom context.

• By triangulating interviews with observations across school-based activities, and in using multiple cycles of analysis, revealed the tensions in Oscar’s identities with learning and language as a fifth-grade, emergent bilingual. It is through this process where different vantage points were illuminated.

— “You Can Talk in Español!” An Ethnographic Case Study of An African American Emergent Bilingual and Biliterate Identity

• This ethnographic case study explores the dynamic and fluid development of one African American student’s bilingual/biliterate identity through her enrollment in a Spanish-English Dual Language Education program.

• Researchers integrated the frameworks of identity in interaction and monoglossic and raciolinguistic language ideologies to understand how this student approached her Spanish language and literacy development from kindergarten to grade 5.

• The study documents the fluid nature of the focal student, Tamara’s, identity as she journeyed from a Spanish enthusiast in kindergarten who embraced her emerging bilingualism/biliteracy to a student who seemed to question her identity as Spanish literate person.

• Tamara’s journey reveals that African American students like her DLE programs with already rich, flexible linguistic repertoires along with the openness and capacity to extend those repertoires.

• Tamara employed the relational process of adequation, downplaying differences among her and her peers’ language practices and racialized identities and instead foregrounding their similarities as friends with emerging bilingual capacities.

• According to a sociocultural perspective, when African American students’ emergent bilingual/biliterate identities are affirmed across home and school contexts, by parents, peers, and teachers, like Ms. Padilla, who adopt a heteroglossic ideologies, those identities can flourish.

• Researchers extend this call by suggesting that DLE programs must carve out space and dedicate resources to address underlying biases and ideologies with their learners as a part of their bilingual/biliterate development.

— Teaching Young Dual Language Learners to Be Writers: Rethinking Writing Instruction Through the Lens of Identity

• Despite a recent “identity turn” (Moje & Luke, 2009, p. 415) in the literacy field that has shifted attention to how children’s identities shape writing practices and motivations for writing, common frameworks for understanding identity in literacy processes have been used only in a limited way to consider identities of both young children and DLLs.

• This article reports relevant theory and research on the writing identities of young DLLs to explicate a framework of writing instruction that is informed by these understandings.

• This framework provides a model for elementary-grade instruction that supports the language acquisition and writing development of DLLs, including positive self-identification with writing.
### Family Treasures: A Dual-Language Book Project
#### Negotiating Language, Literacy, Culture, and Identity
- This article advances a framework for early language and literacy development among young English language learners (English Learners).
- A dual language book project undertaken in partnership with a local elementary school provides a context within which to address children’s need to negotiate language, culture, and identity as they transition and make meaning from their home language (L1) to English and the language of school (L2) and back.
- Using objects of cultural and personal relevance that the children brought from home, stories of “Family Treasures” were generated from the original telling in the L1 into English in small-group contexts, transcribed, illustrated, and uploaded to a Web site for permanent sharing, rereading, and exchange.
- These booklets also provided an opportunity for identity formation, pride of family and culture, and the acquisition of rudimentary technology skills, which all work to motivate and engage young learners in the development of early literacy.

### Rethinking Bilingual Education
- Maintaining home language appears to strengthen students’ sense of self and to increase educational motivation among adolescents (Lee et al., 2021; Zarate, Bhimji, & Reese, 2005)

### The Effects of Spanish English Dual Language Immersion on Student Achievement in Science and Math
- In addition to language background, students’ culture must be taken into account in designing a successful dual language program.
- In order to support student success, Cummins’ (1979, p. 240) states the school program must be geared to the needs of individual children if they are to attain an additive form of bilingualism involving fluent literacy skills in L1 and L2. If the process of instruction is to be meaningful it must reflect the child’s cultural experiences and build upon his competencies.

### Cultural Awareness

#### Equity for Students Learning English in Dual Language Bilingual Education: Persistent Challenges and Promising Practices
- This special issue of TESOL Quarterly examines the equity challenges and promises of dual language bilingual education (DLBE) for students learning English as an additional language.
- Although research confirms the effectiveness of well-implemented dual language programs, studies also find persistent and pervasive inequalities, which are explored in this issue.
- On the one hand, there is a global push toward English as a lingua franca that denies education in students’ native languages; on the other hand, there is not equal access or opportunity to English as a global language of power through English-bilingual education.
- Ideologies and discourses of monolingualism and accountability for English learning continue to impact DLBE policy and practice as well as dehumanize language-minoritized youth who are learning English.
- At the same time, research reported in this issue documents the pride, joy, and multilingual capacities of children and their families, as well as the possibilities for DLBE when we hold programs accountable for bilingual outcomes and avoid “equity traps.”
- A two-way Spanish-English program in the midwestern United States, where Mariana Pacheco and Colleen Hamilton aimed to transform the discourses that typically oppress Spanish-speaking bilingual students and their languages.
- Framed by theories of bilanguaging love (Mignolo, 2012), careful ethnographic detail foregrounds Latinx students’ unique sensitivities developed from their borderland perspectives and experiences; we see how bilingual students supported their peers, showcasing an awareness of bilingual/linguistic challenges and empathy for others—capacities not often reciprocated or recognized by their teachers.
Benefits of Foreign Language Learning and Bilingualism: An Analysis of Published Empirical Research 2012-2019

- Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence.

More Than Being in Class: Adolescents’ Ethnolinguistic Insights in a Two-Way Dual Language Program

- Much of the debate regarding outcomes of various types of dual language program has focused on linguistic and academic results, and with good reason: improving the educational outcomes of language minorities and supporting societal multilingualism are vital goals.
- More rarely explored, however, are these programs’ ethnolinguistic outcomes: the ways in which they provide students with insights into themselves, language, language learning processes and others.
- This study uses interview and audio data to examine ways in which adolescents reported learning about themselves, language and its learning and others through participation in an extracurricular high school program for Spanish-dominant English language learners (English Learners) and English-dominant Spanish language learners (SLLs).
- Findings suggest the program provided opportunities for adolescents.
- recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon; awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources.

Multiple Pathways to Multilingual Investment: A Collective Case Study of Self-Identified Mexican Students in the US

- The children of immigrants are the fastest growing population in U.S. schools at the same time there is increased anti-immigrant discourse, creating a unique linguistic ecology for its students.
- These multinational, multilingual, and multicultural students often encounter mononational, monolingual, and monocultural ideologies in their schools and communities.
- The result is that potentially hybridized learning contexts turn into sites of struggle for continued positive multilingual identities and investments.
- This multiple case study implemented surveys and interviews to explore the factors that contribute to the high multilingual investment of three self-identifying Mexican students residing in the U.S.
- Findings indicate that strong family relationships, formal coursework in Spanish, as well as a strong ethnic identity as Mexicans are interrelated factors that contribute to their high multilingual investment.
- Dual language education is a powerful factor, but formal Spanish courses at the secondary and post-secondary level are also equally strong contributors when dual language education is not available.

View of parents preferring to raise a bilingual child

- This study aimed to compare the views of parents living in their own country or abroad on raising bilingual children.
- At the end of the study, researchers found that parents from both groups gave similar answers to the questions regarding the definition of bilingualism and the age for starting bilingual education, however, they gave similar but also different answers to the questions about their reasons for raising their children bilingual, how they raise them bilingually, and the advantages and disadvantages of being bilingual.
- Furthermore, we found that parents living in their own country attribute more meaning to raising children bilingually.
- We believe that this finding stems from the fact that parents living abroad mostly raise their children bilingually out of obligation whereas those living in their own country do so voluntarily and deliberately.
### Cultural Awareness Knowledge and the Teaching of Spanish to Native Speakers

- This article discusses the importance of cultural awareness knowledge for teachers who teach Spanish to native speakers.
- The article is taken from a study that investigated pedagogical content knowledge, subject matter knowledge, and cultural awareness knowledge.
- The results of the survey suggest that it is important for teachers to make cultural connections with their students. The results also suggested that teachers perceive cultural awareness knowledge is important to effective teaching as well as interpersonal knowledge as defined by Collinson (“Becoming”). Additionally,
- The attitudes and beliefs that teachers have towards minorities, towards non-prestige languages, toward poverty, have an affect on how teachers teach (see Ennis, Cothran, and Loftus; Hollingsworth, Hoy and Murphy, 2001; Nespor). Ha
- Hancock quotes Brown in saying that research suggests that empathy, the capacity to relate emotionally to someone else, may contribute to the success of language learners (2).
- In order to be an effective and successful teacher, that teacher must know her/his students intimately. The teacher must be able to talk about each individual student's strengths and weaknesses and be able and willing to do whatever it takes to ensure that student's academic success.

### The Key to Global Understanding: World Languages Education—Why Schools Need to Adapt

- Bilingual learning affects attitudes and beliefs about language learning and other cultures.
- Language learners develop a more positive attitude toward the target language and/or the speakers of that language.
- Lipton’s surveys (2004) comprise a series of studies that demonstrate, among other factors, that children who have studied a world language develop a sense of cultural pluralism (openness to and appreciation of other cultures) and have an improved self-concept and sense of achievement in school. The ability to easily switch between languages makes children feel competent, and it increases self-esteem (Rubio, 2007).
- Appreciating international literature, music, and film. Translation is subject to the interpretation of the translator. The world’s literary and artistic works have been written in various languages. Some elements do not have equivalents in other languages.
- Increasing understanding of oneself and one’s culture. Viewing one’s value system through the eyes of others is, put simply, valuable. Monolingual views of the world limit the perspective. There are aspects of one’s life and culture that are accepted as universal truths until another way of thinking has been encountered.
- Skutnabb-Kangas (2000) differentiates educational settings in terms of their strength in promoting high levels of bi- or multilingualism and bi- or multiliteracy. Some characteristics of the strong forms of additive bilingual education are as follows:
- Mother tongue maintenance: Linguistic minority children with a lower status L1 receive instruction in their L1 with a view to maintaining and developing skills in this language and developing pride in their cultural identity.
- Immersion: Linguistic minority children with a high-status language are instructed through the medium of a world/minority language in classes consisting entirely of L2 learners.
- Dual language: A mixed group of linguistic minority and majority students are taught through the medium of the learners’ L1 and L2, with the dominant language taught as a subject.
- Alternate days: A mixed group of linguistic minority and majority students are taught using their L1 and L2 on alternate days.
- Plural multilingual: Students with different L1s are taught the curriculum through the medium of their L1 with an L2 taught as a
world language in grade 1. This then increasingly becomes the medium of instruction in later years when other L2s are also offered as world languages. (p. 146)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Language Learners Visualization of Identities in Transformation in an Imagined World</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• In this educational and societal context, this study examines how English Language Learners view their imagined English Learner identities and communities through their drawings and written descriptions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The findings yield insights into the purposes, orientations, and dispositions of EFL learners, their beliefs about imagined English speaker identities, and their awareness of the broader global intercultural context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Concentrating on the transformation in the relational aspect of English Learner identity, the study discusses the weight and affordances of English and its relation to English Learners’ imagined English Learner identity and further demonstrates their language and cultural awareness in the globalized setting.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural Awareness, Listening Comprehension, Listening Motivation, and Attitude Among EFL Learners: A Gender-Based Mixed Method Study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The current research investigated the effects of cultural awareness on listening comprehension and listening motivation of EFL learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The results of one-sample t-test, one-way ANOVA, and the post hoc Sceffe test showed that the experimental classes outflanked the control class in the posttest of listening motivation and listening comprehension. The results indicated that the subjects showed a positive attitude toward having cultural awareness in their English learning process. The outcomes of the study provide some implications for teachers to increase the students’ cultural awareness and to enhance their positive attitudes about the integration of culturally based resources into language education.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Latino English Language Learners: Facing Obstacles Bigger than Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Ideally, English Learners would learn in communities where their culture and language are valued, such as dual language classrooms where content and language arts are taught both in English and Spanish.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Developing teachers’ cultural sensitivity is the foundation for bridging the gap between cultures.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Revisiting Educational Programs that Develop Linguistic and Cultural Awareness for All Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Research has shown that dual-language programs for elementary age students and newcomer centers for recent immigrant arrivals at the secondary level are effective in fostering student academic success, linguistic growth, and multicultural understanding.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Engaging Linguistically diverse families in classroom programs using their home language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self Confidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• In this study, IEP students of various proficiency levels and L1 backgrounds described their attitudes toward the institutional English-only policy at an intensive English program associated with a large U.S. university. Data were collected through a survey (n = 158), interviews (n = 6), and focus groups (n = 4).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Positive attitudes included feeling that the English-only policy helped students to improve their English proficiency, prepare them for the high demands of using English proficiency in real-world interactions, and demonstrate respect for other students and teachers who cannot understand their first.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Several aspects of the policy were perceived negatively, including the ways teachers dealt with students speaking their L1 outside the classroom, methods of punishment that could impact students’ grades, the unconditional character of the policy that denied learners their agency, and the lack of systematic implementation. Based on these findings, suggestions are provided for designing institutional...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Using the Mother tongue in Foreign Language Learning: Secondary School Students in Kazakhstan | • One of the notable behaviors of individuals during the teaching of foreign languages is the use of the first language as an integral part of the learning-teaching process.
• The aim of this study is to determine the reasons why secondary school students in Kazakhstan feel the need to use their first language (Kazakh or Russian) in foreign language classes where they are studying English.
• According to the findings, students avoid the use of the foreign languages they study; have motivation problems; have a fear of being criticized by teachers; have a fear of being teased by classmates; tease their friends; and don't believe in themselves enough. It is therefore necessary to take measures to increase the self-confidence of students; and a more English-speaking environment should be established. |
| --- | --- |
| Masking, mediators, and agency: bilingual children and learning to read | • This paper begins with a discussion of some of the key insights of recent sociocultural research that consider bilingual children and learning to read and culminates in a discussion of Syncretic Literacy Studies (SLS).
• It then presents data from an ethnographic study that focused on the learning experiences of a small group of Year Three Bangladeshi-heritage pupils during 1 year of their schooling in order to problematize some of the claims made in recent sociocultural work and in SLS, particularly the focus on children's agency.
• The findings from the study suggest that there are limits to children’s agency that are not recognized in recent work and in SLS; (b) that identity has an important role to play: children can successfully mask what they cannot do as readers in order to present a particular identity in the mainstream classroom; and (c) that the access some children have to mediators may be limited and can change over time. |
| From Learner to Teacher Assistant: Community Based Service-Learning in a Dual-Language Classroom | • This qualitative study investigated a CBSL program in which L2 Spanish learners at an urban university served as weekly teaching assistants at a local dual-language elementary school. Data were collected from 55 reflective blog entries, two focus group sessions, and interviews with four teaching assistants.
• The L2 Spanish learners reported that the experience supported their language acquisition by (1) providing oral language practice outside of class, (2) facilitating linguistic self-confidence, (3) fostering metacognitive reflection, and (4) transforming motivation and attitudes. |
| Second Language Orientation and Self-Determination Theory: A structural Analysis of the Factors Affecting Language Achievement | • The purpose of the present study is two-fold. First, the present study examines statistical similarity between the integrative and instrumental orientation and Self-Determination Theory subtypes of motivation using chi-square invariance test. Second, based on the results of the chi-square invariance test, the present study further investigates the structural relationships among factors affecting second language achievement.
• Results of the structural analyses demonstrate that intrinsic motivation was the strongest determinant of learners’ self-confidence and motivation to learn a second language.
• It is also found that intrinsic motivation was only indirectly related to second language achievement through the mediating effects of motivation and self-confidence. |
| The effect of ethnic identity and bilingual confidence on Chinese youth’s self-esteem | • This study examines the interrelated issues of private and public domains of self-esteem, ethnic identity formation, and bilingual confidence among youth of a minority group in a city in western Canada.
• The results confirm the importance of ethnic identity on minority youth’s global self-esteem. |
The Effects of Self-Confidence in Bilingual Abilities on the Language Use: Perspectives on Pasifika language Use in South Auckland

- Self-confidence with bilingual proficiency has a great effect on Chinese Youth’s global, academic, and social self-esteem.
- This paper considers speakers’ differing degrees of self-confidence in their bilingual abilities and their effects on reported language use and observed patterns of language choice.
- One hundred and twenty individuals from New Zealand’s four largest Pasifika communities Samoan, Cook Islands, Tongan and Niuean reported on their self confidence in both their community language (CL) and English, and on the basis of these responses, five speaker types are distinguished.
- The findings show how analyses based on speakers’ self-confidence in bilingual abilities provide a community-friendly tool for describing patterns of language use and explaining the effects of social variables on language proficiency.

Critical Consciousness

Vernacular Spanish as a promoter of critical consciousness in dual language bilingual education classrooms

- In this essay, researchers call for programs to adopt vernacular forms of Spanish, including translanguaging practices, in bilingual and biliteracy instruction in order to meet the needs of Spanish-speaking students and combat deficit language ideologies and practices.
- From a critical pedagogical perspective, deliberate inclusion of vernacular Spanish (and translanguaging) in bilingualism and biliteracy is an ideal means to develop critical consciousness for students in DLBE, which can serve to combat deficit language ideologies, and aligns to the proposal of critical consciousness as the fourth goal of DLBE. We offer recommendations for teacher educators and DLBE practitioners.

Bilingualism, Biliteracy, Biculturalism, and Critical Consciousness for All: Proposing a Fourth Fundamental Goal for Two-Way Dual Language Education

- Researchers argue that centering critical consciousness—or fostering among teachers, parents, and children an awareness of the structural oppression that surrounds us and a readiness to take action to correct it—can support increased equity and social justice in TWDL education.
- Researchers elaborate four elements of critical consciousness: interrogating power, critical listening, historicizing schools, and embracing discomfort.
- Researchers describe how critical consciousness impacts and radicalizes the other three core goals, in turn supporting the development of more successful, equitable, and socially just TWDL schools.

Social Development

Social Network

Rethinking Bilingual Instruction

- Bilingual students have larger social networks that can help them navigate both school and community contexts (Zhou & Bankston, 1998).

Rising to the bilingual challenge: self-reported experiences of managing life with two languages

- This beneficial of knowing two languages: (1) sociocultural (e.g., ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world).

Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language Programs

- Considerable research documents students’ outcomes in dual language (DL) programs, but there is little examination of students’ perceptions of bilingualism and its impact on students’ cognitive functioning and social relationships, especially with comparative studies across different target languages and student backgrounds.
- This study, which included a total of 788 fifth- through eighth-grade students who had participated in a Spanish-English (n = 645) or Mandarin-English (n = 143) dual language program, surveyed students’ language proficiencies, ratings of bilingualism, and social and cognitive functioning.
- Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward
| Bilingual development and social networks of British-born Chinese children | - The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of networks rather than morphology of the network.  
- A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer.  
- This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction. |
|---|---|
| Challenging School Segregation in the Twenty-first Century: How Districts can Leverage Dual Language Education to Increase School and Classroom Diversity | - Researchers examine dual language education as a means for promoting ethnically, racially, and linguistically diverse learning experiences.  
- Dual-language schools can be incredibly effective at ensuring students of different backgrounds learn in the same classroom rather than just superficially enroll in the same school.  
- By the very nature of dual language, students are often in a classroom with children of differing backgrounds.  
- Dual language education can allow teachers to “position” students and families from diverse linguistic backgrounds as language and culture brokers for English-speaking peers and families (DeMatthews, Izquierdo, and Knight 2017; Lee, Hill-Bonnet, and Raley 2011; Palmer 2008).  
- Being dual language helps to promote healthy multigenerational, multicultural, and multilingual communities, because it allows schools to connect with a historically marginalized community whose first language is not English as well as the grassroots organizations that are engaged in advocacy and community development work (Fránquiz, Salazar, and DeNicolo 2011; Wiemelt and Welton 2015).  
- Dual-language education has the added advantage that the model makes racial and ethnic diversity a classroom asset, which in turn promotes even greater benefits on student learning and socialization.  
- Dual language offers an avenue for districts interested in navigating these obstacles and can be an excellent way to concurrently foster diversity in the classroom and improve a variety of social and academic outcomes for the entire student body. |
| Languages Across Borders: Social Network Development in An Adolescent Two-Way Dual Language Program | - Purpose/Objective: This study examines how a two-way, dual language enrichment program for Spanish-language learner (SLL) and English-language learner (ELL) adolescents influenced students’ social networks with peers of different cultural and linguistic backgrounds.  
- Findings/Results: Results suggest that despite participants’ demographic differences, English Learner and Spanish Language Learner students in the dual-language program reported building new, strengthened, and mutually recognized relationships, particularly with students of different language backgrounds who worked together within long-term collaborative small groups.  
- Conclusions/Recommendations: When students are provided with a carefully designed instructional and ecological context that provides authentic purposes for using language and building peer relationships, this research |
<p>| Tell Me Who Your Friends Are and I Might be Able to Tell You What Languages You Speak: | - Social network analysis has proved particularly useful in explaining why speakers in bilingual communities maintain or change their language behavior. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Network Analysis, Bilingualism, and Identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- An underlying assumption in this analysis is that language, particularly the first language or mother tongue, is an integral part of collective identities, such as national, ethnic, or cultural identities, and that maintenance of language across generations is a key factor to the maintenance of such identities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- This article discusses the application of social network analysis to multilingual communities by taking a point of departure in the Filipino community in Oslo, the capital of Norway, with a view towards understanding linguistic and cultural maintenance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Results from the analyses provide support for the importance of social network in understanding language choice and cultural and linguistic maintenance; however, there were some notable exceptions.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language networks and social status among Mexican Americans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- This reciprocal relationship is simultaneously a force of assimilation and of dissimilation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Interpersonal networks are a concrete basis of both culture and social structure. Family, friends, and acquaintances reinforce the beliefs, arts, and institutions of a culture (Greeley, 1974; Yancy and Erikson, 1977) and transmit the advantages, aspirations, and opportunities of a social structure (e.g., Duncan, Haller, and Portes, 1971).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Through their common basis in the associations among people, the cultural and socioeconomic realms influence each other.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Creating Classroom Communities in Linguistically Diverse Settings: Teacher-Directed, Classroom-Level Factor Effects on Peer Dynamics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Employing a social capital framework, this study investigates teachers’ role in influencing the peer dynamics between English learners (ELs) and their non-EL peers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Peer nominations of friendships within the classroom were used to operationalize students’ same-language-status (bonding capital) and cross-language-status (bridging capital) friendships.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Multilevel models reveal teachers’ reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Developing Bilingual Brain: What Parents and Teachers Should Know and Do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Because bilingual learners often interact with different language providers, they appear to develop sociolinguistic awareness more readily.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- They may better understand the arbitrary nature of language (Cook 1997) and that users employ language to communicate their mental states in various ways and for different purposes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Key to Global Understanding: World Languages Education—Why Schools Need to Adapt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Other advantages of learning another language can include the following: passing on part of one’s heritage to children, bridging generations and improving communication within the family and with the extended family, building international links, experiencing two cultures, being able to compare values and worldviews, and becoming biliterate (Marcos, 1998).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Making lifelong friends. Bilingualism increases the number of people with whom one can interact. Interest in other cultures helps one connect deeply with other people around the world.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generation Status, Social Capital and the Routes out of High School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- This study investigates immigrant-native differences in the activities of adolescents 2 years after their sophomore year of high school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Despite their lower levels of human capital and lower previous academic performance, recent immigrants who arrive in the United</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**States as adolescents are more likely than those who arrive earlier or those born in the United States to persevere in high school.**
- Access to familial social capital and attitudinal measures help explain some of this effect. As for those who do leave school early, socioeconomic status and language background play a role in the activities respondents pursue. While recent immigrants are more likely to persevere in high school, once they leave, they are no more likely to pursue additional education than their U.S. born counterparts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationships with Family and Friends</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Student’s Perceptions of Bilingualism in Spanish and Mandarin in Dual Language Programs</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Considerable research documents students’ outcomes in dual language (DL) programs, but there is little examination of students’ perceptions of bilingualism and its impact on students’ cognitive functioning and social relationships, especially with comparative studies across different target languages and student backgrounds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Promise of Two Language Education</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- They point to research showing that bilingualism generates social benefits like reduced discrimination, improved self-esteem, and stronger cross-group relationships (Cho, 2000; Wright &amp; Tropp, 2005);</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Language proficiency and competence: upper elementary students in a dual-language bilingual education program |
| - Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S. |
| - Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs. |
| - Results highlight the different beneficial roles of Cantonese and English proficiency on positive self, peer acceptance, and prosocial behavior. |

| A qualitative study of the play of dual language learners in an English-Speaking preschool |
| - In the present investigation, we recorded and described the naturalistic free play of four dual language learners (DLLs) and compared their interactions to those of four English-speaking children. |
| - Findings indicate that DLLs play and talk with peers less frequently, interact in less sustained and positive ways, and are more reliant on teachers to support their play than their English-speaking peers. Implications for scaffolding DLLs’ play in classrooms and for future research are presented. |

<p>| Creating Classroom Communities in linguistically diverse settings: teacher directed, classroom level factor effects on peer dynamics |
| - Employing a social capital framework, this study investigates teachers’ role in influencing the peer dynamics between English learners (ELs) and their non-EL peers. Participants include 713 students (211 English Learners). |
| - Observed teacher-student interaction quality and teacher self-reports of their peer network management were used to operationalize the teacher-directed, classroom-level factors. |
| - Peer nominations of friendships within the classroom were used to operationalize students’ same-language-status (bonding capital) and cross-language-status (bridging capital) friendships. |
| - Multilevel models reveal teachers’ reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners. |
| - For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer... |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Writing their way into talk: emergent bilinguals’ emergent literacy practices as pathways to peer interaction and oral language growth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - This paper explores the idea that young children’s emergent literacy practices can be tools for mediating peer interaction, and that, therefore, literacy, even in its earliest stages, can support oral language development, particularly for emergent bilinguals.
| - This paper offers a genetic analysis, or an analysis across time, of how students’ interactions with multimodal composing functioned as contexts for emergent bilinguals’ oral language development, and in particular, vocabulary acquisition.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Understanding, Connection, and Identification: Friendship Features of Bilingual Spanish-English Speaking Undergraduates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Bilingual undergraduates may have closer friendships with other bilinguals than with monolinguals.
| - This study investigated this hypothesis and explored the friendship features of 46 bilingual Spanish and English-speaking undergraduates by combining quantitative analyses of surveys and qualitative analyses of interviews.
| - Survey results indicated that participants rated their friendships with bilinguals to be more secure, closer, and to provide more help and companionship than their friendships with monolinguals.
| - During interviews, participants described understanding, connection, and identification with their bilingual friends.
| - These features were considered reasons for their friendships with other bilinguals and reasons for their greater quality.
| - Bilingual friendships also helped bilingual undergraduates navigate a challenging sociopolitical context and have pride in their ethnolinguistic identity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transactional relationships Between Latino’s Friendship Quality and Academic Achievement During the Transition to Middle School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - This study investigates whether friendship quality, academic achievement and mastery goal orientation predict each other across the transition to middle school.
| - Cross-lagged path analyses revealed a bidirectional and negative relationship between negative friendship quality and academic achievement across the transition to middle school.
| - Positive friendship quality predicted mastery goal orientation decreases for girls.
| - Both gender and bilingual status were analyzed and showed significant relations in our models. Results supported the social interaction perspective more than the social bonding perspective of friendship quality.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language Choice and Identity Construction of Azerbaijani Bilinguals in Family and Friendship Domains</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - This study investigates Azerbaijani bilinguals’ language choice and identity construction processes in family and friendship domains.
| - The findings revealed that language attitudes and ideologies are the main reason for Azerbaijani bilinguals’ language choice in family and friendship domains.
| - The findings of the study also showed that age and gender in family domain and gender in friendship domain are influential factors in Azerbaijani bilinguals’ language choice.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bilingualism in Autism: Language learning profiles and social experiences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Bilingualism changes how people relate to others and lead their lives. This is particularly relevant in autism, where social interaction presents challenges.
| - In the full sample, age negatively predicted social life quality scores while the number of languages known positively predicted social life quality scores.
| - In the multilingual subset, age negatively predicted social life quality scores, while third language proficiency positively predicted social life quality scores.
| - This is the first study describing the language history and social experiences of a substantial sample of bilingual and multilingual autistic adults.
### Rethinking Bilingual Education

- It provides valuable insight into how autistic people can learn and use a new language, and how their bilingualism experiences shape their social life.
- Preserving the home language reduces cultural dissonance between children and parents, reinforcing parental authority and thus reducing behavior problems (Portes & Hao, 2002; Portes & Rumbaut, 2001).

### Engaging Linguistically diverse families in classroom programs using their home language

- Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000).
- A crucial step in supporting students who may be put at risk involves an understanding of, and respect for, the literacy activities of the family and communities in which the child lives.
- Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children.
- Involve linguistically diverse families in the literacy classroom.

### Social Competence

#### Social competence of bilingual and monolingual native English-speaking preschoolers: a comparison of parent and teacher perspectives.

- Effective peer interaction is fundamental to social development, cognitive development, and academic success.
- This study compares parent and teacher perspectives of children’s social competence (i.e., social skills and problem behaviors) and whether similarities and differences in perspectives are associated with children’s classification as an emergent bilingual or monolingual native English speaker.
- Findings indicate statistically significant differences in parent and teacher ratings on the empathy, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for bilingual children and on the empathy, self-control, internalizing, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for monolingual English-speaking children.

#### Bilingual children judge moral, social, and language violations as less transgressive than monolingual children

- The current study examined whether bilingualism is associated with differences in children’s developing social knowledge.
- In line with previous research findings, results demonstrate that all children evaluated moral violations more harshly than conventional violations.
- Notably, however, bilingual children were more permissive of violations across moral, social, and language domains than monolingual children.
- These findings yield new insights into the role of early experience in the development of social knowledge.
- We propose that bilinguals’ unique linguistic and social experiences influence their understanding of moral and conventional rules.

#### The impact of early social interactions on later language development in Spanish-English bilingual infants

- This study tested the impact of child-directed language input on language development in Spanish–English bilingual infants (N = 25, 11- and 14-month-olds from the Seattle metropolitan area), across languages and independently for each language, controlling for socioeconomic status.
- The results also suggest cultural effects on language input and language development in bilingual and bicultural infants.

#### Social competence, cultural orientations, and gender differences: a study of Mandarin-English bilingual preschoolers

- This study investigated whether host and heritage cultural orientations were associated with Chinese preschoolers’ social competence and whether such associations varied across gender in Western contexts.
- Social competence was assessed using teacher reports on the Behavior Assessment System for Children-2 (BASC-2) with four composite scales: Externalizing, Internalizing, Behavioral Symptoms and Adaptive Skills.
- The results indicate that host culture has a stronger relationship with social competence than heritage culture, particularly for girls.
| **A longitudinal study of the social and academic competence of poor bilingual preschool children** | • This longitudinal study was conducted to gain understanding of the social–emotional and academic development of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children.  
• Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development. In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were associated with later academic achievement and growth of English proficiency.  
• Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism. |
| **The social and cultural contexts of second language acquisition in young children** | • The aim of the present study was to examine the social behavior and competence of children, ages 3–6 as they progressed through the stages of second language acquisition in a dual-immersion program in English and Mandarin.  
• Teachers’ evaluations of children’s social competence and behavior were collected at the beginning and end of the school year.  
• Results suggest that girls had more social adjustment difficulties than boys.  
• However, as language skills increased, adjustment difficulties decreased significantly among all children. |
| **Longitudinal Social and Communication Outcomes in Children with Autism Raised in Bi/Multilingual Environments** | • Globally, there are more bilingual speakers than monolingual speakers; however, scant research evidence exists regarding social communication development and outcomes for bilingual children with autism spectrum disorder (ASD).  
• This study employed a longitudinal cohort design to compare social and communication skills, at baseline and over 12 months, for 60 monolingual and 60 bilingual children with ASD receiving community based early intervention.  
• Findings support the notion that there is no basis on which to discourage home language use with bilingual children with ASD. |
| **Social Competence and Language Skills in Mandarin-English bilingual preschoolers: The moderation effect of emotion regulation** | • Research Findings: The main aim of this study was to examine whether language skills and emotion regulation are associated with social competence and whether the relationship between English skills and social competence is moderated by emotion regulation in Mandarin–English bilingual preschoolers.  
• The results show that positive emotion regulation, emotion dysregulation, English skills, and Mandarin skills were associated with different composites of the BASC-2; the relationships between English skills and Behavioral Symptoms were moderated by positive emotion regulation; and English skills and Adaptive Skills were moderated by emotion dysregulation. |
| **An exploratory longitudinal study of social and language outcomes in children with autism in bilingual home environments** | • There are concerns that social communication deficits among children with autism spectrum disorder may reduce the developmental benefits of early intervention for children with autism spectrum disorder raised in bilingual environments.  
• Researchers conducted an exploratory analysis of cross-sectional and longitudinal data from a larger study to explore associations between home language environment and language ability and social skills in response to early autism spectrum disorder intervention.  
• Significant language growth was exhibited by children from both language groups and there was no moderating effect of home language environment.  
• The bilingual home group demonstrated increased gesture use over the course of intervention as compared with the monolingual home group.  
• Preliminary data revealed no basis for concerns regarding negative impact of a bilingual home environment on language or social development in young children with autism spectrum disorder. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive, Social Communication and Social Skills Development in Monolingual and Bilingual Children with Autism Spectrum Disorders in a Multi Ethnic-Lingual Context- A comparative study</td>
<td>The study investigated the effect of language intervention on equal numbers of participants (n=20) in both study groups, monolingual (English only) and bilingual (English and anyone of the Mother Tongue Language) children with Autism Spectrum Disorders, aged between 4.0 and 6.11 years, in Singapore. The results revealed statistically significant improvement in the developmental skills in both the study groups, but no significance was indicated between the groups. The study indicated that bilingual exposure in children with autism spectrum disorders does not have any negative impact.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotion Understanding in Bilingual Preschoolers</td>
<td>Research reveals that simultaneous use of two or more languages affects child’s language development, cognitive and social skills. The current study focuses on the so-far understudied theory of emotion understanding in bilingual children. Our results revealed no group differences between overall emotion understanding and understanding of external and reflective causes of emotions. However, monolingual children had a slightly better understanding of mental causes of emotions compared to bilingual children, when controlling for age, gender, and non-verbal intelligence. These results suggest that children growing up in bilingual environments might require more time and/or language/culture exposure to master the ability to understand mental causes of emotions, taking into account cultural differences, as well as the semantic and lexical differences in emotion labelling and emotion expression in each language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The social and cultural contexts of second language acquisition in young children</td>
<td>The aim of the present study was to examine the social behavior and competence of children, ages 3–6 as they progressed through the stages of second language acquisition in a dual-immersion program in English and Mandarin. Results suggest that girls had more social adjustment difficulties than boys. However, as language skills increased, adjustment difficulties decreased significantly among all children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Context As a Biasing Factor For Language Activation in Bilinguals</td>
<td>Two studies investigated how cultural context and familiarity impact lexical access in Korean- English bilingual and English monolingual adults. ERPs were recorded while participants decided whether a word and picture matched or not. Pictures depicted versions of objects that were prototypically associated with North American Korean culture and named in either English or Korean, creating culturally congruent and incongruent trials. Thus, an unfamiliar culture impeded linguistic processing for monolinguals but facilitated it for bilinguals familiar with that culture. Study 2 presented images that were more or less familiar and both groups replicated the pattern for monolinguals in Study 1. Therefore, in Study 1 monolinguals responded to familiarity but bilinguals responded to culture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effect of Language Context on Ratings of Shy and Unsociable Behaviors in English Language Learner Children</td>
<td>Purpose: The primary goal of this study was to explore the effect of language context on the socially withdrawn behaviors of school-age children who are English language learners (English Learners) from middle– to high–socioeconomic status (SES) backgrounds. Results: Children and mothers in the English Learner group reported significantly higher ratings of shy behavior in English speaking versus native-language contexts, whereas unsociable ratings did not differ across language contexts. Conclusions: Shyness and unsociability are distinguishable behaviors in English Learner children, and researchers should consider these constructs when examining withdrawal. In addition, examining English Learner children’s behavior across language contexts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
provides a valuable method for investigating language-influenced behavioral problems. This study demonstrates the need for service providers to evaluate behavior across subtype and language context before pathologizing withdrawal in English Learner children.

### Social Validity in Early Language Interventions for Dual Language Learners: A Systematic Review of the Literature

- Eleven articles met the inclusionary criteria for this systematic review and were evaluated to describe social validity in early language intervention research—specifically with young (birth through 5 years) dual language learners (DLLs).
- Researchers examined how social validity was considered and addressed, how social validity was measured, and the results of social validity assessments. Definitions of social validity were generally vague, and researchers in most studies only considered social validity post intervention rather than prior to starting or during the interventions. Participants generally viewed interventions positively, but incomplete data were often reported.

### Social Flexibility

**Bilingual children adapt to the needs of their communication partners, monolinguals do not**

- Researchers explored the ability of children to adapt their communication to the needs of their communication partner.
- Monolinguals and bilinguals were equally helpful and informative. In contrast, only bilingual children adapted their level of ostension selectively between the two puppets. These findings point to the greater skills of bilinguals to adapt their communication accordingly.

**Does bilingualism really affect social flexibility?**

- What are the collateral effects of using two languages on a regular basis? Does bilingualism have an impact on cognitive domains other than language, such as attention, mentalizing, and creativity?
- Here we discuss recent results by Ikizer and Ramirez-Esparza (2017), suggesting that bilinguals are more socially flexible than monolinguals.
- We argue that their arguments are not theoretically sound and that their observations are not compelling enough.

**Bilinguals’ social flexibility**

- Is bilingualism better than monolingualism? Previous work shows that bilinguals have an advantage over monolinguals in cognitive flexibility, the ability to shift between different mental sets.
- In this study, researchers explore if bilingualism also provides an advantage in social flexibility, which we define as the ability to (a) switch with ease and adapt between different social environments and (b) accurately read social cues in the environment.
- Bilinguals reported higher social flexibility than monolinguals. Mediation analyses demonstrated that bilinguals’ social flexibility gave them an advantage over monolinguals in the self-reported frequency of social interactions.
- This study reports the first evidence of a social flexibility advantage of bilinguals, and it suggests that as bilinguals alternate between two languages, they might also alternate between two cultural worlds, providing tools to adapt to different social environments and facilitating the frequency of social interactions.

**Bilingual and Monolingual Children Prefer Native-Accented Speakers**

- Bilingual children are less influenced than monolinguals by language variety when attributing personality traits to different speakers, which could indicate that bilinguals have fewer in-group biases and perhaps greater social flexibility.
- In the present study, we investigated the social preferences of 5-year-old English and French monolinguals and English-French bilinguals.
- This result suggests that both monolingual and bilingual children have strong preferences for in-group members who use a familiar language variety, and that bilingualism does not lead to generalized social flexibility.

### Economic Development

#### Cultural Awareness
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Four Essential Questions About Dual Language Education</td>
<td>• With the growing emphasis on a competitive global economy, support is increasing for dual language programs (DLPs) geared toward preparing students in bilingual and multilingual education.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Leadership for Social Justice and Sustainability: A Historical Case Study of a High-Performing Dual Language School along the U.S.-Mexico Border | • This qualitative case study is focused on one high-performing urban elementary school that worked to address inequities within the school and community for two decades partly through dual language education.  
• Key findings from this case highlight intersections between social justice leadership and leadership for school improvement that promote organizational innovation, learning, and sustainability. |
| The key to global understanding: world languages education—why schools need to adapt | • Language educational economics is a newly developed field of study, born from the understanding that language educational policies have economic implications (Breton, 1998).  
• Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006).  
• At a time of scmi globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs.  
• On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005).  
• Trismell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language:  
  • Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture.  
  • Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade.  
  • Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad.  
  • Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.  
  • Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).  
• Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language. |
| Cultural Awareness on a Bilingual Education           | • The purpose of this study is to investigate how a bilingual education program would protect the cultural inheritance, linguistic knowledge, ethnic and religious identity of minority peoples.  
• A bilingual education program for minority people is essential for equal access to education. It solves conflicts between different ethnic groups and brings happiness to the society. |
| A Multilingualism-as-a-Resource Orientation in Dual Language Education | • Dual language educators and program planners rely on the concept of ‘language as a resource’ as a foundational principle of dual language education (DLE).  
• In this article, we argue that a “multilingualism as a resource” orientation is needed as a new or additional paradigm in order to re-imagine DLE within the current context and to respond to the increased diversity within DLE programs. |
### Using Mother Tongues as Building Blocks in Childhood Education

- When you devalue home languages by, for instance, using just English with students who speak another language at home, you stifle learning and community engagement.
- Some language laws, like Arizona’s English-only law and Russia’s law banning instruction in minority languages like Bashkir and Tatar (effective September 1, 2013), silence students and jeopardize the success of entire communities.
- Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).

### Benefits of Foreign Language Learning and Bilingualism: An Analysis of Published Empirical Research 2012-2019

- The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society.
- Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity.
- Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence.

### Cultural Identity and Language: A Proposed Framework for Cultural Globalization and Glocalization

- This paper attempts to define cultural globalization and cultural glocalisation in terms of cultural identity (CI) and language.
- To be an effective communicator in this multilingual world, people have to develop multilingual and multicultural competencies.

### Labor Market

- Learning two language is beneficial economically (e.g., better job prospects and ability to grow professionally also in other countries).

### Rising to the Bilingual Challenge: Self-Reported Experiences of Managing Life with Two Languages

- It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives.

### Raciolingustic Ideology and Spanish-English Bilingualism on the US Labor Market: An Analysis of Online Job Advertisements

- Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English, according to a study carried out by the Civil Rights Project at University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA) and Educational Testing Service (ETS).
- “Balanced bilinguals,” those who understand, speak, read, and write in both English and the language of the home: Earn more—$2,000-$5,000 annually compared to their English-only peers; Go to college at higher rates, which dramatically increases earnings; Have more social networks.
- Gandara notes a U.S. News & World Report article that argued that maintaining and teaching languages others than English will be key to the success of the nation’s schools in the coming century.
- “Equally Important, though, is the finding that transitional bilingual instruction that leaves behind the native language is not where the payoff is; it is in maintaining immigrant languages.
- Bilinguals may not always be paid more, but they often are and frequently get hired over monolinguals with similar credentials.
- “Americans for whom English is not their first language face unique obstacles on their path to academic and economic success,” says
| Rethinking Bilingual Instruction | • **The Bilingual Advantage: Language, Literacy, and the US Labor Market**  
| | • Lucrecia Santibanez and Maria Estela Zarate compared Asian and Latino students who self-reported that they were moderately bilingual or high use bilinguals with those who called themselves monolingual. They found that the bilingual students from both groups were more likely to graduate from high school and go to college. Among Latinos, high-use bilingual students were also significantly more likely to go directly to four-year colleges than those who were monolingual.  
| | • Ruben Rumbaut examined the effects of bilingualism on more than 6,000 young people in their mid to late 20s. He distinguished among limited, moderate, and fluent bilingual and non-bilingual people across a range of ethnicities. He found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased.  
| | • Diana A. Porras, Jungeyon Ee, and Patricia Gandara surveyed almost 300 large, medium, and small businesses in California, across all sectors of the economy, asking employers whether they had a preference for hiring bilingual employees and if so, whether they compensated them for their language skills. Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred bilingual employees if their skills were comparable to those of monolingual employees. This confirmed that in California, bilingual employees are in high demand and have a hiring advantage over those who are monolingual.  
| Gender, Bilingualism, and the Early Occupational Careers of Second-Generation Mexicans in the South | • Researchers analyze the early occupational careers of fifty-eight second-generation young adults in Dalton, Georgia, a global carpet manufacturing center.  
| | • Researchers find intergenerational occupational mobility, with children of Mexican immigrants deploying human-capital skills to access better jobs than their parents.  
| | • While bilingual skills play a critical role in the employment paths that members of the second generation have started to chart, their use of bilingualism is also shaped by gender dynamic in the workplace.  
| Economic Advantages of Multilingualism | • The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries.  
| | • Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English.  
| | • “In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage.”  
| Is there really a labor market advantage to being bilingual in the US? | • Although it is commonly thought that people who are bilingual have an advantage in the labor market, studies on this topic have not borne out this perception.  
| | • The literature, in fact, has found an earnings penalty is associated with bilingualism—people who are bilingual often make less than people who are monolingual in similar jobs. |
|**The demand for Multilingual Human Capital in the US labor Market**| • This article presents the results of a 2014 survey of more than 2,100 U.S. employers on their requirements for multilingual employees.  
• The survey found a significant discrepancy: On the one hand, 93% of respondents “value[d] employees who...are able to work effectively with customers, clients, and businesses from a range of different countries and cultures.”  
• On the other, 66% of respondents reported identifying foreign language skills in the hiring process, 41% reported giving advantage to multilingual applicants, and only 10% of respondents indicated that new hires “needed to speak at least one language besides English.”  
• In addition, the survey revealed employer characteristics related to demand for language ability: Industries with the greatest demand were government and public administration, information services, educational services, health care, and the administrative sector.  
• Language skills were sought in combination with other skill sets, notably customer service, sales, vendor management, and marketing.  
• The results are critical to educational programs seeking to understand the value of language in the job market. |
|---|---|
|**A raciolinguistic analysis of the neoliberal promotion of dual language education in a new Latinx South state**| • Using structural topic modeling and critical discourse analysis, this study employs a raciolinguistic perspective to unpack the ideologies underlying the discourses in over 200 DL programs in a new Latinx South state of the United States.  
• Our findings show that DL programs are promoted as a model that brings cognitive and employment benefits to its students.  
• Moreover, private corporate power has a strong existence and influence on the establishment, staffing, and promotion of DL programs. |
|**English Skills, Earnings, and the Occupational Sorting of Mexican Americans Along the US-Mexican border**| • While English proficiency enhances labor market outcomes, its role in minority-language regions remains largely unexplored.  
• Employing the U.S. Mexico border as a minority-language region, researchers analyzed whether English skills differently affect the earnings and occupational sorting of Mexican Americans along the border relative to their non-border peers.  
• Researchers found comparable English deficiency earnings penalties for Mexican immigrants, suggesting that this group responds to English-specific regional wage gaps.  
• US born men, however, have larger earnings penalty along the border, possibly reflecting natives’ relative immobility owing to strong geographic preferences. Occupational sorting exercises give credence to this interpretation for native Mexican American females. |
|**The Promise of English: Linguistic Capital and the Neoliberal Workers in the South Korean Job Market**| • English is often assumed to be a key to material success and social inclusion, and this belief commonly works to justify the global dominance of English, glossing over and rationalizing broader social inequalities.  
• This paper extends the discussion of this fallacy of ‘the promise of English’ to the domain of the South Korean job market, where skills in the English language play a major role in determining one’s access to white-collar jobs. Since the 1990s, different modes of English language testing have emerged as popular means for evaluating job applicants for Korean corporations, constantly upgrading the criteria for “good English.” |
|**Paths to Mobility: The Mexican Second Generation At Work in A new Destination**| • Prior studies have shown that children of Mexican immigrants face structural challenges that threaten to obstruct their economic success in young adulthood.  
• They activated three resources in mobility promoting ways given the demographic, economic, and social characteristics of their community.  
• The resources include parental support, advice, and guidance from extrafamilial mentors, and bilingualism in English and Spanish. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sociospatial Practices of Hispanic Youth Navigating Their Labor Market Opportunities</td>
<td>• Such strategies include leveraging institutional and familial connections, advertising their bilingualism, working close to home, and navigating stereotypes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Bamboo bridges or barriers? Exploring advantages of bilingualism among Asians in the US labor market through the lens of superdiversity | • A series of logistic and ordinary least squared regression analyses of the 2011–2015 American Community Survey (ACS) data shows that substantial differences exist across different ethnic groups among Asians.  
  • Bilingual advantages appear in most Asian groups when predicting both employment status and personal earnings, and the benefits tend to be more salient in the results of earnings analysis.  
  • The findings indicate that native-language literacy skill is a more momentous variable than the other variables in the model and that bilingual advantages stand out among Asian Indians and Chinese/Taiwanese more substantially compared to other Asians.  
  • Immense gender gaps also exist between Asian males and females in terms of economic well-being, and such gaps are more conspicuous in personal earnings than in employment status. |
| Latinxs’ bilingualism at work in the US: Profit for whom? | • Working from a political economy perspective and drawing from current theoretical approaches to language and labor under neoliberalism, researchers examine the reproduction of the discursive trope of language profit in the corporate world and educational spaces, and then analyze the narratives and trajectories of young Latinx workers in New York.  
  • The marginalized position of Latinxs in the social structure and the racialization of their linguistic practice result in a linguistic exploitation that remains unchallenged in the US.  
  • Researchers conclude that today’s celebrations of bilingualism, which follow a capitalist logic, perpetuate a hierarchy of languages and speakers that is detrimental to racialized minorities. |
| Global Economy |  |
| Succeeding with Latino Students | • With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills. |
| Raciolingustic ideology and Spanish-English bilingualism on the US labor market: An analysis of online job advertisements | • Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words, language mixing were explored.  
  • It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. |
| Rising to the bilingual challenge: self-reported experiences of managing life with two languages |  |
| In Quest for Bilingual Grads, Schools Push Dual Language | • Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g., possibility to obtain information from a large number of sources and the multilingual world we live in).  
  • Now, a growing number of states also see bilingualism as key to accessing the global economy, as evidenced by the surging popularity of the “seal of biliteracy”–a special recognition for graduates who demonstrate fluency in two or more languages. |
| Going Global: Can Dual-Language Programs Save Bilingual Education? | • Lindholm-Leary (2001) argued that DLI programs have the potential to “eradicate the negative status of bilingualism in the U.S.” because they combine “maintenance bilingual education and immersion education models in an integrated classroom composed of both language majority and language minority students with the goal of full bilingualism and biliteracy.”  
  • The benefits of bilingual education have long been characterized in terms of advantages for a global economy. |
• Although aware of the pitfalls of this association, many (e.g., Krashen, as cited in Crawford, 2001; MacSwan, 1998; Tse, 2001) have attempted to emphasize the economic advantages of bilingual education by stressing the “great importance of bilingualism in our modern global community” (MacSwan, 1998, p. 9).

• “In an era of globalization, a society that has access to multilingual and multicultural resources is advantaged in its ability to play an important social and economic role on the world stage” (p. 7).

• Highlighting this perspective, bilingualism and bilingual education can be viewed as a way to serve students and nations in the inevitable move toward an interconnected multilingual world.

Families and Educators Supporting Bilingualism in Early Childhood

• This article explores the strategies that three Latino families in the U.S. employed in raising their children bilingually in Spanish and English. It also looks at their rationale for bilingualism as well as the challenges the parents failed to anticipate in implementing their strategies.

• The data were gleaned from comparative case studies over a three-year period.

• The families wanted their children to be bilingual because they believed in the cognitive and economic advantages of bilingualism and that bilingualism would help maintain the families’ roots.

• In fact, the results of the study indicated that attaining productive bilingualism (the ability to speak the minority language) presented the three young girls with more difficulties than being proficient in English.

Economic Advantages of Multilingualism

• The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries.

• Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English.

• “In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage.”

The economic value of bilingualism in the United States

• Although past research has found no real economic benefit for bilinguals in the U.S. labor market, the new research reviewed here comes to the opposite conclusion: Full literacy in another language brings substantial economic benefit.

• Moreover, the failure to nurture these linguistic skills in the children of immigrants exacts a cost to the earnings of these potentially bilingual/biliterate students.

Becoming Citizens of the World

• To compete successfully in the global marketplace, both U.S.-based multinational corporations as well as small businesses increasingly need employees with knowledge of foreign languages and cultures to market products to customers around the globe and to work effectively with foreign employees and partners in other countries.

• Asia Society (2002) and National Geographic-Roper (2002) indicated that, compared with students in nine other industrialized countries, U.S. students lack knowledge of world geography, history, and current events.

• And shockingly few U.S. students learn languages that large numbers of people speak, such as Chinese (1.3 billion speakers) and Arabic (246 million speakers).

• The United States must create its own education response to globalization, which should include raising standards, increasing high
### How to raise a global kid

- America is so far utterly failing to produce a generation of global citizens.
- For parents who want to give their children global experience while keeping them safely on the straight and narrow American path of PSATs, SATs, and stellar extracurriculars, there's an ever-growing field of options. Immersion schools have exploded over the past 40 years, growing from none in 1970 to 440 today, according to the Center for Applied Linguistics. Mandarin, especially, is seen among type-A parents as a twofer: a child who learns Mandarin starting at 5 increases her brain capacity and is exposed to the culture of the future through language. (One mom in San Francisco laughs when she recalls that her daughter learned about Rosa Parks and the Montgomery bus boycott in Chinese.)

### Rebranding bilingualism: The shifting discuses of language education policy in California’s 2016 election

- Through comparative analyses of framing, keywords, spatial and temporal markers, actors, and legislative titles, we illustrate a discursive shift.
- While Proposition 227 presented bilingual education as a threat to children’s—and, by proxy, the nation’s—well-being (a language as problem orientation), Proposition 58 represents multilingual education as key to students’ future economic success and to the state and nation’s continued global economic advantage (a language as resource orientation).
- We argue that Proposition 58’s approach to “marketing” multilingual education may have contributed to its passing in November 2016, a result that we celebrate. At the same time, we raise questions about whether policies framed within one discursive regime (e.g., neoliberalism and global human capital) can eventually serve the aims of another (e.g., equity, plurality, and social justice), or whether discourse is destiny in policy making.

### Becoming Global Citizens through Bilingualism: English learning in the lives of University Students in China

- “Being a global citizen” is having strong interests in global issues, cultivating the understanding and appreciation of diverse values, and enhancing country’s competitiveness.
- All this however needs to be realized through communication in English, the world language.

### “Glocalization”: Going Beyond the Dichotomy of Global versus Local Through Additive Multilingualism

- This article interrogates the notion of “glocalization” (Moja, 2004, based on Castells, 2001) as a concept that seeks to integrate the local and the global to address both the need for social justice and the need to participate in a global market economy.

### Cultural and Linguistic Ambidexterity

- It might sound like a no-brainer that being bilingual or multilingual helps students planning engineering and just about any other career. But it is certainly true and is becoming more important the economies of nations become more intertwined. What's more being able to go beyond mere language ability and understand cultural distinctions are extra advantages.
- Students say that being bilingual gives them more options on campus and off.

### Elite multilingualism: discourses, practices, and debates

- In the introduction to the special issue ‘Elite Multilingualism: Discourses, practices, and debates’, researchers focus on ‘elite multilingualism’ as a means to provide a window into the complex layers and nuances of today’s multilingual, mobile, and global society.
- Finally, researchers conclude by reflecting on the value of the concept of elite multilingualism as a social practice and argue for the importance of examining the lived experience of multilinguals on the ground.

### Why language learning matters

- To thrive in a global economy and a multicultural society, US students need fluency in at least one language other than English.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Village is more global; language is more vital</th>
<th>The Key to Global Understanding: World Languages Education—Why Schools Need to Adapt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Research shows that multilingual societies have a competitive advantage over societies in international trade (Helliwell, 1999).</td>
<td>• With globalization, languages education should be one of the strategic goals of public as well as private education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Economic success and security in the US depend on our ability to understand the information we gather.</td>
<td>• Language educational economics is a newly developed field of study, born from the understanding that language educational policies have economic implications (Breton, 1998).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Many Americans need to interact regularly with people who are unlikely to know English.</td>
<td>• Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Not only does the omission of language and cultural education leave US students behind their peers in other countries, but also it exacerbates the achievement gap within the US.</td>
<td>• At a time of semi globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the current stumbling economy, job seekers are leveraging every qualification they can think of to sway potential employers. And with immigrants continuing to flood into New York, long the city of immigrants, and its suburbs, speaking a second language is a talent that matters in almost any field.</td>
<td>• On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar &amp; Spindler, 2005).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In the global economy, American companies increasingly are realizing the benefits of a multilingual work force.</td>
<td>• Trimmell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Increasing global understanding. Language learners’ step inside the mind and context of another culture.</td>
<td>• Increasing global understanding. Language learners’ step inside the mind and context of another culture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade.</td>
<td>• Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.</td>
<td>• Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).</td>
<td>• Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.</td>
<td>• Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Increasing chances of entry into college or graduate school. World languages and cultures are part of what an educated person should know.</td>
<td>• Increasing chances of entry into college or graduate school. World languages and cultures are part of what an educated person should know.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Analytic Profile

After the filtering process, I plan to first summarize the data in the table under each theme and further categorize the findings. Then, I will go through each theme and category within the table and note where the different findings overlap. In doing this, I hope to find major themes within the findings that will answer my research questions.
Chapter 2: Literature Review

Summary of Data Collected

In the previous table, the left column is the title of the article and the right is the important information and key findings within the article. In this next step of the process, I reviewed the important information and key findings within each theme, within each area of development, and further organized the information by creating main ideas. In order to do this, I again scanned the research for common language and themes and pulled out the most common language and themes from the articles within each area of development and theme. These organizational categories are called the main ideas. The purpose of this was to put similar findings together so that it is easier to make connections and sort through the findings. This is the next level of organization that will help me in the decision making process.

In the area of Intellectual Development, the themes are Cognitive Skills, Culture of Intellectualism, and Executive Function of the Brain. Within the theme of Cognitive Skills, the main ideas that findings were grouped into are Early Childhood Programs, English Learners with Disabilities, Cognitive Benefits/Advantages, Cognitive Flexibility, Protection from Dementia/Alzheimer’s, Literacy Skills, and Brain Research. Within the theme of Culture of Intellectualism, the only main idea is attitudes. Within the theme of Executive Function of the Brain, the main ideas are Focus and Attention, Processing Advantages, Working Memory, Theory of Mind, Brain Research, Executive Function Advantage, Executive Function Disadvantage/No Advantage, and Executive Functioning in Bilingual Children with Disabilities.

In the area of Educational Development, the themes are Academic Achievement, School/College Readiness, Literacy Development, and Language Acquisition. The main ideas in Academic Achievement are Reading Achievement, Math Achievement, Achievement Gap, Academic Achievement Success, English Learners with Disabilities, and Language Acquisition. The main ideas within School/College Readiness are College Readiness, Elementary School
Readiness, and Preschool Attendance. The main ideas within Literacy Development are First Language Literacy Development, English Language Acquisition, English Literacy Development, and Language & Literacy Development. The main ideas within Language Acquisition are Home Language Proficiency, English Language Proficiency, Maintaining Home Language, and Language Development.

In the area of Personal Development, the themes are Sense of Identity, Cultural Awareness, Self Confidence, and Critical Consciousness. The main ideas within Sense of Identity are Personal Perception, Identity Formation, Personality, Home Language Importance, and Motivation. There are no subcategories or main ideas within Cultural Awareness. The main ideas within Self Confidence are Attitudes, Self Confidence, and Agency. There are no subcategories or main ideas within Critical Consciousness.

In the area of Social Development, the themes are Social Networks, Relationships with Family and Friends, Social Competence, and Social Flexibility. The main ideas within Social Networks are Social Networks, Student Perceptions, Home Language Importance, Social Status, Peer Dynamics, and Sociolinguistic Awareness. The main ideas within Relationships with Family and Friends are Social Benefits, Peer Relationships, Bilingualism and Autism, and Family Relationships. The main ideas within Social Competence are General Social Competence, and Attitudes. There are no subcategories or main ideas within Social Flexibility.

In the Area of Economic Development, the themes are Cultural Awareness, Labor Market, and Global Economy. The main ideas within Cultural Awareness are Global Cultural Awareness and Language Economics. The main ideas within Labor Market are Labor Market, Maintaining Home Language, and Economic Success. The main ideas within Global Economy are Global Economy and Home Language Importance.
### Intellectual Development

#### Cognitive Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Idea</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Early Childhood Programs** | - Young English-language learners still developing oral and literacy skills in their home languages benefit most from early-childhood programs that regularly expose them to both languages (Maxwell, 2013)  
- Supporting the home language, as well as English, is the best thing for young dual language learners (Maxwell, 2013) |
| **English Learners with Disabilities** | - The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth (Carrasquillo & Rodriguez, 2002; Paneque & Barbeta, 2006; Rodriguez, Parmar, & Signer, 2001)  
- For English Learners with disabilities to succeed in bilingual special education programs, they need to be part of a school that promotes bilingualism and provides students with exemplary instructional practices (Rodriguez, 2009) |
| **General Cognitive Benefits/Advantages** | - Results report multiple cognitive benefits of language study and bimultilingualism, particularly later in life, including enhancement of cognitive flexibility, higher cognitive reserve in advanced age, and delay in the onset of dementia (Fox et al, 2019)  
- Researchers have now identified cognitive advantages for bilingual children that include enhanced executive function of the brain, resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001; Diaz & Klingner, 1991); increased short term memory (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013); and enhanced problem-solving skills.  
- These advantages are explained in part by the bilingual brain’s greater flexibility and ability to exclude competing stimuli as a result of having to constantly distinguish between two or more languages (Gandara, 2015)  
- Bilingual individuals have higher cognitive abilities, mental elasticity, and metalinguistic awareness (August, Goldenberg, & Rueda, 2010)  
- Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)  
- Maintenance and development of language and literacy skills in one’s mother tongue (MT) plays a critical role in facilitating second language (L2) learning, developing additive bilingualism and continuous cognitive development (Mandillah, 2019)  
- Numerous studies have demonstrated the bilingual cognitive advantage with regard to: (1) metalinguistic awareness (the ability to dissociate between meaning and form and explicitly talk about the language structure) (e.g. Bialystok et al. 2010); (2) executive functions (inhibition, switching/shifting, updating, monitoring) (see a summary by Dong and Li 2015); and (3) cognitive reserve (the protection mechanism against a cognitive decline related to elderly dementia and Alzheimer’s disease) (e.g. Schweizer at al. 2012)  
- MT use also enables children to expand their thinking—to engage in cultural ways of conceptualizing (i.e., bi/multicultural thinking), which is essential in this day and age, and thus fostering expanded cognitive skills or what some researchers term higher order thinking or executive functioning (Pandey, 2014)  
- Carlson and Metzoff (2008) found that bilingual kindergartners from low-income households—whose parents’ level of education is
substantially lower than their monolingual, English-only peers—
exhibit superior problem-solving skills. Such skills also enhance
children’s memory, as well as their intercultural and interpersonal
skills.

- Metalinguistic awareness and cognitive control in two languages
  and in non-language related tasks have been reported as bilingual-
specific advantages (Dillon, 2009)

- A large number of studies (see reviews in Bialystok, 2005, and in
  Costa, Hernández, Costa-Faidella & Sebastián- Gallés, 2009) have
  shown that early bilingualism acquired through the family or the
  social community can positively influence cognitive development,
  particularly attentional and executive functioning, in children.

- The positive impact of bilingualism has been observed over a
  variety of specific cognitive domains: for example, better flexibility
  in a symbol reorganization task (Peal & Lambert, 1962), superior
  performance at inhibiting distractors in a number concept task
  (Bialystok & Codd, 1997), superior symbolic representation and
  attentional inhibition skills in appearance–reality tasks (Bialystok
  & Senman, 2004).

- In a study to determine to what extent bilingualism acquired
  through a second-language immersion education has positive
cognitive effect, researchers compared an immersion group and a
monolingual group of students. Participants included a total of 106
French-speaking eight-year-old children drawn from two language
groups: 53 children enrolled in English immersion classes since the
age of five years (the immersion group) and 53 children enrolled in
monolingual French-speaking classes (the monolingual group). The
two groups were matched for verbal and nonverbal intelligence and
socioeconomic status (SES). They were administered a battery of
tasks assessing attentional and executive skills. Results showed that
the immersion group performed better (more specifically, faster)
than the monolingual group on tasks assessing alerting, auditory
selective attention, divided attention, and mental flexibility, but not
on tasks assessing response inhibition, as predicted. However,
contrary to our hypothesis, no difference was found between the
two groups on the interference inhibition task. Already after a
period of three years, an L2-immersion school experience
produces some of the attentional and executive benefits associated
with early highly proficient bilingualism, although possibly not for
exactly the same reasons (Poncelet, 2012)

- Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were
established for five cognitive domains: executive function,
memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed. The current
study indicates that bilingual Turkish immigrants have better
executive functioning and episodic memory compared to Turkish
immigrant monolinguals. Whether this is due to the effects of
bilingualism or reflects inherent cognitive abilities in those able to
acquire bilingualism in later life remains to be resolved (Nielson,
et al., 2019)

- In a study of enhanced cognitive control in low income minority
children, researchers found no group differences in representation,
the bilinguals performed significantly better than did the
monolinguals in control. These results demonstrate, first, that the
bilingual advantage is neither confounded with, nor limited by
socioeconomic and cultural factors and, second, that separable
aspects of executive functioning are differentially affected by
bilingualism. The bilingual advantage lies in control but not in
visuospatial representational processes. (Engel et al., 2012)

- The study provided the first credible evidence that rather than being
a negative force, bilingualism might instead have significant
positive outcomes. Although there were problems with the Peal and
| Cognitive Flexibility                                                                 | Rugby study (the language groups may not have been equivalent in socioeconomic status or intelligence and the measures were broadly based intelligence tests), the results created interest in the possibility that bilingualism could affect nonverbal cognition and that the effect could be positive (Bialystok et al., 2005)  
• Paap, Johnson, and Sawi's (2015) review raises a number of methodological issues with the current literature concerning bilingualism and cognitive advantages in executive functions. While the review has focused on providing counterevidence to a positive relationship between the two, we think that what should be the single most important message may have gotten lost in the article: more work needs to focus on identifying and describing the causal link between bilingual experience and cognitive control, as opposed to work just reporting correlations between the two.  
• Lifelong experience with multiple languages is believed to produce a number of executive function advantages including enhanced top-down control, improved attention, and greater working memory capacity. More specifically, the control that is required to select the relevant from the irrelevant language in any given context is believed to require cognitive control, and practicing this control leads to enhanced executive functioning. (Grundy & Timmer, 2016)  
• The paper summarizes research showing that bilingualism affects linguistic and cognitive performance across the lifespan. The effect on cognitive performance is to enhance executive functioning and to protect against the decline of executive control in aging. Memory tasks based primarily on verbal recall are performed more poorly by bilinguals, but memory tasks based primarily on executive control are performed better by bilinguals (Bialystok, 2009)  
• The key difference between bilinguals and monolinguals may be more basic: a heightened ability to monitor the environment (Bhattacharjee, 2012) |
| Protection from Dementia/Alzheimer’s                                                | Knowing a second language is: Cognitive/enriching’ (e.g., a challenge/training for the brain, which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease, an ability to express oneself in more ways along with an ability to |
- Carlson and Metzoff (2008) found that bilingual kindergartners from low-income households—whose parents’ level of education is substantially lower than their monolingual, English-only peers—exhibit superior problem-solving skills. Such skills are associated with a lower incidence of Alzheimer’s and dementia.

- The initial age of cognitive decline did not differ between language groups. The influence of bilingualism appears to be reflected in increased GMV in language and EF regions, and to a lesser degree, in EF (Torres, et al., 2022)

- This paper evaluates evidence supporting the claim that bilingualism contributes to cognitive reserve. Four types of evidence are presented: (i) brain and cognitive function in healthy aging, (ii) age of onset of symptoms of dementia, (iii) relation between clinical level and neuropathology for patients, and (iv) rate of cognitive decline in later stages of dementia. In all cases, bilinguals revealed patterns that were consistent with the interpretation of protection from cognitive reserve when compared with monolinguals. (Bialystok, 2021)

**Literacy Skills**

- One consistent finding in terms of the effects of reading in two languages has been the higher phonological awareness and processing ability found in bilinguals with two alphabetic languages such as English and Spanish (Bialystok et al., 2005)

**Brain Research**

- Gray matter volume was higher in language and EF brain regions among bilinguals, but no differences were found in memory regions (Torres, et al., 2022)

- A bilingual speaker’s brain has two active language systems even when he is using only one language. That creates situations in which one system obstructs the other. This interference turns out to be a blessing, not a handicap, because it forces the brain to resolve internal conflict, which gives the mind a workout that strengthens its cognitive muscles (Bhattacharjee, 2012)

- Evidence from a number of studies demonstrates that “the bilingual experience improves the brain’s so-called executive function — a command system that directs the attention processes that we use for planning, solving problems, and performing various other mentally demanding tasks. These processes include ignoring distractions to stay focused, switching attention willfully from one thing to another and holding information in mind — like remembering a sequence of directions while driving.” (Bhattacharjee, 2012)

**Culture of Intellectualism**

- DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual. There were significant group difference according to the target program model (90:10) vs (50:50), level of bilingualism, and whether students were native target language or English speakers (Cho et al., 2023)

- Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child (Cardenas, 1986)
• Importance of the native language: use of native language enhances learning, fund of language has a circular relationship with intellect, use of language for discovery. Failure to allow sufficient language development before the transition will result in a child's being unable to cope with anything but the most shallow levels of learning and will affect that child's future capability for learning. (Cardenas, 1986)
• “The extent to which a person develops his or her intellectual capacity depends greatly on the extent of language acquisition and use” (Cardenas, 1986)

### Executive Function of the Brain

| Focus and Attention | Researchers have now identified cognitive advantages for bilingual children that include enhanced executive function of the brain, resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001; Diaz & Klinger, 1991); increased short-term memory (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013); and enhanced problem-solving skills (Lauchlan, Parisi, & Fadda, 2013).
• Bilinguals show better executive function (a variety of more sophisticated processing including inhibition and decision-making) and metalinguistic awareness (knowing how language works) (Adesope et al. 2010).

### Processing advantage

• Studies support a domain-general processing advantage (e.g., attention, recall, associations) in bilinguals (Barac et al. 2014) with greater accuracy, better reaction times on nonverbal tasks, more fluid switching, and stronger performances on working memory tasks (Ransdell et al. 2001), perhaps developing a specialized form of long-term working memory that can support reading and writing.

### Working Memory

• Before correcting estimates for observed publication bias, the analyses revealed a very small bilingual advantage for inhibition, shifting, and working memory, but not for monitoring or attention. No evidence for a bilingual advantage remained after correcting for bias. (Antfolk et al., 2018)
• Study: (Anton, 2018) In this study the researchers explored the potential impact of bilingualism on executive functioning abilities by testing large groups of young adult bilinguals and monolinguals in the tasks that were most extensively used when the advantages were reported. Researchers found no differences between groups in their performance. The evidence presented here indicates that the bilingual advantage might indeed be caused by spurious uncontrolled factors rather than bilingualism per se. Secondly, bilingualism has been argued to potentially affect working memory also. Therefore, these researchers tested the same participants in both a forward and a backward version of a visual and an auditory working memory task. Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions.

### Theory of Mind

• These processing strengths indicate greater cognitive flexibility and may relate to increased cognitive reserve (Bialystok 2011). being bilingual may also increase “understanding of other people, their mental and knowledge states” (Barac et al. 2014) or what is known as “theory of mind” (Goetz 2003).
**Brain Research**

- Bilinguals have been shown to have “increased density of grey matter in the left inferior parietal cortex” (Bialystok 2009, p. 3) that is more pronounced among those with more L2 proficiency.
- Simultaneous bilingual brains evidence more white matter density (in the anterior cingulate) than sequential bilinguals (Mohades et al. 2015).

**Executive Function Advantage**

- Study: Esposito 2022: Executive functions are positively correlated to both socio-economic status (SES, e.g., Nesbitt et al., 2013) and academic performance (for review, see Serpell & Esposito, 2016). The pattern of results supported an academic advantage for intermediate TWDL students. The advantage in executive functions was less robust, emerging for TWDL students in behavioral ratings but not in computerized measures. Using the behavioral rating measure of executive functions and a standardized measure of math performance, we did find evidence for executive functions as a mechanism supporting the academic advantage. While there were few differences between those in TWDL mainstream education in the computerized measures of executive functions, the behavioral rating measure revealed a significant difference between education models such that children in the TWDL program exhibited fewer indicators of executive dysfunction in the classroom. The difference was present at both the primary and the intermediate level. The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels.
- Attention difficulty is associated with poor performance on executive functioning (EF) tasks, yet EF is enhanced in bilingual children. Results from hierarchical regressions confirmed that both attention ability and bilingualism contributed to performance on the EF tasks. Attention ability was a stronger predictor for an inhibition task, namely stop signal, and bilingualism a stronger predictor for an interference task, namely flanker (Sorge et al., 2018).
- The extant research suggests bilingualism is associated with enhanced cognitive effects, most evident in attention and executive functioning (EF). This study examined the contributions of balance in the bilingualism (Spanish English) of children to performance-based measures and caregiver ratings of EF. Participants included 30 bilingual children. Balance in children’s bilingualism was correlated with caregiver ratings of task initiation. After controlling for demographic variables, balance in bilingualism significantly accounted for 37% of the variance in ratings of children’s task initiation (Weber et al., 2014).
- Socioeconomic status (SES) and bilingualism have been shown to influence executive functioning during early childhood. Study: Bilingualism moderated the effects of SES by ameliorating the detrimental consequences of low-SES on EF and self-regulatory behaviors. These findings underscore bilingualism’s power to enrich executive functioning and self-regulatory behaviors, especially among underprivileged children (Hartanto et al., 2019).
- Recent research suggests that bilinguals might exhibit advantages in several areas of executive function, including working memory, inhibitory control, and attentional control. Across three experiments, bilingual children exhibited superior performance on two different measures of visual–spatial memory, as well as measures of inhibitory and attentional control. These results suggest that bilinguals exhibit broad advantages in executive function during the preschool years, and these advantages are evident within a disadvantaged, low-SES population. (Grote, 2021)
- Bilingual children have been shown to outperform monolingual children on tasks measuring executive functioning skills. This advantage is usually attributed to bilinguals’ extensive practice in
exercising selective attention and cognitive flexibility during language use because both languages are active when one of them is being used. Native bilingual children performed significantly better than monolingual children on the Stroop task, with no difference between groups on the other tasks, confirming the specificity of bilingual effects to conflict tasks reported in older children. These results demonstrate that bilingual advantages in executive control emerge at an age not previously shown. (Poulin-Dubois, 2010)

- Bilinguals’ routine deployment of selective attention and inhibition in the domain of language is assumed to hone these executive processes to such an extent that far transfer of attentional control to non-linguistic domains ultimately occurs. Hence, bilinguals are expected to outperform monolinguals on non-linguistic executive functioning tasks. Links between bilingualism and executive functioning may, at least in part, arise because superior executive functioning is a cause rather than a consequence of bilingualism. Moreover, given that individuals tend to seek out environments and pursuits that best suit their cognitive strengths (Haworth et al., 2010), superior executive functioning might predict which individuals are likely to seek out language learning opportunities in the first place. (Kempe et al., 2015)

- However, bilinguals obtained higher scores than both groups of monolinguals on three tests of executive functioning: Luria’s tapping task measuring response inhibition, the opposite worlds task requiring children to assign incongruent labels to a sequence of animal pictures, and reverse categorization in which children needed to reclassify a set of objects into incongruent categories after an initial classification. This evidence for a bilingual advantage in aspects of executive functioning at an earlier age than previously reported is discussed in terms of the possibility that bilingual language production may not be the only source of these developmental effects (Bialystok, 2010)

- There is debate over the extent to which the unique experiences of bilingual children afford advantages in cognitive development. Our findings suggest that young bilingual children’s unique experiences lead to greater ability to use cognitive skills to engage in goal-directed behavior, when compared to monolingual children. Therefore, bilingualism may have important influences on cognitive development that can help support children’s success in school and beyond. (Goodrich, 2022)

- Advanced inhibitory control skills have been found in bilingual speakers as compared to monolingual controls (Bialystok, 1999). After statistically controlling for these factors and age, native bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function better than both other groups. Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call for managing conflicting attentional demands (Conflict tasks); there was no advantage on impulse-control (Delay tasks). (Carlson, 2008)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive Function Disadvantage/ No Advantage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• This book examines the hypothesis that using two languages leads to the enhancement of domain-general executive functioning (EF) and argues that either the bilingual advantage does not exist or is restricted to very specific circumstances. The conclusion extends to situations where EF is referred to as self-control, self-regulation, self-discipline, attention-control, impulse-control, inhibitory control, cognitive control, and willpower. Empirical evidence does not support a bilingual advantage on EF that is distinguishable from zero. This includes new data that compares tests of the bilingual advantage hypothesis based on self-reports of cognitive control to performance-based measures of EF (Paap, 2018)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For verbal fluency, our analyses indicated a small bilingual disadvantage, possibly reflecting less exposure for each individual language when using two languages in a balanced manner (Antfolk et al.). Researchers conclude that the available evidence does not provide systematic support for the widely held notion that bilingualism is associated with benefits in cognitive control functions in adults (Antfolk et al.).

Study: (Anton, 2018) In this study the researchers explored the potential impact of bilingualism on executive functioning abilities by testing large groups of young adults’ bilinguals and monolinguals in the tasks that were most extensively used when the advantages were reported. Researchers found no differences between groups in their performance. The evidence presented here indicates that the bilingual advantage might indeed be caused by spurious uncontrolled factors rather than bilingualism per se. Secondly, bilingualism has been argued to potentially affect working memory also. Therefore, these researchers tested the same participants in both a forward and a backward version of a visual and an auditory working memory task. Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions.

One potential reason for discrepant findings across studies examining the bilingual advantage is the difficulty in matching monolingual and bilingual groups on important confounding variables that are elated to EF. No effects of bilingualism were observed for performance-based measures of working memory or cognitive flexibility. Results are discussed in the context of recent theoretical models of EF development in early childhood (Goodrich, 2022).

---

**EF in Bilingual Children with Disabilities**

Research in typically developing children has noted advantages for bilinguals in domains such as executive functioning and social skills, but less is known about the effects in ASD. Our findings indicate that the bilingual advantage in executive functioning may extend to children with neurodevelopmental conditions (Ratto et al., 2020).

---

### Educational Development

**Academic Achievement**

**Reading Achievement**

- Students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized reading and mathematics tests (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)
- Students in DLE programs score similar to their statewide peers by about grade 5-7, if not sooner (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)
- Students in DLE programs achieve at or above grade level in reading tests measured in the partner language (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)
- DLE middle and high school students are more likely to pass the high school exit exam (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)
- Students who remained in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake student in English-only programs at about the 5th grade; by high school, the were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured, including English language arts scores and reclassification to English-proficient status (Gandara, 2015)
- Research was conducted to compare former English Learners placed in GE settings and those who remained in DL classrooms on state tests in English Language Arts (ELA) and math (n = 99) at the middle-school level. In both subjects, DL students outperformed...
GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. Calling into question policies favoring placement of former English Learners in GE classes, the results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. (Torph & Murphy, 2021)

- In this study, researchers used a quasi-experimental, longitudinal design to examine the English language arts (ELA) and mathematics test scores of emergent bilinguals (EBs) in DLBE 50:50 models versus English as a second language (ESL) models in Indiana over four academic school years. Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)

- In North Carolina, DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas & Collier, 2012).

- This pilot study compares the overall academic achievement in the area of language arts literacy among elementary bilingual students enrolled in either Dual Language: Two-Way Immersion programs or in an Early Exit, Transitional Bilingual program in a large urban public school district. By analyzing the results of curriculum-based measures in the area of word decoding and overall reading comprehension, this study shows that students who have continuously enrolled in a Dual Language: Two Way Immersion Bilingual Program reveal higher academic achievement than students enrolled in an Early Exit, Transitional Bilingual program, from kindergarten to third grade (Nascimento, 2017)

- The objective of this short-term longitudinal study was to examine individual versus classroom peer effects of grit on later individual literacy achievement in elementary school. The current article found that classroom peer grit, not individual grit, was a strong predictor of individual literacy achievement 4 months later among dual language, largely Latina/o elementary school students. This study holds implications for educators of dual language learners who would be interested in the conclusion that grit’s role in literacy achievement may not lie solely in an individual’s character, but also in an individual’s classroom context among dual language learner elementary schoolchildren. (O’Neal, 2018)

- Thomas & Collier have found that in the North Carolina districts with two-way, dual-language instruction, students score statistically significantly higher in reading in 4th grade than their nondual-language peers, a pattern that continues through 8th grade. By 5th grade, dual language students score about the same as their monolingual peers a grade ahead of them, an advantage that lasts through 8th grade. The same pattern plays out in math, with 5th-grade dual-language students scoring as high as non-program peers in 6th grade. Two groups of students are benefitting the most from dual language instruction: English language learners and African-American students. For English-learners in dual language programs, reading scores in all the tested grades are much higher than for English Learners who are not in a dual-language program, according to the study. (Maxwell, 2015)

- A new study from RAND Education and the American Councils for International Education in conjunction with the Portland Public Schools has examined the effects of dual-language immersion (DU) on student achievement. The study covered DU programs in Spanish, Japanese, Mandarin Chinese, Russian, and Vietnamese,
and included two-way programs, where half the students in the program were native speakers of English and the other half native speakers of the partner (non-English) language. The study found that:

- Students randomly assigned to immersion outperformed their peers in English reading by about seven months in fifth grade and nine months in eighth grade. There was no statistically significant benefit, but also no detriment, for math and science performance. There were no clear differences in immersion effects by native language. Reading effects for students whose native language matches the classroom partner language appear as high as or higher than for native English speakers. There is suggestive but not statistically significant evidence that the immersion benefit in reading is higher for students in Spanish immersion programs, and that modest math benefits are higher for students in the less commonly taught languages (Japanese, Mandarin, and Russian). Immersion students have three-point lower rates of classification as English Language Learners (English Learners) by sixth grade, and this effect is larger (14 points) if students’ native language matches the classroom partner language. On average, immersion students reach intermediate levels of partner-language proficiency by eighth grade, with somewhat higher performance in Spanish and Chinese (intermediate mid-to-high) than in Japanese (intermediate low-to-mid). (Burkhauser et al., 2016)

### Math Achievement

- In this study, researchers present quantitative findings on the effects of English-Spanish dual language immersion on student achievement in science and mathematics in grades 3, 4, and 5. Dual language programs promote positive academic and social outcomes for all students and particularly for English language learners. When put together well, dual language programs can have a profound impact on student outcomes. Clarkson (2007) writes that “the evidence that bilingual young people, relative to monolingual controls, show greater cognitive flexibility, creativity, divergent thought and improved problem-solving abilities, is very persuasive” (pp. 192-93). One effect of these cognitive advantages is increased academic achievement, including in mathematics and science. Several studies with students from different linguistic groups have noted improved mathematics achievement for bilingual students. (Tran et al., 2015)

- In this study, researchers used a quasi-experimental, longitudinal design to examine the English language arts (ELA) and mathematics test scores of emergent bilinguals (EBs) in DLBE 50:50 models versus English as a second language (ESL) models in Indiana over four academic school years. Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)

- In North Carolina, DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas & Collier, 2012).

- This article reports on a study that investigated achievement in math of third and fourth grade dual language immersion (DLI) students, building on research that has demonstrated the academic achievement of students who receive content instruction predominantly in the target language. This study expands the scope and methodology of prior research by including one-way programs in three languages (Chinese, French and Spanish) and two-way Spanish-English programs; and by relying on propensity matching to mitigate possible effects of school and student differences. In the third-grade study, researchers compared students’ math scores in
relation to their English Language Arts (ELA) achievement to control for pre-existing differences between DLI and non-DLI students. DLI students who attained the same levels in ELA, and who received math instruction in a target language, performed at the same level as their non-DLI peers in third grade math tests given in English. For the fourth-grade study, we compared DLI students to a propensity-matched non-DLI group. DLI students grew more in math than their counterparts not in DLI. The results from this natural experiment indicate that students in a DLI program that has been implemented state-wide were able to succeed academically in math (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018)

- A new study from RAND Education and the American Councils for International Education in conjunction with the Portland Public Schools has examined the effects of dual-language immersion (DU) on student achievement. The study covered DU programs in Spanish, Japanese, Mandarin Chinese, Russian, and Vietnamese, and included two-way programs, where half the students in the program were native speakers of English and the other half native speakers of the partner (non-English) language. The study found that: Students randomly assigned to immersion outperformed their peers in English reading by about seven months in fifth grade and nine months in eighth grade. There was no statistically significant benefit, but also no detriment, for math and science performance. There were no clear differences in immersion effects by native language. Reading effects for students whose native language matches the classroom partner language appear as high as or higher than for native English speakers. There is suggestive but not statistically significant evidence that the immersion benefit in reading is higher for students in Spanish immersion programs, and that modest math benefits are higher for students in the less commonly taught languages (Japanese, Mandarin, and Russian). Immersion students have three-point lower rates of classification as English Language Learners (English Learners) by sixth grade, and this effect is larger (14 points) if students’ native language matches the classroom partner language. On average, immersion students reach intermediate levels of partner-language proficiency by eighth grade, with somewhat higher performance in Spanish and Chinese (intermediate mid-to-high) than in Japanese (intermediate low-to-mid). (Burkhauser et al., 2016)

- Marian et al. (2013) investigated the academic achievement of students in grades 3, 4, or 5 (approximately ages 8–10 years), a portion of which were enrolled in a two-way dual-language program. They found an advantage in academic performance in math across all three grade levels and reading in 3rd grade.

- Watzinger-Tharp, Swenson, and Mayne (2018) examined growth in over 2000 4th grade students in either mainstream English education or a dual-language education model (comprised of both one-way and two-way models across three partner languages). In a matched-sample of mainstream and dual-language students, the dual-language students showed greater growth in math achievement across the 4th grade year.

**Achievement Gap**

- English Learners close the achievement gap with NES students in English-Only classrooms by about fifth grade (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)

- DLE middle and high school students are more likely to close the gap with NES peers by the end of high school (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)

- Ideally, English Learners would learn in communities where their culture and language are valued, such as dual language classrooms where content and language arts are taught both in English and Spanish. The benefits of such models include accelerated academic
progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap (Oberg & Phillips, 2014)

- Research shows that long-term DL programs can close achievement gaps between English-proficient speakers and emergent bilinguals after five years, while short-term bilingual or English-only transitional programs close only about half of that gap (Collier & Thomas, 2017).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Achievement Success</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Esposito (2020) that two-way dual-language education fosters executive functions similar to the advantage found in bilingual individuals and that well-developed executive functions are a mechanism for an academic advantage. The results did indicate that the academic advantage found on the standardized math assessment for children at the intermediate level of the TWDL program was mediated by executive functions behaviors exhibited in the classroom. The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels, yet the academic advantage was only present in the intermediate students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages (Gandara, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Multiple studies indicate that children in bilingual education models (including dual-language and immersion models) have academic outcomes that match or even exceed those of their peers in mainstream education models, especially in later elementary grades (Esposito, 2020).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics (Gomez et al., 2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- This longitudinal study was conducted to gain understanding of the social–emotional and academic development of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children. Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development. In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were associated with later academic achievement and growth of English proficiency. Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism (Oades-Sese et al., 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Employing a mixed-methods research design, this study examines how a newly designed dual language program in an urban school advances language proficiencies among Spanish-English bilingual 6th graders in relation to content area achievement as measured on NYS standardized tests in English Language Arts and Math. It further investigates how students’ emotional (school identification) and behavioral engagement (language learning commitment) relate to bilingual language proficiencies. The results drawn from both quantitative and qualitative data indicate that bilingual students benefitted from attending a dual language program. It contributes positively to students’ academic achievement, bilingual school identification and commitment to language learning. With respect to language development, the study found that English proficiency in productive skills was positively correlated with standardized test scores. Spanish proficiency was positively correlated with students’ commitment to language learning. Spanish and English languages play different but equally important functions in the dual language program. However, students, face challenges in sustaining learning the two languages in school; researchers show that students experience a gradual language shift from Spanish to English. The study underscores the potential benefits of a multilingual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
proficiency perspective theory among the students and in preparing bilingual teachers. (Bruitt-Griffier & Jang, 2022)
• Additional research finds that DL programming improves academic outcomes for traditionally under-served groups while fostering diverse learning environments for all learners. Students in DL programs outperform students who participate in non-DL programs (Palencia et al., 2021).
• Internationally, research shows the most powerful predictor of academic achievement for emergent bilinguals is the sustained development of the students’ home language through the school curriculum (Collier & Thomas, 2017). Within an asset-focused context, students have an opportunity to build linguistic capital, defined as “the intellectual and social skills attained through communication experiences in more than one language and/or style” (Yosso, 2005, p. 78).
• Using a large longitudinal dataset including children who attended Head Start over two years, this study examined academic growth trajectories during the period between Head Start entry and kindergarten (2.5 years), and whether those growth trajectories differ by children's dual language learning status. Analyses comparing three groups of children (i.e., Spanish-English bilinguals, Spanish-English emergent bilinguals [EBs], and English monolinguals) showed three noteworthy findings. First, bilinguals entering Head Start with English proficiency showed similar developmental trajectories in vocabulary and math to those of monolinguals. Second, EBs entering Head Start with limited English proficiency presented the lowest baseline skills in vocabulary and math. Whereas the initial vocabulary gaps generally persisted over time, gaps in math between EBs and monolinguals narrowed by kindergarten. Third, no difference was found between bilinguals and EBs in their Spanish vocabulary development (Choi et al., 2018).
• The purpose of this study was to analyze the effects of a two-way immersion elementary school program on academic achievement at the end of the elementary school and the end of the first year of junior high school. Longitudinal high stakes test data in reading, writing, and mathematics were collected on native English speakers and native Spanish speakers from the two-way immersion program and on matched controls through the use of an ex post facto quasiexperimentional design. Findings suggest consistent support for the two-way immersion program over matched control students across all three achievement areas. It appears the greatest effect for native English speakers may be in reading, while native Spanish speakers may benefit more in writing and mathematics. (Cobb et al., 2006.)
• When properly implemented, DLPs are an effective way to improve academic achievement for all students (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).
• Data has demonstrated that DLPs have benefited both English Learners and native English-speaking students in obtaining higher levels of academic achievement in all areas, as compared to their counterparts in mainstream classrooms (Thomas & Collier, 2012).
• In states with high numbers of English Learners, such as Arizona, implementing a two-way 50/50 model can be beneficial for the academic achievement of all students involved in such programs. (Gomez & Cisneros, 2020)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Learners with Disabilities</th>
<th>If the number of Latino students in your school is high, dual language programs can increase their academic achievement while also developing their biliteracy and bilingual skills (Gomez, 2005)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Language Acquisition</td>
<td>The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth. For English Learners with disabilities to succeed in bilingual special education programs, they need to be part of a school that promotes bilingualism and provides students with exemplary instructional practices. (Rodriguez, 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College Readiness</td>
<td>This study assesses the long-term linguistic and academic outcomes associated with different bilingual language education models for low-income dual language learners (DLLs) residing in a bilingual, bicultural context. Two-way immersion models that support the home language and culture and integrate language majority and minority learners were associated with faster English acquisition, which mediated the link between Two-Way Immersion (TWI) programs and higher GPAs (Serafini et al., 2022)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**School/College Readiness**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>College Readiness</th>
<th>This causal-comparative study analyzed the college readiness of Latino English Learners educated in two different bilingual education programs, Transitional Bilingual (TB) and Dual Language (DL), by examining science and mathematics scores on the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the ACT. A statistically significant difference was found in the performance of the participants in the areas of mathematics and science via a series of t-tests. The descriptive statistics report that DL participants had a 29.6% higher probability in science and a 15.2% higher probability in mathematics of being college ready, per the Texas Uniform Admission Policy. Over all, DL participants outperformed TB participants. (Garza-Reyna, 2019)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>This study compared the performance of bilingual learners, educated in either a Transitional Bilingual (TB) or Dual Language (DL) program, on the Reading and English portions of the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the American College Test (ACT). A statistically significant difference was found on the t-tests run for the Reading (p &gt; .000) and English (p &gt; .000) portions of the ACT exam. Outlined in the Texas Uniform Admission Policy (TUAP) are recommended minimum scores students should meet in order to be deemed “college ready.” In the area of Reading, the TB comparison group (10.8%) had less than the DL comparison group (51.8%) meet the recommended minimum score outlined in the TUAP. Similar findings were found on the English portion of the ACT exam. A smaller percentage of participants in the TB comparison group (9%) meet the TUAP recommended minimum score for English than the DL comparison group (59.1%). By and large, DL participants outperformed the TB participants in this study. (Garza-Reyna et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The idea behind the immersion program is to get students from different backgrounds to work together while simultaneously aiding each other in communication. The benefits of a program include improved college readiness for all students involved -- not just the English Language Learners, who are largely Spanish speakers in the Crossroads, said Alejandro Mojica, the Victoria school districts newly hired Bilingual and ESL Learning director. “Both groups of students would benefit from each other,” said Mojica, a Columbia native. “Research shows that by the time they reach high school, these students are more college-ready than their peers who didn’t participate in an immersion program.” (Astrain, 2014).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Elementary School Readiness

- Young children learning two languages demonstrate school readiness factors: strong social-emotional development and “executive function” skills, such as listening and following directions (Ford, 2010).

- This study examined how parents, teachers, and administrators conceptualized dual-language immersion (DLI) education and its goals at Bobcat Canyon School (BCS, pseudonym), a private preschool in the Southwestern USA where 64% students were White and 36% were students of color. The analysis revealed that with a framework of neoliberal linguistic instrumentalism, the preschool conceptualized its DLI as an enriching context for students to obtain a cognitive, social, and academic edge. Cognitive development, social competencies, and school readiness were primary goals while bilingualism/biliteracy was a secondary bonus if achieved. (D. Chen, 2022)

- The present study investigated school readiness in Brazilian (Portuguese-Japanese dual language learner or DLL) 5-year-olds in Japan (1) by examining their language skills, executive function (EF), and theory of mind (ToM) in comparison to their monolingual peers and (2) by investigating the developmental relations between these three skills. DLLs scored lower than monolinguals in Japanese language skills, specifically in receptive vocabulary and the understanding of complement clauses in Japanese. In conclusion, DLLs had school readiness difficulties in Japanese language skills and ToM, but not in EF, compared to their Japanese monolingual peers. Furthermore, the positive relationship of language and EF skills with ToM development, which is commonly reported in monolingual children, extended to an understudied population of DLLs in this study. (Sudo & Matsui, 2021)

- Preschool is a critical period during which children’s development and learning exert a long-lasting impact on their school adjustment and academic outcomes. Using multilevel modeling, this study examined the specific ways teachers use students’ home language (Spanish) in their various verbal exchanges in the classroom (i.e., giving directions, requesting language, providing, and eliciting contextualized information, and providing and eliciting decontextualized information). These conversations with Latino DLLs, as measured by the Language Interaction Snapshot, uniquely contributed to students’ language and social skills at the end of the Head Start academic year. Results revealed statistically significant relations between teachers’ Spanish talk and DLLs’ social outcomes. Specifically, teachers’ Spanish talk with DLLs and DLLs’ initial English and Spanish skills were positively associated with the latter’s interactive peer play behaviors, whereas DLLs’ initial English skills were negatively associated with their disconnected peer play behaviors. (Limlingan et al., 2022)

- Researchers examined the school readiness skills of 217 Latino DLLs attending Head Start taking into account specific teacher characteristics that may impact the development of readiness skills. Different teacher characteristics have different effects on the developmental outcomes. Amount of training had a positive significant effect on several children’s outcomes in English and in Spanish. The years of experience a teacher had working in classrooms with DLLs had a positive effect on children’s English spelling skills. Teachers’ cultural competency rating had a positive effect on receptive language and literacy in Spanish. (Ramírez et al., 2019)

- Emerging research shows there is substantial heterogeneity in the English and Spanish language and literacy proficiencies of dual language learners (DLLs) in U.S. preschools. This work is...
extended in this paper by examining within-group variability in 320 Spanish-English speaking DLLs’ cognitive, linguistic, literacy, and mathematics skills at the end of prekindergarten ($M = 5.22$ years old). Using latent profile analysis (a type of mixture modeling), four profiles of DLLs were identified. Most DLLs were classified as English Dominant, followed by Balanced Average, Spanish Dominant, and Balanced Low, respectively. In general, the Balanced Average profile outperformed the other profiles in English and Spanish, and their norm-referenced standard scores provide additional evidence that bilingual development is not associated with educational risk. (López & Foster, 2021)

### Preschool Attendance
- Achievement gaps are already established when DLLs enter kindergarten without having attended a preschool program, such as being less able to recognize English letters, count to 20, or write their names compared with their English-dominant peers (Ansari, 2018).
- Preschool attendance promotes the native or first language (L1) and the target or second language (L2; English) and literacy development (Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016; Phillips et al., 2017).
- Academic language and social-behavioral skills also increase when DLLs attend public preschool programs (Ansari & López, 2015).
- Gains in English proficiency, reading achievement and math performance have also been demonstrated (Halle et al., 2012).
- Attending formalized preschool environments can raise literacy and math scores for DLL children while reducing inequality in kindergarten (Barnett et al., 2020; Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016).

### First Language Literacy Development
- Over 30% of children in the US are dual language learners who are learning two languages. Few have simultaneously examined development of skills in both languages for children in preschool. The purpose of this study was to examine the language and literacy skills in both Spanish and English in secondary data analyses of three studies of DLL children. Hierarchical linear model analyses compared acquisition of language skills in English and Spanish in three studies. Using language and time as nesting factors, these models allow for direct contrast of level and rate of acquisition across languages. Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills. (Hammer et al., 2020)
- The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school. In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis. ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills. (Murphy, 2014)
- Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between
dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S. Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs. Multiple regression results show that both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. These effects remained significant even after controlling for students’ English speaking-writing proficiency. Moreover, both Cantonese and English writing proficiency were positively related to students’ classroom competence. Additionally, higher English reading proficiency was positively associated with peer competence. (He et al., 2022)

**English Language Acquisition**

- Researchers analyzed data on eight cohorts of English language learners who were each assigned to one of the four different instructional programs, using up to 10 years of data for each cohort. Researchers compared students in the four programs on three different outcomes: students’ English language acquisition (as measured by their performance on the California English Language Development Test); their academic performance and growth (as measured by their performance on the California Standards Tests in mathematics and English language arts); and their reclassification from English learner status to fluent English proficient status. In all programs, more than 80 percent of English Learners were proficient in English by the end of elementary school, and more than 90 percent were proficient by 7th grade. When possible, invest in high-quality two-language programs. Choose among two-language programs based on community and stakeholder voice. (Umansky, 2016)

**English Literacy Development**

- Over 30% of children in the US are dual language learners who are learning two languages. Few have simultaneously examined development of skills in both languages for children in preschool. The purpose of this study was to examine the language and literacy skills in both Spanish and English in secondary data analyses of three studies of DLL children. Hierarchical linear model analyses compared acquisition of language skills in English and Spanish in three studies. Using language and time as nesting factors, these models allow for direct contrast of level and rate of acquisition across languages. Results showed that Spanish–English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills. (Hammer et al., 2020)

- The current study reports on the results of a longitudinal investigation of the language and early literacy development of a sample of dual-language learners (DLLs) and monolingual English speakers from low-income families who received an Early Reading First intervention during their Head Start preschool year. A total of 62 children who entered and remained in the same school district were followed from kindergarten through 2nd grade. The results indicate that both the DLLs and monolingual English speakers in the study showed similar developmental trajectories on receptive vocabulary, story recall, decoding, and letter and word identification from preschool through the 2nd grade. Furthermore, at the end of 2nd grade, the 2 groups’ vocabulary, story recall, reading fluency, decoding, and letter and word identification
performances were similar and within the normal range for children their age. The study’s findings suggest that a strong preschool language and literacy program can reduce the English language gap between DLLs and monolingual English speakers from low-income families. (Han et al., 2014)

- The current study explores variation in phonemic representation among Spanish–English dual language learners (DLLs, n = 60) who were dominant in English or in Spanish. Children were given a phonetic discrimination task with speech sounds that: 1) occur in English and Spanish, 2) are exclusive to English, and 3) are exclusive to Russian, during Fall (age m = 57 months) and Spring (age m = 62 months, n = 42). In Fall, English-dominant DLLs discriminated more accurately than Spanish-dominant DLLs between English-Spanish phones and English-exclusive phones. In Spring, however, groups no longer differed in discriminating English-exclusive phones and both groups discriminated Russian phones above chance. Additionally, joint English-Spanish and English-exclusive phonetic discrimination predicted children’s phonological awareness in both groups. Results demonstrate plasticity in early childhood through diverse language exposure and suggest that phonemic representation begins to emerge driven by lexical restructuring. (Smith et al., 2022)

- Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S. Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs. Multiple regression results show that both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. These effects remained significant even after controlling for students’ English speaking/writing proficiency. Moreover, both Cantonese and English writing proficiency were positively related to students’ classroom competence. Additionally, higher English reading proficiency was positively associated with peer competence. (He et al., 2022)

- This study examined the role of the language of vocabulary instruction in promoting English vocabulary in preschool Latino dual language learners (DLLs). The authors compared the effectiveness of delivering a single evidence-informed vocabulary approach using English as the language of vocabulary instruction (English culturally responsive [ECR]) versus using a bilingual modality that strategically combined Spanish and English (culturally and linguistically responsive [CLR]). Forty-two DLL Spanish-speaking preschoolers were randomly assigned to the ECR group (n = 22) or CLR group (n = 20). Thirty English words were presented during small-group shared readings in their preschools 3 times a week for 5 weeks. Multilevel models were used to examine group differences in post instruction scores on 2 Spanish and 2 English vocabulary assessments at instruction end and follow-up. Children receiving instruction in the CLR bilingual modality had significantly higher posttest scores (than those receiving the ECR English-only instruction) on Spanish and English vocabulary assessments at instruction end and on the Spanish vocabulary assessment at follow-up, even after controlling for preinstruction
scores. The results provide additional evidence of the benefits of strategically combining the first and second language to promote English and Spanish vocabulary development in this population. Future directions for research and clinical applications are discussed. (Méndez et al., 2015)

| Language & Literacy Development | • To summarize the extant literature and guide future research, a critical analysis of the literature was conducted. A search of major databases for studies on young typically developing DLLs between 2000 and 2011 yielded 182 peer reviewed articles. First, the research shows that DLLs have two separate language systems early in life. Second, differences in some areas of language development, such as vocabulary, appear to exist among DLLs depending on when they were first exposed to their second language. Third, DLLs’ language and literacy development may differ from that of monolinguals, although DLLs appear to catch up over time. Fourth, little is known about factors that influence DLLs’ development, although the amount of language exposure to and usage of DLLs’ two languages appears to play key roles. (Hammer et al., 2014)

• The purpose of this study was to evaluate which aspects of the HLE significantly predict growth in English and Spanish vocabulary among Spanish-speaking DLLs. 944 Spanish-speaking DLLs (51.6% female; mean age = 53.77 months) completed assessments of English and Spanish vocabulary at 4 time points across 2 academic years. Parents completed a survey of the HLE that included information on language exposure, reading exposure, and family reading habits. Results indicated that specific literacy-related practices, including availability of books in the home, language read to the child, and parental reading skills were significant predictors of growth in children’s Spanish and English vocabulary knowledge, even after controlling children’s initial level of language skills and family socioeconomic status. (Goodrich et al., 2021)

• Year 2 findings are reported from a longitudinal, experimental-control study involving 31 Spanish speaking preschoolers (aged 38–48 months) randomly assigned to two Head Start classrooms. In Year 1, classrooms differed only in the language of instruction, with teachers using only Spanish in one classroom and only English in the other. In Year 2, an experimental transitional bilingual education (TBE) model was implemented, with English being gradually introduced in the TBE classroom until a ratio of 30:70 English-to-Spanish was achieved, and Spanish being gradually introduced in the predominantly English (PE) classroom until a ratio of 70:30 English-to-Spanish was achieved. Year 2 results were consistent with Year 1, with the TBE classroom exceeding the PE classroom on all Spanish measures of language and literacy development and no significant differences favoring the PE classroom. Results also indicated that Year 2 trajectories were conditional on first-year effects, suggesting that sustained growth in dual language learner’s early literacy may depend on early intervention among 3-year-old preschoolers. (Durán et al., 2015)

• The present investigation builds off prior empirical work to describe the quality of the language and literacy instruction Latino dual language learning (DLL) children receive in Head Start. Specifically, researchers measured the frequency and duration of language and literacy lessons in classes that enrolled large numbers of Latino DLLs. Researchers also investigated children’s opportunities to participate in high-quality language end literacy experiences as a part of their everyday instructional experience. In total researchers observed 398 lessons in 20 classes. Results
revealed (a) that the frequency and duration of instruction was variable, with some children enrolled in classes that implemented language- and literacy-based lessons for 23 min (10%) of the 4-h day and others in classes that fit in up to 82 min (34%) of instruction per day; (b) when language and literacy instruction occurred in these classes, it was most frequently delivered in a whole group and featured an instructional style that was characterized by the teacher directing the children to answer basic questions with a one- or two-word response; and (c) that high-quality instruction, which we operationalized as instruction that promoted language development, was predicted by characteristic features of the lessons—not features of the classroom. (Jacoby & Lesaux, 2017)

### Language Acquisition

| Home Language Proficiency | • The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school. In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis. ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills. In light of research linking proficiency in the home language with achievement in English language skills and content learning, dual-language instruction appears to be more effective than transitional-bilingual education, although the advantage is limited to the facilitation of home-language verbal expression associated with the dual-language model (Murphy, 2014) |
| English Language Proficiency | • Grounded in sociocultural theory, this study uses an ecological approach to examine how student interactions within a dual-language school context may offer affordances for increased linguistic and conceptual understanding. Using qualitative analysis of student discourse, this paper focuses on data from recorded interactions between pairs of fifth-grade students engaged in writing activities (in English and Spanish). Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009) |
| • The impact of California’s transitional kindergarten program on Spanish-speaking dual language learners was examined through two studies. Participants in the two studies included: (1) the statewide population of students who met study inclusion criteria (n = 45,010) and took the California English Language Development Test (CELDT), and (2) a sample of students (n = 1868) in 20 school districts. Findings indicate that TK had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social–emotional skills or executive function. The transitional |
kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry, as compared to Spanish-speaking dual language learners who do not attend. (Holod et al., 2020)

- This study examined the relationship between verbal short-term and working memory, language experience, and English tense-marking skill in Spanish L1-English L2 dual language learners (DLLs). Ten Spanish-English DLLs, in kindergarten and first grade, participated in the study. Children completed the Test of Early Grammatical Impairment, a narrative retell task in English, and verbal memory tasks. Parents provided information regarding language input and output in the home and school environment. Correlational analyses were conducted to examine relationships between English and Spanish input/output, forward and backward digit span, assessed in English and Spanish, and the accurate and productive use of English tense morphemes in various linguistic contexts. Study outcomes indicated varied use of English tense morphemes among DLLs. Additionally, a strong, positive association was found between the use of a variety of distinct tense forms and verbal working memory performance. This study is the first investigation to examine verbal short-term and working memory and home language experience to advance our understanding of the specific child internal and external factors that may account for the variability in tense marking during English second language acquisition. This research provides further insight to the effects of individual differences on the acquisition of second language grammatical skill during childhood. (Jenkins & Anderson, 2021)

- This study investigated the vocabulary development of children (N = 547) from linguistically and socioeconomically diverse classrooms in Germany from age 3 in preschool to age 7 in Grade 1. The results showed that for dual language learners (DLLs, n = 107) growth rates in their German majority language skills varied over classrooms. Compared to monolingual children, DLLs improved faster in classrooms with higher peer level skills in the majority language than DLLs in classrooms with lower peer-level skills (controlling for socioeconomic status and classroom quality). DLLs showed stronger growth dynamics than monolingual children during later preschool stages. The findings highlight the role of preschool peers in DLLs’ acquisition of the majority language before entering elementary school. (Schmerse, 2021)

Maintaining Home Language

- Grounded in sociocultural theory, this study uses an ecological approach to examine how student interactions within a dual-language school context may offer affordances for increased linguistic and conceptual understanding. Using qualitative analysis of student discourse, this paper focuses on data from recorded interactions between pairs of fifth-grade students engaged in writing activities (in English and Spanish). Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009)

- The study examined the contributions of Spanish and English oral narrative skills to English reading among 95 early elementary dual
language learners (DLLs) from Spanish-speaking homes in the United States. This sample of first- and third-grade DLL children attended Spanish–English dual language immersion programs and received language and literacy instruction in both English and Spanish. All participants completed a storytelling task in both languages and two English reading tests in decoding and reading comprehension. The story narratives were analyzed for microstructures (number of different new words, lexical diversity [D], mean length of utterance, subordination index [SI]) using the Computerized Language Analysis program. The narrative sample were also evaluated for macrostructures (i.e., discourse-level features) using the Narrative Scoring Scheme. Grade, English D, and Spanish SI significantly predicted English reading. Grade level was the strongest predictor of the three for both decoding and comprehension. However, Spanish SI was more robust than English D for decoding whereas English D was a stronger predictor than Spanish SI for comprehension. Young DLL children’s oral narrative skills in English as well as in their home language Spanish contributed to their English reading outcomes. The results also implicated that maintaining young DLL children’s home language skills may be beneficial, rather than harmful, to their English reading development. (Huang et al., 2022)

- The present study examines the multilingual benefit in relation to language learning and mathematical learning. The objective is to assess whether speakers of three or more languages, depending on language profile and personal histories, show significant advantages in language learning and/or mathematical learning, and whether mother tongue literacy can be associated with their performance in Math and English language tests. Participants are all multilinguals with knowledge of French as an L1 or as a non-native language. Three core groups were examined: (a) School multilinguals (n = 449), typically French L1 speakers with knowledge of two additional languages learned in a formal school context; (b) Multilinguals with Literacy in the home language (n = 45) and Multilinguals without Literacy in the home language (n = 113). All participants were given a Maths test, an English language test and a questionnaire. A questionnaire for parents was also used. Results suggest a positive role of mother tongue literacy in language learning as well as mathematical learning. (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018)

- Purpose of this paper is to discuss how languages other than English (LOTEs) can be used to help emerging bilingual children, whether they are in English medium or bilingual programs. Regardless of program model, bilingual learners always have all of their linguistic resources available to them. These resources form a unified and inseparable whole that is the foundation of a powerful form of cultural capital that can, and should, be leveraged to accelerate and enhance learning (Bourdieu, 1991). Our research indicates that adherence to these guidelines in Spanish–English bilingual education settings results in significant language and literacy achievement for Spanish–English Bilingual learners (Hopewell & Escamilla, 2013; Soltero-González et al., 2012, 2016; Sparrow et al., 2014). We cannot and should not teach them as if they were monolingual English speakers and/or if the LOTE is irrelevant to literacy acquisition. (Escamilla et al., 2021)

- The present study investigates how changes in both Spanish and English proficiencies of Latino, second-generation immigrant children (n = 163) from kindergarten to second grade relate to instructional program type as well as language use at home and school. A series of MANCOVAs demonstrated significant dual language gains in children who were in bilingual classrooms and
schools where Spanish was used among the teachers, students, and staff. Furthermore, only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education. (Collins, 2014)

Language Development

- This study tested the impact of child-directed language input on language development in Spanish–English bilingual infants (N = 25, 11- and 14-month-olds from the Seattle metropolitan area), across languages and independently for each language, controlling for socioeconomic status. Language input was characterized by social interaction variables, defined in terms of speech style (“parentese” vs. standard speech) and social context (one-on-one vs. group). Correlations between parentese one-on-one and productive vocabulary at 24 months (n = 18) were found across languages and in each language independently. The results also suggest cultural effects on language input and language development in bilingual and bicultural infants. (Ramírez-Esparza et al., 2017)

- The present study examined the following research questions: (1) What teacher behaviors and student-level characteristics predict student achievement? (2) Do teacher behaviors moderate the relationship between language acquisition models and English Learners’ achievement? Sources of data in this study consist of student demographic variables and reading achievement for 995 students and classroom observation data using the Classroom Assessment Scoring System collected across 46 classrooms in an urban school district in Wisconsin. Hierarchical linear modeling was used to address the research questions. A two-level hierarchical linear modeling analysis revealed that prior achievement, Hispanic and African American ethnicity, and eligibility for free lunch contributed significantly to the model, but gender did not. Teachers contributed markedly to student reading outcomes when they (1) incorporated student perspectives into instruction; (2) promoted autonomy and responsibility; (3) provided instructional opportunities to support higher level thinking; and (4) applied instruction to real-life applications. Cross-level interactions indicate that emotional warmth was particularly salient for English Learners in dual language immersion, whereas instructional support moderated the relationship between developmental bilingual education and reading achievement: Findings from the present study suggest that developing teachers’ emotional warmth and instructional support is particularly salient for teachers of English Learners, who must possess qualities associated with good teaching, both in general (such as content knowledge and pedagogical skills) and, more specifically, for English Learners (proficiency in bilingual education methods). (Lopez, 2012)

Personal Development

Sense of Identity

Personal Perception

- What seems to be missing from the current discussion is the voice of bilingual speakers, that is, how they manage life with two languages and if they perceive a cognitive, social or economic advantages or indeed, disadvantages of knowing two languages more than one language. Tytus reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. All 92 participants agreed unanimously that knowing a second language is advantageous. Knowing two languages is beneficial in (3) personal (personal development,
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning New Things and Learning Additional Languages</th>
<th>Identity Formation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Drawing upon sociocultural theories of learning and social constructivist theories of identity development, this article defines learning and identity as outcomes of participation in order to investigate how an emergent bilingual in elementary school, Roselyn, has opportunities to participate in school-based activities and how these structured shifts in her learning and identity. Drawing upon a unique data set that aligned 18 months of student interviews with student observations, findings indicate how Roselyn’s shifts in participation lend insight to how she was able to construct identities of herself as a learner in general, and more specifically as a Latina language learner. (Collett, 2019)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- This article explores the interactional co-constitution of identities among two first-grade students learning Spanish as a third language in a Spanish-English dual language classroom. Drawing on ethnographic and interactional data, the article focuses on a single interaction between these two “Spanish learners” and two of their Spanish-speaking classmates that took place within the context of a classroom literacy event. Their identity formation always took place within the context of joint social activity—in the presence of and in relation to their classmates. By focusing in depth on a single example of classroom interaction, the researchers’ purpose has been to illustrate the intersubjective back-and-forth dynamic that was central to identity formation among these particular children. There is a larger context at play here, and attention to how individual speech events such as this one connects with other speech events across time and space (Wortham &amp; Reyes, 2015) is necessary if we are to more fully understand the itineraries of identity (Bucholtz et al. 2012) that students like Alicia and Malik envision, enact, resist, and pursue in their everyday interactions. Researchers maintain that this particular focus on classroom talk—at this particular level of granularity—is warranted precisely because of how this single classroom interaction both reflects and helps constitute larger interactional patterns and broader social structure. (Martínez et al., 2017)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- In this article, we briefly review the literature on cross-cultural outcomes for students in TWI programs and highlight a consistent focus on the self in these studies, particularly as it relates to student identity. As cross-cultural competence begins with awareness of the self within the socially and culturally diverse classrooms that TWI provides, we assert that scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence. (Feinauer &amp; Howard, 2014)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- This study explores the interplay between early reading, identity, and bilingualism. Reading identities, or understandings about what reading is and whom one is as a reader, have been linked to reading achievement and the development of reading skills. This exploratory study provides a description of the reading identities of three dual language learners in prekindergarten. Data include child-centered interviews, child and classroom observations, teacher interviews and a family questionnaire. Methods centered on the use of child-oriented data collection protocols, and the inclusion of children in the interpretation of their own work and language. Through the exploration of three cases, this study documents the ways that reading identities were constructed, taken up and expressed by the participants. This study provides evidence that dual language learners are actively constructing ideas about reading, bilingualism/ biliteracy, and whom they are as readers as they learn to read. These findings show that framing early reading</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
in an identity perspective presents opportunities to look more holistically at the language and reading practices of dual language learners as they learn to read and navigate two or more languages at home and school. (Collett, 2019)

- Identity formation is one of the key components of adolescence and linguistic identity is critical to that process. For English learners to reach higher levels of achievement, they had to see themselves as high achievers in the first place—and in their first language. To achieve this, they focused on shifting to an asset based mindset, with the long term goal of turning the transitional bilingual education program into a dual language program. Students reported that being bilingual is a big part of their identity. Morton has embraced bilingualism as part of the school’s collective identity (Barrera et al., 2020).

- This study used interview and audio data to examine ways in which adolescents reported learning about themselves, language and its learning and others through participation in an extracurricular high school program for Spanish-dominant English language learners (English Learners) and English-dominant Spanish language learners (SLLs). Findings suggest the program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. Patterns of learning were largely consonant with students’ sociolinguistic positioning in schools as language minority or majority speakers. (A. Kibler et al., 2014)

- Emergent bilinguals’ engagement and participation with learning is closely connected to the identities they are able to construct in this learning. Drawing upon Holland, Lachiotte, Skinner & Cain’s (1998) framework of how identities are shaped across figured worlds, and Nasir & Hand’s (2006, 2008) notion of practice-linked identities in school-based contexts, the model identifies the ways in which three components—context, subject positioning, and agency—play a critical role in how emergent bilinguals in a Spanish-English dual language, elementary school program begin to construct identities with learning and language. In juxtaposing the experiences of two emergent bilinguals, data highlights how these students used language in novel ways to assert a level of agency to become active participants in school-based activities. (Collett, 2018)

- Identities are dynamic, constantly shifting processes of self-understanding mediated by local and institutional repertoires, behaviors, resources and enacted through one’s positioning in practice. Data from a study of emergent bilinguals in elementary school is used to understand how learners’ identities are shaped during the nascent years of school. This paper argues that certain methodological approaches should be used to research the identities of young emergent bilinguals. Specifically, data must document four components of learning and identity as represented in Figure 2. These components include the learners’ positioning across interactions; access to tools, resources and/or artifacts; access to agency and subject positions to act; and reflections of this dynamic. Identities though are also mediated by the cultural practices, social norms, storylines of the larger community and institutions in question. Findings complicated Oscar’s presented identity (Nasir, 2010) as a quiet and passive learner who faced academic struggles to become proficient in English, but nonetheless gravitated towards the language. While initial classroom observations did reflect these characteristics, in using varied approaches, data revealed a student who used his bilingualism in thoughtful and proficient ways to
support his academic growth. Findings indicate how multiple approaches must be used to understand the bidirectional relationship language learning holds with identity development. Interviews need to align with observations to provide a more complete interpretation of learners’ behaviors. Multiple interview approaches should be used, and observations need to document interactions outside the classroom context. By triangulating interviews with observations across school-based activities, and in using multiple cycles of analysis, revealed the tensions in Oscar’s identities with learning and language as a fifth-grade, emergent bilingual. (Collett, 2020)

- This ethnographic case study explores the dynamic and fluid development of one African American student’s bilingual/biliterate identity through her enrollment in a Spanish-English Dual Language Education program. Researchers integrated the frameworks of identity in interaction and monoglossic and raciolinguistic language ideologies to understand how this student approached her Spanish language and literacy development from kindergarten to grade 5. The study documents the fluid nature of the focal student, Tamara’s, identity as she journeyed from a Spanish enthusiast in kindergarten who embraced her emerging bilingualism/biliteracy to a student who seemed to question her identity as Spanish literate person. Tamara’s journey reveals that African-American students like her DLE programs with already rich, flexible linguistic repertoires along with the openness and capacity to extend those repertoires Tamara employed the relational process of adequation, downplaying differences among her and her peers’ language practices and racialized identities and instead foregrounding their similarities as friends with emerging bilingual capacities According to a sociocultural perspective, when African-American students’ emergent bilingual/biliterate identities are affirmed across home and school contexts, by parents, peers, and teachers, like Ms. Padilla, who adopt a heteroglossic ideologies, those identities can flourish. Researchers extend this call by suggesting that DLE programs must carve out space and dedicate resources to address underlying biases and ideologies with their learners as a part of their bilingual/biliterate development. (Bauer et al., 2020)

- The children of immigrants are the fastest growing population in U.S. schools at the same time there is increased anti-immigrant discourse, creating a unique linguistic ecology for its students. These multinational, multilingual, and multicultural students often encounter mononational, monolingual, and monocultural ideologies in their schools and communities. The result is that potentially hybridized learning contexts turn into sites of struggle for continued positive multilingual identities and investments. This multiple case study implemented surveys and interviews to explore the factors that contribute to the high multilingual investment of three self-identifying Mexican students residing in the U.S. Findings indicate that strong family relationships, formal coursework in Spanish, as well as a strong ethnic identity as Mexicans are interrelated factors that contribute to their high multilingual investment. Dual language education is a powerful factor, but formal Spanish courses at the secondary and post-secondary level are also equally strong contributors when dual language education is not available. (Babino & Stewart, 2019)

Personality

- Personality, cognitive strategies, and metalinguistic skills are important factors related to the acquisition and use of language (Michael and Gollan 2005).

- “I am me; my personality does not change depending on the words I speak. Yet, languages act like filters, exaggerating or...
downplaying different sides of my character. I become more direct or carefree depending on the language I am speaking." “For me, learning language is not about memorizing a dictionary, it’s a way of building self-confidence, self-awareness, and community” (Hobson, 2021)

### Home Language Importance

- Language is the foundation for all learning, including interpersonal communication, reading, writing, and the core content we expect children to know. Children’s language also mirrors what they know, and how they categorize information and conceptualize their world. How children respond, talk, read, and/or write also signals their readiness for various skills and content learning. Language is, in fact, the most effective means through which we assess children’s abilities and knowledge base. The MT is the primary means through which a child makes sense of her world and connects with others—learning new words and vital content. While dialoging, she observes and engages in meaning-making, learns about proxemics (the physical distance she is expected to maintain, which varies from culture to culture), and develops communication strategies (e.g., turn-taking and conversation entry prompts). Without continued use of the MT, a child feels lost, uprooted Low self-esteem and identity crises are rampant, and often lead to a high drop-out rate—all of which bode badly for a nation with an aging population that is dependent on this generation. So we must make every effort to stop failing our children—and use of the MT and a mathematical language-building-blocks approach could be just the solution (Pandey, 2014)

- Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, positive self-concept, a negative self-concept is detrimental to learning, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child. (Caraballo & Martinez, 2019)

- Maintaining home language appears to strengthen students’ sense of self and to increase educational motivation among adolescents (Lee et al., 2021; Zarate, Bhimji, & Reese, 2005)

- In addition to language background, students' culture must be considered in designing a successful dual language program. In order to support student success, Cummins' (1979, p. 240) states the school program must be geared to the needs of individual children if they are to attain an additive form of bilingualism involving fluent literacy skills in L1 and L2. If the process of instruction is to be meaningful it must reflect the child's cultural experiences and build upon his competencies (Tran et al., 2015)

### Motivation

- This study presents a structural relationship model that integrates English language learners’ motivation with their online self-regulation. Two questionnaires, Online Language Learning Motivation (OLLM) and Online Self-regulated English Learning (OSEL), were developed and administered to 293 Chinese university students. The results indicated that OLLM consists of five factors, namely online language learning experience, cultural interest, instrumentality-promotion, instrumentality-prevention, and others’ expectations. Meanwhile, OSEL is composed of six factors: goal setting, time management, environment structuring, help seeking, task strategies, and self-evaluation. The path analysis revealed that students with a positive future image of their language learning and an intrinsic interest in English culture tended to have better self-regulatory capacity in online learning environments. Learners with positive online learning experiences tended to be more flexible and independent in their self-regulatory learning process. Related pedagogical implications are discussed, such as
motivating learners to visualize a successful future self, improving their inherent interest in learning English, and designing more effective online tasks. (Magid & Chan, 2012)

• This article advances a framework for early language and literacy development among young English language learners (English Learners). A dual language book project undertaken in partnership with a local elementary school provides a context within which to address children’s need to negotiate language, culture, and identity as they transition and make meaning from their home language (L1) to English and the language of school (L2) and back. Using objects of cultural and personal relevance that the children brought from home, stories of ‘Family Treasures’ were generated from the original telling in the L1 into English in small-group contexts, transcribed, illustrated, and uploaded to a Web site for permanent sharing, rereading, and exchange. These booklets also provided an opportunity for identity formation, pride of family and culture, and the acquisition of rudimentary technology skills, which all work to motivate and engage young learners in the development of early literacy. (Roessingh, 2011)

Cultural Awareness

• This issue of TESOL Quarterly examines the equity challenges and promises of dual language bilingual education (DLBE) for students learning English as an additional language Research reported in this issue documents the pride, joy, and multilingual capacities of children and their families, as well as the possibilities for DLBE when we hold programs accountable for bilingual outcomes and avoid “equity traps.” A two-way Spanish-English program in the midwestern United States, where Mariana Pacheco and Colleen Hamilton aimed to transform the discourses that typically oppress Spanish-speaking bilingual students and their languages. Framed by theories of bilanguaging love (Mignolo, 2012), careful ethnographic detail foregrounds Latinx students’ unique sensitivities developed from their borderland perspectives and experiences; we see how bilingual students supported their peers, showcasing an awareness of bilingual/linguistic challenges and empathy for others—capacities not often reciprocated or recognized by their teachers. (Dorner & Cervantes-Soon, 2020)

• Results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)

• Much of the debate regarding outcomes of various types of dual-language program has focused on linguistic and academic results, and with good reason: improving the educational outcomes of language minorities and supporting societal multilingualism are vital goals. More rarely explored, however, are these programs’ ethnolinguistic outcomes: the ways in which they provide students with insights into themselves, language, language learning processes and others. This study uses interview and audio data to examine ways in which adolescents reported learning about themselves, language and its learning and others through participation in an extracurricular high school program for Spanish-dominant English language learners (English Learners) and English-dominant Spanish language learners (SLLs). Findings suggest the program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. (A. Kibler et al., 2014)
This article discusses the importance of cultural awareness knowledge for teachers who teach Spanish to native speakers. The article is taken from a study that investigated pedagogical content knowledge, subject matter knowledge, and cultural awareness knowledge. The results of the survey suggest that it is important for teachers to make cultural connections with their students. The results also suggested that teachers perceive cultural awareness knowledge is important to effective teaching as well as interpersonal knowledge as defined by Collinson (“Becoming”). Additionally, The attitudes and beliefs that teachers have towards minorities, towards non-prestige languages, toward poverty, have an effect on how teachers teach (see Ennis, Cothran, and Loftus; Hollingsworth; Hoy and Murphy, 2001; Nespor). Hancock quotes Brown in saying that research suggests that empathy, the capacity to relate emotionally to someone else, may contribute to the success of language learners (2). In order to be an effective and successful teacher, that teacher must know her/his students intimately. The teacher must be able to talk about each individual student's strengths and weaknesses and be able and willing to do whatever it takes to ensure that student's academic success (Ellison, 2006).

Bilingual learning affects attitudes and beliefs about language learning and other cultures. Language learners develop a more positive attitude toward the target language and/or the speakers of that language. Lipton’s surveys (2004) comprise a series of studies that demonstrate, among other factors, that children who have studied a world language develop a sense of cultural pluralism (openness to and appreciation of other cultures) and have an improved self-concept and sense of achievement in school. The ability to easily switch between languages makes children feel competent, and it increases self-esteem (Rubio, 2007). Appreciating international literature, music, and film. Translation is subject to the interpretation of the translator. The world’s literary and artistic works have been written in various languages. Some elements do not have equivalents in other languages. Increasing understanding of oneself and one’s culture. Viewing one’s value system through the eyes of others is, put simply, valuable. Monolingual views of the world limit the perspective. There are aspects of one’s life and culture that are accepted as universal truths until another way of thinking has been encountered. (Tochon, 2009).

In this educational and societal context, this study examines how English Learners view their imagined English Learner identities and communities through their drawings and written descriptions. The findings yield insights into the purposes, orientations, and dispositions of EFL learners, their beliefs about imagined English-speaker identities, and their awareness of the broader global, intercultural context. Concentrating on the transformation in the relational aspect of English Learner identity, the study discusses the weight and affordances of English and its relation to English Learners’ imagined English Learner identity and further demonstrates their language and cultural awareness in the globalized setting. (Ahn, 2021).

The current research investigated the effects of cultural awareness on listening comprehension and listening motivation of EFL learners. The results of one-sample t-test, one-way ANOVA, and the post hoc Sceffe test showed that the experimental classes outflanked the control class in the posttest of listening motivation and listening comprehension. The results indicated that the subjects showed a positive attitude toward having cultural awareness in their English learning process. The outcomes of the study provide some implications for teachers to increase the students’ cultural awareness and to enhance their positive attitudes about the...
integration of culturally based resources into language education. (Kamaeva et al., 2022)

- Research has shown that dual-language programs for elementary age students and newcomer centers for recent immigrant arrivals at the secondary level are effective in fostering student academic success, linguistic growth, and multicultural understanding. (Lucido, 2019)
- Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000).

Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children. (Amorsen, 2015)

| Self Confidence | | |
|-----------------|-----------------|
| **Attitudes**   | • In this study, IEP students of various proficiency levels and L1 backgrounds described their attitudes toward the institutional English-only policy at an intensive English program associated with a large U.S. university. Data were collected through a survey (n = 158), interviews (n = 6), and focus groups (n = 4). Positive attitudes included feeling that the English-only policy helped students to improve their English proficiency, prepare them for the high demands of using English proficiency in real-world interaction, and demonstrate respect for other students and teachers who cannot understand their first. Several aspects of the policy were perceived negatively, including the ways teachers dealt with students speaking their L1 outside the classroom, methods of punishment that could impact students’ grades, the unconditional character of the policy that denied learners their agency, and the lack of systematic implementation. Based on these findings, suggestions are provided for designing institutional environments that could more effectively maximize target language use rather than demoralize learners. (Shvidko, 2017) |
| **Self Confidence** | • One of the notable behaviors of individuals during the teaching of foreign languages is the use of the first language as an integral part of the learning-teaching process. The aim of this study is to determine the reasons why secondary-school students in Kazakhstan feel the need to use their first language (Kazakh or Russian) in foreign language classes where they are studying English. According to the findings, students avoid the use of the foreign languages they study; have motivation problems; have a fear of being criticized by teachers; have a fear of being teased by classmates; tease their friends; and don’t believe in themselves enough. It is therefore necessary to take measures to increase the self-confidence of students; and a more English-speaking environment should be established. (Gumilev, 2020) |
| | • This qualitative study investigated a CBSSL program in which L2 Spanish learners at an urban university served as weekly teaching assistants at a local dual-language elementary school. Data were collected from 55 reflective blog entries, two focus group sessions, and interviews with four teaching assistants. The L2 Spanish learners reported that the experience supported their language acquisition by (1) providing oral language practice outside of class, (2) facilitating linguistic self-confidence, (3) fostering metacognitive reflection, and (4) transforming motivation and attitudes. (Baker, 2018) |
| | • The purpose of the present study is two-fold. First, the present study examines statistical similarity between the integrative and instrumental orientation and Self-Determination Theory subtypes of motivation using chi-square invariance test. Second, based on
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• This paper begins with a discussion of some of the key insights of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>recent sociocultural research that consider bilingual children and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>learning to read and culminates in a discussion of Syncretic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literacy Studies (SLS). It then presents data from an ethnographic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>study that focused on the learning experiences of a small group of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year Three Bangladeshi-heritage pupils during 1 year of their</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>schooling in order to problematize some of the claims made in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>recent sociocultural work and in SLS, particularly the focus on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>children’s agency. The findings from the study suggest that there</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>are limits to children’s agency that are not recognized in recent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>work and in SLS; (b) that identity has an important role to play:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>children can successfully mask what they cannot do as readers in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>order to present a particular identity in the mainstream classroom;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and (c) that the access some children have to mediators may be</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>limited and can change over time. (Walters, 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This qualitative study investigated a CBSL program in which L2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish learners at an urban university served as weekly teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assistants at a local dual-language elementary school. Data were</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>collected from 55 reflective blog entries, two focus group sessions,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and interviews with four teaching assistants. The L2 Spanish learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reported that the experience supported their language acquisition by</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) providing oral language practice outside of class, (2) facilitating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>linguistic self-confidence, (3) fostering metacognitive reflection,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and (4) transforming motivation and attitudes. (Baker, 2018)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Critical Consciousness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• In this essay, researchers call for programs to adopt vernacular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>forms of Spanish, including translanguaging practices, in bilingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and biliteracy instruction in order to meet the needs of Spanish-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>speaking students and combat deficit language ideologies and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>practices. From a critical pedagogical perspective, deliberate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>inclusion of vernacular Spanish (and translanguaging) in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bilingualism and biliteracy is an ideal means to develop critical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>consciousness for students in DLBE, which can serve to combat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the results of the chi-square invariance test, the present study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>further investigates the structural relationships among factors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>affecting second language achievement. Results of the structural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>analyses demonstrate that intrinsic motivation was the strongest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>determinant of learners’ self-confidence and motivation to learn a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>second language. It is also found that intrinsic motivation was only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>indirectly related to second language achievement through the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mediating effects of motivation and self-confidence. (Pae, 2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This study examines the interrelated issues of private and public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>domains of self-esteem, ethnic identity formation, and bilingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>confidence among youth of a minority group in a city in western</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada. The results confirm the importance of ethnic identity on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>minority youth’s global self-esteem. Self-confidence with bilingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>proficiency has a great effect on Chinese Youth’s global, academic,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and social self-esteem. (Wen-shya, 2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This paper considers speakers’ differing degrees of self-confidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in their bilingual abilities and their effects on reported language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>use and observed patterns of language choice. One hundred and twenty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>individuals from New Zealand’s four largest Pasifika communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samoan, Cook Islands, Tongan and Niuean reported on their self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>confidence in both their community language (CL) and English, and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>on the basis of these responses, five speaker types are distinguished.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The findings show how analyses based on speakers’ self-confidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in bilingual abilities provide a community-friendly tool for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>describing patterns of language use and explaining the effects of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>social variables on language proficiency. (Starks, 2005)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
deficit language ideologies, and aligns to the proposal of critical consciousness as the fourth goal of DLBE. We offer recommendations for teacher educators and DLBE practitioners. (Freire & Feinauer, 2022)

- Researchers argue that centering critical consciousness—or fostering among teachers, parents, and children an awareness of the structural oppression that surrounds us and a readiness to take action to correct it—can support increased equity and social justice in TWDL education. Researchers elaborate four elements of critical consciousness: interrogating power, critical listening, historicizing schools, and embracing discomfort. Researchers describe how critical consciousness impacts and radicalizes the other three core goals, in turn supporting the development of more successful, equitable, and socially just TWDL schools. (Palmer et al., 2019)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Development</th>
<th>Social Network</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Networks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual students have larger social networks that can help them navigate both school and community contexts (Zhou &amp; Bankston, 1998)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits of knowing two languages: (1) sociocultural (e.g. ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world (Tytus, 2018)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This study examines how a two-way, dual language enrichment program for Spanish-language learner and English-language learner adolescents influenced students’ social networks with peers of different cultural and linguistic backgrounds. Results suggest that despite participants’ demographic differences, English Learner and Spanish Language Learner students in the dual-language program reported building new, strengthened, and mutually recognized relationships, particularly with students of different language backgrounds who worked together within long-term collaborative small groups. When students are provided with a carefully designed instructional and ecological context that provides authentic purposes for using language and building peer relationships, this research suggests that both English Learners and SLLs may be able to build linguistically integrated social networks. (A. K. Kibler et al., 2015)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Researchers examine dual language education as a means for promoting ethnically, racially, and linguistically diverse learning experiences. Dual-language schools can be incredibly effective at ensuring students of different backgrounds learn in the same classroom rather than just superficially enroll in the same school. By the very nature of dual language, students are often in a classroom with children of differing backgrounds. Dual language education can allow teachers to “position” students and families from diverse linguistic backgrounds as language and culture brokers for English-speaking peers and families (DeMatthews, Izquierdo, and Knight 2017; Lee, Hill-Bonnet, and Raley 2011; Palmer 2008). Being dual language helps to promote healthy multigenerational, multicultural, and multilingual communities, because it allows schools to connect with a historically marginalized community whose first language is not English as well as the grassroots organizations that are engaged in advocacy and community development work (Fránquiz, Salazar, and DeNicolo 2011; Wiemelt and Welton 2015). Dual-language education has the added advantage that the model makes racial and ethnic diversity a classroom asset, which in turn promotes even greater benefits on student learning and socialization. Dual language offers an avenue for districts interested in navigating these obstacles and can be an excellent way to concurrently foster
diversity in the classroom and improve a variety of social and academic outcomes for the entire student body. (Kotok & DeMatthews, 2018)

- Social network analysis has proved particularly useful in explaining why speakers in bilingual communities maintain or change their language behavior. An underlying assumption in this analysis is that language, particularly the first language or mother tongue, is an integral part of collective identities, such as national, ethnic, or cultural identities, and that maintenance of language across generations is a key factor to the maintenance of such identities. This article discusses the application of social network analysis to multilingual communities by taking a point of departure in the Filipino community in Oslo, the capital of Norway, with a view towards understanding linguistic and cultural maintenance. Results from the analyses provide support for the importance of social network in understanding language choice and cultural and linguistic maintenance; however, there were some notable exceptions. (Lanza & Svendsen, 2007)

- Advantages of being bilingual: Making lifelong friends. Bilingualism increases the number of people with whom one can interact. Interest in other cultures helps one connect deeply with other people around the world. (Tochon, 2009)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Perceptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Considerable research documents students’ outcomes in dual language (DL) programs, but there is little examination of students’ perceptions of bilingualism and its impact on students’ cognitive functioning and social relationships, especially with comparative studies across different target languages and student backgrounds. This study, which included a total of 788 fifth- through eighth-grade students who had participated in a Spanish-English (n = 645) or Mandarin-English (n = 143) dual language program, surveyed students’ language proficiencies, ratings of bilingualism, and social and cognitive functioning. Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual. (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Home Language Importance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of network ties rather than morphology of the network. A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer. This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks. This reciprocal relationship is simultaneously a force of assimilation and of dissimilation. Interpersonal networks are a concrete basis of both culture and social structure. Family, friends, and acquaintances reinforce the beliefs, arts, and institutions of a culture (Greeley, 1974; Yancy and Erikson, 1977) and transmit the advantages, aspirations, and opportunities of a social structure (e.g., Duncan, Haller, and Portes, 1971). Through their common basis in the</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
associations among people, the cultural and socioeconomic realms influence each other. (Mirowsky & Ross, 1984)

• This study investigates immigrant-native differences in the activities of adolescents 2 years after their sophomore year of high school. Despite their lower levels of human capital and lower previous academic performance, recent immigrants who arrive in the United States as adolescents are more likely than those who arrive earlier or those born in the United States to persevere in high school. Access to familial social capital and attitudinal measures help explain some of this effect. As for those who do leave school early, socioeconomic status and language background play a role in the activities respondents pursue. While recent immigrants are more likely to persevere in high school, once they leave they are no more likely to pursue additional education than their U.S. born counterparts. (White & Glick, 2000)

Peer Dynamics

• Employing a social capital framework, this study investigates teachers’ role in influencing the peer dynamics between English learners (ELs) and their non-EL peers. Peer nominations of friendships within the classroom were used to operationalize students’ same-language-status (bonding capital) and cross-language-status (bridging capital) friendships. Multilevel models reveal teachers’ reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners. For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall, and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships. (Johnson et al., 2020)

Sociolinguistic Awareness

• Because bilingual learners often interact with different language providers, they appear to develop sociolinguistic awareness more readily. They may better understand the arbitrary nature of language (Cook 1997) and that users employ language to communicate their mental states in various ways and for different purposes. (Mohr et al., 2018)

• Other advantages of learning another language can include the following: passing on part of one’s heritage to children, bridging generations and improving communication within the family and with the extended family, building international links, experiencing two cultures, being able to compare values and worldviews, and becoming biliterate (Marcos, 1998).

Relationships with Family and Friends

Social Benefits

• Bilingualism generates social benefits like reduced discrimination, improved self-esteem, and stronger cross-group relationships (Cho, 2000; Wright & Tropp, 2005)

Peer Relationships

• Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S. Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs. Results highlight the different beneficial roles of Cantonese and English proficiency on positive self, peer acceptance, and prosocial behavior (He et al., 2022)
• In the present investigation, we recorded and described the naturalistic free play of four dual language learners (DLLs) and compared their interactions to those of four English-speaking children. Findings indicate that DLLs play and talk with peers less frequently, interact in less sustained and positive ways, and are more reliant on teachers to support their play than their English-speaking peers. Implications for scaffolding DLLs’ play in classrooms and for future research are presented (Dominguez & Trawick-Smith, 2018)

• Employing a social capital framework, this study investigates teachers’ role in influencing the peer dynamics between English learners (ELs) and their non-EL peers. Participants include 713 students (211 English Learners). Observed teacher-student interaction quality and teacher self-reports of their peer network management were used to operationalize the teacher-directed, classroom-level factors. Peer nominations of friendships within the classroom were used to operationalize students’ same-language-status (bonding capital) and cross-language-status (bridging capital) friendships. Multilevel models reveal teachers’ reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners. For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall, and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships. (Johnson et al., 2020)

• This paper explores the idea that young children’s emergent literacy practices can be tools for mediating peer interaction, and that, therefore, literacy, even in its earliest stages, can support oral language development, particularly for emergent bilinguals. This paper offers a genetic analysis, or an analysis across time, of how students’ interactions with multimodal composing functioned as contexts for emergent bilinguals’ oral language development, and in particular, vocabulary acquisition. (Bernstein, 2017)

• Bilingual undergraduates may have closer friendships with other bilinguals than with monolinguals. This study investigated this hypothesis and explored the friendship features of 46 bilingual Spanish and English-speaking undergraduates by combining quantitative analyses of surveys and qualitative analyses of interviews. Survey results indicated that participants rated their friendships with bilinguals to be more secure, closer, and to provide more help and companionship than their friendships with monolinguals. During interviews, participants described understanding, connection, and identification with their bilingual friends. These features were considered reasons for their friendships with other bilinguals and reasons for their greater quality. Bilingual friendships also helped bilingual undergraduates navigate a challenging sociopolitical context and have pride in their ethnolinguistic identity. (Sebanc et al., 2009)

• This study investigates whether friendship quality, academic achievement and mastery goal orientation predict each other across the transition to middle school. Cross-lagged path analyses revealed a bidirectional and negative relationship between negative friendship quality and academic achievement across the transition to middle school. Positive friendship quality predicted mastery goal orientation decreases for girls. Both gender and bilingual status were analyzed and showed significant relations in our models. Results supported the social interaction perspective more than the social bonding perspective of friendship quality. (Sebanc et al., 2016)
| Bilingualism and Autism | | |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Bilingualism changes how people relate to others and lead their lives. This is particularly relevant in autism, where social interaction presents challenges. In the full sample, age negatively predicted social life quality scores while the number of languages known positively predicted social life quality scores. In the multilingual subset, age negatively predicted social life quality scores, while third language proficiency positively predicted social life quality scores. This is the first study describing the language history and social experiences of a substantial sample of bilingual and multilingual autistic adults. It provides valuable insight into how autistic people can learn and use a new language, and how their bilingualism experiences shape their social life. (Digard et al., 2020) |
| | Globally, there are more bilingual speakers than monolingual speakers; however, scant research evidence exists regarding social communication development and outcomes for bilingual children with autism spectrum disorder (ASD). This study employed a longitudinal cohort design to compare social and communication skills, at baseline and over 12 months, for 60 monolingual and 60 bilingual children with ASD receiving community based early intervention. Findings support the notion that there is no basis on which to discourage home language use with bilingual children with ASD. (Siyambalapitiya et al., 2022) |
| | There are concerns that social communication deficits among children with autism spectrum disorder may reduce the developmental benefits of early intervention for children with autism spectrum disorder raised in bilingual environments. Researchers conducted an exploratory analysis of cross-sectional and longitudinal data from a larger study to explore associations between home language environment and language ability and social skills in response to early autism spectrum disorder intervention. Significant language growth was exhibited by children from both language groups and there was no moderating effect of home language environment. The bilingual home group demonstrated increased gesture use over the course of intervention as compared with the monolingual home group. Preliminary data revealed no basis for concerns regarding negative impact of a bilingual home environment on language or social development in young children with autism spectrum disorder. (Zhou et al., 2019) |
| | The study investigated the effect of language intervention on equal numbers of participants (n=20) in both study groups, monolingual (English only) and bilingual (English and anyone of the Mother Tongue Language) children with Autism Spectrum Disorders, aged between 4.0 and 6.11 years, in Singapore. The results revealed statistically significant improvement in the developmental skills in both the study groups, but no significance was indicated between the groups. The study indicated that bilingual exposure in children with Autism Spectrum Disorders does not have any negative impact. (Sendhilnathan & Chengappa, 2020) |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family Relationships</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preserving the home language reduces cultural dissonance between children and parents, reinforcing parental authority and thus reducing behavior problems (Portes &amp; Hao, 2002; Portes &amp; Rumbaut, 2001)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000). A crucial step in supporting students who may be put at risk involves an understanding of, and respect for, the literacy activities of the family and communities in which the child lives. Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of their cultures can help to foster a sense of belonging and self-worth, which is crucial for their development. (Gay, 2000)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
of language enriches the classroom experience for all children. Involve linguistically diverse families in the literacy classroom. (Amorsen, 2015)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Competence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Effective peer interaction is fundamental to social development, cognitive development, and academic success. This study compares parent and teacher perspectives of children’s social competence (i.e., social skills and problem behaviors) and whether similarities and differences in perspectives are associated with children’s classification as an emergent bilingual or monolingual native English speaker. Findings indicate statistically significant differences in parent and teacher ratings on the empathy, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for bilingual children and on the empathy, self-control, internalizing, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for monolingual English-speaking children. (Baxter et al., 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This study investigated whether host and heritage cultural orientations were associated with Chinese preschoolers’ social competence and whether such associations varied across gender in Western contexts. Social competence was assessed using teacher reports on the Behavior Assessment System for Children-2 (BASC-2) with four composite scales: Externalizing, Internalizing, Behavioral Symptoms and Adaptive Skills. The results indicate that host culture has a stronger relationship with social competence than heritage culture, particularly for girls. (Ren &amp; Wyver, 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The current study examined whether bilingualism is associated with differences in children’s developing social knowledge. In line with previous research findings, results demonstrate that all children evaluated moral violations more harshly than conventional violations. Notably, however, bilingual children were more permissive of violations across moral, social, and language domains than monolingual children. These findings yield new insights into the role of early experience in the development of social knowledge. We propose that bilinguals’ unique linguistic and social experiences influence their understanding of moral and conventional rules. (Iannuccilli et al., 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This longitudinal study was conducted to gain understanding of the social–emotional and academic development of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children. Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development. In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were associated with later academic achievement and growth of English proficiency. Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism. (Oades-Sese et al., 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The aim of the present study was to examine the social behavior and competence of children, ages 3–6 as they progressed through the stages of second language acquisition in a dual-immersion program in English and Mandarin. Teachers’ evaluations of children’s social competence and behavior were collected at the beginning and end of the school year. Results suggest that girls had more social adjustment difficulties than boys. However, as language skills increased, adjustment difficulties decreased significantly among all children. (Soderman &amp; Oshio, 2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The main aim of this study was to examine whether language skills and emotion regulation are associated with social competence and whether the relationship between English skills and social competence is moderated by emotion regulation in Mandarin–</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
English bilingual preschoolers. The results show that positive emotion regulation, emotion dysregulation, English skills, and Mandarin skills were associated with different composites of the BASC-2; the relationships between English skills and Behavioral Symptoms were moderated by positive emotion regulation; and English skills and Adaptive Skills were moderated by emotion dysregulation. (Ren et al., 2016)

Attitudes

- The primary goal of this study was to explore the effect of language context on the socially withdrawn behaviors of school-age children who are English language learners (English Learners) from middle- to high-socioeconomic status (SES) backgrounds. Children and mothers in the English Learner group reported significantly higher ratings of shy behavior in English speaking versus native-language contexts, whereas unsociable ratings did not differ across language contexts. Shyness and unsociability are distinguishable behaviors in English Learner children, and researchers should consider these constructs when examining withdrawal. In addition, examining English Learner children’s behavior across language contexts provides a valuable method for investigating language-influenced behavioral problems. This study demonstrates the need for service providers to evaluate behavior across subtype and language context before pathologizing withdrawal in English Learner children. (Ash et al., 2014)

Social Flexibility

- Researchers explored the ability of children to adapt their communication to the needs of their communication partner. Monolinguals and bilinguals were equally helpful and informative. In contrast, only bilingual children adapted their level of ostension selectively between the two puppets. These findings point to the greater skills of bilinguals to adapt their communication accordingly. (Gampe et al., 2019)
- What are the collateral effects of using two languages on a regular basis? Does bilingualism have an impact on cognitive domains other than language, such as attention, mentalizing, and creativity? Here we discuss recent results by Ikizer and Ramirez-Esparza (2017), suggesting that bilinguals are more socially flexible than monolinguals. We argue that their arguments are not theoretically sound and that their observations are not compelling enough. (Vives et al., 2018)
- Is bilingualism better than monolingualism? Previous work shows that bilinguals have an advantage over monolinguals in cognitive flexibility, the ability to shift between different mental sets. In this study, researchers explore if bilingualism also provides an advantage in social flexibility, which we define as the ability to (a) switch with ease and adapt between different social environments and (b) accurately read social cues in the environment. Bilinguals reported higher social flexibility than monolinguals. Mediation analyses demonstrated that bilinguals’ social flexibility gave them an advantage over monolinguals in the self-reported frequency of social interactions. This study reports the first evidence of a social flexibility advantage of bilinguals, and it suggests that as bilinguals alternate between two languages, they might also alternate between two cultural worlds, providing tools to adapt to different social environments and facilitating the frequency of social interactions. (Ikizer & Ramírez-Esparza, 2018)
- Bilingual children are less influenced than monolinguals by language variety when attributing personality traits to different speakers, which could indicate that bilinguals have fewer in-group biases and perhaps greater social flexibility. In the present study, we investigated the social preferences of 5 year old English and
French monolinguals and English-French bilinguals. This results suggests that both monolingual and bilingual children have strong preferences for in-group members who use a familiar language variety, and that bilingualism does not lead to generalized social flexibility. (Souza et al., 2013)

### Economic Development

#### Cultural Awareness

**Global Cultural Awareness**

- With the growing emphasis on a competitive global economy, support is increasing for dual language programs (DLPs) geared toward preparing students in bilingual and multilingual education. (Gomez & Cisneros, 2020)
- This qualitative case study is focused on one high-performing urban elementary school that worked to address inequities within the school and community for two decades partly through dual language education. Key findings from this case highlight intersections between social justice leadership and leadership for school improvement that promote organizational innovation, learning, and sustainability. (DeMatthews & Izquierdo, 2020)
- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture. Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade.
- The purpose of this study is to investigate how a bilingual education program would protect the cultural inheritance, linguistic knowledge, ethnic and religious identity of minority peoples. This study utilized an explanatory sequential mixed method, conducted in two phases: a quantitative phase followed by a qualitative phase. Both quantitative and qualitative data reflected that a bilingual education program could increase the educational success of students and contribute to social justice including equal educational rights. Such as system might also increase brotherhood between different ethnic groups in society and perhaps resolve the conflicts among them. A bilingual education program for minority people is essential for equal access to education. It solves conflicts between different ethnic groups and brings happiness to the society. (Ozfidan & Toprak, 2020)
- The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)
- This paper attempts to define cultural globalization and cultural glocalisation in terms of cultural identity (CI) and language. To be an effective communicator in this multilingual world, people have to develop multilingual and multicultural competencies. (Tong & Cheung, 2011)

**Language Economics**

- Language educational economics is a newly developed field of study, born from the understanding that language educational policies have economic implications (Breton, 1998). Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and...
cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006). At a time of semi globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs. On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005).

- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.

### Labor Market

- Learning two language is beneficial economically (e.g. better job prospects and ability to grow professionally also in other countries) (Tytus, 2018)
- The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)
- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).
- Multilingualism is often framed as human capital that increases individuals’ labor market value. Such assertions overlook the role of ideology in assigning value to languages and their speakers based on factors other than communicative utility. This article explores the value assigned to Spanish-English bilingualism on the United States labor market through a mixed methods analysis of online job advertisements. Findings suggest that Spanish-English bilingualism is frequently preferred or required for employment in the US, but that such employment opportunities are less lucrative. The results suggest a penalty associated with Spanish-English bilingualism in which positions listing such language requirements advertise lower wages than observationally similar positions. Quantitative disparities and qualitative differences in the specification of language requirements across income levels suggest that bilingual labor is assigned value through a racial lens that leads to linguistic work undertaken by and for US Latinxs being assigned less value (Subtirelu, 2017)
- Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English, according to a study carried out by the Civil Rights Project at University of California, Los
Angeles (UCLA) and Educational Testing Service (ETS) (Gandara, 2015)
• Balanced bilinguals,” those who understand, speak, read, and write in both English and the language of the home: Earn more—$2,000-$5,000 annually compared to their English-only peers; Go to college at higher rates, which dramatically increases earnings; Have more social networks. (Gandara, 2015)
• Bilinguals may not always be paid more, but they often are and frequently get hired over monolinguals with similar credentials.” (Gandara, 2015)
• Ruben Rumbaut examined the effects of bilingualism on more than 6,000 young people in their mid to late 20s. He distinguished among limited, moderate, and fluent bilingual and non-bilingual people across a range of ethnicities. He found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased.
• Diana A. Porras, Jungeyon Ee, and Patricia Gandara surveyed almost 300 large, medium, and small businesses in California, across all sectors of the economy, asking employers whether they had a preference for hiring bilingual employees and if so, whether they compensated them for their language skills. Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred bilingual employees if their skills were comparable to those of monolingual employees. This confirmed that in California, bilingual employees are in high demand and have a hiring advantage over those who are monolingual.
• Researchers analyze the early occupational careers of fifty-eight second-generation young adults in Dalton, Georgia, a global carpet-manufacturing center. Researchers find intergenerational occupational mobility, with children of Mexican immigrants deploying human-capital skills to access better jobs than their parents. While bilingual skills play a critical role in the employment paths that members of the second generation have started to chart, their use of bilingualism is also shaped by gender dynamic in the workplace. (Hernandez-Leon & Lakhani, 2013)
• The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries. Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. “In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage.” (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)
• Although it is commonly thought that people who are bilingual have an advantage in the labor market, studies on this topic have not borne out this perception. The literature, in fact, has found an earnings penalty is associated with bilingualism—people who are bilingual often make less than people who are monolingual in similar jobs. (Gándara, 2015)
• This article presents the results of a 2014 survey of more than 2,100 U.S. employers on their requirements for multilingual employees. The survey found a significant discrepancy: On the one hand, 93% of respondents “value[d] employees who . . . are able to work effectively with customers, clients, and businesses from a range of
On the other, 66% of respondents reported identifying foreign language skills in the hiring process, 41% reported giving advantage to multilingual applicants, and only 10% of respondents indicated that new hires “needed to speak at least one language besides English.” In addition, the survey revealed employer characteristics related to demand for language ability: Industries with the greatest demand were government and public administration, information services, educational services, health care, and the administrative sector. Language skills were sought in combination with other skill sets, notably customer service, sales, vendor management, and marketing. The results are critical to educational programs seeking to understand the value of language in the job market. (Damari et al., 2017)

- Using structural topic modeling and critical discourse analysis, this study employs a raciolinguistic perspective to unpack the ideologies underlying the discourses in over 200 DL programs in a new Latinx South state of the United States. Our findings show that DL programs are promoted as a model that brings cognitive and employment benefits to its students. Moreover, private corporate power has a strong existence and influence on the establishment, staffing, and promotion of DL programs. (Sun & Wang, 2023)

- While English proficiency enhances labor market outcomes, its role in minority-language regions remains largely unexplored. Employing the U.S. Mexico border as a minority-language region, researchers analyzed whether English skills differently affect the earnings and occupational sorting of Mexican Americans along the border relative to their non-border peers. Researchers found comparable English deficiency earnings penalties for Mexican immigrants, suggesting that this group responds to English-specific regional wage gaps. US born men, however, have larger earnings penalty along the border, possibly reflecting natives’ relative immobility owing to strong geographic preferences. Occupational sorting exercises give credence to this interpretation for native Mexican American females. (Davila & Mora, 2000).

- English is often assumed to be a key to material success and social inclusion, and this belief commonly works to justify the global dominance of English, glossing over and rationalizing broader social inequalities. This paper extends the discussion of this fallacy of “the promise of English” to the domain of the South Korean job market, where skills in the English language play a major role in determining one’s access to white-collar jobs. Since the 1990s, different modes of English language testing have emerged as popular means for evaluating job applicants for Korean corporations, constantly upgrading the criteria for ‘good English’. (Park, 2011)

Maintaining Home Language

- Gandara notes a U.S. News & World Report article that argued that maintaining and teaching languages others than English will be key to the success of the nation’s schools in the coming century. “Equally Important, though, is the finding that transitional bilingual instruction that leaves behind the native language is not where the payoff is; it is in maintaining immigrant languages. (Gandara 2015)

Economic Success

- Prior studies have shown that children of Mexican immigrants face structural challenges that threaten to obstruct their economic success in young adulthood. They activated three resources in mobility promoting ways given the demographic, economic, and social characteristics of their community. The resources include parental support, advice and guidance from extrafamilial mentors, and bilingualism in English and Spanish.(Morando, 2013)

- A series of logistic and ordinary least squared regression analyses of the 2011–2015 American Community Survey (ACS) data shows that substantial differences exist across different ethnic groups.
among Asians. Bilingual advantages appear in most Asian groups when predicting both employment status and personal earnings, and the benefits tend to be more salient in the results of earnings analysis. The findings indicate that native-language literacy skill is a more momentous variable than the other variables in the model and that bilingual advantages stand out among Asian Indians and Chinese/Taiwanese more substantially compared to other Asians. Immense gender gaps also exist between Asian males and females in terms of economic well-being, and such gaps are more conspicuous in personal earnings than in employment status. (Ee, 2019)

- Working from a political economy perspective and drawing from current theoretical approaches to language and labor under neoliberalism, researchers examine the reproduction of the discursive trope of language profit in the corporate world and educational spaces, and then analyze the narratives and trajectories of young Latinx workers in New York. The marginalized position of Latinxs in the social structure and the racialization of their linguistic practice result in a linguistic exploitation that remains unchallenged in the US. Researchers conclude that today’s celebrations of bilingualism, which follow a capitalist logic, perpetuate a hierarchy of languages and speakers that is detrimental to racialized minorities. (Alonso & Villa, 2020)

Global Economy

- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.

- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.

- When you devalue home languages by, for instance, using just English with students who speak another language at home, you stifle learning and community engagement. Some language laws, like Arizona’s English-only law and Russia’s law banning instruction in minority languages like Bashkir and Tatar (effective September 1, 2013), silence students and jeopardize the success of entire communities. Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).

- With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills. (Rolon, 2005)

- Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words language mixing were explored. It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. (Close, 2017)

- Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the
fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to obtain information from a large number of sources and the multilingual world we live in) (Tytus, 2018)

- Now, a growing number of states also see bilingualism as key to accessing the global economy, as evidenced by the surging popularity of the “seal of biliteracy” — a special recognition for graduates who demonstrate fluency in two or more languages. (Corey, 2018)

- Lindholm-Leary (2001) argued that DLI programs have the potential to “eradicate the negative status of bilingualism in the U.S.” because they combine “maintenance bilingual education and immersion education models in an integrated classroom composed of both language majority and language minority students with the goal of full bilingualism and biliteracy”

- The benefits of bilingual education have long been characterized in terms of advantages for a global economy (Varghese & Park, 2010)

- Although aware of the pitfalls of this association, many (e.g., Krashen, as cited in Crawford, 2001; MacSwan, 1998; Tse, 2001) have attempted to emphasize the economic advantages of bilingual education by stressing the “great importance of bilingualism in our modern global community” (MacSwan, 1998, p. 9).

- “In an era of globalization, a society that has access to multilingual and multicultural resources is advantaged in its ability to play an important social and economic role on the world stage” (MacSwan, 1998, p. 7).

- Highlighting this perspective, bilingualism and bilingual education can be viewed as a way to serve students and nations in the inevitable move toward an interconnected multilingual world. (MacSwan, 1998).

- The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries. Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. "In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage.” (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

- To compete successfully in the global marketplace, both U.S.-based multinational corporations as well as small businesses increasingly need employees with knowledge of foreign languages and cultures to market products to customers around the globe and to work effectively with foreign employees and partners in other countries. Asia Society (2002) and National Geographic-Roper (2002) indicated that, compared with students in nine other industrialized countries, U.S. students lack knowledge of world geography, history, and current events. And shockingly few U.S. students learn languages that large numbers of people speak, such as Chinese (1.3 billion speakers) and Arabic (246 million speakers). The United States must create its own education response to globalization, which should include raising standards, increasing high school and college graduation rates, and modernizing and internationalizing the curriculum. (Stewart, 2006)

- America is so far utterly failing to produce a generation of global citizens. For parents who want to give their children global experience while keeping them safely on the
straight and narrow American path of PSATs, SATs, and stellar extracurriculars, there's an ever-growing field of options. Immersion schools have exploded over the past 40 years, growing from none in 1970 to 440 today, according to the Center for Applied Linguistics, and Mandarin, especially, is seen among type-A parents as a twofer: a child who learns Mandarin starting at 5 increases her brain capacity and is exposed to the culture of the future through language. (One mom in San Francisco laughs when she recalls that her daughter learned about Rosa Parks and the Montgomery bus boycott in Chinese.) (Miller et al., 2011)

• “Being a global citizen” is having strong interests in global issues, cultivating the understanding and appreciation of diverse values, and enhancing country’s competitiveness. All this however needs to be realized through communication in English, the world language. (Chen, 2011)

• Through comparative analyses of framing, keywords, spatial and temporal markers, actors, and legislative titles, we illustrate a discursive shift. While Proposition 227 presented bilingual education as a threat to children’s—and, by proxy, the nation’s—well-being (a language as problem orientation), Proposition 58 represents multilingual education as key to students’ future economic success and to the state and nation’s continued global economic advantage (a language as resource orientation). We argue that Proposition 58’s approach to “marketing” multilingual education may have contributed to its passing in November 2016, a result that we celebrate. At the same time, we raise questions about whether policies framed within one discursive regime (e.g., neoliberalism and global human capital) can eventually serve the aims of another (e.g., equity, plurality, and social justice), or whether discourse is destiny in policy making. (Katznelson & Bernstein, 2017)

• To thrive in a global economy and a multicultural society, US students need fluency in at least one language other than English. Research shows that multilingual societies have a competitive advantage over societies in international trade (Hilliwell, 1999). Economic success and security in the US depend on our ability to understand the information we gather. Many Americans need to interact regularly with people who are unlikely to know English. Not only does the omission of language and cultural education leave US students behind their peers in other countries, but also it exacerbates the achievement gap within the US. (Met, 2001)

• It might sound like a no-brainer that being bilingual or multilingual helps students planning engineering and just about any other career. But it is certainly true and is becoming more important the economies of nations become more intertwined. What's more being able to go beyond mere language ability and understand cultural distinctions are extra advantages. Students say that being bilingual gives them more options on campus and off (Galusza, 2007)

• In the current stumbling economy, job seekers are leveraging every qualification they can think of to sway potential employers. And with immigrants continuing to flood into New York, long the city of immigrants, and its suburbs, speaking a second language is a talent that matters in almost any field. In the global economy, American companies increasingly are realizing the benefits of a multilingual work force (Skomial, 2002)

• Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006).

• At a time of semi globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs.
On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005).

Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language:

- Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture. Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade. Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages. Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).

This article explores the strategies that three Latino families in the U.S. employed in raising their children bilingually in Spanish and English. It also looks at their rationale for bilingualism as well as the challenges the parents failed to anticipate in implementing their strategies. The data were gleaned from comparative case studies over a three-year period. The families wanted their children to be bilingual because they believed in the cognitive and economic advantages of bilingualism and that bilingualism would help maintain the families’ roots. (Rodríguez, 2015)

Although past research has found no real economic benefit for bilinguals in the U.S. labor market, the new research reviewed here comes to the opposite conclusion: Full literacy in another language brings substantial economic benefit. Moreover, the failure to nurture these linguistic skills in the children of immigrants exacts a cost to the earnings of these potentially bilingual/biliterate students. (Gándara, 2018)

Summary of Data by Research Question

The next step in this meta-analysis process is analyzing the data by each research question. To do this, I further sorted the data, making sure that the data included relates to the question. I annotated the data using bold type to note related findings.
### First Language Literacy Development

- Over 30% of children in the US are dual language learners who are learning two languages. Few have simultaneously examined development of skills in both languages for children in preschool. The purpose of this study was to examine the language and literacy skills in both Spanish and English in secondary data analyses of three studies of DLL children. Hierarchical linear model analyses compared acquisition of language skills in English and Spanish in three studies. Using language and time as nesting factors, these models allow for direct contrast of level and rate of acquisition across languages. **Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills.** (Hammer et al., 2020)

- The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school. In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis. **ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills.** (Murphy, 2014)

- Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S. Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs. **Multiple regression results show that both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. These effects remained significant even after controlling for students’ English speaking/writing proficiency. Moreover, both Cantonese and English writing proficiency were positively related to students’ classroom competence. Additionally, higher English**
### Maintaining Home Language

- Grounded in sociocultural theory, this study uses an ecological approach to examine how student interactions within a dual-language school context may offer affordances for increased linguistic and conceptual understanding. Using qualitative analysis of student discourse, this paper focuses on data from recorded interactions between pairs of fifth-grade students engaged in writing activities (in English and Spanish). **Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding:** 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009)

- The study examined the contributions of Spanish and English oral narrative skills to English reading among 95 early elementary dual language learners (DLLs) from Spanish-speaking homes in the United States. This sample of first- and third-grade DLL children attended Spanish–English dual language immersion programs and received language and literacy instruction in both English and Spanish. All participants completed a storytelling task in both languages and two English reading tests in decoding and reading comprehension. The story narratives were analyzed for microstructures (number of different new words, lexical diversity \([D]\), mean length of utterance, subordination index \([SI]\)) using the Computerized Language Analysis program. The narrative sample were also evaluated for macrostructures (i.e., discourse-level features) using the Narrative Scoring Scheme. Grade, English D, and Spanish SI significantly predicted English reading. Grade level was the strongest predictor of the three for both decoding and comprehension. However, Spanish SI was more robust than English D for decoding whereas English D was a stronger predictor than Spanish SI for comprehension. Young DLL children’s oral narrative skills in English as well as in their home language Spanish contributed to their English reading outcomes. The results also implicated that maintaining young DLL children’s home language skills may be beneficial, rather than harmful, to their English reading development. (Huang et al., 2022)

- The present study examines the multilingual benefit in relation to language learning and mathematical learning. The objective is to assess whether speakers of three or more languages, depending on language profile and personal histories, show significant advantages in language learning and/or mathematical learning, and whether mother tongue literacy can be associated with their performance in Math and English language tests. Participants are all multilinguals with knowledge of French as an L1 or as a non-native language. Three core groups were examined: (a) School multilinguals (n = 449), typically French L1 speakers with knowledge of two additional languages learned in a formal school context; (b) Multilinguals with Literacy in the home language (n = 45) and Multilinguals without Literacy in the home language (n = 113). All participants were given a Math test, an English language test and a questionnaire. A questionnaire for parents was also used. **Results suggest a positive role of mother tongue literacy in reading proficiency was positively associated with peer competence.** (He et al., 2022)
language learning as well as mathematical learning. (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018)

- The purpose of this paper is to discuss how languages other than English (LOTEs) can be used to help emerging bilingual children, whether they are in English medium or bilingual programs. Regardless of program model, bilingual learners always have all of their linguistic resources available to them. These resources form a unified and inseparable whole that is the foundation of a powerful form of cultural capital that can, and should, be leveraged to accelerate and enhance learning (Bourdieu, 1991). Our research indicates that adherence to these guidelines in Spanish–English bilingual education settings results in significant language and literacy achievement for Spanish–English Bilingual learners (Hopewell & Escamilla, 2013; Soltero-González et al., 2012, 2016; Sparrow et al., 2014). We cannot and should not teach them as if they were monolingual English speakers and/or if the LOTE is irrelevant to literacy acquisition. (Escamilla et al., 2021)

- This study investigates how changes in both Spanish and English proficiencies of Latino, second-generation immigrant children (n = 163) from kindergarten to second grade relate to instructional program type as well as language use at home and school. A series of MANCOVAs demonstrated significant dual language gains in children who were in bilingual classrooms and schools where Spanish was used among the teachers, students, and staff. Furthermore, only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education. (Collins, 2014)

**Home Language Importance**

- The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of network ties rather than morphology of the network. A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer. This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)

- Gandara notes a U.S. News & World Report article that argued that maintaining and teaching languages others than English will be key to the success of the nation’s schools in the coming century. “Equally Important, though, is the finding that transitional bilingual instruction that leaves behind the native language is not where the payoff is; it is in maintaining immigrant languages. (Gandara 2015)

- This article explores the strategies that three Latino families in the U.S. employed in raising their children bilingually in Spanish and English. It also looks at their rationale for bilingualism as well as the challenges the parents failed to anticipate in implementing their strategies. The data were gleaned from comparative case studies over a three-year period. The families wanted their children to be bilingual because they believed in the cognitive and economic advantages of bilingualism and that bilingualism would help maintain the families’ roots. (Rodríguez, 2015)

- Although past research has found no real economic benefit for bilinguals in the U.S. labor market, the new research reviewed here
comes to the opposite conclusion: **Full literacy in another language brings substantial economic benefit.** Moreover, the failure to nurture these linguistic skills in the children of immigrants exacts a cost to the earnings of these potentially bilingual/biliterate students. (Gándara, 2018)
How does participation in a dual language program impact the intellectual development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Idea</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Early Childhood Programs | - Young English-language learners still developing oral and literacy skills in their home languages benefit most from early-childhood programs that regularly expose them to both languages (Maxwell, 2013)  
- Supporting the home language, as well as English, is the best thing for young dual language learners (Maxwell, 2013) |
| English Learners with Disabilities | - The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth (Carrasquillo & Rodriguez, 2002; Paneque & Barbetta, 2006; Rodriguez, Parmar, & Signer, 2001)  
- For English Learners with disabilities to succeed in bilingual special education programs, they need to be part of a school that promotes bilingualism and provides students with exemplary instructional practices (Rodriguez, 2009) |
| General Cognitive Benefits/Advantages | - Results report multiple cognitive benefits of language study and bilingualism, particularly later in life, including enhancement of cognitive flexibility, higher cognitive reserve in advanced age, and delay in the onset of dementia (Fox et al, 2019)  
- Researchers have now identified cognitive advantages for bilingual children that include enhanced executive function of the brain, resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001; Diaz & Klinger, 1991); increased short term memory (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013); and enhanced problem-solving skills.  
- These advantages are explained in part by the bilingual brain’s greater flexibility and ability to exclude competing stimuli as a result of having to constantly distinguish between two or more languages (Gandara, 2015)  
- Bilingual individuals have higher cognitive abilities, mental elasticity, and metalinguistic awareness (August, Goldenberg, & Rueda, 2010)  
- Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)  
- Maintenance and development of language and literacy skills in one’s mother tongue (MT) plays a critical role in facilitating second language (L2) learning, developing additive bilingualism and continuous cognitive development (Mandillah, 2019) |
Numerous studies have demonstrated the bilingual cognitive advantage with regard to: (1) **metalinguistic awareness** (the ability to dissociate between meaning and form and explicitly talk about the language structure) (e.g. Bialystok et al. 2010); (2) **executive functions** (inhibition, switching/shifting, updating, monitoring) (see a summary by Dong and Li 2015); and (3) **cognitive reserve** (the protection mechanism against a cognitive decline related to elderly dementia and Alzheimer’s disease) (e.g. Schweizer et al. 2012).

MT use also enables children to expand their thinking—to engage in cultural ways of conceptualizing (i.e., bi/multicultural thinking), which is essential in this day and age), and thus fostering expanded cognitive skills or what some researchers term higher order thinking or executive functioning (Pandey, 2014).

Carlson and Metzoff (2008) found that bilingual kindergartners from low-income households—whose parents’ level of education is substantially lower than their monolingual, English-only peers—exhibit superior problem-solving skills. Such skills also enhance children’s memory, as well as their intercultural and interpersonal skills.

Metalinguistic awareness and cognitive control in two languages and in non-language related tasks have been reported as bilingual-specific advantages (Dillon, 2009).

A large number of studies (see reviews in Bialystok, 2005, and in Costa, Hernández, Costa-Faidella & Sebastián-Gallés, 2009) have shown that early bilingualism acquired through the family or the social community can positively influence cognitive development, particularly attentional and executive functioning, in children.

The positive impact of bilingualism has been observed over a variety of specific cognitive domains: for example, better flexibility in a symbol reorganization task (Peal & Lambert, 1962), superior performance at inhibiting distractors in a number concept task (Bialystok & Codd, 1997), superior symbolic representation and attentional inhibition skills in appearance–reality tasks (Bialystok & Senman, 2004).

In a study to determine to what extent bilingualism acquired through a second-language immersion education has positive cognitive effect, researchers compared an immersion group and a monolingual group of students. Participants included a total of 106 French-speaking eight-year-old children drawn from two language groups: 53 children enrolled in English immersion classes since the age of five years (the immersion group) and 53 children enrolled in monolingual French-speaking classes (the monolingual group). The two groups were matched for verbal and nonverbal intelligence and socioeconomic status (SES). They were administered a battery of tasks assessing attentional and executive skills. Results showed that the immersion group performed better (more specifically, faster) than the monolingual group on tasks assessing alerting, auditory selective attention, divided attention, and mental flexibility, but not on tasks assessing response inhibition, as predicted. However, contrary to our hypothesis, no difference was found between the two groups on the interference inhibition task. Already after a period of three years, an L2-immersion school experience produces some of the attentional and executive benefits associated with early highly proficient bilingualism, although possibly not for exactly the same reasons (Poncelet, 2012).

Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function,
memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed. The current study indicates that bilingual Turkish immigrants have better executive functioning and episodic memory compared to Turkish immigrant monolinguals. Whether this is due to the effects of bilingualism or reflects inherent cognitive abilities in those able to acquire bilingualism in later life remains to be resolved (Nielson, et al., 2019)

- In a study of enhanced cognitive control in low income minority children, researchers found no group differences in representation, the bilinguals performed significantly better than did the monolinguals in control. These results demonstrate, first, that the bilingual advantage is neither confounded with, nor limited by socioeconomic and cultural factors and, second, that separable aspects of executive functioning are differentially affected by bilingualism. The bilingual advantage lies in control but not in visuospatial representational processes. (Engel et al., 2012)

- The study provided the first credible evidence that rather than being a negative force, bilingualism might instead have significant positive outcomes. Although there were problems with the Peal and Lambert study (the language groups may not have been equivalent in socioeconomic status or intelligence and the measures were broadly based intelligence tests), the results created interest in the possibility that bilingualism could affect nonverbal cognition and that the effect could be positive (Bialystok et al., 2005)

- Paap, Johnson, and Sawi's (2015) review raises a number of methodological issues with the current literature concerning bilingualism and cognitive advantages in executive functions. While the review has focused on providing counterevidence to a positive relationship between the two, we think that what should be the single most important message may have gotten lost in the article: more work needs to focus on identifying and describing the causal link between bilingual experience and cognitive control, as opposed to work just reporting correlations between the two.

- Lifelong experience with multiple languages is believed to produce a number of executive function advantages including enhanced top-down control, improved attention, and greater working memory capacity. More specifically, the control that is required to select the relevant from the irrelevant language in any given context is believed to require cognitive control, and practicing this control leads to enhanced executive functioning. (Grundy & Timmer, 2016)

- The paper summarizes research showing that bilingualism affects linguistic and cognitive performance across the lifespan. The effect on cognitive performance is to enhance executive functioning and to protect against the decline of executive control in aging. Memory tasks based primarily on verbal recall are performed more poorly by bilinguals, but memory tasks based primarily on executive control are performed better by bilinguals (Bialystok, 2009)

- The key difference between bilinguals and monolinguals may be more basic: a heightened ability to monitor the environment (Bhattacharjee, 2012)

Cognitive Flexibility

- The researchers highlight the parallels in these constructs, arguing that bilinguals may be uniquely receptive to growth mindset interventions due to their increased cognitive flexibility. (Grote et al., 2021)

- Barbu et al. (2018) showed that high frequency switchers (HFLSs) outperformed low-frequency switchers (LFLSs) on a
mental flexibility task but not on alertness or response inhibition tasks. The aim of the study was to replicate these results as well as to compare proficient (HFLSs and LFLSs) to a control group of monolingual participants. Two groups of proficient bilingual adult (30 HFLSs and 21 LFLSs) and a group of 28 monolinguals participated in the study. The results showed superior mental flexibility skills in HFLSs compared to (LFLSs) and monolinguals; furthermore, the two latter groups showed no difference in mental flexibility skills. These results provide novel support for the hypothesis that the so-called bilingual advantage is, in fact, a result of language-switching habits (Barbu et al., 2020)

- Recent studies have proposed that the executive advantages associated with bilingualism may stem from language-switching frequency rather than from bilingualism per se (see, for example, Prior and Gollan, 2011).

### Protection from Dementia/Alzheimer’s

- Knowing a second language is: Cognitive/enriching’ (e.g., a challenge/training for the brain, which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease, an ability to express oneself in more ways along with an ability to notice/think differently and to widen horizons (Schweizer et al. 2012)

- Carlson and Metzoff (2008) found that bilingual kindergartners from low-income households—whose parents’ level of education is substantially lower than their monolingual, English-only peers—exhibit superior problem-solving skills. Such skills are associated with a lower incidence of Alzheimer’s and dementia.

- The initial age of cognitive decline did not differ between language groups. The influence of bilingualism appears to be reflected in increased GMV in language and EF regions, and to a lesser degree, in EF (Torres, et al., 2022)

- This paper evaluates evidence supporting the claim that bilingualism contributes to cognitive reserve. Four types of evidence are presented: (i) brain and cognitive function in healthy aging, (ii) age of onset of symptoms of dementia, (iii) relation between clinical level and neuropathology for patients, and (iv) rate of cognitive decline in later stages of dementia. In all cases, bilinguals revealed patterns that were consistent with the interpretation of protection from cognitive reserve when compared with monolinguals. (Bialystok, 2021)

### Literacy Skills

- One consistent finding in terms of the effects of reading in two languages has been the higher phonological awareness and processing ability found in biliterate- bilinguals with two alphabetic languages such as English and Spanish (Bialystok et al., 2005)

### Brain Research

- Gray matter volume was higher in language and EF brain regions among bilinguals, but no differences were found in memory regions (Torres, et al., 2022)

- A bilingual speaker’s brain has two active language systems even when he is using only one language. That creates situations in which one system obstructs the other. This interference turns out to be a blessing, not a handicap, because it forces the brain to resolve internal conflict, which gives the mind a workout that strengthens its cognitive muscles (Bhattacharjee 2012)

- Evidence from a number of studies demonstrates that “the bilingual experience improves the brain’s so-
executive function — a command system that directs the attention processes that we use for planning, solving problems, and performing various other mentally demanding tasks. These processes include ignoring distractions to stay focused, switching attention willfully from one thing to another and holding information in mind — like remembering a sequence of directions while driving.” (Bhattacharjee, 2012)

### Culture of Intellectualism

#### Attitudes

- DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual. There were significant group difference according to the target program model (90:10) vs (50:50), level of bilingualism, and whether students were native target language or English speakers (Cho et al., 2023)

- Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child (Cardenas, 1986)

- Importance of the native language: use of native language enhances learning, fund of language has a circular relationship with intellect, use of language for discovery. Failure to allow sufficient language development before the transition will result in a child's being unable to cope with anything but the most shallow levels of learning and will affect that child's future capability for learning. (Cardenas, 1986)

- “The extent to which a person develops his or her intellectual capacity depends greatly on the extent of language acquisition and use’(Cardenas, 1986)

### Executive Function of the Brain

#### Focus and Attention

- Researchers have now identified cognitive advantages for bilingual children that include enhanced executive function of the brain, resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001; Diaz & Klinger, 1991); increased short-term memory (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013); and enhanced problem-solving skills (Lauchlan, Parisi, & Fadda, 2013).

- Bilinguals show better executive function (a variety of more sophisticated processing including inhibition and decision-making) and metalinguistic awareness (knowing how language works) (Adesope et al. 2010).

#### Processing advantage

- Studies support a domain-general processing advantage (e.g., attention, recall, associations) in bilinguals (Barac et al. 2014) with greater accuracy, better reaction times on nonverbal tasks, more fluid switching, and stronger performances on working memory tasks (Ransdell et al. 2001), perhaps developing a specialized form of long-term working memory that can support reading and writing.

#### Working Memory

- Before correcting estimates for observed publication bias, the analyses revealed a very small bilingual advantage for inhibition, shifting, and working memory, but not for monitoring or attention. No evidence for a bilingual advantage remained after correcting for bias. (Antfolk et al., 2018)

- Study: (Anton, 2018) In this study the researchers explored the potential impact of bilingualism on executive functioning abilities by testing large groups of young adult bilinguals and
monolinguals in the tasks that were most extensively used when the advantages were reported. Researchers found no differences between groups in their performance. The evidence presented here indicates that the bilingual advantage might indeed be caused by spurious uncontrolled factors rather than bilingualism per se. Secondly, bilingualism has been argued to potentially affect working memory also. Therefore, these researchers tested the same participants in both a forward and a backward version of a visual and an auditory working memory task. Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions.

**Theory of Mind**

- These processing strengths indicate greater cognitive flexibility and may relate to increased cognitive reserve (Bialystok 2011). Being bilingual may also increase “understanding of other people, their mental and knowledge states” (Barac et al. 2014) or what is known as “theory of mind” (Goetz 2003).

**Brain Research**

- Bilinguals have been shown to have “increased density of grey matter in the left inferior parietal cortex” (Bialystok 2009, p. 3) that is more pronounced among those with more L2 proficiency.
- Simultaneous bilingual brains evidence more white matter density (in the anterior cingulate) than sequential bilinguals (Mohades et al. 2015).

**Executive Function Advantage**

- Study: Esposito 2022: Executive functions are positively correlated to both socio-economic status (SES, e.g., Nesbitt et al., 2013) and academic performance (for review, see Serpell & Esposito, 2016). The pattern of results supported an academic advantage for intermediate TWDL students. The advantage in executive functions was less robust, emerging for TWDL students in behavioral ratings but not in computerized measures. Using the behavioral rating measure of executive functions and a standardized measure of math performance, we did find evidence for executive functions as a mechanism supporting the academic advantage. While there were few differences between those in TWDL mainstream education in the computerized measures of executive functions, the behavioral rating measure revealed a significant difference between education models such that children in the TWDL program exhibited fewer indicators of executive dysfunction in the classroom. The difference was present at both the primary and the intermediate level. The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels.
- Attention difficulty is associated with poor performance on executive functioning (EF) tasks, yet EF is enhanced in bilingual children. Results from hierarchical regressions confirmed that both attention ability and bilingualism contributed to performance on the EF tasks. Attention ability was a stronger predictor for an inhibition task, namely stop signal, and bilingualism a stronger predictor for an interference task, namely flanker (Sorge et al., 2018).
- The extant research suggests bilingualism is associated with enhanced cognitive effects, most evident in attention and executive functioning (EF). This study examined the contributions of balance in the bilingualism (Spanish English) of children to performance-based measures and caregiver ratings of EF. Participants included 30 bilingual children. Balance in children’s bilingualism was correlated with caregiver ratings of task initiation. After controlling for demographic variables, balance in...
bilingualism significantly accounted for 37% of the variance in ratings of children’s task initiation (Weber et al., 2014)

- Socioeconomic status (SES) and bilingualism have been shown to influence executive functioning during early childhood. Study: Bilingualism moderated the effects of SES by ameliorating the detrimental consequences of low-SES on EF and self-regulatory behaviors. These findings underscore bilingualism’s power to enrich executive functioning and self-regulatory behaviors, especially among underprivileged children (Hartanto et al., 2019)

- Recent research suggests that bilinguals might exhibit advantages in several areas of executive function, including working memory, inhibitory control, and attentional control. Across three experiments, bilingual children exhibited superior performance on two different measures of visual–spatial memory, as well as measures of inhibitory and attentional control. These results suggest that bilinguals exhibit broad advantages in executive function during the preschool years, and these advantages are evident within a disadvantaged, low-SES population. (Grote, 2021)

- Bilingual children have been shown to outperform monolingual children on tasks measuring executive functioning skills. This advantage is usually attributed to bilinguals’ extensive practice in exercising selective attention and cognitive flexibility during language use because both languages are active when one of them is being used. Native bilingual children performed significantly better than monolingual children on the Stroop task, with no difference between groups on the other tasks, confirming the specificity of bilingual effects to conflict tasks reported in older children. These results demonstrate that bilingual advantages in executive control emerge at an age not previously shown. (Poulain-Dubois, 2010)

- Bilinguals' routine deployment of selective attention and inhibition in the domain of language is assumed to hone these executive processes to such an extent that far transfer of attentional control to non-linguistic domains ultimately occurs. Hence, bilinguals are expected to outperform monolinguals on non-linguistic executive functioning tasks. Links between bilingualism and executive functioning may, at least in part, arise because superior executive functioning is a cause rather than a consequence of bilingualism. Moreover, given that individuals tend to seek out environments and pursuits that best suit their cognitive strengths (Haworth et al., 2010), superior executive functioning might predict which individuals are likely to seek out language learning opportunities in the first place. (Kempe et al., 2015)

- However, bilinguals obtained higher scores than both groups of monolinguals on three tests of executive functioning: Luria’s tapping task measuring response inhibition, the opposite worlds task requiring children to assign incongruent labels to a sequence of animal pictures, and reverse categorization in which children needed to reclassify a set of objects into incongruent categories after an initial classification. This evidence for a bilingual advantage in aspects of executive functioning at an earlier age than previously reported is discussed in terms of the possibility that bilingual language production may not be the only source of these developmental effect (Bialystok, 2010)

- There is debate over the extent to which the unique experiences of bilingual children afford advantages in cognitive development. Our findings suggest that young bilingual children’s unique experiences lead to greater ability to use cognitive skills to engage in goal-directed behavior, when compared to
monolingual children. Therefore, bilingualism may have important influences on cognitive development that can help support children’s success in school and beyond. (Goodrich, 2022)

- Advanced inhibitory control skills have been found in bilingual speakers as compared to monolingual controls (Bialystok, 1999). After statistically controlling for these factors and age, native bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function better than both other groups. Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call for managing conflicting attentional demands (Conflict tasks); there was no advantage on impulse-control (Delay tasks). (Carlson, 2008)

| Executive Function Disadvantage/ No Advantage | This book examines the hypothesis that using two languages leads to the enhancement of domain-general executive functioning (EF) and argues that either the bilingual advantage does not exist or is restricted to very specific circumstances. The conclusion extends to situations where EF is referred to as self-control, self-regulation, self-discipline, attention-control, impulse control, inhibitory control, cognitive control, and willpower. **Empirical evidence does not support a bilingual advantage on EF that is distinguishable from zero.** This includes new data that compares tests of the bilingual advantage hypothesis based on self-reports of cognitive control to performance-based measures of EF (Paap, 2018)
- For verbal fluency, our analyses indicated a small bilingual disadvantage, possibly reflecting less exposure for each individual language when using two languages in a balanced manner (Antfolk et al.,)  
- Researchers conclude that the available evidence does not provide systematic support for the widely held notion that bilingualism is associated with benefits in cognitive control functions in adults. (Antfolk et al.,)
- Study: (Anton, 2018) In this study the researchers explored the potential impact of bilingualism on executive functioning abilities by testing large groups of young adults’ bilinguals and monolinguals in the tasks that were most extensively used when the advantages were reported. Researchers found no differences between groups in their performance. The evidence presented here indicates that the bilingual advantage might indeed be caused by spurious uncontrolled factors rather than bilingualism per se. Secondly, bilingualism has been argued to potentially affect working memory also. Therefore, these researchers tested the same participants in both a forward and a backward version of a visual and an auditory working memory task. **Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions.**
- One potential reason for discrepant findings across studies examining the bilingual advantage is the difficulty in matching monolingual and bilingual groups on important confounding variables that are elated to EF. **No effects of bilingualism were observed for performance-based measures of working memory or cognitive flexibility.** Results are discussed in the context of recent theoretical models of EF development in early childhood. (Goodrich, 2022).

| EF in Bilingual Children with Disabilities | Research in typically developing children has noted advantages for bilinguals in domains such as executive functioning and social skills, but less is known about the effects in ASD. **Our findings** |
indicate that the bilingual advantage in executive functioning may extend to children with neurodevelopmental conditions. (Ratto et al., 2020)
How does participation in a dual language program impact the educational development of English Learners?

### Educational Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reading Achievement</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized reading and mathematics tests (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students in DLE programs score similar to their statewide peers by about grade 5-7, if not sooner (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students in DLE programs achieve at or above grade level in reading tests measured in the partner language (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• DLE middle and high school students are more likely to pass the high school exit exam (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students who remained in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake student in English-only programs at about the 5th grade; by high school, the were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured, including English language arts scores and reclassification to English-proficient status (Gandara, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Research was conducted to compare former English Learners placed in GE settings and those who remained in DL classrooms on state tests in English Language Arts (ELA) and math (n = 99) at the middle-school level. In both subjects, <strong>DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification</strong>, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. <strong>GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests</strong>. Calling into question policies favoring placement of former English Learners in GE classes, the results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. (Torph &amp; Murphy, 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In this study, researchers used a quasi-experimental, longitudinal design to examine the English language arts (ELA) and mathematics test scores of emergent bilinguals (EBs) in DLBE 50:50 models versus English as a second language (ESL) models in Indiana over four academic school years. Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In North Carolina, <strong>DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level</strong> (Thomas &amp; Collier, 2012).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This pilot study compares the overall academic achievement in the area of language arts literacy among elementary bilingual students enrolled in either Dual Language: Two-Way Immersion programs or in an Early Exit, Transitional Bilingual program in a large urban public school district. By analyzing the results of curriculum-based...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
measures in the area of word decoding and overall reading comprehension, this study shows that students who have continuously enrolled in a Dual Language: Two Way Immersion Bilingual Program reveal higher academic achievement than students enrolled in an Early Exit, Transitional Bilingual program, from kindergarten to third grade (Nascimento, 2017).

- The objective of this short-term longitudinal study was to examine individual versus classroom peer effects of grit on later individual literacy achievement in elementary school. The current article found that classroom peer grit, not individual grit, was a strong predictor of individual literacy achievement 4 months later among dual language, largely Latina/o elementary school students. This study holds implications for educators of dual language learners who would be interested in the conclusion that grit’s role in literacy achievement may not lie solely in an individual’s character, but also in an individual’s classroom context among dual language learner elementary schoolchildren (O’Neal, 2018).

- Thomas & Collier have found that in the North Carolina districts with two-way, dual-language instruction, students score statistically significantly higher in reading in 4th grade than their nondual-language peers, a pattern that continues through 8th grade. By 5th grade, dual language students score about the same as their monolingual peers a grade ahead of them, an advantage that lasts through 8th grade. The same pattern plays out in math, with 5th-grade dual-language students scoring as high as non-program peers in 6th grade. Two groups of students are benefiting the most from dual language instruction: English language learners and African American students. For English learners in dual language programs, reading scores in all the tested grades are much higher than for English Learners who are not in a dual-language program, according to the study. (Maxwell, 2015)

- A new study from RAND Education and the American Councils for International Education in conjunction with the Portland Public Schools has examined the effects of dual-language immersion (DU) on student achievement. The study covered DU programs in Spanish, Japanese, Mandarin Chinese, Russian, and Vietnamese, and included two-way programs, where half the students in the program were native speakers of English and the other half native speakers of the partner (non-English) language. The study found that: Students randomly assigned to immersion outperformed their peers in English reading by about seven months in fifth grade and nine months in eighth grade. There was no statistically significant benefit, but also no detriment, for math and science performance. There were no clear differences in immersion effects by native language. Reading effects for students whose native language matches the classroom partner language appear as high as or higher than for native English speakers. There is suggestive but not statistically significant evidence that the immersion benefit in reading is higher for students in Spanish immersion programs, and that modest math benefits are higher for students in the less commonly taught languages (Japanese, Mandarin, and Russian). Immersion students have three-point lower rates of classification as English Language Learners (English Learners) by sixth grade, and this effect is larger (14 points) if students’ native language matches the classroom partner language. On average, immersion students reach intermediate levels of partner-language proficiency by eighth grade, with somewhat
higher performance in Spanish and Chinese (intermediate mid-to-high) than in Japanese (intermediate low-to-mid). (Burkhauser et al., 2016)

Math Achievement

- In this study, researchers present quantitative findings on the effects of English-Spanish dual language immersion on student achievement in science and mathematics in grades 3, 4, and 5. Dual language programs promote positive academic and social outcomes for all students and particularly for English language learners.

When put together well, dual language programs can have a profound impact on student outcomes. Clarkson (2007) writes that "the evidence that bilingual young people, relative to monolingual controls, show greater cognitive flexibility, creativity, divergent thought and improved problem-solving abilities, is very persuasive" (pp. 192-93). One effect of these cognitive advantages is increased academic achievement, including in mathematics and science. Several studies with students from different linguistic groups have noted improved mathematics achievement for bilingual students. (Tran et al., 2015)

- In this study, researchers used a quasi-experimental, longitudinal design to examine the English language arts (ELA) and mathematics test scores of emergent bilinguals (EBs) in DLBE 50:50 models versus English as a second language (ESL) models in Indiana over four academic school years. Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)

- In North Carolina, DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas & Collier, 2012).

- This article reports on a study that investigated achievement in math of third and fourth grade dual language immersion (DLI) students, building on research that has demonstrated the academic achievement of students who receive content instruction predominantly in the target language. This study expands the scope and methodology of prior research by including one-way programs in three languages (Chinese, French and Spanish) and two-way Spanish-English programs; and by relying on propensity matching to mitigate possible effects of school and student differences. In the third-grade study, researchers compared students’ math scores in relation to their English Language Arts (ELA) achievement to control for pre-existing differences between DLI and non-DLI students. DLI students who attained the same levels in ELA, and who received math instruction in a target language, performed at the same level as their non-DLI peers in third grade math tests given in English. For the fourth-grade study, we compared DLI students to a propensity-matched non-DLI group. DLI students grew more in math than their counterparts not in DLI. The results from this natural experiment indicate that students in a DLI program that has been implemented state-wide were able to succeed academically in math (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018)

- A new study from RAND Education and the American Councils for International Education in conjunction with the Portland Public Schools has examined the effects of dual-language immersion (DU) on student achievement. The study covered DU programs in Spanish, Japanese, Mandarin Chinese, Russian, and Vietnamese, and included two-way programs, where half the students in the program were native speakers of English and the other half native speakers of the partner (non-English) language. The study found that: Students randomly assigned to immersion outperformed their peers in English reading by about seven months in fifth
grade and nine months in eighth grade. There was no statistically significant benefit, but also no detriment, for math and science performance. There were no clear differences in immersion effects by native language. Reading effects for students whose native language matches the classroom partner language appear as high as or higher than for native English speakers. There is suggestive but not statistically significant evidence that the immersion benefit in reading is higher for students in Spanish immersion programs, and that modest math benefits are higher for students in the less commonly taught languages (Japanese, Mandarin, and Russian). Immersion students have three-point lower rates of classification as English Language Learners (English Learners) by sixth grade, and this effect is larger (14 points) if students’ native language matches the classroom partner language. On average, immersion students reach intermediate levels of partner-language proficiency by eighth grade, with somewhat higher performance in Spanish and Chinese (intermediate mid-to-high) than in Japanese (intermediate low-to-mid). (Burkhauser et al., 2016)

• Marian et al. (2013) investigated the academic achievement of students in grades 3, 4, or 5 (approximately ages 8–10 years), a portion of which were enrolled in a two-way dual-language program. They found an advantage in academic performance in math across all three grade levels and reading in 3rd grade.

• Watzinger-Tharp, Swenson, and Mayne (2018) examined growth in over 2000 4th grade students in either mainstream English education or a dual-language education model (comprised of both one-way and two-way models across three partner languages). In a matched-sample of mainstream and dual-language students, the dual-language students showed greater growth in math achievement across the 4th grade year.

Achievement Gap

• English Learners close the achievement gap with NES students in English-Only classrooms by about fifth grade (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)

• DLE middle and high school students are more likely to close the gap with NES peers by the end of high school (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)

• Ideally, English Learners would learn in communities where their culture and language are valued, such as dual language classrooms where content and language arts are taught both in English and Spanish. The benefits of such models include accelerated academic progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap (Oberg & Phillips, 2014)

• Research shows that long-term DL programs can close achievement gaps between English-proficient speakers and emergent bilinguals after five years, while short-term bilingual or English-only transitional programs close only about half of that gap (Collier & Thomas, 2017).

Academic Achievement Success

• Esposito (2020) that two-way dual-language education fosters executive functions similar to the advantage found in bilingual individuals and that well-developed executive functions are a mechanism for an academic advantage. The results did indicate that the academic advantage found on the standardized math assessment for children at the intermediate level of the TWDL program was mediated by executive functions behaviors exhibited in the classroom. The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels, yet the academic advantage was only present in the intermediate students.
• Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages (Gandara, 2015).

• Multiple studies indicate that children in bilingual education models (including dual-language and immersion models) have academic outcomes that match or even exceed those of their peers in mainstream education models, especially in later elementary grades (Esposito, 2020).

• Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics (Gomez et al., 2005).

• This longitudinal study was conducted to gain understanding of the social–emotional and academic development of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children. Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development. In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were associated with later academic achievement and growth of English proficiency. Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism (Oades-Sese et al., 2011).

• Employing a mixed-methods research design, this study examines how a newly designed dual language program in an urban school advances language proficiencies among Spanish-English bilingual 6th graders in relation to content area achievement as measured on NYS standardized tests in English Language Arts and Math. It further investigates how students’ emotional (school identification) and behavioral engagement (language learning commitment) relate to bilingual language proficiencies. The results drawn from both quantitative and qualitative data indicate that bilingual students benefitted from attending a dual language program. It contributes positively to students’ academic achievement, bilingual school identification and commitment to language learning. With respect to language development, the study found that English proficiency in productive skills was positively correlated with standardized test scores. Spanish proficiency was positively correlated with students’ commitment to language learning. Spanish and English languages play different but equally important functions in the dual language program. However, students, face challenges in sustaining learning the two languages in school; researchers show that students experience a gradual language shift from Spanish to English. The study underscores the potential benefits of a multilingual proficiency perspective theory among the students and in preparing bilingual teachers. (Bruitt-Griffier & Jang, 2022).

• Additional research finds that DL programming improves academic outcomes for traditionally under-served groups while fostering diverse learning environments for all learners. Students in DL programs outperform students who participate in non-DL programs (Palencia et al., 2021).

• Internationally, research shows the most powerful predictor of academic achievement for emergent bilinguals is the sustained development of the students’ home language through the school curriculum (Collier & Thomas, 2017). Within an asset-focused context, students have an opportunity to build linguistic capital, defined as “the intellectual and social skills attained through communication experiences in more than one language and/or style” (Yosso, 2005, p. 78).
Using a large longitudinal dataset including children who attended Head Start over two years, this study examined academic growth trajectories during the period between Head Start entry and kindergarten (2.5 years), and whether those growth trajectories differ by children's dual language learning status. Analyses comparing three groups of children (i.e., Spanish-English bilinguals, Spanish-English emergent bilinguals [EBs], and English monolinguals) showed three noteworthy findings. First, bilinguals entering Head Start with English proficiency showed similar developmental trajectories in vocabulary and math to those of monolinguals. Second, EBs entering Head Start with limited English proficiency presented the lowest baseline skills in vocabulary and math. Whereas the initial vocabulary gaps generally persisted over time, gaps in math between EBs and monolinguals narrowed by kindergarten. Third, no difference was found between bilinguals and EBs in their Spanish vocabulary development (Choi et al., 2018).

The purpose of this study was to analyze the effects of a two-way immersion elementary school program on academic achievement at the end of the elementary school and the end of the first year of junior high school. Longitudinal high stakes test data in reading, writing, and mathematics were collected on native English speakers and native Spanish speakers from the two-way immersion program and on matched controls through the use of an ex post facto quasi-experimental design. Findings suggest consistent support for the two-way immersion program over matched control students across all three achievement areas. It appears the greatest effect for native English speakers may be in reading, while native Spanish speakers may benefit more in writing and mathematics. (Cobb et al., 2006.)

When properly implemented, DLPs are an effective way to improve academic achievement for all students (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).

Data has demonstrated that DLPs have benefited both English Learners and native English-speaking students in obtaining higher levels of academic achievement in all areas, as compared to their counterparts in mainstream classrooms (Thomas & Collier, 2012).

In states with high numbers of English Learners, such as Arizona, implementing a two-way 50/50 model can be beneficial for the academic achievement of all students involved in such programs. (Gomez & Cisneros, 2020)

If the number of Latino students in your school is high, dual language programs can increase their academic achievement while also developing their biliteracy and bilingual skills (Gomez, 2005).

The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth. For English Learners with disabilities to succeed in bilingual special education programs, they need to be part of a school that promotes bilingualism and provides students with exemplary instructional practices. (Rodriguez, 2009)

This study assesses the long-term linguistic and academic outcomes associated with different bilingual language education models for low-income dual language learners (DLLs) residing in a bilingual, bicultural context. Two-way immersion models that support the home language and culture and integrate language majority and minority learners were associated with faster English acquisition, which mediated the link between Two-Way

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Learners with Disabilities</th>
<th>Language Acquisition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth. For English Learners with disabilities to succeed in bilingual special education programs, they need to be part of a school that promotes bilingualism and provides students with exemplary instructional practices. (Rodriguez, 2009)</td>
<td>• This study assesses the long-term linguistic and academic outcomes associated with different bilingual language education models for low-income dual language learners (DLLs) residing in a bilingual, bicultural context. Two-way immersion models that support the home language and culture and integrate language majority and minority learners were associated with faster English acquisition, which mediated the link between Two-Way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School/College Readiness</td>
<td>Immersion (TWI) programs and higher GPAs (Serafini et al., 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College Readiness</td>
<td>This causal-comparative study analyzed the college readiness of Latino English Learners educated in two different bilingual education programs, Transitional Bilingual (TB) and Dual Language (DL), by examining science and mathematics scores on the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the ACT. A statistically significant difference was found in the performance of the participants in the areas of mathematics and science via a series of t-tests. The descriptive statistics report that DL participants had a 29.6% higher probability in science and a 15.2% higher probability in mathematics of being college ready, per the Texas Uniform Admission Policy. Overall, DL participants outperformed TB participants. (Garza-Reyna, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>This study compared the performance of bilingual learners, educated in either a Transitional Bilingual (TB) or Dual Language (DL) program, on the Reading and English portions of the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the American College Test (ACT). A statistically significant difference was found on the t-tests run for the Reading (p &gt; .000) and English (p &gt; .000) portions of the ACT exam. Outlined in the Texas Uniform Admission Policy (TUAP) are recommended minimum scores students should meet in order to be deemed “college ready.” In the area of Reading, the TB comparison group (10.8%) had less than the DL comparison group (51.8%) meet the recommended minimum score outlined in the TUAP. Similar findings were found on the English portion of the ACT exam. A smaller percentage of participants in the TB comparison group (9%) meet the TUAP recommended minimum score for English than the DL comparison group (59.1%). By and large, DL participants outperformed the TB participants in this study. (Garza-Reyna et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The idea behind the immersion program is to get students from different backgrounds to work together while simultaneously aiding each other in communication. The benefits of a program include improved college readiness for all students involved -- not just the English Language Learners, who are largely Spanish speakers in the Crossroads, said Alejandro Mojica, the Victoria school district’s newly hired Bilingual and ESL Learning director. “Both groups of students would benefit from each other,” said Mojica, a Columbia native. &quot;Research shows that by the time they reach high school, these students are more college-ready than their peers who didn’t participate in an immersion program.” (Astraint, 2014).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary School Readiness</td>
<td>Young children learning two languages demonstrate school readiness factors: strong social-emotional development and “executive function” skills, such as listening and following directions (Ford, 2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>This study examined how parents, teachers, and administrators conceptualized dual-language immersion (DLI) education and its goals at Bobcat Canyon School (BCS, pseudonym), a private preschool in the Southwestern USA where 64% students were White and 36% were students of color. The analysis revealed that with a framework of neoliberal linguistic instrumentalism, the preschool conceptualized its DLI as an enriching context for students to obtain a cognitive, social, and academic edge. Cognitive development, social competencies, and school readiness were primary goals while bilingualism/biliteracy was a secondary bonus if achieved. (D. Chen, 2022)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The present study investigated school readiness in Brazilian (Portuguese-Japanese dual language learner or DLL) 5-year-olds in Japan (1) by examining their language skills, executive function (EF), and theory of mind (ToM) in comparison to their monolingual peers and (2) by investigating the developmental relations between these three skills. DLLs scored lower than monolinguals in Japanese language skills, specifically in receptive vocabulary and the understanding of complement clauses in Japanese. In conclusion, DLLs had school readiness difficulties in Japanese language skills and ToM, but not in EF, compared to their Japanese monolingual peers. Furthermore, the positive relationship of language and EF skills with ToM development, which is commonly reported in monolingual children, extended to an understudied population of DLLs in this study. (Sudo & Matsui, 2021)

Preschool is a critical period during which children's development and learning exert a long-lasting impact on their school adjustment and academic outcomes. Using multilevel modeling, this study examined the specific ways teachers use students' home language (Spanish) in their various verbal exchanges in the classroom (i.e., giving directions, requesting language, providing, and eliciting contextualized information, and providing and eliciting decontextualized information). These conversations with Latino DLLs, as measured by the Language Interaction Snapshot, uniquely contributed to students' language and social skills at the end of the Head Start academic year. Results revealed statistically significant relations between teachers' Spanish talk and DLLs' social outcomes. Specifically, teachers' Spanish talk with DLLs and DLLs' initial English and Spanish skills were positively associated with the latter's interactive peer play behaviors, whereas DLLs' initial English skills were negatively associated with their disconnected peer play behaviors. (Limlingan et al., 2022)

Researchers examined the school readiness skills of 217 Latino DLLs attending Head Start taking into account specific teacher characteristics that may impact the development of readiness skills. Different teacher characteristics have different effects on the developmental outcomes. Amount of training had a positive significant effect on several children's outcomes in English and in Spanish. The years of experience a teacher had working in classrooms with DLLs had a positive effect on children's English spelling skills. Teachers' cultural competency rating had a positive effect on receptive language and literacy in Spanish. (Ramírez et al., 2019)

Emerging research shows there is substantial heterogeneity in the English and Spanish language and literacy proficiencies of dual language learners (DLLs) in U.S. preschools. This work is extended in this paper by examining within-group variability in 320 Spanish-English speaking DLLs' cognitive, linguistic, literacy, and mathematics skills at the end of prekindergarten ($M = 5.22$ years old). Using latent profile analysis (a type of mixture modeling), four profiles of DLLs were identified. Most DLLs were classified as English Dominant, followed by Balanced Average, Spanish Dominant, and Balanced Low, respectively. In general, the Balanced Average profile outperformed the other profiles in English and Spanish, and their norm-referenced standard scores provide additional evidence that bilingual development is not associated with educational risk. (López & Foster, 2021)

Preschool Attendance

- Achievement gaps are already established when DLLs enter kindergarten without having attended a preschool program, such as being less able to recognize English letters, count to 20,
or write their names compared with their English-dominant peers (Ansari, 2018).

- Preschool attendance promotes the native or first language (L1) and the target or second language (L2; English) and literacy development (Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016; Phillips et al., 2017).
- Academic language and social-behavioral skills also increase when DLLs attend public preschool programs (Ansari & López, 2015).
- Gains in English proficiency, reading achievement and math performance have also been demonstrated (Halle et al., 2012).
- Attending formalized preschool environments can raise literacy and math scores for DLL children while reducing inequality in kindergarten (Barnett et al., 2020; Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016).

### Literacy Development

First Language Literacy Development

- Over 30% of children in the US are dual language learners who are learning two languages. Few have simultaneously examined development of skills in both languages for children in preschool. The purpose of this study was to examine the language and literacy skills in both Spanish and English in secondary data analyses of three studies of DLL children. Hierarchical linear model analyses compared acquisition of language skills in English and Spanish in three studies. Using language and time as nesting factors, these models allow for direct contrast of level and rate of acquisition across languages. **Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills.** (Hammer et al., 2020)
- The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school. In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis. **ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills.** (Murphy, 2014)
- Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S. Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs. **Multiple regression results show that both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. These effects remained significant even**
after controlling for students’ English speaking/writing proficiency. Moreover, both Cantonese and English writing proficiency were positively related to students’ classroom competence. Additionally, higher English reading proficiency was positively associated with peer competence. (He et al., 2022)

English Language Acquisition
- Researchers analyzed data on eight cohorts of English language learners who were each assigned to one of the four different instructional programs, using up to 10 years of data for each cohort. Researchers compared students in the four programs on three different outcomes: students’ English language acquisition (as measured by their performance on the California English Language Development Test); their academic performance and growth (as measured by their performance on the California Standards Tests in mathematics and English language arts); and their reclassification from English learner status to fluent English proficient status. In all programs, more than 80 percent of English Learners were proficient in English by the end of elementary school, and more than 90 percent were proficient by 7th grade. When possible, invest in high-quality two-language programs. Choose among two-language programs based on community and stakeholder voice. (Umansky, 2016)

English Literacy Development
- Over 30% of children in the US are dual language learners who are learning two languages. Few have simultaneously examined development of skills in both languages for children in preschool. The purpose of this study was to examine the language and literacy skills in both Spanish and English in secondary data analyses of three studies of DLL children. Hierarchical linear model analyses compared acquisition of language skills in English and Spanish in three studies. Using language and time as nesting factors, these models allow for direct contrast of level and rate of acquisition across languages. Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills. (Hammer et al., 2020)
- The current study reports on the results of a longitudinal investigation of the language and early literacy development of a sample of dual-language learners (DLLs) and monolingual English speakers from low-income families who received an Early Reading First intervention during their Head Start preschool year. A total of 62 children who entered and remained in the same school district were followed from kindergarten through 2nd grade. The results indicate that both the DLLs and monolingual English speakers in the study showed similar developmental trajectories on receptive vocabulary, story recall, decoding, and letter and word identification from preschool through the 2nd grade. Furthermore, at the end of 2nd grade, the 2 groups’ vocabulary, story recall, reading fluency, decoding, and letter and word identification performances were similar and within the normal range for children their age. The study’s findings suggest that a strong preschool language and literacy program can reduce the English language gap between DLLs and monolingual English speakers from low-income families. (Han et al., 2014)
- The current study explores variation in phonemic representation among Spanish-English dual language learners (DLLs, n = 60) who were dominant in English or in Spanish. Children were given a phonetic discrimination task with speech sounds that: 1) occur in English and Spanish, 2) are exclusive to English, and 3) are
exclusive to Russian, during Fall (age m = 57 months) and Spring (age m = 62 months, n = 42). In Fall, English-dominant DLLs discriminated more accurately than Spanish-dominant DLLs between English-Spanish phones and English-exclusive phones. In Spring, however, groups no longer differed in discriminating English-exclusive phones and both groups discriminated Russian phones above chance. Additionally, joint English-Spanish and English-exclusive phonetic discrimination predicted children’s phonological awareness in both groups. Results demonstrate plasticity in early childhood through diverse language exposure and suggest that phonemic representation begins to emerge driven by lexical restructuring. (Smith et al., 2022)

- Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S. Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs.

Multiple regression results show that both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. These effects remained significant even after controlling for students’ English speaking/writing proficiency. Moreover, both Cantonese and English writing proficiency were positively related to students’ classroom competence. Additionally, higher English reading proficiency was positively associated with peer competence. (He et al., 2022)

- This study examined the role of the language of vocabulary instruction in promoting English vocabulary in preschool Latino dual language learners (DLLs). The authors compared the effectiveness of delivering a single evidence-informed vocabulary approach using English as the language of vocabulary instruction (English culturally responsive [ECR]) versus using a bilingual modality that strategically combined Spanish and English (culturally and linguistically responsive [CLR]). Forty-two DLL Spanish-speaking preschoolers were randomly assigned to the ECR group (n = 22) or CLR group (n = 20). Thirty English words were presented during small-group shared readings in their preschools 3 times a week for 5 weeks. Multilevel models were used to examine group differences in post instruction scores on 2 Spanish and 2 English vocabulary assessments at instruction end and follow-up.

Children receiving instruction in the CLR bilingual modality had significantly higher posttest scores (than those receiving the ECR English-only instruction) on Spanish and English vocabulary assessments at instruction end and on the Spanish vocabulary assessment at follow-up, even after controlling for pre-instruction scores. The results provide additional evidence of the benefits of strategically combining the first and second language to promote English and Spanish vocabulary development in this population. Future directions for research and clinical applications are discussed. (Méndez et al., 2015)

To summarize the extant literature and guide future research, a critical analysis of the literature was conducted. A search of major databases for studies on young typically developing DLLs between 2000 and 2011 yielded 182 peer reviewed articles. First, the research shows that DLLs have two separate language systems.
early in life. Second, differences in some areas of language
development, such as vocabulary, appear to exist among DLLs
depending on when they were first exposed to their second
language. Third, DLLs’ language and literacy development
may differ from that of monolinguals, although DLLs appear to
catch up over time. Fourth, little is known about factors that
influence DLLs’ development, although the amount of language
exposure to and usage of DLLs’ two languages appears to play
key roles. (Hammer et al., 2014)

- The purpose of this study was to evaluate which aspects of the HLE
  significantly predict growth in English and Spanish vocabulary
  among Spanish-speaking DLLs. 944 Spanish-speaking DLLs
  (51.6% female; mean age = 53.77 months) completed assessments
  of English and Spanish vocabulary at 4 time points across 2
  academic years. Parents completed a survey of the HLE that
  included information on language exposure, reading exposure, and
  family reading habits. Results indicated that specific literacy-
  related practices, including availability of books in the home,
  language read to the child, and parental reading skills were
  significant predictors of growth in children’s Spanish and
  English vocabulary knowledge, even after controlling
  children’s initial level of language skills and family
  socioeconomic status. (Goodrich et al., 2021)

- Year 2 findings are reported from a longitudinal, experimental-
  control study involving 31 Spanish speaking preschoolers (aged
  38–48 months) randomly assigned to two Head Start classrooms. In
  Year 1, classrooms differed only in the language of instruction,
  with teachers using only Spanish in one classroom and only
  English in the other. In Year 2, an experimental transitional
  bilingual education (TBE) model was implemented, with English
  being gradually introduced in the TBE classroom until a ratio of
  30:70 English-to-Spanish was achieved, and Spanish being
  gradually introduced in the predominantly English (PE) classroom
  until a ratio of 70:30 English-to-Spanish was achieved. Year 2
  results were consistent with Year 1, with the TBE classroom
  exceeding the PE classroom on all Spanish measures of
  language and literacy development and no significant
  differences favoring the PE classroom. Results also indicated
  that Year 2 trajectories were conditional on first-year effects,
  suggesting that sustained growth in dual language learner’s
  early literacy may depend on early intervention among 3-year-
  old preschoolers. (Durán et al., 2015)

- The present investigation builds off prior empirical work to
  describe the quality of the language and literacy instruction Latino
dual language learning (DLL) children receive in Head Start.
Specifically, researchers measured the frequency and duration of
language and literacy lessons in classes that enrolled large numbers
of Latino DLLs. Researchers also investigated children’s
opportunities to participate in high-quality language end literacy
experiences as a part of their everyday instructional experience. In
total researchers observed 398 lessons in 20 classes. Results
revealed (a) that the frequency and duration of instruction was
variable, with some children enrolled in classes that implemented
language- and literacy-based lessons for 23 min (10%) of the 4-h
day and others in classes that fit in up to 82 min (34%) of
instruction per day; (b) when language and literacy instruction
occurred in these classes, it was most frequently delivered in a
whole group and featured an instructional style that was
characterized by the teacher directing the children to answer
basic questions with a one- or two-word response; and (c) that
high-quality instruction, which we operationalized as
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language Acquisition</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Home Language Proficiency</strong></td>
<td>The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school. In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis. <strong>ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills.</strong> In light of research linking proficiency in the home language with achievement in English language skills and content learning, <strong>dual-language instruction appears to be more effective than transitional-bilingual education, although the advantage is limited to the facilitation of home-language verbal expression associated with the dual-language model</strong> (Murphy, 2014).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Language Proficiency</strong></td>
<td>Grounded in sociocultural theory, this study uses an ecological approach to examine how student interactions within a dual-language school context may offer affordances for increased linguistic and conceptual understanding. Using qualitative analysis of student discourse, this paper focuses on data from recorded interactions between pairs of fifth-grade students engaged in writing activities (in English and Spanish). <strong>Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding:</strong> 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and <strong>suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English.</strong> (Martin-Beltran, 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The impact of California’s transitional kindergarten program on Spanish-speaking dual language learners was examined through two studies. Participants in the two studies included: (1) the statewide population of students who met study inclusion criteria (n = 45,010) and took the California English Language Development Test (CELDT), and (2) a sample of students (n = 1868) in 20 school districts. <strong>Findings indicate that TK had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social–emotional skills or executive function. The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry, as compared to Spanish-speaking dual language learners who do not attend.</strong> (Holod et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>This study examined the relationship between verbal short-term and working memory, language experience, and English tense-marking skill in Spanish L1-English L2 dual language learners (DLLs). Ten Spanish-English DLLs, in kindergarten and first</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
grade, participated in the study. Children completed the Test of Early Grammatical Impairment, a narrative retell task in English, and verbal memory tasks. Parents provided information regarding language input and output in the home and school environment. Correlational analyses were conducted to examine relationships between English and Spanish input/output, forward and backward digit span, assessed in English and Spanish, and the accurate and productive use of English tense morphemes in various linguistic contexts. Study outcomes indicated varied use of English tense morphemes among DLLs. Additionally, a strong, positive association was found between the use of a variety of distinct tense forms and verbal working memory performance. This study is the first investigation to examine verbal short-term and working memory and home language experience to advance our understanding of the specific child internal and external factors that may account for the variability in tense marking during English second language acquisition. This research provides further insight to the effects of individual differences on the acquisition of second language grammatical skill during childhood. (Jenkins & Anderson, 2021)

- This study investigated the vocabulary development of children (N = 547) from linguistically and socioeconomically diverse classrooms in Germany from age 3 in preschool to age 7 in Grade 1. The results showed that for dual language learners (DLLs, n = 107) growth rates in their German majority language skills varied over classrooms. Compared to monolingual children, DLLs improved faster in classrooms with higher peer level skills in the majority language than DLLs in classrooms with lower peer-level skills (controlling for socioeconomic status and classroom quality). DLLs showed stronger growth dynamics than monolingual children during later preschool stages. The findings highlight the role of preschool peers in DLLs’ acquisition of the majority language before entering elementary school. (Schmerse, 2021)

Maintaining Home Language

- Grounded in sociocultural theory, this study uses an ecological approach to examine how student interactions within a dual-language school context may offer affordances for increased linguistic and conceptual understanding. Using qualitative analysis of student discourse, this paper focuses on data from recorded interactions between pairs of fifth-grade students engaged in writing activities (in English and Spanish). Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009)

- The study examined the contributions of Spanish and English oral narrative skills to English reading among 95 early elementary dual language learners (DLLs) from Spanish-speaking homes in the United States. This sample of first- and third-grade DLL children attended Spanish–English dual language immersion programs and received language and literacy instruction in both English and Spanish. All participants completed a storytelling task in both
languages and two English reading tests in decoding and reading comprehension. The story narratives were analyzed for microstructures (number of different new words, lexical diversity [D], mean length of utterance, subordination index [SI]) using the Computerized Language Analysis program. The narrative sample were also evaluated for macrostructures (i.e., discourse-level features) using the Narrative Scoring Scheme. Grade, English D, and Spanish SI significantly predicted English reading. Grade level was the strongest predictor of the three for both decoding and comprehension. However, Spanish SI was more robust than English D for decoding whereas English D was a stronger predictor than Spanish SI for comprehension. Young DLL children’s oral narrative skills in English as well as in their home language Spanish contributed to their English reading outcomes. The results also implicated that maintaining young DLL children’s home language skills may be beneficial, rather than harmful, to their English reading development. (Huang et al., 2022)

• The present study examines the multilingual benefit in relation to language learning and mathematical learning. The objective is to assess whether speakers of three or more languages, depending on language profile and personal histories, show significant advantages in language learning and/or mathematical learning, and whether mother tongue literacy can be associated with their performance in Math and English language tests. Participants are all multilinguals with knowledge of French as an L1 or as a non-native language. Three core groups were examined: (a) School multilinguals (n = 449), typically French L1 speakers with knowledge of two additional languages learned in a formal school context; (b) Multilinguals with Literacy in the home language (n = 45) and Multilinguals without Literacy in the home language (n = 113). All participants were given a Maths test, an English language test and a questionnaire. A questionnaire for parents was also used. Results suggest a positive role of mother tongue literacy in language learning as well as mathematical learning. (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018)

• The of this paper is to discuss how languages other than English (LOTEs) can be used to help emerging bilingual children, whether they are in English medium or bilingual programs. Regardless of program model, bilingual learners always have all of their linguistic resources available to them. These resources form a unified and inseparable whole that is the foundation of a powerful form of cultural capital that can, and should, be leveraged to accelerate and enhance learning (Bourdieu, 1991). Our research indicates that adherence to these guidelines in Spanish–English bilingual education settings results in significant language and literacy achievement for Spanish–English Bilingual learners (Hopewell & Escamilla, 2013; Soltero-González et al., 2012, 2016; Sparrow et al., 2014). We cannot and should not teach them as if they were monolingual English speakers and/or if the LOTE is irrelevant to literacy acquisition. (Escamilla et al., 2021)

• The present study investigates how changes in both Spanish and English proficiencies of Latino, second-generation immigrant children (n = 163) from kindergarten to second grade relate to instructional program type as well as language use at home and school. A series of MANCOVAs demonstrated significant dual language gains in children who were in bilingual classrooms and schools where Spanish was used among the teachers, students, and staff. Furthermore, only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • This study tested the impact of child-directed language input on language development in Spanish–English bilingual infants (N = 25, 11- and 14-month-olds from the Seattle metropolitan area), across languages and independently for each language, controlling for socioeconomic status. Language input was characterized by social interaction variables, defined in terms of speech style (“parentese” vs. standard speech) and social context (one-on-one vs. group). Correlations between parentese one-on-one and productive vocabulary at 24 months (n = 18) were found across languages and in each language independently. **The results also suggest cultural effects on language input and language development in bilingual and bicultural infants.** (Ramírez-Esparza et al., 2017)
|• The present study examined the following research questions: (1) What teacher behaviors and student-level characteristics predict student achievement? (2) Do teacher behaviors moderate the relationship between language acquisition models and English Learners’ achievement? Sources of data in this study consist of student demographic variables and reading achievement for 995 students and classroom observation data using the Classroom Assessment Scoring System collected across 46 classrooms in an urban school district in Wisconsin. Hierarchical linear modeling was used to address the research questions. A two-level hierarchical linear modeling analysis revealed that prior achievement, Hispanic and African American ethnicity, and eligibility for free lunch contributed significantly to the model, but gender did not. **Teachers contributed markedly to student reading outcomes when they (1) incorporated student perspectives into instruction; (2) promoted autonomy and responsibility; (3) provided instructional opportunities to support higher level thinking; and (4) applied instruction to real-life applications.** Cross-level interactions indicate that emotional warmth was particularly salient for English Learners in dual language immersion, whereas instructional support moderated the relationship between developmental bilingual education and reading achievement: **Findings from the present study suggest that developing teachers’ emotional warmth and instructional support is particularly salient for teachers of English Learners, who must possess qualities associated with good teaching, both in general (such as content knowledge and pedagogical skills) and, more specifically, for English Learners (proficiency in bilingual education methods).** (Lopez, 2012) |
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the personal development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Development</th>
<th>Sense of Identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal Perception</td>
<td>• What seems to be missing from the current discussion is the voice of bilingual speakers, that is, how they manage life with two languages and if they perceive a cognitive, social or economic advantages or indeed, disadvantages of knowing two languages more than one language. Tytus reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. <strong>All 92 participants agreed unanimously that knowing a second language is advantageous. Knowing two languages is beneficial in (3) personal (personal development, learning new things and learning additional languages)</strong> (Tytus, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identity Formation</td>
<td>• Drawing upon sociocultural theories of learning and social constructivist theories of identity development, this article defines learning and identity as outcomes of participation in order to investigate how an emergent bilingual in elementary school, Roselyn, has opportunities to participate in school-based activities and how these structured shifts in her learning and identity. Drawing upon a unique data set that aligned 18 months of student interviews with student observations, <strong>findings indicate how Roselyn’s shifts in participation lend insight to how she was able to construct identities of herself as a learner in general, and more specifically as a Latina language learner.</strong> (Collett, 2019)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There is a larger context at play here, and attention to how individua speech events such as this one connects with other speech events across time and space (Wortham & Reyes, 2015) is necessary if we are to more fully understand the itineraries of identity (Bucholtz et al. 2012) that students like Alicia and Malik envision, enact, resist, and pursue in their everyday interactions. Researchers maintain that this particular focus on classroom talk—at this particular level of granularity—is warranted precisely because of how this single classroom interaction both reflects and helps constitute larger interactional patterns and broader social structure. (Martínez et al., 2017)
In this article, we briefly review the literature on cross-cultural outcomes for students in TWI programs and highlight a consistent focus on the self in these studies, particularly as it relates to student identity. As cross-cultural competence begins with awareness of the self within the socially and culturally diverse classrooms that TWI provides, we assert that scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence. (Feinauer & Howard, 2014)

This study explores the interplay between early reading, identity, and bilingualism. Reading identities, or understandings about what reading is and whom one is as a reader, have been linked to reading achievement and the development of reading skills. This exploratory study provides a description of the reading identities of three dual language learners in prekindergarten. Data include child-centered interviews, child and classroom observations, teacher interviews and a family questionnaire. Methods centered on the use of child-oriented data collection protocols, and the inclusion of children in the interpretation of their own work and language. Through the exploration of three cases, this study documents the ways that reading identities were constructed, taken up and expressed by the participants. This study provides evidence that dual language learners are actively constructing ideas about reading, bilingualism/biliteracy, and whom they are as readers as they learn to read. These findings show that framing early reading in an identity perspective presents opportunities to look more holistically at the language and reading practices of dual language learners as they learn to read and navigate two or more languages at home and school. (Collett, 2019)

Identity formation is one of the key components of adolescence and linguistic identity is critical to that process. For English learners to reach higher levels of achievement, they had to see themselves as high achievers in the first place—and in their first language. To achieve this, they focused on shifting to an asset based mindset, with the long term goal of turning the transitional bilingual education program into a dual language program. Students reported that being bilingual is a big part of their identity. Morton has embraced bilingualism as part of the school’s collective identity (Barrera et al., 2020)

This study used interview and audio data to examine ways in which adolescents reported learning about themselves, language and its learning and others through participation in an extracurricular high school program for Spanish-dominant English language learners (English Learners) and English-dominant Spanish language learners (SLLs). Findings suggest the program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnonlinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnonlinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnonlinguistic resources. Patterns of learning were largely consonant with students’ sociolinguistic positioning in schools as language minority or majority speakers. (A. Kibler et al., 2014)

Emergent bilinguals’ engagement and participation with learning is closely connected to the identities they are able to construct in this learning. Drawing upon Holland, Lachiotte, Skinner & Cain’s (1998) framework of how identities are shaped across figured worlds, and Nasir & Hand’s (2006, 2008) notion of practice-linked identities in school-based contexts, the model identifies the ways in which three components—context, subject positioning, and agency—play a critical role in how emergent bilinguals in a
Spanish-English dual language, elementary school program begin to construct identities with learning and language. In juxtaposing the experiences of two emergent bilinguals, data highlights how these students used language in novel ways to assert a level of agency to become active participants in school-based activities. (Collett, 2018)

- Identities are dynamic, constantly shifting processes of self-understanding mediated by local and institutional repertoires, behaviors, resources and enacted through one’s positioning in practice. Data from a study of emergent bilinguals in elementary school is used to understand how learners’ identities are shaped during the nascent years of school. This paper argues that certain methodological approaches should be used to research the identities of young emergent bilinguals. Specifically, data must document four components of learning and identity as represented in Figure 2. These components include the learners’: positioning across interactions; access to tools, resources and/or artifacts; access to agency and subject positions to act; and reflections of this dynamic. Identities though are also mediated by the cultural practices, social norms, storylines of the larger community and institutions in question. Findings complicated Oscar’s presented identity (Nasir, 2010) as a quiet and passive learner who faced academic struggles to become proficient in English, but nonetheless gravitated towards the language. While initial classroom observations did reflect these characteristics, in using varied approaches, data revealed a student who used his bilingualism in thoughtful and proficient ways to support his academic growth. Findings indicate how multiple approaches must be used to understand the bidirectional relationship language learning holds with identity development. Interviews need to align with observations to provide a more complete interpretation of learners’ behaviors. Multiple interview approaches should be used, and observations need to document interactions outside the classroom context. By triangulating interviews with observations across school-based activities, and in using multiple cycles of analysis, revealed the tensions in Oscar’s identities with learning and language as a fifth-grade emergent bilingual. (Collett, 2020)

- This ethnographic case study explores the dynamic and fluid development of one African American student’s bilingual/biliterate identity through her enrollment in a Spanish-English Dual Language Education program. Researchers integrated the frameworks of identity in interaction and monoglossic and raciolinguistic language ideologies to understand how this student approached her Spanish language and literacy development from kindergarten to grade 5. The study documents the fluid nature of the focal student, Tamara’s, identity as she journeyed from a Spanish enthusiast in kindergarten who embraced her emerging bilingualism/biliteracy to a student who seemed to question her identity as Spanish literate person. Tamara’s journey reveals that African-American students like her DLE programs with already rich, flexible linguistic repertoires along with the openness and capacity to extend those repertoires Tamara employed the relational process of adequation, downplaying differences among her and her peers’ language practices and racialized identities and instead foregrounding their similarities as friends with emerging bilingual capacities. According to a sociocultural perspective, when African-American students’ emergent bilingual/biliterate identities are affirmed across home and school contexts, by parents, peers, and teachers, like Ms. Padilla, who adopt a heteroglossic ideologies, those identities can flourish.
Researchers extend this call by suggesting that DLE programs must carve out space and dedicate resources to address underlying biases and ideologies with their learners as a part of their bilingual/biliterate development. (Bauer et al., 2020)

- The children of immigrants are the fastest growing population in U.S. schools at the same time there is increased anti-immigrant discourse, creating a unique linguistic ecology for its students. These multinational, multilingual, and multicultural students often encounter mononational, monolingual, and monocultural ideologies in their schools and communities. The result is that potentially hybridized learning contexts turn into sites of struggle for continued positive multilingual identities and investments. This multiple case study implemented surveys and interviews to explore the factors that contribute to the high multilingual investment of three self-identifying Mexican students residing in the U.S. Findings indicate that strong family relationships, formal coursework in Spanish, as well as a strong ethnic identity as Mexicans are interrelated factors that contribute to their high multilingual investment. Dual language education is a powerful factor, but formal Spanish courses at the secondary and post-secondary level are also equally strong contributors when dual language education is not available. (Babino & Stewart, 2019)

### Personality

- Personality, cognitive strategies, and metalinguistic skills are important factors related to the acquisition and use of language (Michael and Gollan 2005).
- “I am me; my personality does not change depending on the words I speak. Yet, languages act like filters, exaggerating or downplaying different sides of my character. I become more direct or carefree depending on the language I am speaking.” “For me, learning language is not about memorizing a dictionary, it’s a way of building self-confidence, self-awareness, and community” (Hobson, 2021)

### Home Language Importance

- Language is the foundation for all learning, including interpersonal communication, reading, writing, and the core content we expect children to know. Children’s language also mirrors what they know, and how they categorize information and conceptualize their world. How children respond, talk, read, and/or write also signals their readiness for various skills and content learning. Language is, in fact, the most effective means through which we assess children’s abilities and knowledge base. The MT is the primary means through which a child makes sense of her world and connects with others—learning new words and vital content. While dialoging, she observes and engages in meaning-making, learns about proxemics (the physical distance she is expected to maintain, which varies from culture to culture), and develops communication strategies (e.g., turn-taking and conversation entry prompts). Without continued use of the MT, a child feels lost, uprooted Low self-esteem and identity crises are rampant, and often lead to a high drop-out rate—all of which bode badly for a nation with an aging population that is dependent on this generation. So we must make every effort to stop failing our children—and use of the MT and a mathematical language-building-blocks approach could be just the solution (Pandey, 2014)
- Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, positive self-concept, a negative self-concept is detrimental to learning, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child. (Caraballo & Martinez, 2019)
- Maintaining home language appears to strengthen students’ sense of self and to increase educational motivation among adolescents (Lee et al., 2021; Zarate, Bhunji, & Reese, 2005).
- In addition to language background, students’ culture must be considered in designing a successful dual language program. In order to support student success, Cummins’ (1979, p. 240) states the school program must be geared to the needs of individual children if they are to attain an additive form of bilingualism involving fluent literacy skills in L1 and L2. If the process of instruction is to be meaningful it must reflect the child’s cultural experiences and build upon his competencies (Tran et al., 2015).

**Motivation**

- This study presents a structural relationship model that integrates English language learners’ motivation with their online self-regulation. Two questionnaires, Online Language Learning Motivation (OLLM) and Online Self-regulated English Learning (OSEL), were developed and administered to 293 Chinese university students. The results indicated that OLLM consists of five factors, namely online language learning experience, cultural interest, instrumentality-promotion, instrumentality-prevention, and others’ expectations. Meanwhile, OSEL is composed of six factors: goal setting, time management, environment structuring, help seeking, task strategies, and self-evaluation. The path analysis revealed that students with a positive future image of their language learning and an intrinsic interest in English culture tended to have better self-regulatory capacity in online learning environments. Learners with positive online learning experiences tended to be more flexible and independent in their self-regulatory learning process. Related pedagogical implications are discussed, such as motivating learners to visualize a successful future self, improving their inherent interest in learning English, and designing more effective online tasks. (Magid & Chan, 2012)

- This article advances a framework for early language and literacy development among young English language learners (English Learners). A dual language book project undertaken in partnership with a local elementary school provides a context within which to address children’s need to negotiate language, culture, and identity as they transition and make meaning from their home language (L1) to English and the language of school (L2) and back. Using objects of cultural and personal relevance that the children brought from home, stories of ‘Family Treasures’ were generated from the original telling in the L1 into English in small-group contexts, transcribed, illustrated, and uploaded to a Web site for permanent sharing, rereading, and exchange. These booklets also provided an opportunity for identity formation, pride of family and culture, and the acquisition of rudimentary technology skills, which all work to motivate and engage young learners in the development of early literacy. (Roessingh, 2011)

**Cultural Awareness**

- This issue of TESOL Quarterly examines the equity challenges and promises of dual language bilingual education (DLBE) for students learning English as an additional language. Research reported in this issue documents the pride, joy, and multilingual capacities of children and their families, as well as the possibilities for DLBE when we hold programs accountable for bilingual outcomes and avoid “equity traps.” A two-way Spanish-English program in the midwestern United States, where Mariana Pacheco and Colleen Hamilton aimed to transform the discourses that typically oppress Spanish-speaking bilingual students and their languages. Framed
| by theories of bilanguaging love (Mignolo, 2012), careful ethnographic detail foregrounds Latinx students’ unique sensitivities developed from their borderland perspectives and experiences; we see how bilingual students supported their peers, showcasing an awareness of bilingual/linguistic challenges and empathy for others—capacities not often reciprocated or recognized by their teachers. (Dorner & Cervantes-Soon, 2020) |
| • Results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019) |
| • Much of the debate regarding outcomes of various types of dual-language program has focused on linguistic and academic results, and with good reason: improving the educational outcomes of language minorities and supporting societal multilingualism are vital goals. More rarely explored, however, are these programs’ ethnolinguistic outcomes: the ways in which they provide students with insights into themselves, language, language learning processes and others. This study uses interview and audio data to examine ways in which adolescents reported learning about themselves, language and its learning and others through participation in an extracurricular high school program for Spanish-dominant English language learners (English Learners) and English-dominant Spanish language learners (SLLs). Findings suggest the program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. (A. Kibler et al., 2014) |
| • This article discusses the importance of cultural awareness knowledge for teachers who teach Spanish to native speakers. The article is taken from a study that investigated pedagogical content knowledge, subject matter knowledge, and cultural awareness knowledge. The results of the survey suggest that it is important for teachers to make cultural connections with their students. The results also suggested that teachers perceive cultural awareness knowledge is important to effective teaching as well as interpersonal knowledge as defined by Collinson ("Becoming"). Additionally, The attitudes and beliefs that teachers have towards minorities, towards non-prestige languages, toward poverty, have an effect on how teachers teach (see Ennis, Cothran, and Loftus; Hollingsworth; Hoy and Murphy, 2001; Nespor). Hancock quotes Brown in saying that research suggests that empathy. the capacity to relate emotionally to someone else, may contribute to the success of language learners (2). In order to be an effective and successful teacher, that teacher must know her/his students intimately. The teacher must be able to talk about each individual student’s strengths and weak nesses and be able and willing to do whatever it takes to ensure that student's academic success (Ellison, 2006) |
| • Bilingual learning affects attitudes and beliefs about language learning and other cultures. Language learners develop a more positive attitude toward the target language and/or the speakers of that language. Lipton’s surveys (2004) comprise a series of studies that demonstrate, among other factors, that children who have studied a world language develop a sense of cultural pluralism (openness to and appreciation of other cultures) and have an improved self-concept and sense of |
achievement in school. The ability to easily switch between languages makes children feel competent, and it increases self-esteem (Rubio, 2007). Appreciating international literature, music, and film. Translation is subject to the interpretation of the translator. The world’s literary and artistic works have been written in various languages. Some elements do not have equivalents in other languages. Increasing understanding of oneself and one’s culture. Viewing one’s value system through the eyes of others is, put simply, valuable. Monolingual views of the world limit the perspective. There are aspects of one’s life and culture that are accepted as universal truths until another way of thinking has been encountered. (Tochon, 2009)

- In this educational and societal context, this study examines how English Learners view their imagined English Learner identities and communities through their drawings and written descriptions. The findings yield insights into the purposes, orientations, and dispositions of EFL learners, their beliefs about imagined English-speaker identities, and their awareness of the broader global, intercultural context. Concentrating on the transformation in the relational aspect of English Learner identity, the study discusses the weight and affordances of English and its relation to English Learners’ imagined English Learner identity and further demonstrates their language and cultural awareness in the globalized setting. (Ahn, 2021)

- The current research investigated the effects of cultural awareness on listening comprehension and listening motivation of EFL learners. The results of one-sample t-test, one-way ANOVA, and the post hoc Scheffe test showed that the experimental classes outflanked the control class in the posttest of listening motivation and listening comprehension. The results indicated that the subjects showed a positive attitude toward having cultural awareness in their English learning process. The outcomes of the study provide some implications for teachers to increase the students’ cultural awareness and to enhance their positive attitudes about the integration of culturally based resources into language education. (Kamaeva et al., 2022)

- Research has shown that dual-language programs for elementary age students and newcomer centers for recent immigrant arrivals at the secondary level are effective in fostering student academic success, linguistic growth, and multicultural understanding. (Lucido, 2019)

- Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000). Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children. (Amorsen, 2015)

### Self Confidence

**Attitudes**

- In this study, IEP students of various proficiency levels and L1 backgrounds described their attitudes toward the institutional English-only policy at an intensive English program associated with a large U.S. university. Data were collected through a survey (n = 158), interviews (n = 6), and focus groups (n = 4). Positive attitudes included feeling that the English-only policy helped students to improve their English proficiency, prepare them for the high demands of using English proficiency in real-world interaction, and demonstrate respect for other students and teachers who cannot understand their first. Several aspects of the policy were perceived negatively, including the ways teachers dealt with students speaking their L1 outside the
classroom, methods of punishment that could impact students’
grades, the unconditional character of the policy that denied
learners their agency, and the lack of systematic
implementation. Based on these findings, suggestions are provided
for designing institutional environments that could more effectively
maximize target language use rather than demoralize learners.
(Shvidko, 2017)

Self Confidence

- One of the notable behaviors of individuals during the teaching of
foreign languages is the use of the first language as an integral
part of the learning-teaching process. The aim of this study is to
determine the reasons why secondary-school students in
Kazakhstan feel the need to use their first language (Kazakh or
Russian) in foreign language classes where they are studying
English. According to the findings, students avoid the use of the
foreign languages they study; have motivation problems; have
a fear of being criticized by teachers; have a fear of being
 teased by classmates; tease their friends; and don’t believe in
themselves enough. It is therefore necessary to take measures to
increase the self-confidence of students; and a more English-
speaking environment should be established. (Gumilev, 2020)

- This qualitative study investigated a CBSL program in which L2
Spanish learners at an urban university served as weekly teaching
assistants at a local dual-language elementary school. Data were
collected from 55 reflective blog entries, two focus group sessions,
and interviews with four teaching assistants. The L2 Spanish
learners reported that the experience supported their language
acquisition by (1) providing oral language practice outside of
class, (2) facilitating linguistic self-confidence, (3) fostering
metacognitive reflection, and (4) transforming motivation and
attitudes. (Baker, 2018)

- The purpose of the present study is two-fold. First, the present
study examines statistical similarity between the integrative and
instrumental orientation and Self-Determination Theory subtypes
of motivation using chi-square invariance test. Second, based on
the results of the chi-square invariance test, the present study
further investigates the structural relationships among factors
affecting second language achievement. Results of the structural
analyses demonstrate that intrinsic motivation was the
strongest determinant of learners’ self-confidence and
motivation to learn a second language. It is also found that
intrinsic motivation was only indirectly related to second
language achievement through the mediating effects of
motivation and self-confidence. (Pae, 2008)

- This study examines the interrelated issues of private and public
domains of self-esteem, ethnic identity formation, and bilingual
confidence among youth of a minority group in a city in western
Canada. The results confirm the importance of ethnic identity
on minority youth’s global self-esteem. Self-confidence with
bilingual proficiency has a great effect on Chinese Youth’s
global, academic, and social self-esteem. (Wen-shya, 2005)

- This paper considers speakers’ differing degrees of self-confidence
in their bilingual abilities and their effects on reported language use
and observed patterns of language choice. One hundred and twenty
individuals from New Zealand’s four largest Pasifika communities
Samoan, Cook Islands, Tongan and Niuean reported on their self
confidence in both their community language (CL) and English,
and on the basis of these responses, five speaker types are
distinguished. The findings show how analyses based on
speakers’ self-confidence in bilingual abilities provide a
community-friendly tool for describing patterns of language
use and explaining the effects of social variables on language proficiency. (Starks, 2005)

| Agency | - This paper begins with a discussion of some of the key insights of recent sociocultural research that consider bilingual children and learning to read and culminates in a discussion of Syncretic Literacy Studies (SLS). It then presents data from an ethnographic study that focused on the learning experiences of a small group of Year Three Bangladeshi-heritage pupils during 1 year of their schooling in order to problematize some of the claims made in recent sociocultural work and in SLS, particularly the focus on children’s agency. The findings from the study suggest that there are limits to children’s agency that are not recognized in recent work and in SLS; (b) that identity has an important role to play; children can successfully mask what they cannot do as readers in order to present a particular identity in the mainstream classroom; and (c) that the access some children have to mediators may be limited and can change over time. (Walters, 2011)
- This qualitative study investigated a CBSL program in which L2 Spanish learners at an urban university served as weekly teaching assistants at a local dual-language elementary school. Data were collected from 55 reflective blog entries, two focus group sessions, and interviews with four teaching assistants. The L2 Spanish learners reported that the experience supported their language acquisition by (1) providing oral language practice outside of class, (2) facilitating linguistic self-confidence, (3) fostering metacognitive reflection, and (4) transforming motivation and attitudes. (Baker, 2018) |

| Critical Consciousness | - In this essay, researchers call for programs to adopt vernacular forms of Spanish, including translanguaging practices, in bilingual and biliteracy instruction in order to meet the needs of Spanish-speaking students and combat deficit language ideologies and practices. From a critical pedagogical perspective, deliberate inclusion of vernacular Spanish (and translanguaging) in bilingualism and biliteracy is an ideal means to develop critical consciousness for students in DLBE, which can serve to combat deficit language ideologies, and aligns to the proposal of critical consciousness as the fourth goal of DLBE. We offer recommendations for teacher educators and DLBE practitioners. (Freire & Feinauer, 2022)
- Researchers argue that centering critical consciousness—or fostering among teachers, parents, and children an awareness of the structural oppression that surrounds us and a readiness to take action to correct it—can support increased equity and social justice in TWDL education. Researchers elaborate four elements of critical consciousness: interrogating power, critical listening, historicizing schools, and embracing discomfort. Researchers describe how critical consciousness impacts and radicalizes the other three core goals, in turn supporting the development of more successful, equitable, and socially just TWDL schools. (Palmer et al., 2019) |
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the social development of English Learners?

Social Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Network</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Networks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingual students have larger social networks that can help them navigate both school and community contexts (Zhou &amp; Bankston, 1998)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Benefits of knowing two languages: (1) sociocultural (e.g. ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world (Tytus, 2018)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This study examines how a two-way, dual language enrichment program for Spanish-language learner and English-language learner adolescents influenced students’ social networks with peers of different cultural and linguistic backgrounds. Results suggest that despite participants’ demographic differences, English Learner and Spanish Language Learner students in the dual-language program reported building new, strengthened, and mutually recognized relationships, particularly with students of different language backgrounds who worked together within long-term collaborative small groups. When students are provided with a carefully designed instructional and ecological context that provides authentic purposes for using language and building peer relationships, this research suggests that both English Learners and SLLs may be able to build linguistically integrated social networks. (A. K. Kibler et al., 2015)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Researchers examine dual language education as a means for promoting ethnically, racially, and linguistically diverse learning experiences. Dual-language schools can be incredibly effective at ensuring students of different backgrounds learn in the same classroom rather than just superficially enroll in the same school. By the very nature of dual language, students are often in a classroom with children of differing backgrounds. Dual language education can allow teachers to “position” students and families from diverse linguistic backgrounds as language and culture brokers for English-speaking peers and families (DeMathews, Izquierdo, and Knight 2017; Lee, Hill-Bonnet, and Raley 2011; Palmer 2008). Being dual language helps to promote healthy multigenerational, multicultural, and multilingual communities, because it allows schools to connect with a historically marginalized community whose first language is not English as well as the grassroots organizations that are engaged in advocacy and community development work (Fránquiz, Salazar, and DeNicolo 2011; Wiemelt andWelton 2015). Dual-language education has the added advantage that the model makes racial and ethnic diversity a classroom asset, which in turn promotes even greater benefits on student learning and socialization. Dual language offers an avenue for districts interested in navigating these obstacles and can be an excellent way to concurrently foster diversity in the classroom</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
and improve a variety of social and academic outcomes for the entire student body. (Kotok & DeMatthews, 2018)

- Social network analysis has proved particularly useful in explaining why speakers in bilingual communities maintain or change their language behavior. An underlying assumption in this analysis is that language, particularly the first language or mother tongue, is an integral part of collective identities, such as national, ethnic, or cultural identities, and that maintenance of language across generations is a key factor to the maintenance of such identities. This article discusses the application of social network analysis to multilingual communities by taking a point of departure in the Filipino community in Oslo, the capital of Norway, with a view towards understanding linguistic and cultural maintenance. Results from the analyses provide support for the importance of social network in understanding language choice and cultural and linguistic maintenance; however, there were some notable exceptions. (Lanza & Svendsen, 2007)

- Advantages of being bilingual: Making lifelong friends. Bilingualism increases the number of people with whom one can interact. Interest in other cultures helps one connect deeply with other people around the world. (Tochon, 2009)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Perceptions</th>
<th>• Considerable research documents students’ outcomes in dual language (DL) programs, but there is little examination of students’ perceptions of bilingualism and its impact on students’ cognitive functioning and social relationships, especially with comparative studies across different target languages and student backgrounds. This study, which included a total of 788 fifth- through eighth-grade students who had participated in a Spanish-English (n = 645) or Mandarin-English (n = 143) dual language program, surveyed students’ language proficiencies, ratings of bilingualism, and social and cognitive functioning. Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual. (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Home Language Importance</td>
<td>• The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of network ties rather than morphology of the network. A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer. This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Status</td>
<td>• A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks. This reciprocal relationship is simultaneously a force of assimilation and of dissimilation. Interpersonal networks are a concrete basis of both culture and social structure. Family, friends, and acquaintances reinforce the beliefs, arts, and institutions of a culture (Greeley, 1974; Yancy and Erikson, 1977) and transmit the advantages, aspirations, and opportunities of a social structure (e.g., Duncan, Haller, and Portes, 1971). Through their common basis in the associations among people, the</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
cultural and socioeconomic realms influence each other. (Mirowsky & Ross, 1984)

- This study investigates immigrant-native differences in the activities of adolescents 2 years after their sophomore year of high school. Despite their lower levels of human capital and lower previous academic performance, recent immigrants who arrive in the United States as adolescents are more likely than those who arrive earlier or those born in the United States to persevere in high school. Access to familial social capital and attitudinal measures help explain some of this effect. As for those who do leave school early, socioeconomic status and language background play a role in the activities respondents pursue. While recent immigrants are more likely to persevere in high school, once they leave they are no more likely to pursue additional education than their U.S. born counterparts. (White & Glick, 2000)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Dynamics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Employing a social capital framework, this study investigates teachers’ role in influencing the peer dynamics between English learners (ELs) and their non-EL peers. Peer nominations of friendships within the classroom were used to operationalize students’ same-language-status (bonding capital) and cross-language-status (bridging capital) friendships. Multilevel models reveal teachers’ reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners. For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall, and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships. (Johnson et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sociolinguistic Awareness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Because bilingual learners often interact with different language providers, they appear to develop sociolinguistic awareness more readily. They may better understand the arbitrary nature of language (Cook 1997) and that users employ language to communicate their mental states in various ways and for different purposes. (Mohr et al., 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Other advantages of learning another language can include the following: passing on part of one’s heritage to children, bridging generations and improving communication within the family and with the extended family, building international links, experiencing two cultures, being able to compare values and worldviews, and becoming biliterate (Marcos, 1998).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Relationships with Family and Friends**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Benefits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingualism generates social benefits like reduced discrimination, improved self-esteem, and stronger cross-group relationships (Cho, 2000; Wright &amp; Tropp, 2005)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Relationships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S. Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs. Results highlight the different beneficial roles of Cantonese and English
proficiency on positive self, peer acceptance, and prosocial behavior (He et al., 2022)

- In the present investigation, we recorded and described the naturalistic free play of four dual language learners (DLLs) and compared their interactions to those of four English-speaking children. Findings indicate that DLLs play and talk with peers less frequently, interact in less sustained and positive ways, and are more reliant on teachers to support their play than their English-speaking peers. Implications for scaffolding DLLs’ play in classrooms and for future research are presented (Dominguez & Trawick-Smith, 2018)

- Employing a social capital framework, this study investigates teachers’ role in influencing the peer dynamics between English learners (ELs) and their non-EL peers. Participants include 713 students (211 English Learners). Observed teacher-student interaction quality and teacher self-reports of their peer network management were used to operationalize the teacher-directed, classroom-level factors. Peer nominations of friendships within the classroom were used to operationalize students’ same-language-status (bonding capital) and cross-language-status (bridging capital) friendships. Multilevel models reveal teachers’ reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners. For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall, and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships. (Johnson et al., 2020)

- This paper explores the idea that young children’s emergent literacy practices can be tools for mediating peer interaction, and that, therefore, literacy, even in its earliest stages, can support oral language development, particularly for emergent bilinguals. This paper offers a genetic analysis, or an analysis across time, of how students’ interactions with multimodal composing functioned as contexts for emergent bilinguals’ oral language development, and in particular, vocabulary acquisition. (Bernstein, 2017)

- Bilingual undergraduates may have closer friendships with other bilinguals than with monolinguals. This study investigated this hypothesis and explored the friendship features of 46 bilingual Spanish and English-speaking undergraduates by combining quantitative analyses of surveys and qualitative analyses of interviews. Survey results indicated that participants rated their friendships with bilinguals to be more secure, closer, and to provide more help and companionship than their friendships with monolinguals. During interviews, participants described understanding, connection, and identification with their bilingual friends. These features were considered reasons for their friendships with other bilinguals and reasons for their greater quality. Bilingual friendships also helped bilingual undergraduates navigate a challenging sociopolitical context and have pride in their ethnolinguistic identity. (Sebanc et al., 2009)

- This study investigates whether friendship quality, academic achievement and mastery goal orientation predict each other across the transition to middle school. Cross-lagged path analyses revealed a bidirectional and negative relationship between negative friendship quality and academic achievement across the transition to middle school. Positive friendship quality predicted mastery goal orientation decreases for girls. Both gender and bilingual status were analyzed and showed
### Bilingualism and Autism

- Bilingualism changes how people relate to others and lead their lives. This is particularly relevant in autism, where social interaction presents challenges. In the full sample, age negatively predicted social life quality scores while the number of languages known positively predicted social life quality scores. In the multilingual subset, age negatively predicted social life quality scores, while third language proficiency positively predicted social life quality scores. This is the first study describing the language history and social experiences of a substantial sample of bilingual and multilingual autistic adults. **It provides valuable insight into how autistic people can learn and use a new language, and how their bilingualism experiences shape their social life.** *(Digard et al., 2020)*

- Globally, there are more bilingual speakers than monolingual speakers; however, scant research evidence exists regarding social communication development and outcomes for bilingual children with autism spectrum disorder (ASD). This study employed a longitudinal cohort design to compare social and communication skills, at baseline and over 12 months, for 60 monolingual and 60 bilingual children with ASD receiving community based early intervention. **Findings support the notion that there is no basis on which to discourage home language use with bilingual children with ASD.** *(Śiyambalapitiya et al., 2022)*

- There are concerns that social communication deficits among children with autism spectrum disorder may reduce the developmental benefits of early intervention for children with autism spectrum disorder raised in bilingual environments. Researchers conducted an exploratory analysis of cross-sectional and longitudinal data from a larger study to explore associations between home language environment and language ability and social skills in response to early autism spectrum disorder intervention. **Significant language growth was exhibited by children from both language groups and there was no moderating effect of home language environment.** The bilingual home group demonstrated increased gesture use over the course of intervention as compared with the monolingual home group. Preliminary data revealed no basis for concerns regarding negative impact of a bilingual home environment on language or social development in young children with autism spectrum disorder. **(Zhou et al., 2019)**

- The study investigated the effect of language intervention on equal numbers of participants (n=20) in both study groups, monolingual (English only) and bilingual (English and anyone of the Mother Tongue Language) children with Autism Spectrum Disorders, aged between 4.0 and 6.11 years, in Singapore. **The results revealed statistically significant improvement in the developmental skills in both the study groups, but no significance was indicated between the groups.** The study indicated that bilingual exposure in children with Autism Spectrum Disorders does not have any negative impact. *(Sendhilnathan & Chengappa, 2020)*

### Family Relationships

- Preserving the home language reduces cultural dissonance between children and parents, reinforcing parental authority and thus reducing behavior problems *(Portes & Hao, 2002; Portes & Rumbaut, 2001)*

- Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing *(Gay, 2000;*
A crucial step in supporting students who may be put at risk involves an understanding of, and respect for, the literacy activities of the family and communities in which the child lives. Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children. Involve linguistically diverse families in the literacy classroom. 

(Amorsen, 2015)

### Social Competence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Competence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Effective peer interaction is fundamental to social development, cognitive development, and academic success. This study compares parent and teacher perspectives of children’s social competence (i.e., social skills and problem behaviors) and whether similarities and differences in perspectives are associated with children’s classification as an emergent bilingual or monolingual native English speaker. <strong>Findings indicate statistically significant differences in parent and teacher ratings on the empathy, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for bilingual children and on the empathy, self-control, internalizing, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for monolingual English-speaking children.</strong> (Baxter et al., 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This study investigated whether host and heritage cultural orientations were associated with Chinese preschoolers’ social competence and whether such associations varied across gender in Western contexts. Social competence was assessed using teacher reports on the Behavior Assessment System for Children-2 (BASC-2) with four composite scales: Externalizing, Internalizing, Behavioral Symptoms and Adaptive Skills. <strong>The results indicate that host culture has a stronger relationship with social competence than heritage culture, particularly for girls.</strong> (Ren &amp; Wyver, 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The current study examined whether bilingualism is associated with differences in children’s developing social knowledge. In line with previous research findings, <strong>results demonstrate that all children evaluated moral violations more harshly than conventional violations.</strong> Notably, however, <strong>bilingual children were more permissive of violations across moral, social, and language domains than monolingual children.</strong> These findings yield new insights into the role of early experience in the development of social knowledge. We propose that bilinguals’ unique linguistic and social experiences influence their understanding of moral and conventional rules. (Iannuccilli et al., 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This longitudinal study was conducted to gain understanding of the social–emotional and academic development of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children. <strong>Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development.</strong> In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were associated with later academic achievement and growth of English proficiency. <strong>Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism.</strong> (Oades-Sese et al., 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The aim of the present study was to examine the social behavior and competence of children, ages 3–6 as they progressed through the stages of second language acquisition in a dual-immersion program in English and Mandarin. Teachers’ evaluations of children’s social competence and behavior were collected at the beginning and end of the school year. <strong>Results suggest that girls had more social adjustment difficulties than boys.</strong> However, as</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Flexibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitudes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Flexibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Flexibility</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

language skills increased, adjustment difficulties decreased significantly among all children. (Soderman & Oshio, 2008)

- The main aim of this study was to examine whether language skills and emotion regulation are associated with social competence and whether the relationship between English skills and social competence is moderated by emotion regulation in Mandarin–English bilingual preschoolers. The results show that positive emotion regulation, emotion dysregulation, English skills, and Mandarin skills were associated with different composites of the BASC-2; the relationships between English skills and Behavioral Symptoms were moderated by positive emotion regulation; and English skills and Adaptive Skills were moderated by emotion dysregulation. (Ren et al., 2016)
environments and facilitating the frequency of social interactions. (Ikizer & Ramírez-Esparza, 2018)

- Bilingual children are less influenced than monolinguals by language variety when attributing personality traits to different speakers, which could indicate that bilinguals have fewer in-group biases and perhaps greater social flexibility. In the present study, we investigated the social preferences of 5 year old English and French monolinguals and English-French bilinguals. These results suggest that both monolingual and bilingual children have strong preferences for in-group members who use a familiar language variety, and that bilingualism does not lead to generalized social flexibility. (Souza et al., 2013)
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the economic development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Development</th>
<th>Cultural Awareness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Global Cultural Awareness</td>
<td>With the growing emphasis on a competitive global economy, support is increasing for dual language programs (DLPs) geared toward preparing students in bilingual and multilingual education. (Gomez &amp; Cisneros, 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>This qualitative case study is focused on one high-performing urban elementary school that worked to address inequities within the school and community for two decades partly through dual language education. Key findings from this case highlight intersections between social justice leadership and leadership for school improvement that promote organizational innovation, learning, and sustainability. (DeMatthews &amp; Izquierdo, 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Increasing global understanding, Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture, Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The purpose of this study is to investigate how a bilingual education program would protect the cultural inheritance, linguistic knowledge, ethnic and religious identity of minority peoples. This study utilized an explanatory sequential mixed method, conducted in two phases: a quantitative phase followed by a qualitative phase. Both quantitative and qualitative data reflected that a bilingual education program could increase the educational success of students and contribute to social justice including equal educational rights. Such as system might also increase brotherhood between different ethnic groups in society and perhaps resolve the conflicts among them. A bilingual education program for minority people is essential for equal access to education. It solves conflicts between different ethnic groups and brings happiness to the society. (Ozfidan &amp; Toprak, 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This paper attempts to define cultural globalization and cultural glocalisation in terms of cultural identity (CI) and language. To be an effective communicator in this multilingual world, people have to develop multilingual and multicultural competencies. (Tong & Cheung, 2011)

**Language Economics**

- Language educational economics is a newly developed field of study, born from the understanding that language educational policies have economic implications (Breton, 1998). Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006). At a time of semi globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs. On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005).
- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.

**Labor Market**

- Learning two language is beneficial economically (e.g. better job prospects and ability to grow professionally also in other countries) (Tytus, 2018)
- The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)
- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).
- Multilingualism is often framed as human capital that increases individuals’ labor market value. Such assertions overlook the role of ideology in assigning value to languages and their speakers based on factors other than communicative utility. This article explores the value assigned to Spanish-English bilingualism on the United States labor market through a mixed methods analysis of online job advertisements. Findings suggest that Spanish-English bilingualism is frequently preferred or required for employment in the US, but that such employment opportunities are less lucrative. The results suggest a penalty associated with Spanish-English bilingualism in which positions listing such
language requirements advertise lower wages than observationally similar positions. Quantitative disparities and qualitative differences in the specification of language requirements across income levels suggest that bilingual labor is assigned value through a racial lens that leads to linguistic work undertaken by and for US Latinxs being assigned less value (Subtirelu, 2017)

- Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English, according to a study carried out by the Civil Rights Project at University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA) and Educational Testing Service (ETS) (Gandara, 2015)

- Balanced bilinguals,” those who understand, speak, read, and write in both English and the language of the home: Earn more—$2,000-$5,000 annually compared to their English-only peers; Go to college at higher rates, which dramatically increases earnings; Have more social networks. (Gandara, 2015)

- Bilinguals may not always be paid more, but they often are and frequently get hired over monolinguals with similar credentials.” (Gandara, 2015)

- Ruben Rumbaut examined the effects of bilingualism on more than 6,000 young people in their mid to late 20s. He distinguished among limited, moderate, and fluent bilingual and non-bilingual people across a range of ethnicities. He found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased.

- Diana A. Porras, Jungeyon Ee, and Patricia Gandara surveyed almost 300 large, medium, and small businesses in California, across all sectors of the economy, asking employers whether they had a preference for hiring bilingual employees and if so, whether they compensated them for their language skills. Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred bilingual employees if their skills were comparable to those of monolingual employees. This confirmed that in California, bilingual employees are in high demand and have a hiring advantage over those who are monolingual.

- Researchers analyze the early occupational careers of fifty-eight second-generation young adults in Dalton, Georgia, a global carpet-manufacturing center. Researchers find intergenerational occupational mobility, with children of Mexican immigrants deploying human-capital skills to access better jobs than their parents. While bilingual skills play a critical role in the employment paths that members of the second generation have started to chart, their use of bilingualism is also shaped by gender dynamic in the workplace. (Hernandez-Leon & Lakhani, 2013)

- The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. "In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of
language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage.” (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

- Although it is commonly thought that people who are bilingual have an advantage in the labor market, studies on this topic have not borne out this perception. The literature, in fact, has found an earnings penalty is associated with bilingualism—people who are bilingual often make less than people who are monolingual in similar jobs. (Gándara, 2015)

- This article presents the results of a 2014 survey of more than 2,100 U.S. employers on their requirements for multilingual employees. The survey found a significant discrepancy: On the one hand, 93% of respondents “value[d] employees who...are able to work effectively with customers, clients, and businesses from a range of different countries and cultures.” On the other, 66% of respondents reported identifying foreign language skills in the hiring process, 41% reported giving advantage to multilingual applicants, and only 10% of respondents indicated that new hires “needed to speak at least one language besides English.” In addition, the survey revealed employer characteristics related to demand for language ability: Industries with the greatest demand were government and public administration, information services, educational services, health care, and the administrative sector. Language skills were sought in combination with other skill sets, notably customer service, sales, vendor management, and marketing. The results are critical to educational programs seeking to understand the value of language in the job market. (Damari et al., 2017)

- Using structural topic modeling and critical discourse analysis, this study employs a raciolinguistic perspective to unpack the ideologies underlying the discourses in over 200 DL programs in a new Latinx South state of the United States. Our findings show that DL programs are promoted as a model that brings cognitive and employment benefits to its students. Moreover, private corporate power has a strong existence and influence on the establishment, staffing, and promotion of DL programs. (Sun & Wang, 2023)

- While English proficiency enhances labor market outcomes, its role in minority-language regions remains largely unexplored. Employing the U.S. Mexico border as a minority-language region, researchers analyzed whether English skills differently affect the earnings and occupational sorting of Mexican Americans along the border relative to their non-border peers. Researchers found comparable English deficiency earnings penalties for Mexican immigrants, suggesting that this group responds to English-specific regional wage gaps. US born men, however, have larger earnings penalty along the border, possibly reflecting natives’ relative immobility owing to strong geographic preferences. Occupational sorting exercises give credence to this interpretation for native Mexican American females. (Davila & Mora, 2000).

- English is often assumed to be a key to material success and social inclusion, and this belief commonly works to justify the global dominance of English, glossing over and rationalizing broader social inequalities. This paper extends the discussion of this fallacy of “the promise of English” to the domain of the South Korean job market, where skills in the English language play a major role in determining one’s access to white-collar jobs. Since the 1990s, different modes of English language testing have emerged as popular means for evaluating job applicants for...
Korean corporations, constantly upgrading the criteria for ‘good English’. (Park, 2011)

Maintaining Home Language

- Gandara notes a U.S. News & World Report article that argued that maintaining and teaching languages other than English will be key to the success of the nation’s schools in the coming century. “Equally important, though, is the finding that transitional bilingual instruction that leaves behind the native language is not where the payoff is; it is in maintaining immigrant languages.” (Gandara 2015)

Economic Success

- Prior studies have shown that children of Mexican immigrants face structural challenges that threaten to obstruct their economic success in young adulthood. They activated three resources in mobility promoting ways given the demographic, economic, and social characteristics of their community. The resources include parental support, advice and guidance from extrafamilial mentors, and bilingualism in English and Spanish. (Morando, 2013)

- A series of logistic and ordinary least squared regression analyses of the 2011–2015 American Community Survey (ACS) data shows that substantial differences exist across different ethnic groups among Asians. Bilingual advantages appear in most Asian groups when predicting both employment status and personal earnings, and the benefits tend to be more salient in the results of earnings analysis. The findings indicate that native-language literacy skill is a more momentous variable than the other variables in the model and that bilingual advantages stand out among Asian Indians and Chinese/Taiwanese more substantially compared to other Asians. Immense gender gaps also exist between Asian males and females in terms of economic well-being, and such gaps are more conspicuous in personal earnings than in employment status. (Ee, 2019)

- Working from a political economy perspective and drawing from current theoretical approaches to language and labor under neoliberalism, researchers examine the reproduction of the discursive trope of language profit in the corporate world and educational spaces, and then analyze the narratives and trajectories of young Latinx workers in New York. The marginalized position of Latinxs in the social structure and the racialization of their linguistic practice result in a linguistic exploitation that remains unchallenged in the US. Researchers conclude that today’s celebrations of bilingualism, which follow a capitalist logic, perpetuate a hierarchy of languages and speakers that is detrimental to racialized minorities. (Alonso & Villa, 2020)

Global Economy

- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.

- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.

- When you devalue home languages by, for instance, using just English with students who speak another language at home, you stifle learning and community engagement. Some language laws, like Arizona’s English-only law and Russia’s law banning instruction in minority languages like Bashkir and Tatar (effective...
September 1, 2013), silence students and jeopardize the success of entire communities. Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child's passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).

- With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students' future marketable skills. (Rolon, 2005)

- Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words language mixing were explored. It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. (Close, 2017)

- Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to obtain information from a large number of sources and the multilingual world we live in) (Tytus, 2018)

- Now, a growing number of states also see bilingualism as key to accessing the global economy, as evidenced by the surging popularity of the "seal of biliteracy"—a special recognition for graduates who demonstrate fluency in two or more languages. (Corey, 2018)

- Lindholm-Leary (2001) argued that DLI programs have the potential to “eradicate the negative status of bilingualism in the U.S.” because they combine “maintenance bilingual education and immersion education models in an integrated classroom composed of both language majority and language minority students with the goal of full bilingualism and biliteracy”

- The benefits of bilingual education have long been characterized in terms of advantages for a global economy (Varghese & Park, 2010)

- Although aware of the pitfalls of this association, many (e.g., Krashen, as cited in Crawford, 2001; MacSwan, 1998; Tse, 2001) have attempted to emphasize the economic advantages of bilingual education by stressing the “great importance of bilingualism in our modern global community” (MacSwan, 1998, p. 9).

- “In an era of globalization, a society that has access to multilingual and multicultural resources is advantaged in its ability to play an important social and economic role on the world stage” (MacSwan, 1998, p. 7).

- Highlighting this perspective, bilingualism and bilingual education can be viewed as a way to serve students and nations in the inevitable move toward an interconnected multilingual world. (MacSwan, 1998).

- The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries. Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. "In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to
squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage.” (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

- To compete successfully in the global marketplace, both U.S.-based multinational corporations as well as small businesses increasingly need employees with knowledge of foreign languages and cultures to market products to customers around the globe and to work effectively with foreign employees and partners in other countries. Asia Society (2002) and National Geographic-Roper (2002) indicated that, compared with students in nine other industrialized countries, U.S. students lack knowledge of world geography, history, and current events. And shockingly few U.S. students learn languages that large numbers of people speak, such as Chinese (1.3 billion speakers) and Arabic (246 million speakers). The United States must create its own education response to globalization, which should include raising standards, increasing high school and college graduation rates, and modernizing and internationalizing the curriculum. (Stewart, 2006)

- America is so far utterly failing to produce a generation of global citizens. For parents who want to give their children global experience while keeping them safely on the straight and narrow American path of PSATs, SATs, and stellar extracurriculars, there's an ever-growing field of options. Immersion schools have exploded over the past 40 years, growing from none in 1970 to 440 today, according to the Center for Applied Linguistics, and Mandarin, especially, is seen among type-A parents as a twofer: a child who learns Mandarin starting at 5 increases her brain capacity and is exposed to the culture of the future through language. (One mom in San Francisco laughs when she recalls that her daughter learned about Rosa Parks and the Montgomery bus boycott in Chinese.) (Miller et al., 2011)

- “Being a global citizen” is having strong interests in global issues, cultivating the understanding and appreciation of diverse values, and enhancing country’s competitiveness. All this however needs to be realized through communication in English, the world language. (Chen, 2011)

- Through comparative analyses of framing, keywords, spatial and temporal markers, actors, and legislative titles, we illustrate a discursive shift. While Proposition 227 presented bilingual education as a threat to children’s—and, by proxy, the nation’s—well-being (a language as problem orientation), Proposition 58 represents multilingual education as key to students’ future economic success and to the state and nation’s continued global economic advantage (a language as resource orientation). We argue that Proposition 58’s approach to “marketing” multilingual education may have contributed to its passing in November 2016, a result that we celebrate. At the same time, we raise questions about whether policies framed within one discursive regime (e.g., neoliberalism and global human capital) can eventually serve the aims of another (e.g., equity, plurality, and social justice), or whether discourse is destiny in policy making. (Katznelson & Bernstein, 2017)

- To thrive in a global economy and a multicultural society, US students need fluency in at least one language other than English. Research shows that multilingual societies have a competitive advantage over societies in international trade. (Hilliwell, 1999). Economic success and security in the US
depend on our ability to understand the information we gather. Many Americans need to interact regularly with people who are unlikely to know English. Not only does the omission of language and cultural education leave US students behind their peers in other countries, but also it exacerbates the achievement gap within the US. (Met, 2001)

- It might sound like a no-brainer that being bilingual or multilingual helps students planning engineering and just about any other career. But it is certainly true and is becoming more important the economies of nations become more intertwined. What’s more being able to go beyond mere language ability and understand cultural distinctions are extra advantages. Students say that being bilingual gives them more options on campus and off (Galuszka, 2007)

- In the current stumbling economy, job seekers are leveraging every qualification they can think of to sway potential employers. And with immigrants continuing to flood into New York, long the city of immigrants, and its suburbs, speaking a second language is a talent that matters in almost any field. In the global economy, American companies increasingly are realizing the benefits of a multilingual work force (Skomial, 2002)

- Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006).

- At a time of semi globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs.

- On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005).

- Trimmell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture. Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade. Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages. Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalain, 2000).

### Home language Importance

- This article explores the strategies that three Latino families in the U.S. employed in raising their children bilingually in Spanish and English. It also looks at their rationale for bilingualism as well as the challenges the parents failed to anticipate in implementing their strategies. The data were gleaned from comparative case studies over a three-year period. The families wanted their children to be bilingual because they believed in the cognitive and economic advantages of bilingualism and that bilingualism would help maintain the families’ roots. (Rodriguez, 2015)
Decision Making

Now that the filters are in place and the data is sorted, organized, and summarized, the next step is to make decisions about the data collected. In order to determine the best way to make decisions given the data I collected, I looked at other researchers’ document analyses and meta analyses to inform my decision making.

I first analyzed the work of Orkan, Azman, and Su-Mei (2020) because their systematic review steps were similar to the steps I have taken in this modified meta-analysis. Their synthesis in their systematic review went through three distinct phases: Phase 1 search and inclusion, Phase 2: individual study review and Phase 3: content analysis through cross-study comparison and analysis which is modeled after the research conducted by Baran (2014). In the final part of their research, phase 3, a content analysis was carried out through a directed approach which is suggested by Hsieh and Shannon (2005) to be informed by a relevant theory or findings. The chosen articles were compared and analyzed within these determined categories and reported as findings. The data gathered were examined “to consider themes, shapes, and organization of research ideas present in the overall literature” (Opfer & Pedder, 2011). The categories employed portrayed differences as well as similarities. The categories were trends, advantages and disadvantages of bilingualism, methodological approaches, challenges and limitations in relation to language processing (Or-Kan et al., 2020).

Analyzing this systematic review led me to investigate Hseih and Shannon, as the systematic review used their suggestion to carry out a directed approach to content analysis. Upon investigating, I found that Hseih and Shannon offer three approaches to qualitative content analysis. All three approaches are used to interpret meaning from the content of text data. In conventional content analysis, coding categories are derived directly from the text data.
With a directed approach, analysis starts with a theory or relevant research findings as guidance for initial codes. A summative content analysis involves counting and comparisons, usually of keywords or content, followed by the interpretation of the underlying context (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005). Although this information informs my decision making, the decision making process within my modified meta-analysis does not fit directly into one of these approaches to qualitative content analysis.

My findings of content analysis then led me to search “Systematic Content Analysis.” I found an article that used a method that combined a systematic review of literature and inductive content analysis. This article compared content analysis to thematic analysis. The researchers indicate that qualitative content analysis consists of a linear, descriptive process based on a focused material scope (text documents only), and categories are concept-driven, and consistency is important. Thematic analysis on the other hand, seeks similarly to better understand a phenomenon by searching text for patterns and themes, but differs in the specific research objectives and in the application of research methods. Content analysis lends itself better to more generalizable, descriptive research questions than thematic analysis (Khirfan et al., 2020).

This finding led me to explore meta analyses/systematic reviews that utilize thematic analysis. After exploring 5-10 articles that fit the criteria of being meta analyses/systematic reviews that utilize thematic analyses, I concluded that most researchers have a software that helps with the thematic analysis step of their process. Generally, the software codes the data in each study to develop of list of themes and ideas, comparing one study to the next to examine similarities and differences. The researchers then review and refine the list of themes by merging themes and subthemes and discuss relationships between the themes. The goal of this step is to determine what story was being told through the studies. Much like a software program, I have already coded the data to develop themes, and I have merged themes and subthemes. The next
step is to define the relationship between the themes in order to answer my questions, thus telling a story with the data.

In order to do this, I plan to examine the findings within each main idea category and pull out similarities. The similarities in research findings within each main idea category are conclusions from the research. The hope is that these conclusions from the research will answer my initial research questions. The visual representation below outlines the process that I will undertake to draw conclusions from the data.
Area of Development

Theme
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea

Theme
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea

Theme
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea
Main Idea

Main Idea


Similarity/Overlap

Similarity/Overlap

Conclusion

Answer to research question
Chapter 3: Data Analysis

The first step in my data analysis process was to summarize and simplify each finding within each main idea. To do this, I read the bolded findings, determined if it related directly to the research question, simplified the finding. To simplify the finding, I summarized when possible. If I was unable to summarize effectively, then I removed all unnecessary words. I put these simplified findings that directly related to the research question on the left column, directly under each main idea.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Theme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Idea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Idea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Idea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Idea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Idea</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Finding

Similarity/Overlap

Conclusion

Answer to research question
How do dual language programs support English Learners in maintaining their first language?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First Language Literacy Development</th>
<th>Maintaining Home Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Gains in English Abilities (Hammer et al., 2020)</td>
<td>• Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills. (Hammer et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Gains in Spanish language abilities (Murphy, 2014)</td>
<td>• ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills. (Murphy, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Gains in verbal expression skills (Murphy, 2014)</td>
<td>• Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Grade level was the strongest predictor of the three for both decoding and comprehension. However, Spanish SI was more robust than English D for decoding whereas English D was a stronger predictor than Spanish SI for comprehension. Young DLL children’s oral narrative skills in English as well as in their home language Spanish contributed to their English reading outcomes. The results also implicated that maintaining young DLL children’s home language skills may be beneficial, rather than harmful, to their English reading development. (Huang et al., 2022) |

| Results suggest a positive role of mother tongue literacy in language learning as well as mathematical learning. (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018) |
| Regardless of program model, bilingual learners always have all of their linguistic resources available to them. Our research indicates that adherence to these guidelines in Spanish–English bilingual education settings results in significant language and literacy achievement for Spanish–English Bilingual learners (Hopewell & Escamilla, 2013; Soltero-González et al., 2012, 2016; Sparrow et al., 2014). We cannot and should not teach them as if they were monolingual English speakers and/or if the LOTE is irrelevant to literacy acquisition. (Escamilla et al., 2021) |

| In bilingual classrooms children reached age | Bilingual learners always have all linguistic resources available to them. (Escamilla et al., 2021) |
| Bilingual education results in significant literacy achievement. (Escamilla et al., 2021) |
| Maintaining home language is beneficial to English reading development (Huang et al., 2022) |
| Home language plays positive role in language learning (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018) |
| Home language plays positive role in math learning (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018) |
| Bilingual learners always have all linguistic resources available to them. (Escamilla et al., 2021) |
| Two languages as academic tools/funds of knowledge (Martin-Beltran, 2009) |
| Oral narrative skills and home language contribute to reading outcomes (Huang et al., 2022) |
| Maintaining home language is beneficial to English reading development (Huang et al., 2022) |
| Home language plays positive role in language learning (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018) |
| Home language plays positive role in math learning (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018) |
| Bilingual learners always have all linguistic resources available to them. (Escamilla et al., 2021) |
Home Language Importance

- Maintaining and teaching languages other than English is the key to success this century. (Gandara 2015)
- Pay off is in maintaining home languages. (Gandara 2015)
- Bilingualism results in cognitive and economic advantages. (Rodríguez, 2015)
- Bilingualism helps maintain family roots. (Rodríguez, 2015)
- Failure to nurture home language results in potential cost to earnings of bilingual/biliterate students. (Gándara, 2018)

- Furthermore, only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education. (Collins, 2014)

- This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction. (Raschka et al., 2002)

- Gandara notes a U.S. News & World Report article that argued that maintaining and teaching languages other than English will be key to the success of the nation’s schools in the coming century. “Equally important, though, is the finding that transitional bilingual instruction that leaves behind the native language is not where the payoff is; it is in maintaining immigrant languages.” (Gandara 2015)

- The families wanted their children to be bilingual because they believed in the cognitive and economic advantages of bilingualism and that bilingualism would help maintain the families’ roots. (Rodríguez, 2015)

- Full literacy in another language brings substantial economic benefit. Moreover, the failure to nurture these linguistic skills in the children of immigrants exacts a cost to the earnings of these potentially bilingual/biliterate students. (Gándara, 2018)
## Intellectual Development

### Cognitive Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Idea</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Early Childhood Programs</strong>&lt;br&gt;• Young English Learners benefit most from bilingual programs (Maxwell, 2013)&lt;br&gt;• Supporting the home language is the best for young ELs (Maxwell, 2013)</td>
<td>• Young English-language learners still developing oral and literacy skills in their home languages benefit most from early-childhood programs that regularly expose them to both languages (Maxwell, 2013)&lt;br&gt;• Supporting the home language, as well as English, is the best thing for young dual language learners (Maxwell, 2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Learners with Disabilities</strong>&lt;br&gt;• English Learners with disabilities in bilingual programs show gains in linguistic, academic, cognitive growth (Carrasquillo &amp; Rodriguez, 2002; Paneque &amp; Barbetta, 2006; Rodriguez, Parmar, &amp; Signer, 2001)</td>
<td>• The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth (Carrasquillo &amp; Rodriguez, 2002; Paneque &amp; Barbetta, 2006; Rodriguez, Parmar, &amp; Signer, 2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>General Cognitive Benefits/Advantages</strong>&lt;br&gt;• Bilingualism results in enhancement of cognitive flexibility, higher cognitive reserve, delay in the onset of dementia (Fox et al, 2019)&lt;br&gt;• Cognitive advantages in bilingual children: enhanced executive function, increased short term memory, enhanced problem solving skills (Morales, Calvo, &amp; Bialystok, 2013)&lt;br&gt;• Bilinguals have higher cognitive abilities, mental elasticity, and metalinguistic awareness (August, Goldenberg, &amp; Rueda, 2010)&lt;br&gt;• DL students perceive cognitive and other benefits of being bilingual</td>
<td>• Results report multiple cognitive benefits of language study and bimultilingualism, particularly later in life, including enhancement of cognitive flexibility, higher cognitive reserve in advanced age, and delay in the onset of dementia (Fox et al, 2019)&lt;br&gt;• Researchers have now identified cognitive advantages for bilingual children that include enhanced executive function of the brain, resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001; Diaz &amp; Klinger, 1991); increased short term memory (Morales, Calvo, &amp; Bialystok, 2013); and enhanced problem-solving skills.&lt;br&gt;• These advantages are explained in part by the bilingual brain’s greater flexibility and ability to exclude competing stimuli as a result of having to constantly distinguish between two or more languages (Gandara, 2015)&lt;br&gt;• Bilingual individuals have higher cognitive abilities, mental elasticity, and metalinguistic awareness (August, Goldenberg, &amp; Rueda, 2010)&lt;br&gt;• Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**bilingual (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)**
- Bilingual cognitive advantage: increased metalinguistic (Bialystok et al. 2010), executive functions, and cognitive reserve (Schweizer et al. 2012)
- Home language use in addition to English expands cognitive skills and higher order thinking/ executive functioning (Pandey, 2014)
- Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit superior problem solving skills compared to peers (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)
- Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit enhanced memory compared to peers (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)
- Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit enhanced intercultural and interpersonal skills (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)
- Bilingual specific advantage: metalinguistic awareness and cognitive control (Dillon, 2009)
- Early bilingualism can positively influence cognitive development, particularly attentional and executive functioning in children (see reviews in Bialystok, 2005; and in Costa, Hernández, Costa-Faidella & Sebastián-Gallés, 2009)
- Positive impact of bilingualism: flexibility in a symbol reorganization task (Peal & Lambert, 1962), superior performance at inhibiting distractors in a number concept task (Bialystok & Codd, 1997), superior symbolic representation and attentional inhibition skills in appearance–reality tasks (Bialystok & Senman, 2004).
- Maintenance and development of language and literacy skills in one’s mother tongue (MT) plays a critical role in facilitating second language (L2) learning, developing additive bilingualism and continuous cognitive development (Mandillah, 2019)
- Numerous studies have demonstrated the bilingual cognitive advantage with regard to: (1) metalinguistic awareness (the ability to dissociate between meaning and form and explicitly talk about the language structure) (e.g. Bialystok et al. 2010); (2) executive functions (inhibition, switching/shifting, updating, monitoring) (see a summary by Dong and Li 2015); and (3) cognitive reserve (the protection mechanism against a cognitive decline related to elderly dementia and Alzheimer’s disease) (e.g. Schweizer et al. 2012)
- MT use also enables children to expand their thinking—to engage in cultural ways of conceptualizing (i.e., bi/multicultural thinking), which is essential in this day and age), and thus fostering expanded cognitive skills or what some researchers term higher order thinking or executive functioning (Pandey, 2014)
- Carlson and Metzoff (2008) found that bilingual kindergartners from low-income households—whose parents’ level of education is substantially lower than their monolingual, English-only peers—exhibit superior problem-solving skills. Such skills also enhance children’s memory, as well as their intercultural and interpersonal skills.
- Metalinguistic awareness and cognitive control in two languages and in non-language related tasks have been reported as bilingual-specific advantages (Dillon, 2009)
- A large number of studies (see reviews in Bialystok, 2005; and in Costa, Hernández, Costa-Faidella & Sebastián-Gallés, 2009) have shown that early bilingualism acquired through the family or the social community can positively influence cognitive development, particularly attentional and executive functioning, in children.
- The positive impact of bilingualism has been observed over a variety of specific cognitive domains: for example, better flexibility in a symbol reorganization task (Peal & Lambert, 1962), superior performance at inhibiting distractors in a number concept task (Bialystok & Codd, 1997), superior symbolic representation and attentional inhibition skills in appearance–reality tasks (Bialystok & Senman, 2004).
- . Results showed that the immersion group performed better (more specifically, faster) than the monolingual group on tasks assessing alerting, auditory selective attention, divided attention, and mental flexibility, but not on tasks assessing response inhibition, as predicted. However, contrary to our hypothesis, no difference was found between the two groups on the interference inhibition task. Already after a period of three years, an L2- immersion school experience produces some of the attentional and executive benefits associated with early highly proficient bilingualism, although possibly not for exactly the same reasons (Poncelet, 2012)
- Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed. The current study indicates that bilingual Turkish immigrants have better executive functioning and episodic memory compared to Turkish immigrant monolinguals. Whether this is due to the effects of bilingualism or reflects inherent cognitive abilities in those able to acquire bilingualism in later life remains to be resolved (Nielson, et al., 2019)
Cognitive Flexibility

- Bilinguals may be uniquely receptive to growth mindset interventions due to their increased cognitive flexibility. (Grote et al., 2021)
- Barbu et al. (2018) showed that high frequency switchers (HFLSs) outperformed low-frequency switchers (LFLSs) on a mental flexibility task but not on alertness or response inhibition tasks. The aim of the study was to replicate these results as well as to compare proficient (HFLSs and LFLSs to a control group of monolingual participants. Two groups of proficient bilingual adult (30 HFLSs and 21 LFLSs) and a group of 28 monolinguals participated in the study. The results showed superior mental flexibility skills in HFLSs compared to
| Executive advantages associated with bilingualism may stem from language switching frequency rather than from bilingualism per se (Prior and Gollan, 2011). | (LFLs) and monolinguals; furthermore, the two latter groups showed no difference in mental flexibility skills. These results provide novel support for the hypothesis that the so-called bilingual advantage is, in fact, a result of language-switching habits (Barbu et al., 2020). Recent studies have proposed that the executive advantages associated with bilingualism may stem from language-switching frequency rather than from bilingualism per se (see, for example, Prior and Gollan, 2011). |
| Protection from Dementia/Alzheimer’s | Knowing a second language is: Cognitive/enriching’, which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease, an ability to express oneself in more ways along with an ability to notice/think differently and to widen horizons (Schweizer et al. 2012). Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit superior problem-solving skills compared to peers. These skills are associated with a lower incidence of Alzheimer’s and dementia (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008). Bilinguals revealed patterns that were consistent with the interpretation of protection from cognitive reserve when compared with monolinguals (Bialystok, 2021). |
| Literacy Skills | One consistent finding in terms of the effects of reading in two languages has been the higher phonological awareness and processing ability found in biliterate bilinguals with two alphabetic languages such as English and Spanish (Bialystok et al., 2005). |
| Brain Research | Gray matter volume was higher in language and EF brain regions among bilinguals, but no differences were found in memory regions (Torres, et al., 2022). A bilingual speaker’s brain has two active language systems even when he is using only one language. That creates situations in which one system obstructs the other. This interference turns out to be a blessing, not a handicap, because it forces the brain to resolve internal conflict, which gives the mind a workout that strengthens its cognitive muscles (Bhattacharjee 2012). |
creates situations in which one system obstructs the other. This interference forces the brain to resolve internal conflict, which gives the mind a workout that strengthens its cognitive muscles (Bhattacharjee 2012)

- Bilingual experience improves the brain’s executive functioning (Bhattacharjee, 2012)

**Culture of Intellectualism**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attitudes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- DL students had positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language. They perceive benefits from being bilingual (Cho et al., 2023)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child (Cardenas, 1986)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Failure to allow sufficient language development before the transition will result in a child being unable to cope with anything but the most shallow levels of learning and will affect that child’s future capability for learning. (Cardenas, 1986)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The extent to which a person develops his or her intellectual capacity depends greatly on the extent of language acquisition and use (Cardenas, 1986)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive Function of the Brain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Researchers have now identified cognitive advantages for bilingual children that include enhanced executive function of the brain, resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001; Diaz &amp; Klinger, 1991); increased short-term memory (Morales, Calvo, &amp;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Function of the Brain
- Resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001)
- Bilinguals show better executive function and metalinguistic awareness (Adesope et al. 2010).

### Bilingual Advantage
- Studies support a domain-general processing advantage (e.g., attention, recall, associations) in bilinguals (Barac et al. 2014) with greater accuracy, better reaction times on nonverbal tasks, more fluid switching, and stronger performances on working memory tasks (Ransdell et al. 2001), perhaps developing a specialized form of long-term working memory that can support reading and writing.

### Processing Advantage
- Before correcting estimates for observed publication bias, the analyses revealed a very small bilingual advantage for inhibition, shifting, and working memory, but not for monitoring or attention. No evidence for a bilingual advantage remained after correcting for bias. (Antfolk et al., 2018)
- Study: (Anton, 2018) In this study the researchers explored the potential impact of bilingualism on executive functioning abilities by testing large groups of young adult bilinguals and monolinguals in the tasks that were most extensively used when the advantages were reported. Researchers found no differences between groups in their performance. The evidence presented here indicates that the bilingual advantage might indeed be caused by spurious uncontrolled factors rather than bilingualism per se. (Anton, 2018)
- Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions. (Anton, 2018)

### Working Memory
- No evidence for a bilingual advantage remained after correcting for bias. (Antfolk et al., 2018)
- Researchers found no differences between groups in their performance. The evidence presented here indicates that the bilingual advantage might indeed be caused by spurious uncontrolled factors rather than bilingualism per se. (Anton, 2018)
- Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions. (Anton, 2018)

### Theory of Mind
- Being bilingual may also increase “understanding of other people, their mental and knowledge states” (Barac et al. 2014) or what is known as “theory of mind” (Goetz 2003).
as “theory of mind” (Goetz 2003).

**Brain Research**
- Bilinguals have been shown to have “increased density of grey matter in the left inferior parietal cortex” (Bialystok 2009, p. 3) that is more pronounced among those with more L2 proficiency.
- Simultaneous bilingual brains evidence more white matter density (in the anterior cingulate) than sequential bilinguals (Mohades et al. 2015).

**Executive Function Advantage**
- Executive functions are positively correlated to both socio-economic status (SES, e.g., Nesbitt et al., 2013) and academic performance (for review, see Serpell & Esposito, 2016). The pattern of results supported an academic advantage for intermediate TWDL students. The advantage in executive functions was less robust, emerging for TWDL students in behavioral ratings but not in computerized measures. Using the behavioral rating measure of executive functions and a standardized measure of math performance, we did find evidence for executive functions as a mechanism supporting the academic advantage. While there were few differences between those in TWDL mainstream education in the computerized measures of executive functions, the behavioral rating measure revealed a significant difference between education models such that children in the TWDL program exhibited fewer indicators of executive dysfunction in the classroom. The difference was present at both the primary and the intermediate level. The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels.
- Attention difficulty is associated with poor performance on executive functioning (EF) tasks, yet EF is enhanced in bilingual children. Results from hierarchical regressions confirmed that both attention ability and bilingualism contributed to performance on the EF tasks. Attention ability was a stronger predictor for an inhibition task, namely stop signal, and bilingualism a stronger predictor for an interference task, namely flanker (Sorge et al., 2018).
- The extant research suggests bilingualism is associated with enhanced cognitive effects, most evident in attention and executive functioning (EF). After controlling for demographic variables, balance in bilingualism significantly accounted for 37% of the variance in ratings of children’s task initiation (Weber et al., 2014) (Weber, et al., 2014).
- The extant research suggests bilingualism is associated with enhanced cognitive effects, most evident in attention and executive functioning (EF). This study examined the contributions of balance in the bilingualism (Spanish English) of children to performance-based measures and caregiver ratings of EF. Participants included 30 bilingual children. Balance in children’s bilingualism was correlated with caregiver ratings of task initiation. After controlling for demographic variables, balance in bilingualism significantly accounted for 37% of the variance in ratings of children’s task initiation (Weber, et al., 2014).
- Socioeconomic status (SES) and bilingualism have been shown to influence executive functioning during early childhood. Study: Bilingualism moderated the effects of SES by ameliorating the detrimental consequences of low-SES on EF and self-regulatory behaviors. These findings underscore bilingualism’s power to enrich executive functioning and self-regulatory behaviors, especially among underprivileged children (Hartanto et al., 2019).
Recent research suggests that bilinguals might exhibit advantages in several areas of executive function, including working memory, inhibitory control, and attentional control. Across three experiments, bilingual children exhibited superior performance on two different measures of visual–spatial memory, as well as measures of inhibitory and attentional control. These results suggest that bilinguals exhibit broad advantages in executive function during the preschool years, and these advantages are evident within a disadvantaged, low-SES population. (Grote, 2021)

- Bilingual advantages in executive control emerge at an age not previously shown. (Poulin-Dubois, 2010)

- Given that individuals tend to seek out environments and pursuits that best suit their cognitive strengths (Haworth et al., 2010), superior executive functioning might predict which individuals are likely to seek out language learning opportunities in the first place. (Kempe et al., 2015)

- Young bilingual children’s unique experiences lead to greater ability to use cognitive skills to engage in goal-directed behavior, when compared to monolingual children. Therefore, bilingualism may have important influences on cognitive development that can help support children’s success in school and beyond. (Goodrich, 2022)

- Advanced inhibitory control skills have been found in bilingual speakers as compared to monolingual controls (Bialystok, 1999).

- Bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function better than both other groups. Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call for managing conflicting attentional demands (Conflict tasks);

- There is debate over the extent to which the unique experiences of these developmental effect might predict which individuals are likely to seek out language learning opportunities in the first place. (Haworth et al., 2010), superior executive functioning may, at least in part, arise because superior executive functioning is a cause rather than a consequence of bilingualism. Moreover, given that individuals tend to seek out environments and pursuits that best suit their cognitive strengths (Haworth et al., 2010), superior executive functioning might predict which individuals are likely to seek out language learning opportunities in the first place. (Kempe et al., 2015)

- However, bilinguals obtained higher scores than both groups of monolinguals on three tests of executive functioning: Luria’s tapping task measuring response inhibition, the opposite world task requiring children to assign incongruent labels to a sequence of animal pictures, and reverse categorization in which children needed to reclassify a set of objects into incongruent categories after an initial classification. This evidence for a bilingual advantage in aspects of executive functioning at an earlier age than previously reported is discussed in terms of the possibility that bilingual language production may not be the only source of these developmental effect (Bialystok, 2010)

- Recent research suggests that bilinguals might exhibit advantages in several areas of executive function, including working memory, inhibitory control, and attentional control. Across three experiments, bilingual children exhibited superior performance on two different measures of visual–spatial memory, as well as measures of inhibitory and attentional control. These results suggest that bilinguals exhibit broad advantages in executive function during the preschool years, and these advantages are evident within a disadvantaged, low-SES population. (Grote, 2021)

- Bilingual children have been shown to outperform monolingual children on tasks measuring executive functioning skills. This advantage is usually attributed to bilinguals’ extensive practice in exercising selective attention and cognitive flexibility during language use because both languages are active when one of them is being used. Native bilingual children performed significantly better than monolingual children on the Stroop task, with no difference between groups on the other tasks, confirming the specificity of bilingual effects to conflict tasks reported in older children. These results demonstrate that bilingual advantages in executive control emerge at an age not previously shown. (Poulin-Dubois, 2010)

- Bilinguals’ routine deployment of selective attention and inhibition in the domain of language is assumed to hone these executive processes to such an extent that far transfer of attentional control to non-linguistic domains ultimately occurs. Hence, bilinguals are expected to outperform monolinguals on non-linguistic executive functioning tasks. Links between bilingualism and executive functioning may, at least in part, arise because superior executive functioning is a cause rather than a consequence of bilingualism. Moreover, given that individuals tend to seek out environments and pursuits that best suit their cognitive strengths (Haworth et al., 2010), superior executive functioning might predict which individuals are likely to seek out language learning opportunities in the first place. (Kempe et al., 2015)

- There is debate over the extent to which the unique experiences of bilingual children afford advantages in cognitive development. Our findings suggest that young bilingual children’s unique experiences lead to greater ability to use cognitive skills to engage in goal-directed behavior, when compared to monolingual children. Therefore, bilingualism may have important influences on cognitive development that can help support children’s success in school and beyond. (Goodrich, 2022)

- Advanced inhibitory control skills have been found in bilingual speakers as compared to monolingual controls (Bialystok, 1999). After statistically controlling for these factors and age, native bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function better than both other groups. Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call
there was no advantage on impulse-control (Delay tasks). (Carlson, 2008)

| Executive Function Disadvantage/ No Advantage | This book examines the hypothesis that using two languages leads to the enhancement of domain-general executive functioning (EF) and argues that either the bilingual advantage does not exist or is restricted to very specific circumstances. The conclusion extends to situations where EF is referred to as self-control, self-regulation, self-discipline, attention-control, impulse control, inhibitory control, cognitive control, and willpower. **Empirical evidence does not support a bilingual advantage on EF that is distinguishable from zero.** This includes new data that compares tests of the bilingual advantage hypothesis based on self-reports of cognitive control to performance-based measures of EF (Paap, 2018)

• For verbal fluency, our analyses indicated a small bilingual disadvantage, possibly reflecting less exposure for each individual language when using two languages in a balanced manner (Antfolk et al.)

• Researchers conclude that the available evidence does not provide systematic support for the widely held notion that bilingualism is associated with benefits in cognitive control functions in adults. (Antfolk et al.)

• Study: (Anton, 2018) In this study the researchers explored the potential impact of bilingualism on executive functioning abilities by testing large groups of young adults' bilinguals and monolinguals in the tasks that were most extensively used when the advantages were reported. Researchers found no differences between groups in their performance. The evidence presented here indicates that the bilingual advantage might indeed be caused by spurious uncontrolled factors rather than bilingualism per se. Secondly, bilingualism has been argued to potentially affect working memory also. Therefore, these researchers tested the same participants in both a forward and a backward version of a visual and an auditory working memory task. **Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions.**

• One potential reason for discrepant findings across studies examining the bilingual advantage is the difficulty in matching monolingual and bilingual groups on important confounding variables that are elated to EF. **No effects of bilingualism were observed for performance-based measures of working memory or cognitive flexibility.** Results are discussed in the context of recent theoretical models of EF development in early childhood. (Goodrich, 2022).

| EF in Bilingual Children with Disabilities | Research in typically developing children has noted advantages for bilinguals in domains such as executive functioning and social |
- Our findings indicate that the bilingual advantage in executive functioning may extend to children with neurodevelopmental conditions. (Ratto et al., 2020)

| skills, but less is known about the effects in ASD. Our findings indicate that the bilingual advantage in executive functioning may extend to children with neurodevelopmental conditions. (Ratto et al., 2020) |
How does participation in a dual language program impact the educational development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Development</th>
<th>Academic Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reading Achievement</strong></td>
<td>Students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized reading and mathematics tests (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized reading and mathematics tests (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
<td><strong>Students in DLE programs score similar to their statewide peers by about grade 5-7, if not sooner</strong> (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students in DLE programs score similar to their statewide peers by about grade 5-7, if not sooner (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
<td><strong>Students in DLE programs achieve at or above grade level in reading tests measured in the partner language</strong> (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• DLE middle and high school students are more likely to pass the high school exit exam (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
<td><strong>DLE middle and high school students are more likely to pass the high school exit exam</strong> (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students who remained in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake student in English-only programs at about the 5th grade; by high school, the were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured, including English language arts scores and reclassification to English-proficient status (Gandara, 2015)</td>
<td><strong>Students who remained in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake student in English-only programs at about the 5th grade; by high school, the were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured, including English language arts scores and reclassification to English-proficient status</strong> (Gandara, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In both subjects, DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. These results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. (Torph &amp; Murphy, 2021)</td>
<td><strong>Research was conducted to compare former English Learners placed in GE settings and those who remained in DL classrooms on state tests in English Language Arts (ELA) and math (n = 99) at the middle-school level. In both subjects, DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. Calling into question policies favoring placement of former English Learners in GE classes, the results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification.</strong> (Torph &amp; Murphy, 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In this study, researchers used a quasi-experimental, longitudinal design to examine the English language arts (ELA) and mathematics test scores of emergent bilinguals (EBs) in DLBE 50:50 models versus English as a second language (ESL) models in Indiana over four academic school years. Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)</td>
<td><strong>In this study, researchers used a quasi-experimental, longitudinal design to examine the English language arts (ELA) and mathematics test scores of emergent bilinguals (EBs) in DLBE 50:50 models versus English as a second language (ESL) models in Indiana over four academic school years. Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex.</strong> (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In North Carolina, DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas &amp; Collier, 2012).</td>
<td><strong>In North Carolina, DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level</strong> (Thomas &amp; Collier, 2012).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This pilot study compares the overall academic achievement in the area of language arts literacy among elementary bilingual...</td>
<td><strong>This pilot study compares the overall academic achievement in the area of language arts literacy among elementary bilingual...</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. (Torph & Murphy, 2021)

- Students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)

- DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas & Collier, 2012).

- Students who have continuously enrolled in a Dual Language: Two Way Immersion Bilingual Program reveal higher academic achievement than students enrolled in an Early Exit, Transitional Bilingual program, from kindergarten to third grade (Nascimento, 2017)

- Classroom peer grit, not individual grit, was a strong predictor of individual literacy achievement 4 months later among dual language, largely Latina/o elementary school students. This study holds implications for educators of dual language learners who would be interested in the conclusion that grit’s role in literacy achievement may not lie solely in an individual’s character, but also in an individual’s classroom context among dual language learner elementary schoolchildren (O’Neal, 2018)

- Thomas & Collier have found that in the North Carolina districts with two-way, dual-language instruction, students score statistically significantly higher in reading in 4th grade than their nondual-language peers, a pattern that continues through 8th grade. By 5th grade, dual language students score about the same as their monolingual peers a grade ahead of them, an advantage that lasts through 8th grade. The same pattern plays out in math, with 5th-grade dual-language students scoring as high as non-program peers in 6th grade. Two groups of students are benefitting the most from dual language instruction: English language learners and African-American students. For English-learners in dual language programs, reading scores in all the tested grades are much higher than for English Learners who are not in a dual-language program, according to the study. (Maxwell, 2015)

- A new study from RAND Education and the American Councils for International Education in conjunction with the Portland Public Schools has examined the effects of dual-language immersion (DU) on student achievement. The study covered DU programs in Spanish, Japanese, Mandarin Chinese, Russian, and Vietnamese, and included two-way programs, where half the students in the program were native speakers of English and the other half native speakers of the partner (non-English) language. The study found that: Students randomly assigned to immersion outperformed their peers in English reading by about seven months in fifth grade and nine months in eighth grade. There was no statistically significant benefit, but also no detriment, for math and science performance. There were no clear differences in immersion effects by native language. Reading effects for students whose native language matches the classroom partner language appear as high as or higher than for native English speakers. There is suggestive but not statistically significant evidence that the immersion benefit in reading is higher for students in Spanish immersion programs, and that modest math benefits are higher for students in the less commonly taught languages (Japanese, Mandarin, and Russian). Immersion students have three-point lower rates of classification as English Language Learners (English Learners) by sixth grade, and this effect is
• Students randomly assigned to immersion outperformed their peers in English reading by about seven months in fifth grade and nine months in eighth grade. There was no statistically significant benefit, but also no detriment, for math and science performance (RAND).

| Math Achievement | In this study, researchers present quantitative findings on the effects of English-Spanish dual language immersion on student achievement in science and mathematics in grades 3, 4, and 5. Dual language programs promote positive academic and social outcomes for all students and particularly for English language learners When put together well, dual language programs can have a profound impact on student outcomes. Clarkson (2007) writes that “the evidence that bilingual young people, relative to monolingual controls, show greater cognitive flexibility, creativity, divergent thought and improved problem-solving abilities, is very persuasive” (pp. 192-93). One effect of these cognitive advantages is increased academic achievement, including in mathematics and science. (Clarkson, 2007)

| Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021) | Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)

| DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas & Collier, 2012). | In North Carolina, DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas & Collier, 2012).

| The results from this natural experiment indicate that students in a DLI program that has been implemented state-wide were able to succeed academically in math (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018) | This article reports on a study that investigated achievement in math of third and fourth grade dual language immersion (DLI) students, building on research that has demonstrated the academic achievement of students who receive content instruction predominantly in the target language. This study expands the scope and methodology of prior research by including one-way programs in three languages (Chinese, French and Spanish) and two-way Spanish-English programs; and by relying on propensity matching to mitigate possible effects of school and student differences. In the third-grade study, researchers compared students’ math scores in relation to their English Language Arts (ELA) achievement to control for pre-existing differences between DLI and non-DLI students. DLI students who attained the same levels in ELA, and who received math instruction in a target language, performed at the same level as their non-DLI peers in third grade math tests given in English. For the fourth-grade study, we compared DLI students to a propensity-matched non-DLI group. DLI students grew more in math than their counterparts not in DLI. The results from this natural experiment indicate that students in a DLI program... |

| Marian et al. (2013) investigated the academic achievement of students in grades 3, 4, or 5 (approximately ages 8–10 years), a portion of which were enrolled in a two-way dual-language program. larger (14 points) if students’ native language matches the classroom partner language. On average, immersion students reach intermediate levels of partner-language proficiency by eighth grade, with somewhat higher performance in Spanish and Chinese (intermediate mid-to-high) than in Japanese (intermediate low-to-mid). (Burkhauser et al., 2016) | The results from this natural experiment indicate that students in a DLI program... |
They found an advantage in academic performance in math across all three grade levels and reading in 3rd grade. The dual-language students showed greater growth in math achievement across the 4th grade year compared to mainstreamed English students (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018). A new study from RAND Education and the American Councils for International Education in conjunction with the Portland Public Schools has examined the effects of dual-language immersion (DU) on student achievement. The study covered DU programs in Spanish, Japanese, Mandarin Chinese, Russian, and Vietnamese, and included two-way programs, where half the students in the program were native speakers of English and the other half native speakers of the partner (non-English) language. The study found that: Students randomly assigned to immersion outperformed their peers in English reading by about seven months in fifth grade and nine months in eighth grade. There was no statistically significant benefit, but also no detriment, for math and science performance. There were no clear differences in immersion effects by native language. 

**Reading effects for students whose native language matches the classroom partner language appear as high as or higher than for native English speakers.** There is suggestive but not statistically significant evidence that the immersion benefit in reading is higher for students in Spanish immersion programs, and that modest math benefits are higher for students in the less commonly taught languages (Japanese, Mandarin, and Russian). Immersion students have three-point lower rates of classification as English Language Learners (English Learners) by sixth grade, and this effect is larger (14 points) if students’ native language matches the classroom partner language. On average, immersion students reach intermediate levels of partner-language proficiency by eighth grade, with somewhat higher performance in Spanish and Chinese (intermediate mid-to-high) than in Japanese (intermediate low-to-mid).(Burkhauser et al., 2016)

- Marian et al. (2013) investigated the academic achievement of students in grades 3, 4, or 5 (approximately ages 8–10 years), a portion of which were enrolled in a two-way dual-language program. They found an advantage in academic performance in math across all three grade levels and reading in 3rd grade. 
- Watzinger-Tharp, Swenson, and Mayne (2018) examined growth in over 2000 4th grade students in either mainstream English education or a dual-language education model (comprised of both one-way and two-way models across three partner languages). In a matched-sample of mainstream and dual-language students, the dual-language students showed greater growth in math achievement across the 4th grade year.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Achievement Gap</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- English Learners close the achievement gap with NES students in English-Only classrooms by about fifth grade (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- DLE middle and high school students are more likely to close the gap with NES peers by the end of high school (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ideally, English Learners would learn in communities where their culture and language are valued, such as dual language classrooms where content and language arts are taught both in English and Spanish. The benefits of such models include accelerated academic progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap (Oberg &amp; Phillips, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Research shows that long-term DL programs can close achievement gaps between English-proficient speakers and emergent bilinguals after five years, while short-term</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

-英语学习者在英语-唯一教室中的成就差距在五年级前关闭（林德霍姆-利里，2012）
-同时，英语学习者可能在高中时期更有可能关闭与英语同行的差距（林德霍姆-利里，2012）
-理想情况下，英语学习者将学习在重视其文化和语言的社区中，例如双语教室，内容和语言艺术在英语和西班牙语中都被教授。这种模式的好处包括加速学术进步和成就差距的缩小（奥伯格和菲利普斯，2014）
-研究显示，长期DL项目可以减少英语熟练者和新兴的双语者的差距，尽管短时间
language are valued, such as dual language classrooms where content and language arts are taught both in English and Spanish. The benefits of such models include accelerated academic progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap (Oberg & Phillips, 2014).

- Research shows that long-term DL programs can close achievement gaps between English-proficient speakers and emergent bilinguals after five years, while short-term bilingual or English-only transitional programs close only about half of that gap (Collier & Thomas, 2017).

**Academic Achievement Success**

- The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels, yet the academic advantage was only present in the intermediate students (Esposito, 2020).
- Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages (Gandara, 2015).
- Multiple studies indicate that children in bilingual education models (including dual-language and immersion models) have academic outcomes that match or even exceed those of their peers in mainstream education models, especially in later elementary grades (Esposito, 2020).
- Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics (Gomez et al., 2005).
- Esposito (2020) that two-way dual-language education fosters executive functions similar to the advantage found in bilingual individuals and that well-developed executive functions are a mechanism for an academic advantage. The results did indicate that the academic advantage found on the standardized math assessment for children at the intermediate level of the TWDL program was mediated by executive functions behaviors exhibited in the classroom. The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels, yet the academic advantage was only present in the intermediate students.
- Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages (Gandara, 2015).
- Multiple studies indicate that children in bilingual education models (including dual-language and immersion models) have academic outcomes that match or even exceed those of their peers in mainstream education models, especially in later elementary grades (Esposito, 2020).
- Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics (Gomez et al., 2005).
- This longitudinal study was conducted to gain understanding of the social–emotional and academic development of economically disadvantaged bilingual preschool children. Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development. In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were associated with later academic achievement and growth of English proficiency. Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism (Oades-Sese et al., 2011).
- Employing a mixed-methods research design, this study examines how a newly designed dual language program in an urban school advances language proficiencies among Spanish-
- Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism (Oades-Sese et al., 2011)

- The results drawn from both quantitative and qualitative data indicate that bilingual students benefited from attending a dual language program. It contributes positively to students’ academic achievement, bilingual school identification and commitment to language learning. (Bruitt-Griffler & Jang, 2022)

- DL programming improves academic outcomes for traditionally under-served groups while fostering diverse learning environments for all learners. Students in DL programs outperform students who participate in non-DL programs (Palencia et al., 2021)

- Bilinguals entering Head Start with English proficiency showed similar developmental trajectories in vocabulary and math to those of monolinguals. Second, EBs entering Head Start with limited English proficiency presented the lowest baseline skills in vocabulary and math. Whereas the initial vocabulary gaps generally persisted over time, gaps in math between EBs and monolinguals narrowed by kindergarten. Third, no difference was found between bilinguals and EBs in their Spanish vocabulary development (Choi et al., 2018)

- Findings suggest consistent support for the two-way immersion program over matched control students across all three achievement areas. It

| English bilingual 6th graders in relation to content area achievement as measured on NYS standardized tests in English Language Arts and Math. It further investigates how students’ emotional (school identification) and behavioral engagement (language learning commitment) relate to bilingual language proficiencies. The results drawn from both quantitative and qualitative data indicate that bilingual students benefited from attending a dual language program. It contributes positively to students’ academic achievement, bilingual school identification and commitment to language learning. With respect to language development, the study found that English proficiency in productive skills was positively correlated with standardized test scores. Spanish proficiency was positively correlated with students’ commitment to language learning. Spanish and English languages play different but equally important functions in the dual language program. However, students face challenges in sustaining learning the two languages in school; researchers show that students experience a gradual language shift from Spanish to English. The study underscores the potential benefits of a multilingual proficiency perspective theory among the students and in preparing bilingual teachers. (Bruitt-Griffler & Jang, 2022) |
| Additional research finds that DL programming improves academic outcomes for traditionally under-served groups while fostering diverse learning environments for all learners. Students in DL programs outperform students who participate in non-DL programs (Palencia et al., 2021) |
| Internationally, research shows the most powerful predictor of academic achievement for emergent bilinguals is the sustained development of the students’ home language through the school curriculum (Collier & Thomas, 2017). Within an asset-focused context, students have an opportunity to build linguistic capital, defined as “the intellectual and social skills attained through communication experiences in more than one language and/or style” (Yosso, 2005, p. 78). |
| Using a large longitudinal dataset including children who attended Head Start over two years, this study examined academic growth trajectories during the period between Head Start entry and kindergarten (2.5 years), and whether those growth trajectories differ by children’s dual language learning status. Analyses comparing three groups of children (i.e., Spanish–English bilinguals, Spanish–English emergent bilinguals [EBs], and English monolinguals) showed three noteworthy findings. First, bilinguals entering Head Start with English proficiency showed similar developmental trajectories in vocabulary and math to those of monolinguals. Second, EBs entering Head Start with limited English proficiency presented the lowest baseline skills in vocabulary and math. Whereas the initial vocabulary gaps generally persisted over time, gaps in math between EBs and monolinguals narrowed by kindergarten. Third, no difference was found between bilinguals and EBs in their Spanish vocabulary development (Choi et al., 2018) |
| The purpose of this study was to analyze the effects of a two-way immersion elementary school program on academic achievement at the end of the elementary school and the end of the first year of junior high school. Longitudinal high stakes test data in reading, writing, and mathematics were collected on native English speakers and native Spanish speakers from the two-way immersion program and on matched controls through the use of |
• When properly implemented, DLPs are an effective way to improve academic achievement for all students (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).
• Data has demonstrated that DLPs have benefited both English Learners and native English-speaking students in obtaining higher levels of academic achievement in all areas, as compared to their counterparts in mainstream classrooms (Thomas & Collier, 2012).
• In states with high numbers of English Learners, such as Arizona, implementing a two-way 50/50 model can be beneficial for the academic achievement of all students involved in such programs. (Gomez & Cisneros, 2020)
• If the number of Latino students in your school is high, dual language programs can increase their academic achievement while also developing their biliteracy and bilingual skills (Gomez, 2005)

---

English Learners with Disabilities

• English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth (Rodriguez, 2009)

Language Acquisition

• Two-way immersion models that support the home language and culture and integrate language majority and minority learners were associated with faster English acquisition, which mediated the link between Two-Way Immersion (TWI) programs and higher GPAs (Serafini et al., 2022)

---

The literature on bilingual special education demonstrates that English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth. For English Learners with disabilities to succeed in bilingual special education programs, they need to be part of a school that promotes bilingualism and provides students with exemplary instructional practices. (Rodriguez, 2009)
and higher GPAs (Serafini et al., 2022)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School/College Readiness</th>
<th>Elementary School Readiness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>College Readiness</strong></td>
<td><strong>Elementary School Readiness</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| • A statistically significant difference was found in the performance of the participants in the areas of mathematics and science. Overall, DL participants outperformed TB participants. (Garza-Reyna, 2019)  
• A statistically significant difference was found on the t-tests run for the Reading (p > .000) and English (p > .000) portions of the ACT exam. “In the area of Reading, the TB comparison group (10.8%) had less than the DL comparison group (51.8%) meet the recommended minimum score outlined in the TUAP. Similar findings were found on the English portion of the ACT exam. By and large, DL participants outperformed the TB participants in this study. (Garza-Reyna et al., 2019)  
• The benefits of a program include improved college readiness for all students involved -- not just the English Language Learners, who are largely Spanish speakers in the Crossroads, said Alejandro Mojica, the Victoria school districts newly hired Bilingual and ESL Learning director. "Research shows that by the time they reach high school, these students are more college-ready than their peers who didn't participate in an immersion program." (Astrain, 2014).  
• This causal-comparative study analyzed the college readiness of Latino English Learners educated in two different bilingual education programs, Transitional Bilingual (TB) and Dual Language (DL), by examining science and mathematics scores on the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the ACT. A statistically significant difference was found in the performance of the participants in the areas of mathematics and science via a series of t-tests. The descriptive statistics report that DL participants had a 29.6% higher probability in science and a 15.2% higher probability in mathematics of being college ready, per the Texas Uniform Admission Policy. Overall, DL participants outperformed TB participants. (Garza-Reyna, 2019)  
• This study compared the performance of bilingual learners, educated in either a Transitional Bilingual (TB) or Dual Language (DL) program, on the Reading and English portions of the nationally recognized college entrance exam, the American College Test (ACT). A statistically significant difference was found on the t-tests run for the Reading (p > .000) and English (p > .000) portions of the ACT exam. Outlined in the Texas Uniform Admission Policy (TUAP) are recommended minimum scores students should meet in order to be deemed “college ready.” In the area of Reading, the TB comparison group (10.8%) had less than the DL comparison group (51.8%) meet the recommended minimum score outlined in the TUAP. Similar findings were found on the English portion of the ACT exam. A smaller percentage of participants in the TB comparison group (9%) meet the TUAP recommended minimum score for English than the DL comparison group (59.1%). By and large, DL participants out-performed the TB participants in this study. (Garza-Reyna et al., 2019)  
• The idea behind the immersion program is to get students from different backgrounds to work together while simultaneously aiding each other in communication. The benefits of a program include improved college readiness for all students involved -- not just the English Language Learners, who are largely Spanish speakers in the Crossroads, said Alejandro Mojica, the Victoria school districts newly hired Bilingual and ESL Learning director. “Both groups of students would benefit from each other,” said Mojica, a Columbia native. "Research shows that by the time they reach high school, these students are more college-ready than their peers who didn’t participate in an immersion program.” (Astrain, 2014).  
| **College Readiness** | **Elementary School Readiness** |
| • Young children learning two languages demonstrate school readiness factors: strong social-emotional development and executive function” skills, such as listening and following directions (Ford, 2010)  
• This study examined how parents, teachers, and administrators conceptualized dual-language immersion (DLI) education and its
“executive function” skills, such as listening and following directions (Ford, 2010)

- With a framework of neoliberal linguistic instrumentalism, the preschool conceptualized its DLL as an enriching context for students to obtain a cognitive, social, and academic edge. Cognitive development, social competencies, and school readiness were primary goals while bilingualism/biliteracy was a secondary bonus if achieved. (Chen, 2022)

- DLLs had school readiness difficulties in Japanese language skills and ToM, but not in EF, compared to their Japanese monolingual peers. The positive relationship of language and EF skills with ToM development, which is commonly reported in monolingual children, extended to an understudied population of DLLs in this study. (Sudo & Matsui, 2021)

- Results revealed statistically significant relations between teachers’ Spanish talk and DLLs’ social outcomes. Specifically, teachers’ Spanish talk with DLLs and DLLs’ initial English and Spanish skills were positively associated with the latter’s interactive peer play behaviors, whereas DLLs’ initial English skills were negatively associated with their disconnected peer play behaviors. (Limlingan et al., 2022)

| Goals at Bobcat Canyon School (BCS, pseudonym), a private preschool in the Southwestern USA where 64% students were White and 36% were students of color. The analysis revealed that with a framework of neoliberal linguistic instrumentalism, the preschool conceptualized its DLI as an enriching context for students to obtain a cognitive, social, and academic edge. Cognitive development, social competencies, and school readiness were primary goals while bilingualism/biliteracy was a secondary bonus if achieved. (D. Chen, 2022)
| The present study investigated school readiness in Brazilian (Portuguese-Japanese dual language learner or DLL) 5-year-olds in Japan (1) by examining their language skills, executive function (EF), and theory of mind (ToM) in comparison to their monolingual peers and (2) by investigating the developmental relations between these three skills. DLLs scored lower than monolinguals in Japanese language skills, specifically in receptive vocabulary and the understanding of complement clauses in Japanese. In conclusion, DLLs had school readiness difficulties in Japanese language skills and ToM, but not in EF, compared to their Japanese monolingual peers. Furthermore, the positive relationship of language and EF skills with ToM development, which is commonly reported in monolingual children, extended to an understudied population of DLLs in this study. (Sudo & Matsui, 2021)
| Preschool is a critical period during which children’s development and learning exert a long-lasting impact on their school adjustment and academic outcomes. Using multilevel modeling, this study examined the specific ways teachers use students’ home language (Spanish) in their various verbal exchanges in the classroom (i.e., giving directions, requesting language, providing, and eliciting contextualized information, and providing and eliciting decontextualized information). These conversations with Latino DLLs, as measured by the Language Interaction Snapshot, uniquely contributed to students’ language and social skills at the end of the Head Start academic year. Results revealed statistically significant relations between teachers’ Spanish talk and DLLs’ social outcomes. Specifically, teachers’ Spanish talk with DLLs and DLLs’ initial English and Spanish skills were positively associated with the latter’s interactive peer play behaviors, whereas DLLs’ initial English skills were negatively associated with their disconnected peer play behaviors. (Limlingan et al., 2022)
| Researchers examined the school readiness skills of 217 Latino DLLs attending Head Start taking into account specific teacher characteristics that may impact the development of readiness skills. Different teacher characteristics have different effects on the developmental outcomes. Amount of training had a positive significant effect on several children’s outcomes in English and in Spanish. The years of experience a teacher had working in classrooms with DLLs had a positive effect on children’s English spelling skills. Teachers’ cultural competency rating had a positive effect on receptive language and literacy in Spanish. (Ramirez et al., 2019)
| Emerging research shows there is substantial heterogeneity in the English and Spanish language and literacy proficiencies of dual language learners (DLLs) in U.S. preschools. This work is extended in this paper by examining within-group variability in 320 Spanish-English speaking DLLs’ cognitive, linguistic, literacy, and mathematics skills at the end of prekindergarten (M = 5.22 years old). Using latent profile analysis (a type of mixture
modeling), four profiles of DLLs were identified. Most DLLs were classified as English Dominant, followed by Balanced Average, Spanish Dominant, and Balanced Low, respectively. In general, the Balanced Average profile outperformed the other profiles in English and Spanish, and their norm-referenced standard scores provide additional evidence that bilingual development is not associated with educational risk. (López & Foster, 2021)

| Preschool Attendance | Achievement gaps are already established when DLLs enter kindergarten without having attended a preschool program, such as being less able to recognize English letters, count to 20, or write their names compared with their English-dominant peers (Ansari, 2018).
| Preschool attendance promotes the native or first language (L1) and the target or second language (L2; English) and literacy development (Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016; Phillips et al., 2017).
| Academic language and social-behavioral skills also increase when DLLs attend public preschool programs (Ansari & López, 2015).
| Attending formalized preschool environments can raise literacy and math scores for DLL children while reducing inequality in kindergarten (Barnett et al., 2020; Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016). |

<p>| Literacy Development | Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support |
| Over 30% of children in the US are dual language learners who are learning two languages. Few have simultaneously examined development of skills in both languages for children in preschool. The purpose of this study was to examine the language and literacy skills in both Spanish and English in secondary data analyses of three studies of DLL children. Hierarchical linear model analyses compared acquisition of language skills in English and Spanish in three studies. Using language and time as nesting factors, these models allow for direct contrast of level and rate of acquisition across languages. Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills. (Hammer et al., 2020) |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Language Acquisition</th>
<th>English Literacy Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills. (Murphy, 2014)</td>
<td>• The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school. In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis. ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills. (Murphy, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. These effects remained significant even after controlling for students’ English speaking/writing proficiency. (He et al., 2022)</td>
<td>• Researchers analyzed data on eight cohorts of English language learners who were each assigned to one of the four different instructional programs, using up to 10 years of data for each cohort. Researchers compared students in the four programs on three different outcomes: students’ English language acquisition (as measured by their performance on the California English Language Development Test); their academic performance and growth (as measured by their performance on the California Standards Tests in mathematics and English language arts); and their reclassification from English learner status to fluent English proficient status. In all programs, more than 80 percent of English Learners were proficient in English by the end of elementary school, and more than 90 percent were proficient by 7th grade, When possible, invest in high-quality two-language programs. Choose among two-language programs based on community and stakeholder voice.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills. (Hammer et al., 2020)

- Both the DLLs and monolingual English speakers in the study showed similar developmental trajectories on receptive vocabulary, story recall, decoding, and letter and word identification from preschool through the 2nd grade. At end of 2nd grade, the 2 groups’ vocabulary, story recall, reading fluency, decoding, and letter and word identification performances were similar and within the normal range for children their age. The study’s findings suggest that a strong preschool language and literacy program can reduce the English language gap between DLLs and monolingual English speakers from low-income families. (Han et al., 2014)

- Results demonstrate plasticity in early childhood through diverse language exposure and suggest that phonemic representation begins to emerge driven by lexical restructuring. (Smith et al., 2022)

- Both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. (He et al., 2022)

- Children receiving instruction in the CLR bilingual modality had significantly higher posttest scores (than those receiving the ECR English-only instruction) on Spanish and English vocabulary assessments at instruction end and on the Spanish vocabulary assessment at end of 2nd grade. Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills. (Hammer et al., 2020)

- The current study reports on the results of a longitudinal investigation of the language and early literacy development of a sample of dual-language learners (DLLs) and monolingual English speakers from low-income families who received an Early Reading First intervention during their Head Start preschool year. A total of 62 children who entered and remained in the same school district were followed from kindergarten through 2nd grade. The results indicate that both the DLLs and monolingual English speakers in the study showed similar developmental trajectories on receptive vocabulary, story recall, decoding, and letter and word identification from preschool through the 2nd grade. Furthermore, at the end of 2nd grade, the 2 groups’ vocabulary, story recall, reading fluency, decoding, and letter and word identification performances were similar and within the normal range for children their age. The study’s findings suggest that a strong preschool language and literacy program can reduce the English language gap between DLLs and monolingual English speakers from low-income families. (Han et al., 2014)

- The current study explores variation in phonemic representation among Spanish–English dual language learners (DLLs, n = 60) who were dominant in English or in Spanish. Children were given a phonetic discrimination task with speech sounds that: 1) occur in English and Spanish, 2) are exclusive to English, and 3) are exclusive to Russian. During Fall (age m = 57 months) and Spring (age m = 62 months, n = 42). In Fall, English-dominant DLLs discriminated more accurately than Spanish-dominant DLLs between English–Spanish phones and English-exclusive phones. In Spring, however, groups no longer differed in discriminating English-exclusive phones and both groups discriminated Russian phones above chance. Additionally, joint English–Spanish and English-exclusive phonetic discrimination predicted children’s phonological awareness in both groups. Results demonstrate plasticity in early childhood through diverse language exposure and suggest that phonemic representation begins to emerge driven by lexical restructuring. (Smith et al., 2022)

- Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S. Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs. Multiple regression results show that both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. These effects remained significant even after
The results provide additional evidence of the benefits of strategically combining the first and second language to promote English and Spanish vocabulary development in this population. (Méndez et al., 2015)

Future directions for research and clinical applications are discussed. (Méndez et al., 2015)

- DLLs have two separate language systems early in life. Differences in some areas of language development, such as vocabulary, appear to exist among DLLs depending on when they were first exposed to their second language. DLLs’ language and literacy development may differ from that of monolinguals, although DLLs appear to catch up over time. Little is known about factors that influence DLLs’ development, although the amount of language exposure to and usage of DLLs’ two languages appears to play key roles. (Hammer et al., 2014)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language &amp; Literacy Development</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• To summarize the extant literature and guide future research, a critical analysis of the literature was conducted. A search of major databases for studies on young typically developing DLLs between 2000 and 2011 yielded 182 peer reviewed articles. <strong>First, the research shows that DLLs have two separate language systems early in life.</strong> Second, differences in some areas of language development, such as vocabulary, appear to exist among DLLs depending on when they were first exposed to their second language. <strong>Third, DLLs’ language and literacy development may differ from that of monolinguals, although DLLs appear to catch up over time.</strong> Fourth, little is known about factors that influence DLLs’ development, although the amount of language exposure to and usage of DLLs’ two languages appears to play key roles. (Hammer et al., 2014)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>The purpose of this study was to evaluate which aspects of the HLE significantly predict growth in English and Spanish vocabulary among Spanish-speaking DLLs.</strong> 944 Spanish-speaking DLLs (51.6% female; mean age = 53.77 months) completed assessments of English and Spanish vocabulary at 4 time points across 2 academic years. Parents completed a survey of the HLE that included information on language exposure, reading exposure, and family reading habits. <strong>Results indicated that specific literacy-related practices, including availability of books in the home, language read to the child, and parental reading skills were significant predictors of growth in children’s Spanish and English vocabulary knowledge, even after controlling children’s initial level of language skills and family socioeconomic status.</strong> (Goodrich et al., 2021)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Year 2 findings are reported from a longitudinal, experimental-control study involving 31 Spanish speaking preschoolers (aged</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Language Proficiency</td>
<td>Language Acquisition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills. (Murphy 2014)</td>
<td>• The effects of “transitional-bilingual” and “dual-language” educational models on proficiency in students’ home language (Spanish) were examined in a study of English language learners in the first and second grades in a large urban elementary school. In each grade, students were taught with either a transitional-bilingual model or a dual-language one, with a Spanish proficiency assessment administered on a pre/post basis. ANOVA results showed that both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills. In light of research linking proficiency in the home language with achievement in English language skills and content learning, dual-language instruction appears to be more effective than transitional-bilingual education, although the advantage is</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Dual-language instruction appears to be more effective than transitional-bilingual education, although the advantage is limited to the facilitation of home-language verbal expression associated with the dual-language model (Murphy, 2014).

| English Language Proficiency | Grounded in sociocultural theory, this study uses an ecological approach to examine how student interactions within a dual-language school context may offer affordances for increased linguistic and conceptual understanding. Using qualitative analysis of student discourse, this paper focuses on data from recorded interactions between pairs of fifth-grade students engaged in writing activities (in English and Spanish). Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for language (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009).

- TK had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social-emotional skills or executive function. The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry, as compared to Spanish-speaking dual language learners who do not attend. (Holod et al., 2020)

- The results showed that for dual language learners (DLLs, n = 107) growth rates in their German majority language skills

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The impact of California’s transitional kindergarten program on Spanish-speaking dual language learners was examined through two studies. Participants in the two studies included: (1) the statewide population of students who met study inclusion criteria (n = 45,010) and took the California English Language Development Test (CELDT), and (2) a sample of students (n = 1868) in 20 school districts. Findings indicate that TK had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social–emotional skills or executive function. The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry, as compared to Spanish-speaking dual language learners who do not attend. (Holod et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>This study examined the relationship between verbal short-term and working memory, language experience, and English tense-marking skill in Spanish L1-English L2 dual language learners (DLLs). Ten Spanish-English DLLs, in kindergarten and first grade, participated in the study. Children completed the Test of Early Grammatical Impairment, a narrative retell task in English, and verbal memory tasks. Parents provided information regarding language input and output in the home and school environment. Correlational analyses were conducted to examine relationships between English and Spanish input/output, forward and backward digit span, assessed in English and Spanish, and the accurate and productive use of English tense morphemes in various linguistic contexts. Study outcomes indicated varied use of English tense morphemes among DLLs. Additionally, a strong, positive association was found between the use of a variety of distinct tense forms and verbal working memory performance. This study is the first investigation to examine...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Maintaining Home Language | Grounded in sociocultural theory, this study uses an ecological approach to examine how student interactions within a dual-language school context may offer affordances for increased linguistic and conceptual understanding. Using qualitative analysis of student discourse, this paper focuses on data from recorded interactions between pairs of fifth-grade students engaged in writing activities (in English and Spanish). Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009)

- Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009)

- Young DLL children’s oral narrative skills in English as well as in their home language Spanish contributed to their English reading outcomes. Maintaining young DLL children’s home language verbal short-term and working memory and home language experience to advance our understanding of the specific child internal and external factors that may account for the variability in tense marking during English second language acquisition. This research provides further insight to the effects of individual differences on the acquisition of second language grammatical skill during childhood. (Jenkins & Anderson, 2021)

- This study investigated the vocabulary development of children (N = 547) from linguistically and socioeconomically diverse classrooms in Germany from age 3 in preschool to age 7 in Grade 1. The results showed that for dual language learners (DLLs, n = 107) growth rates in their German majority language skills varied over classrooms. Compared to monolingual children, DLLs improved faster in classrooms with higher peer level skills in the majority language than DLLs in classrooms with lower peer-level skills (controlling for socioeconomic status and classroom quality). DLLs showed stronger growth dynamics than monolingual children during later preschool stages. The findings highlight the role of preschool peers in DLLs’ acquisition of the majority language before entering elementary school. (Schmerse, 2021)

- Grounded in sociocultural theory, this study uses an ecological approach to examine how student interactions within a dual-language school context may offer affordances for increased linguistic and conceptual understanding. Using qualitative analysis of student discourse, this paper focuses on data from recorded interactions between pairs of fifth-grade students engaged in writing activities (in English and Spanish). Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009)

- The study examined the contributions of Spanish and English oral narrative skills to English reading among 95 early elementary dual language learners (DLLs) from Spanish-speaking homes in the United States. This sample of first- and third-grade DLL children attended Spanish–English dual language immersion programs and received language and literacy instruction in both English and Spanish. All participants completed a storytelling task in both languages and two English reading tests in decoding and reading comprehension. The story narratives were analyzed for microstructures (number of different new words, lexical diversity [D], mean length of utterance, subordination index [SI]) using the Computerized Language Analysis program. The narrative sample were also evaluated for macrostructures (i.e., discourse-level features) using the Narrative Scoring Scheme. Grade, English D, and Spanish SI significantly predicted English reading. Grade level was the strongest predictor of the three for both decoding and comprehension. However, Spanish SI was more robust than English D for decoding whereas English D was a stronger

varied over classrooms. Compared to monolingual children, DLLs improved faster in classrooms with higher peer level skills in the majority language than DLLs in classrooms with lower peer-level skills (controlling for socioeconomic status and classroom quality). DLLs showed stronger growth dynamics than monolingual children during later preschool stages. The findings highlight the role of preschool peers in DLLs’ acquisition of the majority language before entering elementary school. (Schmerse, 2021)
| Language Development | This study tested the impact of child-directed language input on language development in Spanish–English bilingual infants (N = 25, 11- and 14-month-olds from the Seattle metropolitan area), across languages and independently for each language, controlling for socioeconomic status. Language input was characterized by social interaction variables, defined in terms of

| • Skills may be beneficial, rather than harmful, to their English reading development. (Huang et al., 2022) | • The present study examines the multilingual benefit in relation to language learning and mathematical learning. The objective is to assess whether speakers of three or more languages, depending on language profile and personal histories, show significant advantages in language learning and/or mathematical learning, and whether mother tongue literacy can be associated with their performance in Math and English language tests. Participants are all multilinguals with knowledge of French as an L1 or as a non-native language. Three core groups were examined: (a) School multilinguals (n = 449), typically French L1 speakers with knowledge of two additional languages learned in a formal school context; (b) Multilinguals with Literacy in the home language (n = 45) and Multilinguals without Literacy in the home language (n = 113). All participants were given a Maths test, an English language test and a questionnaire. A questionnaire for parents was also used. Results suggest a positive role of mother tongue literacy in language learning as well as mathematical learning. (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018)

| • Results suggest a positive role of mother tongue literacy in language learning as well as mathematical learning. (Collins, 2014) | • The present study examines the multilingual benefit in relation to language learning and mathematical learning. The objective is to assess whether speakers of three or more languages, depending on language profile and personal histories, show significant advantages in language learning and/or mathematical learning, and whether mother tongue literacy can be associated with their performance in Math and English language tests. Participants are all multilinguals with knowledge of French as an L1 or as a non-native language. Three core groups were examined: (a) School multilinguals (n = 449), typically French L1 speakers with knowledge of two additional languages learned in a formal school context; (b) Multilinguals with Literacy in the home language (n = 45) and Multilinguals without Literacy in the home language (n = 113). All participants were given a Maths test, an English language test and a questionnaire. A questionnaire for parents was also used. Results suggest a positive role of mother tongue literacy in language learning as well as mathematical learning. (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018)

| • Adherence to these guidelines in Spanish–English bilingual education settings results in significant language and literacy achievement for Spanish–English Bilingual learners (Hopewell & Escamilla, 2013; Soltero-González et al., 2012, 2016; Sparrow et al., 2014). We cannot and should not teach them as if they were monolingual English speakers and/or if the LOTE is irrelevant to literacy acquisition. (Escamilla et al., 2021) | • The present study investigates how changes in both Spanish and English proficiencies of Latino, second-generation immigrant children (n = 163) from kindergarten to second grade relate to instructional program type as well as language use at home and school. A series of MANCOVAs demonstrated significant dual language gains in children who were in bilingual classrooms and schools where Spanish was used among the teachers, students, and staff. Furthermore, only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education. (Collins, 2014)

| • Only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education. (Collins, 2014) | • The present study investigates how changes in both Spanish and English proficiencies of Latino, second-generation immigrant children (n = 163) from kindergarten to second grade relate to instructional program type as well as language use at home and school. A series of MANCOVAs demonstrated significant dual language gains in children who were in bilingual classrooms and schools where Spanish was used among the teachers, students, and staff. Furthermore, only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education. (Collins, 2014)
• Teachers contributed markedly to student reading outcomes when they (1) incorporated student perspectives into instruction; (2) promoted autonomy and responsibility; (3) provided instructional opportunities to support higher level thinking; and (4) applied instruction to real-life applications.

• Developing teachers’ emotional warmth and instructional support is particularly salient for teachers of English Learners, who must possess qualities associated with good teaching, both in general (such as content knowledge and pedagogical skills) and, more specifically, for English Learners (proficiency in bilingual education methods). (Lopez, 2012)

• The present study examined the following research questions: (1) What teacher behaviors and student-level characteristics predict student achievement? (2) Do teacher behaviors moderate the relationship between language acquisition models and English Learners’ achievement? Sources of data in this study consist of student demographic variables and reading achievement for 995 students and classroom observation data using the Classroom Assessment Scoring System collected across 46 classrooms in an urban school district in Wisconsin. Hierarchical linear modeling was used to address the research questions. A two-level hierarchical linear modeling analysis revealed that prior achievement, Hispanic and African American ethnicity, and eligibility for free lunch contributed significantly to the model, but gender did not. Teachers contributed markedly to student reading outcomes when they (1) incorporated student perspectives into instruction; (2) promoted autonomy and responsibility; (3) provided instructional opportunities to support higher level thinking; and (4) applied instruction to real-life applications. Cross-level interactions indicate that emotional warmth was particularly salient for English Learners in dual language immersion, whereas instructional support moderated the relationship between developmental bilingual education and reading achievement: Findings from the present study suggest that developing teachers’ emotional warmth and instructional support is particularly salient for teachers of English Learners, who must possess qualities associated with good teaching, both in general (such as content knowledge and pedagogical skills) and, more specifically, for English Learners (proficiency in bilingual education methods). (Lopez, 2012)
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the personal development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Development</th>
<th>Sense of Identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal Perception</td>
<td>• What seems to be missing from the current discussion is the voice of bilingual speakers, that is, how they manage life with two languages and if they perceive a cognitive, social or economic advantages or indeed, disadvantages of knowing two languages more than one language. Tytus reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. <strong>All 92 participants agreed unanimously that knowing a second language is advantageous. Knowing two languages is beneficial in (3) personal (personal development, learning new things and learning additional languages) (Tytus, 2018)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Findings indicate how Roselyn’s shifts in participation lend insight to how she was able to construct identities of herself as a learner in general, and more specifically as a Latina language learner. (Collett, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identity Formation</td>
<td>• <strong>This article explores the interactional co-construction of identities among two first-grade students learning Spanish as a third language in a Spanish-English dual language classroom. Drawing on ethnographic and interactional data, the article focuses on a single interaction between these two “Spanish learners” and two of their Spanish-speaking classmates that took place within the context of a classroom literacy event. Their identity formation always took place within the context of joint social activity—in the presence of and in relation to their classmates. By focusing in depth on a single example of classroom interaction, the researchers’ purpose has been to illustrate the intersubjective back-and-forth dynamic that was central to identity formation among these particular children.</strong> There is a larger context at play here, and attention to how individual speech events such as this one connects with other speech events across time and space (Wortham &amp; Reyes, 2015) is necessary if we are to more fully understand the itineraries of identity (Bucholtz et al. 2012) that students like Alicia and Malik envision, enact, resist, and pursue in their everyday interactions. Researchers maintain that this particular focus on classroom talk—at this particular level of granularity—is warranted precisely because of how this single classroom interaction both reflects and helps constitute larger interactional patterns and broader social structure. (Martínez et al., 2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• There is a larger context at play here, and attention to how individua speech events such as this one connects with other speech events across time and space (Wortham &amp; Reyes, 2015) is necessary if we are to more fully understand the itineraries of identity (Bucholtz et al. 2012) that students like Alicia and Malik envision, enact, resist, and pursue in their everyday interactions. Researchers maintain that this particular focus on classroom talk—at this particular level of granularity—is warranted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| • All 92 participants agreed unanimously that knowing a second language is advantageous. Knowing two languages is beneficial in (3) personal (personal development, learning new things and learning additional languages) (Tytus, 2018) |
| • Findings indicate how Roselyn’s shifts in participation lend insight to how she was able to construct identities of herself as a learner in general, and more specifically as a Latina language learner. (Collett, 2019) |
In this article, we briefly review the literature on cross-cultural outcomes for students in TWI programs and highlight a consistent focus on the self in these studies, particularly as it relates to student identity. As cross-cultural competence begins with awareness of the self within the socially and culturally diverse classrooms that TWI provides, we assert that scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence. (Feinauer & Howard, 2014)

This study explores the interplay between early reading, identity, and bilingualism. Reading identities, or understandings about what reading is and whom one is as a reader, have been linked to reading achievement and the development of reading skills. This exploratory study provides a description of the reading identities of three dual language learners in prekindergarten. Data include child-centered interviews, child and classroom observations, teacher interviews and a family questionnaire. Methods centered on the use of child-oriented data collection protocols, and the inclusion of children in the interpretation of their own work and language. Through the exploration of three cases, this study documents the ways that reading identities were constructed, taken up and expressed by the participants. This study provides evidence that dual language learners are actively constructing ideas about reading, bilingualism/ biliteracy, and whom they are as readers as they learn to read. These findings show that framing early reading in an identity perspective presents opportunities to look more holistically at the language and reading practices of dual language learners as they learn to read and navigate two or more languages at home and school. (Collett, 2019)

Identity formation is one of the key components of adolescence and linguistic identity is critical to that process. For English learners to reach higher levels of achievement, they had to see themselves as high achievers in the first place—and in their first language. To achieve this, they focused on shifting to an asset based mindset, with the long term goal of turning the transitional bilingual education program into a dual language program

This study used interview and audio data to examine ways in which adolescents reported learning about themselves, language and its learning and others through participation in an extracurricular high school program for Spanish-dominant English language learners (English Learners) and English-dominant Spanish language learners (SLLs). Findings suggest the program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. Patterns of learning were largely consonant with students’ sociolinguistic positioning in schools as language minority or majority speakers. (A. Kibler et al., 2014)

Emergent bilinguals’ engagement and participation with learning is closely connected to the identities they are able to construct in this learning. Drawing upon Holland, Lachiotte, Skinner & Cain’s (1998) framework of how identities are shaped across figured worlds, and Nasir & Hand’s (2006, 2008) notion of practice-linked identities in school-based contexts, the model identifies the ways in which three components—context, subject positioning, and agency—play a critical role in how emergent bilinguals in a
Students reported that being bilingual is a big part of their identity, (Barrera et al., 2020)

- The program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. Patterns of learning were largely consonant with students’ sociolinguistic positioning in schools as language minority or majority speakers. (A. Kibler et al., 2014)

- Data highlights how these students used language in novel ways to assert a level of agency to become active participants in school-based activities. (Collett, 2018)

- Identities are dynamic, constantly shifting processes of self-understanding mediated by local and institutional repertoires, behaviors, resources and enacted through one’s positioning in practice. Multiple approaches must be used to understand the bidirectional relationship language learning holds with identity development. Interviews need to align with observations to provide a more complete interpretation of learners’ behaviors. Multiple interview approaches should be used, and observations need to document interactions outside the classroom context. By triangulating interviews with observations across school-based activities, and in using multiple cycles of analysis, revealed the tensions in Oscar’s identities with learning and language as a fifth-grade, emergent bilingual. (Collett, 2020)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>According to a sociocultural perspective, when African-American students’ emergent bilingual/biliterate identities are affirmed across home and school contexts, by</th>
<th>Spanish-English dual language, elementary school program begin to construct identities with learning and language. In juxtaposing the experiences of two emergent bilinguals, data highlights how these students used language in novel ways to assert a level of agency to become active participants in school-based activities. (Collett, 2018)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students reported that being bilingual is a big part of their identity, (Barrera et al., 2020)</td>
<td>This ethnographic case study explores the dynamic and fluid development of one African American student’s bilingual/biliterate identity through her enrollment in a Spanish-English Dual Language Education program. Researchers integrated the frameworks of identity in interaction and monoglossic and raciolinguistic language ideologies to understand how this student approached her Spanish language and literacy development from kindergarten to grade 5. The study documents the fluid nature of the focal student, Tamara’s, identity as she journeyed from a Spanish enthusiast in kindergarten who embraced her emerging bilingualism/biliteracy to a student who seemed to question her identity as Spanish literate person. Tamara’s journey reveals that African-American students like her DLE programs with already rich, flexible linguistic repertoires along with the openness and capacity to extend those repertoires. Tamara employed the relational process of adequation, downplaying differences among her and her peers’ language practices and racialized identities and instead foregrounding their similarities as friends with emerging bilingual capacities. According to a sociocultural perspective, when African-American students’ emergent bilingual/biliterate identities are affirmed across home and school contexts, by parents, peers, and teachers, like Ms. Padilla, who adopt a heteroglossic ideologies, those identities can flourish.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Students’ emergent bilingual/biliterate identities are affirmed across home and school contexts, by parents, peers, and teachers, like Ms. Padilla, who adopt a heteroglossic ideologies, those identities can flourish. Researchers extend this call by suggesting that DLE programs must carve out space and dedicate resources to address underlying biases and ideologies with their learners as a part of their bilingual/biliterate development. (Bauer et al., 2020)

- Strong family relationships, formal coursework in Spanish, as well as a strong ethnic identity as Mexicans are interrelated factors that contribute to their high multilingual investment. Dual language education is a powerful factor, but formal Spanish courses at the secondary and post-secondary level are also equally strong contributors when dual language education is not available. (Babino & Stewart, 2019)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personality</th>
<th>Personality, cognitive strategies, and metalinguistic skills are important factors related to the acquisition and use of language (Michael and Gollan 2005).</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“I am me; my personality does not change depending on the words I speak. Yet, languages act like filters, exaggerating or downplaying different sides of my character. I become more direct or carefree depending on the language I am speaking.” “For me, learning language is not about memorizing a dictionary, it’s a way of building self-confidence, self-awareness, and community” (Hobson, 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Language Importance</td>
<td>Language is the foundation for all learning, including interpersonal communication, reading, writing, and the core content we expect children to know. Children’s language also mirrors what they know, and how they categorize information and conceptualize their world. How children respond, talk, read, and/or write also signals their readiness for various skills and content learning. Language is, in fact, the most effective means through which we assess children’s abilities and knowledge base. The MT is the primary means through which a child makes sense of her world and connects with others—learning new words and vital content. While dialoging, she observes and engages in meaning-making, learns about proxemics (the physical distance she is expected to maintain, which varies from culture to culture), and develops communication strategies (e.g., turn-taking and conversation entry prompts). Without continued use of the MT, a child feels lost, uprooted Low self-esteem and identity crises are rampant, and often lead to a high drop-out rate—all of which bode badly for a nation with an aging population that is dependent on this generation. So we must make every effort to stop failing our children—and use of the MT and a mathematical language-building-blocks approach could be just the solution (Pandey, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Language is the foundation for all learning, including interpersonal communication, reading, writing, and the core content we expect children to know. (Caraballo &amp; Martinez, 2019)</td>
<td>• Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, positive self-concept, a negative self-concept is detrimental to learning, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child. (Caraballo &amp; Martinez, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The MT is the primary means through which a child makes sense of her world and connects with others—learning new words and vital content. (Pandey, 2014)</td>
<td>• Maintaining home language appears to strengthen students’ sense of self and to increase educational motivation among adolescents (Lee et al., 2021; Zarate, Bhimji, &amp; Reese, 2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Without continued use of the MT, a child feels lost, uprooted Low self-esteem and identity crises are rampant, and often lead to a high drop-out rate—all of which bode badly for a nation with an aging population that is dependent on this generation. So we must make every effort to stop failing our children—and use of the MT and a mathematical language-building-blocks approach could be just the solution (Pandey, 2014)</td>
<td>• In addition to language background, students’ culture must be considered in designing a successful dual language program. In order to support student success, Cummins’ (1979, p. 240) states the school program must be geared to the needs of individual children if they are to attain an additive form of bilingualism involving fluent literacy skills in L1 and L2. If the process of instruction is to be meaningful it must reflect the child’s cultural experiences and build upon his competencies (Tran et al., 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, positive self-concept, a negative self-concept is detrimental to learning, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child. (Caraballo &amp; Martinez, 2019)</td>
<td>• Maintaining home language strengthens students’ sense of self</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**dictionary, it's a way of building self-confidence, self-awareness, and community** (Hobson, 2021)
and to increase educational motivation among adolescents (Lee et al., 2021; Zarate, Bhimji, & Reese, 2005).

In addition to language background, students' culture must be considered in designing a successful dual language program. In order to support student success, Cummins' (1979, p. 240) states the school program must be geared to the needs of individual children if they are to attain an additive form of bilingualism involving fluent literacy skills in L1 and L2. If the process of instruction is to be meaningful it must reflect the child's cultural experiences and build upon his competencies (Tran et al., 2015).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Motivation</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students with a positive future image of their language learning and an intrinsic interest in English culture tended to have better self-regulatory capacity in online learning environments. Learners with positive online learning experiences tended to be more flexible and independent in their self-regulatory learning process. (Magid &amp; Chan, 2012)</td>
<td>This study presents a structural relationship model that integrates English language learners’ motivation with their online self-regulation. Two questionnaires, Online Language Learning Motivation (OLLM) and Online Self-regulated English Learning (OSEL), were developed and administered to 293 Chinese university students. The results indicated that OLLM consists of five factors, namely online language learning experience, cultural interest, instrumentality-promotion, instrumentality-prevention, and others’ expectations. Meanwhile, OSEL is composed of six factors: goal setting, time management, environment structuring, help seeking, task strategies, and self-evaluation. The path analysis revealed that students with a positive future image of their language learning and an intrinsic interest in English culture tended to have better self-regulatory capacity in online learning environments. Learners with positive online learning experiences tended to be more flexible and independent in their self-regulatory learning process. Related pedagogical implications are discussed, such as motivating learners to visualize a successful future self, improving their inherent interest in learning English, and designing more effective online tasks. (Magid &amp; Chan, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This article advances a framework for early language and literacy development among young English language learners (English Learners). A dual language book project undertaken in partnership with a local elementary school provides a context within which to address children’s need to negotiate language, culture, and identity as they transition and make meaning from their home language (L1) to English and the language of school (L2) and back. Using objects of cultural and personal relevance that the children brought from home, stories of ‘Family Treasures’ were generated from the original telling in the L1 into English in small-group contexts, transcribed, illustrated, and uploaded to a Web site for permanent sharing, rereading, and exchange. These booklets also provided an opportunity for identity formation, pride of family and culture, and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Cultural Awareness

- Latinx students’ unique sensitivities developed from their borderland perspectives and experiences; Bilingual students supported their peers, showcasing an awareness of bilingual/linguistic challenges and empathy for others—capacities not often reciprocated or recognized by their teachers. (Dorner & Cervantes-Soon, 2020)
- Benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)
- The program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. (A. Kibler et al., 2014)
- It is important for teachers to make cultural connections with their students. Teachers perceive cultural awareness knowledge is important to effective teaching as well as interpersonal knowledge as defined by Collinson (“Becoming”). In order to be an effective and successful teacher, that

| Cultural Awareness                                      | This issue of TESOL Quarterly examines the equity challenges and promises of dual language bilingual education (DLBE) for students learning English as an additional language Research reported in this issue documents the pride, joy, and multilingual capacities of children and their families, as well as the possibilities for DLBE when we hold programs accountable for bilingual outcomes and avoid “equity traps.” A two-way Spanish-English program in the midwestern United States, where Mariana Pacheco and Colleen Hamilton aimed to transform the discourses that typically oppress Spanish-speaking bilingual students and their languages. Framed by theories of bilanguaging love (Mignolo, 2012), careful ethnographic detail foregrounds Latinx students’ unique sensitivities developed from their borderland perspectives and experiences; we see how bilingual students supported their peers, showcasing an awareness of bilingual/linguistic challenges and empathy for others—capacities not often reciprocated or recognized by their teachers. (Dorner & Cervantes-Soon, 2020)
- Results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)
- Much of the debate regarding outcomes of various types of dual-language program has focused on linguistic and academic results, and with good reason: improving the educational outcomes of language minorities and supporting societal multilingualism are vital goals. More rarely explored, however, are these programs’ ethnolinguistic outcomes: the ways in which adolescents reported learning about themselves, language, and its learning and others through participation in an extracurricular high school program for Spanish-dominant English language learners (English Learners) and English-dominant Spanish language learners (SLLs). Findings suggest the program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. (A. Kibler et al., 2014)
- This article discusses the importance of cultural awareness knowledge for teachers who teach Spanish to native speakers. The article is taken from a study that investigated pedagogical content knowledge, subject matter knowledge, and cultural awareness knowledge. The results of the survey suggest that it is important for teachers to make cultural connections with their students. The results also suggested that teachers perceive cultural awareness knowledge is important to effective teaching as well as interpersonal knowledge as defined by Collinson (“Becoming”). Additionally, The attitudes and beliefs that teachers have towards minorities, towards non-prestige languages, toward poverty, have an effect on how teachers teach (see Ennis, Cothran, and Loftus; Hollingsworth; Hoy and Murphy, 2001; Nespor). Hancock quotes Brown in saying that research suggests that empathy, the capacity to relate emotionally to someone else, may
teacher must know her/his students intimately. The teacher must be able to talk about each individual student’s strengths and weaknesses and be able and willing to do whatever it takes to ensure that student’s academic success (Ellison, 2006).

- Bilingual learning affects attitudes and beliefs about language learning and other cultures. Language learners develop a more positive attitude toward the target language and/or the speakers of that language. Lipton’s surveys (2004) comprise a series of studies that demonstrate, among other factors, that children who have studied a world language develop a sense of cultural pluralism (openness to and appreciation of other cultures) and have an improved self-concept and sense of achievement in school. The ability to easily switch between languages makes children feel competent, and it increases self-esteem (Rubio, 2007). Appreciating international literature, music, and film. Translation is subject to the interpretation of the translator. The world’s literary and artistic works have been written in various languages. Some elements do not have equivalents in other languages. Increasing understanding of oneself and one’s culture. Viewing one’s value system through the eyes of others is, put simply, valuable. Monolingual views of the world limit the perspective. There are aspects of one’s life and culture that are accepted as universal truths until another way of thinking has been encountered. (Tochon, 2009)

- In this educational and societal context, this study examines how English Learners view their imagined English Learner identities and communities through their drawings and written descriptions. The findings yield insights into the purposes, orientations, and dispositions of EFL learners, their beliefs about imagined English-speaker identities, and their awareness of the broader global, intercultural context. Concentrating on the transformation in the relational aspect of English Learner identity, the study discusses the weight and affordances of English and its relation to English Learners’ imagined English Learner identity and further demonstrates their language and cultural awareness in the globalized setting. (Ahn, 2021)

- The current research investigated the effects of cultural awareness on listening comprehension and listening motivation of EFL learners. The results of one-sample t-test, one-way ANOVA, and the post hoc Scheffe test showed that the experimental classes outflanked the control class in the posttest of listening motivation and listening comprehension. The results indicated that the subjects showed a positive attitude toward having cultural awareness in their English learning process. The outcomes of the study provide some implications for teachers to increase the students’ cultural awareness and to enhance their positive attitudes about the integration of culturally based resources into language education. (Kamaeva et al., 2022)

- Research has shown that dual-language programs for elementary age students and newcomer centers for recent immigrant arrivals at the secondary level are effective in fostering student academic success, linguistic growth, and multicultural understanding. (Lucido, 2019)

- Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000). Respecting and valuing the home language
study provide some implications for teachers to increase the students' cultural awareness and to enhance their positive attitudes about the integration of culturally based resources into language education. (Kamaeva et al., 2022)

- Dual-language programs for elementary age students and newcomer centers for recent immigrant arrivals at the secondary level are effective in fostering student academic success, linguistic growth, and multicultural understanding. (Lucido, 2019)

- Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000). Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children. (Amorsen, 2015)

### Self Confidence

**Attitudes**

- Positive attitudes included feeling that the English-only policy helped students to improve their English proficiency, prepare them for the high demands of using English proficiency in real-world interaction, and demonstrate respect for other students and teachers who cannot understand their first. Several aspects of the policy were perceived negatively, including the ways teachers dealt with students speaking their

- In this study, IEP students of various proficiency levels and L1 backgrounds described their attitudes toward the institutional English-only policy at an intensive English program associated with a large U.S. university. Data were collected through a survey (n = 158), interviews (n = 6), and focus groups (n = 4). Positive attitudes included feeling that the English-only policy helped students to improve their English proficiency, prepare them for the high demands of using English proficiency in real-world interaction, and demonstrate respect for other students and teachers who cannot understand their first. Several aspects of the policy were perceived negatively, including the ways teachers dealt with students speaking their L1 outside the classroom, methods of punishment that could impact students’ grades, the unconditional character of the policy that denied learners their agency, and the lack of systematic implementation. Based on these findings, suggestions are provided for designing institutional environments that could more effectively maximize target language use rather than demoralize learners. (Shvidko, 2017)
The results confirm the importance of ethnic identity on minority youth’s global self-esteem. Self-confidence with bilingual proficiency has a great effect on Chinese Youth’s global, academic, and social self-esteem. (Wen-shya, 2005)

This paper considers speakers’ differing degrees of self-confidence in their bilingual abilities and their effects on reported language use and observed patterns of language choice. One hundred and twenty individuals from New Zealand’s four largest Pasifika communities (Samoa, Cook Islands, Tonga, and Niue) reported on their self-confidence in both their community language (CL) and English, and on the basis of these responses, five speaker types are distinguished. The findings show how analyses based on
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Youth’s global self-esteem. Self-confidence with bilingual proficiency has a great effect on Chinese Youth’s global, academic, and social self-esteem. (Wen-shya, 2005)</th>
<th>Speakers’ self-confidence in bilingual abilities provide a community-friendly tool for describing patterns of language use and explaining the effects of social variables on language proficiency. (Starks, 2005)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The findings show how analyses based on speakers’ self-confidence in bilingual abilities provide a community-friendly tool for describing patterns of language use and explaining the effects of social variables on language proficiency. (Starks, 2005)</td>
<td>• This paper begins with a discussion of some of the key insights of recent sociocultural research that consider bilingual children and learning to read and culminates in a discussion of Syncretic Literacy Studies (SLS). It then presents data from an ethnographic study that focused on the learning experiences of a small group of Year Three Bangladeshi-heritage pupils during 1 year of their schooling in order to problematize some of the claims made in recent sociocultural work and in SLS, particularly the focus on children’s agency. The findings from the study suggest that there are limits to children’s agency that are not recognized in recent work and in SLS; (b) that identity has an important role to play: children can successfully mask what they cannot do as readers in order to present a particular identity in the mainstream classroom; and (c) that the access some children have to mediators may be limited and can change over time. (Walters, 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agency</td>
<td>• This qualitative study investigated a CBSL program in which L2 Spanish learners at an urban university served as weekly teaching assistants at a local dual-language elementary school. Data were collected from 55 reflective blog entries, two focus group sessions, and interviews with four teaching assistants. The L2 Spanish learners reported that the experience supported their language acquisition by (1) providing oral language practice outside of class, (2) facilitating linguistic self-confidence, (3) fostering metacognitive reflection, and (4) transforming motivation and attitudes. (Baker, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• There are limits to children’s agency that are not recognized in recent work and in SLS; (b) that identity has an important role to play: children can successfully mask what they cannot do as readers in order to present a particular identity in the mainstream classroom; and (c) that the access some children have to mediators may be limited and can change over time. (Walters, 2011)</td>
<td>• Critical Consciousness Researchers call for programs to adopt vernacular forms of Spanish, including translanguaging practices, in bilingual and biliteracy instruction in critical pedagogical perspective, deliberate inclusion of vernacular Spanish (and translanguaging) in bilingualism and biliteracy is an ideal means to develop critical consciousness for students in DLBE,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Critical Consciousness | • Researchers call for programs to adopt vernacular forms of Spanish, including translanguaging practices, in bilingual and biliteracy instruction in order to meet the needs of Spanish-speaking students and combat deficit language ideologies and practices. From a critical pedagogical perspective, deliberate inclusion of vernacular Spanish (and translanguaging) in bilingualism and biliteracy is an ideal means to develop critical consciousness for students in DLBE, |
order to meet the needs of Spanish-speaking students and combat deficit language ideologies and practices. From a critical pedagogical perspective, deliberate inclusion of vernacular Spanish (and translanguaging) in bilingualism and biliteracy is an ideal means to develop critical consciousness for students in DLBE, which can serve to combat deficit language ideologies, and aligns to the proposal of critical consciousness as the fourth goal of DLBE. (Freire & Feinauer, 2022)

- Researchers argue that centering critical consciousness—or fostering among teachers, parents, and children an awareness of the structural oppression that surrounds us and a readiness to take action to correct it—can support increased equity and social justice in TWDL education. Researchers elaborate four elements of critical consciousness: interrogating power, critical listening, historicizing schools, and embracing discomfort. Researchers describe how critical consciousness impacts and radicalizes the other three core goals, in turn supporting the development of more successful, equitable, and socially just TWDL schools. (Palmer et al., 2019)
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the social development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Networks</th>
<th>Social Network</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual students have larger social networks that can help them navigate both school and community contexts (Zhou &amp; Bankston, 1998)</td>
<td>Bilingual students have larger social networks that can help them navigate both school and community contexts (Zhou &amp; Bankston, 1998)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits of knowing two languages: sociocultural (e.g. ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world (Tytus, 2018)</td>
<td>Benefits of knowing two languages: (1) sociocultural (e.g. ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world (Tytus, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despite participants’ demographic differences, English Learner and Spanish Language Learner students in the dual-language program reported building new, strengthened, and mutually recognized relationships, particularly with students of different language backgrounds who worked together within long-term collaborative small groups. When students are provided with a carefully designed instructional and ecological context that provides authentic purposes for using language and building peer relationships, this research suggests that both English Learners and SLLs may be able to build linguistically integrated social networks. (A. K. Kibler et al., 2015)</td>
<td>This study examines how a two-way, dual language enrichment program for Spanish-language learner and English-language learner adolescents influenced students’ social networks with peers of different cultural and linguistic backgrounds. Results suggest that despite participants’ demographic differences, English Learner and Spanish Language Learner students in the dual-language program reported building new, strengthened, and mutually recognized relationships, particularly with students of different language backgrounds who worked together within long-term collaborative small groups. When students are provided with a carefully designed instructional and ecological context that provides authentic purposes for using language and building peer relationships, this research suggests that both English Learners and SLLs may be able to build linguistically integrated social networks. (A. K. Kibler et al., 2015)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Researchers examine dual language education as a means for promoting ethnically, racially, and linguistically diverse learning experiences. Dual-language schools can be incredibly effective at ensuring students of different backgrounds learn in the same classroom rather than just superficially enroll in the same school. By the very nature of dual language, students are often in a classroom with children of differing backgrounds. Dual language education can allow teachers to “position” students and families from diverse linguistic backgrounds as language and culture brokers for English-speaking peers and families (DeMatthews, Izquierdo, and Knight 2017; Lee, Hill-Bonnet, and Raley 2011; Palmer 2008). Being dual language helps to promote healthy multigenerational, multicultural, and multilingual communities, because it allows schools to connect with a historically marginalized community whose first language is not English as well as the grassroots organizations that are engaged in advocacy and community development work (Fránquiz, Salazar, and DeNicolo 2011; Wiemelt and Welton 2015). Dual-language education has the added advantage that the model makes racial and ethnic diversity a classroom asset, which in turn promotes even greater benefits on student learning and socialization. Dual language offers an avenue for districts interested in navigating these obstacles and can be an excellent way to concurrently foster diversity in the classroom.
Students are often in a classroom with children of differing backgrounds. Dual language education can allow teachers to “position” students and families from diverse linguistic backgrounds as language and culture brokers for English-speaking peers and families (DeMatthews, Izquierdo, and Knight 2017; Lee, Hill-Bonnet, and Raley 2011; Palmer 2008).

Being dual language helps to promote healthy multigenerational, multicultural, and multilingual communities, because it allows schools to connect with a historically marginalized community whose first language is not English as well as the grassroots organizations that are engaged in advocacy and community development work (Fránquiz, Salazar, and DeNicolo 2011; Wiemelt andWelton 2015).

Dual-language education has the added advantage that the model makes racial and ethnic diversity a classroom asset, which in turn promotes even greater benefits on student learning and socialization. Dual language offers an avenue for districts interested in navigating these obstacles and can be an excellent way to concurrently foster diversity in the classroom and improve a variety of social and academic outcomes for the entire student body. (Kotok & DeMatthews, 2018)

Advantages of being bilingual: Making lifelong friends. Bilingualism increases the number of people with whom one can interact. Interest in other cultures helps one connect deeply with other people around the world. (Tochon, 2009)

Social network analysis has proved particularly useful in explaining why speakers in bilingual communities maintain or change their language behavior. An underlying assumption in this analysis is that language, particularly the first language or mother tongue, is an integral part of collective identities, such as national, ethnic, or cultural identities, and that maintenance of language across generations is a key factor to the maintenance of such identities. This article discusses the application of social network analysis to multilingual communities by taking a point of departure in the Filipino community in Oslo, the capital of Norway, with a view towards understanding linguistic and cultural maintenance. Results from the analyses provide support for the importance of social network in understanding language choice and cultural and linguistic maintenance; however, there were some notable exceptions. (Lanza & Svendsen, 2007)

Results from the analyses provide support for the importance of social network in understanding language choice and
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Perceptions</th>
<th>Home Language Importance</th>
<th>Social Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual. (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)</td>
<td>• The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of network ties rather than morphology of the network. A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer. This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
<td>• A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks. This reciprocal relationship is simultaneously a force of assimilation and of dissimilation. Interpersonal networks are a concrete basis of both culture and social structure. Family, friends, and acquaintances reinforce the beliefs, arts, and institutions of a culture (Greeley, 1974; Yancy and Erikson, 1977) and transmit the advantages, aspirations, and opportunities of a social structure (e.g., Duncan, Haller, and Portes, 1971). Through their common basis in the associations among people, the cultural and socioeconomic realms influence each other. (Mirowsky &amp; Ross, 1984)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Considerable research documents students’ outcomes in dual language (DL) programs, but there is little examination of students’ perceptions of bilingualism and its impact on students’ cognitive functioning and social relationships, especially with comparative studies across different target languages and student backgrounds. This study, which included a total of 788 fifth- through eighth-grade students who had participated in a Spanish-English (n = 645) or Mandarin-English (n = 143) dual language program, surveyed students’ language proficiencies, ratings of bilingualism, and social and cognitive functioning. Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual. (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)</td>
<td>• This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
<td>• Despite their lower levels of human capital and lower previous academic performance, recent immigrants are more likely to participate in Spanish-speaking networks, while those who have been in the United States for more than ten years are less likely to participate. (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Advantages of being bilingual: Making lifelong friends. Bilingualism increases the number of people with whom one can interact. Interest in other cultures helps one connect deeply with other people around the world. (Tochon, 2009)</td>
<td>• The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of network ties rather than morphology of the network. A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer. This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
<td>• A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks. This reciprocal relationship is simultaneously a force of assimilation and of dissimilation. Interpersonal networks are a concrete basis of both culture and social structure. Family, friends, and acquaintances reinforce the beliefs, arts, and institutions of a culture (Greeley, 1974; Yancy and Erikson, 1977) and transmit the advantages, aspirations, and opportunities of a social structure (e.g., Duncan, Haller, and Portes, 1971). Through their common basis in the associations among people, the cultural and socioeconomic realms influence each other. (Mirowsky &amp; Ross, 1984)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This study investigates immigrant-native differences in the activities of adolescents 2 years after their sophomore year of high school. Despite their lower levels of human capital and lower</td>
<td>• The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of network ties rather than morphology of the network. A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer. This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
<td>• A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks. This reciprocal relationship is simultaneously a force of assimilation and of dissimilation. Interpersonal networks are a concrete basis of both culture and social structure. Family, friends, and acquaintances reinforce the beliefs, arts, and institutions of a culture (Greeley, 1974; Yancy and Erikson, 1977) and transmit the advantages, aspirations, and opportunities of a social structure (e.g., Duncan, Haller, and Portes, 1971). Through their common basis in the associations among people, the cultural and socioeconomic realms influence each other. (Mirowsky &amp; Ross, 1984)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual. (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)</td>
<td>• The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of network ties rather than morphology of the network. A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer. This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
<td>• A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks. This reciprocal relationship is simultaneously a force of assimilation and of dissimilation. Interpersonal networks are a concrete basis of both culture and social structure. Family, friends, and acquaintances reinforce the beliefs, arts, and institutions of a culture (Greeley, 1974; Yancy and Erikson, 1977) and transmit the advantages, aspirations, and opportunities of a social structure (e.g., Duncan, Haller, and Portes, 1971). Through their common basis in the associations among people, the cultural and socioeconomic realms influence each other. (Mirowsky &amp; Ross, 1984)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Language Importance</td>
<td>Social Status</td>
<td>Social Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
<td>• The social-network approach adopted focuses on the ego network of British-born Chinese children, emphasizing the content of network ties rather than morphology of the network. A consistent pattern of language emerges in which children were more likely to use “pure” Chinese to members of their families and to friends who were older if their level of Chinese language ability was good, and to use “pure” English to family members of the same generation if their Chinese language ability was poorer. This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
<td>• A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks. This reciprocal relationship is simultaneously a force of assimilation and of dissimilation. Interpersonal networks are a concrete basis of both culture and social structure. Family, friends, and acquaintances reinforce the beliefs, arts, and institutions of a culture (Greeley, 1974; Yancy and Erikson, 1977) and transmit the advantages, aspirations, and opportunities of a social structure (e.g., Duncan, Haller, and Portes, 1971). Through their common basis in the associations among people, the cultural and socioeconomic realms influence each other. (Mirowsky &amp; Ross, 1984)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Despite their lower levels of human capital and lower previous academic performance, recent immigrants are more likely to participate in Spanish-speaking networks, while those who have been in the United States for more than ten years are less likely to participate. (Raschka et al., 2002)</td>
<td>• A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks. This reciprocal relationship is simultaneously a force of assimilation and of dissimilation. Interpersonal networks are a concrete basis of both culture and social structure. Family, friends, and acquaintances reinforce the beliefs, arts, and institutions of a culture (Greeley, 1974; Yancy and Erikson, 1977) and transmit the advantages, aspirations, and opportunities of a social structure (e.g., Duncan, Haller, and Portes, 1971). Through their common basis in the associations among people, the cultural and socioeconomic realms influence each other. (Mirowsky &amp; Ross, 1984)</td>
<td>• This study investigates immigrant-native differences in the activities of adolescents 2 years after their sophomore year of high school. Despite their lower levels of human capital and lower</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
immigrants who arrive in the United States as adolescents are more likely than those who arrive earlier or those born in the United States to persevere in high school. While recent immigrants are more likely to persevere in high school, once they leave they are no more likely to pursue additional education than their U.S. born counterparts. (White & Glick, 2000)

Peer Dynamics
- Teacher reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners. For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall, and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships. (Johnson et al., 2020)

Sociolinguistic Awareness
- Because bilingual learners often interact with different language providers, they appear to develop sociolinguistic awareness more readily. They may better understand the arbitrary nature of language (Cook 1997) and that users employ language to communicate their mental states in various ways and for different purposes. (Mohr et al., 2018)
- Other advantages of learning another language can include the following: passing on part of one’s heritage to children, bridging generations and improving communication within the family and with the extended family, building international links, experiencing two cultures, being able to compare values and worldviews, and becoming biliterate (Marcos, 1998).

previous academic performance, recent immigrants who arrive in the United States as adolescents are more likely than those who arrive earlier or those born in the United States to persevere in high school. Access to familial social capital and attitudinal measures help explain some of this effect. As for those who do leave school early, socioeconomic status and language background play a role in the activities respondents pursue. While recent immigrants are more likely to persevere in high school, once they leave they are no more likely to pursue additional education than their U.S. born counterparts. (White & Glick, 2000)

• Employing a social capital framework, this study investigates teachers’ role in influencing the peer dynamics between English learners (ELs) and their non-EL peers. Peer nominations of friendships within the classroom were used to operationalize students’ same-language-status (bonding capital) and cross-language-status (bridging capital) friendships. Multilevel models reveal teachers’ reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners. For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall, and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships. (Johnson et al., 2020)
following: passing on part of one’s heritage to children, bridging generations and improving communication within the family and with the extended family, building international links, experiencing two cultures, being able to compare values and worldviews, and becoming biliterate (Marcos, 1998).

### Relationships with Family and Friends

#### Social Benefits
- Bilingualism generates social benefits like reduced discrimination, improved self-esteem, and stronger cross-group relationships (Cho, 2000; Wright & Tropp, 2005)

| Peer Relationships | Building on research that has demonstrated the benefits of Dual-Language Bilingual Education (DLBE) programs on students’ bilingual, academic, and cross-cultural development (Lindholm-Leary and Hernández 2011), this study examines the links between dual language proficiency and competence in elementary students enrolled in a Cantonese DLBE programs in the U.S. Specifically, researchers examined the relations between (a) children’s bilingual (English and Cantonese) language proficiency in four dimensions (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and (b) their competence in academic, peer relationships, activities involvement, and classroom behavior domains with a group of 60 fourth and fifth graders enrolled in a Cantonese–English DLBE programs. Results highlight the different beneficial roles of Cantonese and English proficiency on positive self, peer acceptance, and prosocial behavior (He et al., 2022)
- In the present investigation, we recorded and described the naturalistic free play of four dual language learners (DLLs) and compared their interactions to those of four English-speaking children. Findings indicate that DLLs play and talk with peers less frequently, interact in less sustained and positive ways, and are more reliant on teachers to support their play than their English-speaking peers. Implications for scaffolding DLLs’ play in classrooms and for future research are presented (Dominguez & Trawick-Smith, 2018)
- Employing a social capital framework, this study investigates teachers’ role in influencing the peer dynamics between English learners (ELs) and their non-EL peers. Participants include 713 students (211 English Learners). Observed teacher-student interaction quality and teacher self-reports of their peer network management were used to operationalize students’ same-language-status (bonding capital) and cross-language-status (bridging capital) friendships. Multilevel models reveal teachers’ reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and
Bilingualism and Autism

- Age negatively predicted social life quality scores while the number of languages known positively predicted social life quality scores. It provides valuable insight into how autistic people can learn and use a new language, and how their bilingualism experiences shape their social life. (Digard et al., 2020)
- Globally, there are more bilingual speakers than monolingual speakers; however, scant research evidence exists regarding social communication development and outcomes for bilingual children with autism spectrum disorder (ASD). This study employed a longitudinal cohort design to compare social and communication skills, at baseline and over 12 months, for 60 monolingual and 60 bilingual children with ASD receiving community based early intervention. **Findings support the notion**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bilingualism and Autism</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>friendships also helped bilingual undergraduates navigate a challenging sociopolitical context and have pride in their ethnolinguistic identity. (Sebanc et al., 2009)</td>
<td>non-English Learners. For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall, and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships. (Johnson et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bilingual undergraduates may have closer friendships with other bilinguals than with monolinguals.</strong> This study investigated this hypothesis and explored the friendship features of 46 bilingual Spanish and English-speaking undergraduates by combining quantitative analyses of surveys and qualitative analyses of interviews. <strong>Survey results indicated that participants rated their friendships with bilinguals to be more secure, closer, and to provide more help and companionship than their friendships with monolinguals.</strong> During interviews, participants described understanding, connection, and identification with their bilingual friends. These features were considered reasons for their friendships with other bilinguals and reasons for their greater quality. <strong>Bilingual friendships also helped bilingual undergraduates navigate a challenging sociopolitical context and have pride in their ethnolinguistic identity.</strong> (Sebanc et al., 2009)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This study investigates whether friendship quality, academic achievement and mastery goal orientation predict each other across the transition to middle school. Cross-lagged path analyses revealed a bidirectional and negative relationship between negative friendship quality and academic achievement across the transition to middle school. Positive friendship quality predicted mastery goal orientation decreases for girls. Both gender and bilingual status were analyzed and showed significant relations in our models. Results supported the social interaction perspective more than the social bonding perspective of friendship quality. (Sebanc et al., 2016)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Globally, there are more bilingual speakers than monolingual speakers; however, scant research evidence exists regarding social communication development and outcomes for bilingual children with autism spectrum disorder (ASD). This study employed a longitudinal cohort design to compare social and communication skills, at baseline and over 12 months, for 60 monolingual and 60 bilingual children with ASD receiving community based early intervention. **Findings support the notion**
development and outcomes for bilingual children with autism spectrum disorder (ASD). Findings support the notion that there is no basis on which to discourage home language use with bilingual children with ASD. (Siyambalapitiya et al., 2022)

- Significant language growth was exhibited by children from both language groups and there was no moderating effect of home language environment. The bilingual home group demonstrated increased gesture use over the course of intervention as compared with the monolingual home group. Preliminary data revealed no basis for concerns regarding negative impact of a bilingual home environment on language or social development in young children with autism spectrum disorder. (Zhou et al., 2019)

- There are concerns that social communication deficits among children with autism spectrum disorder may reduce the developmental benefits of early intervention for children with autism spectrum disorder raised in bilingual environments. Researchers conducted an exploratory analysis of cross-sectional and longitudinal data from a larger study to explore associations between home language environment and language ability and social skills in response to early autism spectrum disorder intervention. Significant language growth was exhibited by children from both language groups and there was no moderating effect of home language environment. The bilingual home group demonstrated increased gesture use over the course of intervention as compared with the monolingual home group. Preliminary data revealed no basis for concerns regarding negative impact of a bilingual home environment on language or social development in young children with autism spectrum disorder. (Zhou et al., 2019)

- The study investigated the effect of language intervention on equal numbers of participants (n=20) in both study groups, monolingual (English only) and bilingual (English and anyone of the Mother Tongue Language) children with Autism Spectrum Disorders, aged between 4.0 and 6.11 years, in Singapore. The results revealed statistically significant improvement in the developmental skills in both the study groups, but no significance was indicated between the groups. The study indicated that bilingual exposure in children with Autism Spectrum Disorders does not have any negative impact. (Sendhilnathan & Chengappa, 2020)

---

| Family Relationships | Preserving the home language reduces cultural dissonance between children and parents, reinforcing parental authority and thus reducing behavior problems (Portes & Hao, 2002; Portes & Rumbaut, 2001) | Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000). A crucial step in supporting students who may be put at risk involves an understanding of, and respect |
---|---|---|

- Preserving the home language reduces cultural dissonance between children and parents, reinforcing parental authority and thus reducing behavior problems (Portes & Hao, 2002; Portes & Rumbaut, 2001)
Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000).

A crucial step in supporting students who may be put at risk involves an understanding of, and respect for, the literacy activities of the family and communities in which the child lives. Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children. Involve linguistically diverse families in the literacy classroom. (Amorsen, 2015)

Social Competence

- Effective peer interaction is fundamental to social development, cognitive development, and academic success. This study compares parent and teacher perspectives of children’s social competence (i.e., social skills and problem behaviors) and whether similarities and differences in perspectives are associated with children’s classification as an emergent bilingual or monolingual native English speaker. Findings indicate statistically significant differences in parent and teacher ratings on the empathy, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for bilingual children and on the empathy, self-control, internalizing, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for monolingual English-speaking children. (Baxter et al., 2021)

- This study investigated whether host and heritage cultural orientations were associated with Chinese preschoolers’ social competence and whether such associations varied across gender in Western contexts. Social competence was assessed using teacher reports on the Behavior Assessment System for Children-2 (BASC-2) with four composite scales: Externalizing, Internalizing, Behavioral Symptoms and Adaptive Skills. The results indicate that host culture has a stronger relationship with social competence than heritage culture, particularly for girls. (Ren & Wyver, 2016)

- The current study examined whether bilingualism is associated with differences in children’s developing social knowledge. In line with previous research findings, results demonstrate that all...
heritage culture, particularly for girls. (Ren & Wyver, 2016)

- All children evaluated moral violations more harshly than conventional violations. Notably, however, bilingual children were more permissive of violations across moral, social, and language domains than monolingual children. These findings yield new insights into the role of early experience in the development of social knowledge. We propose that bilinguals’ unique linguistic and social experiences influence their understanding of moral and conventional rules. (Iannuccilli et al., 2021)

- Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development. In Study 2, the authors determined which profiles were associated with later academic achievement and growth of English proficiency. Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism. (Oades-Sese et al., 2011)

- The aim of the present study was to examine the social behavior and competence of children, ages 3–6 as they progressed through the stages of second language acquisition in a dual-immersion program in English and Mandarin. Teachers’ evaluations of children’s social competence and behavior were collected at the beginning and end of the school year. Results suggest that girls had more social adjustment difficulties than boys. However, as language skills increased, adjustment difficulties decreased significantly among all children. (Soderman & Oshio, 2008)

- The main aim of this study was to examine whether language skills and emotion regulation are associated with social competence and whether the relationship between English skills and social competence is moderated by emotion regulation in Mandarin–English bilingual preschoolers. The results show that positive emotion regulation, emotion dysregulation, English skills, and Mandarin skills were associated with different composites of the BASC-2; the relationships between English skills and Behavioral Symptoms were moderated by positive emotion regulation; and English skills and Adaptive Skills were moderated by emotion dysregulation. (Ren et al., 2016)

**Attitudes**

- Children and mothers in the English Learner group reported significantly higher ratings of shy behavior in English speaking versus native-language contexts,

- The primary goal of this study was to explore the effect of language context on the socially withdrawn behaviors of school-age children who are English language learners (English Learners) from middle– to high–socioeconomic status (SES) backgrounds. Children and mothers in the English Learner group reported significantly higher ratings of shy behavior in English speaking versus native-language contexts, whereas unsociable ratings did not differ across language contexts. Shyness and unsociability
whereas unsociable ratings did not differ across language contexts. Shyness and unsociability are distinguishable behaviors in English Learner children, and researchers should consider these constructs when examining withdrawal. In addition, examining English Learner children’s behavior across language contexts provides a valuable method for investigating language-influenced behavioral problems. This study demonstrates the need for service providers to evaluate behavior across subtype and language context before pathologizing withdrawal in English Learner children. (Ash et al., 2014)

Social Flexibility

- Researchers explored the ability of children to adapt their communication to the needs of their communication partner. Monolinguals and bilinguals were equally helpful and informative. In contrast, only bilingual children adapted their level of ostension selectively between the two puppets. These findings point to the greater skills of bilinguals to adapt their communication accordingly. (Gampe et al., 2019)
- What are the collateral effects of using two languages on a regular basis? Does bilingualism have an impact on cognitive domains other than language, such as attention, mentalizing, and creativity? Here we discuss recent results by Ikizer and Ramirez-Esparza (2017), suggesting that bilinguals are more socially flexible than monolinguals. We argue that their arguments are not theoretically sound and that their observations are not compelling enough. (Vives et al., 2018)
- Is bilingualism better than monolingualism? Previous work shows that bilinguals have an advantage over monolinguals in cognitive flexibility, the ability to shift between different mental sets. In this study, researchers explore if bilingualism also provides an advantage in social flexibility, which we define as the ability to (a) switch with ease and adapt between different social environments and (b) accurately read social cues in the environment. Bilinguals reported higher social flexibility than monolinguals. Mediation analyses demonstrated that bilinguals’ social flexibility gave them an advantage over monolinguals in the self-reported frequency of social interactions. This study reports the first evidence of a social flexibility advantage of bilinguals, and it suggests that as bilinguals alternate between two languages, they might also alternate between two cultural worlds, providing tools to adapt to different social environments and facilitating the frequency of social interactions. (Ikizer & Ramírez-Esparza, 2018)
- Bilingual children are less influenced than monolinguals by language variety when attributing personality traits to different speakers, which could indicate that bilinguals have fewer in-group biases and perhaps greater social flexibility. In the present study, we investigated the social preferences of 5 year old English and French monolinguals and English-French bilinguals. These results suggest that both monolingual and bilingual children have strong preferences for in-group members who use a familiar language variety, and that bilingualism does not lead to generalized social flexibility. (Souza et al., 2013)

- Bilingual children are less influenced than monolinguals by language variety when attributing personality traits to different speakers, which could indicate that bilinguals have fewer in-group biases and perhaps greater social flexibility. In the present study, we investigated the social preferences of 5 year old English and French monolinguals and English-French bilinguals. These results suggest that both monolingual and bilingual children have strong preferences for in-group members who use a familiar language variety, and that bilingualism does not lead to generalized social flexibility. (Souza et al., 2013)

- Social Flexibility
group members who use a familiar language variety, and that bilingualism does not lead to generalized social flexibility. (Souza et al., 2013)
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the economic development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Cultural Awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• With the growing emphasis on a competitive global economy, support is increasing for dual language programs (DLPs) geared toward preparing students in bilingual and multilingual education. (Gomez &amp; Cisneros, 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture. Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A bilingual education program for minority people is essential for equal access to education. It solves conflicts between different ethnic groups and brings happiness to the society. (Ozfidan &amp; Toprak, 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language Economics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs. On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar &amp; Spindler, 2005).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Language educational economics is a newly developed field of study, born from the understanding that language educational policies have economic implications (Breton, 1998). Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006). At a time of semi globalisation (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs. On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar &amp; Spindler, 2005).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Language Economics](image)

![Labor Market](image)
The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)

Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).

Multilingualism is often framed as human capital that increases individuals’ labor market value. Such assertions overlook the role of ideology in assigning value to languages and their speakers based on factors other than communicative utility. This article explores the value assigned to Spanish-English bilingualism on the United States labor market through a mixed methods analysis of online job advertisements. Findings suggest that Spanish-English bilingualism is frequently preferred or required for employment in the US, but that such employment opportunities are less lucrative. The results suggest a penalty associated with Spanish-English bilingualism in which positions listing such language requirements advertise lower wages than observationally similar positions. Quantitative disparities and qualitative differences in the specification of language requirements across income levels suggest that bilingual labor is assigned value through a racial lens that leads to linguistic work undertaken by and for US Latinx being assigned less value (Subtirelu, 2017)

Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English, according to a study carried out by the Civil Rights Project at University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA) and Educational Testing Service (ETS) (Gandara, 2015).

Balanced bilinguals,” those who understand, speak, read, and write in both English and the language of the home: Earn more—$2,000-$5,000 annually compared to their English-only peers; Go to college at higher rates, which dramatically increases earnings; Have more social networks. (Gandara, 2015)

Bilinguals may not always be paid more, but they often are and frequently get hired over monolinguals with similar credentials.” (Gandara, 2015)

Ruben Rumbaut examined the effects of bilingualism on more than 6,000 young people in their mid to late 20s. He distinguished among limited, moderate, and fluent bilingual and non-bilingual people across a range of ethnicities. He found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased.

Diana A. Porras, Jungeyon Ee, and Patricia Gandara surveyed almost 300 large, medium, and small businesses in California, across all sectors of the economy, asking employers whether they had a preference for hiring bilingual employees and if so, whether they compensated them for their language skills. Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multilingualism is often framed as human capital that increases individuals’ labor market value. Such assertions overlook the role of ideology in assigning value to languages and their speakers based on factors other than communicative utility. This article explores the value assigned to Spanish-English bilingualism on the United States labor market through a mixed methods analysis of online job advertisements. Findings suggest that Spanish-English bilingualism is frequently preferred or required for employment in the US, but that such employment opportunities are less lucrative. The results suggest a penalty associated with Spanish-English bilingualism in which positions listing such language requirements advertise lower wages than observationally similar positions. Quantitative disparities and qualitative differences in the specification of language requirements across income levels suggest that bilingual labor is assigned value through a racial lens that leads to linguistic work undertaken by and for US Latinx being assigned less value (Subtirelu, 2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English, according to a study carried out by the Civil Rights Project at University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA) and Educational Testing Service (ETS) (Gandara, 2015).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balanced bilinguals,” those who understand, speak, read, and write in both English and the language of the home: Earn more—$2,000-$5,000 annually compared to their English-only peers; Go to college at higher rates, which dramatically increases earnings; Have more social networks. (Gandara, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilinguals may not always be paid more, but they often are and frequently get hired over monolinguals with similar credentials.” (Gandara, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ruben Rumbaut examined the effects of bilingualism on more than 6,000 young people in their mid to late 20s. He distinguished among limited, moderate, and fluent bilingual and non-bilingual people across a range of ethnicities. He found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diana A. Porras, Jungeyon Ee, and Patricia Gandara surveyed almost 300 large, medium, and small businesses in California, across all sectors of the economy, asking employers whether they had a preference for hiring bilingual employees and if so, whether they compensated them for their language skills. Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Multilingualism is often framed as human capital that increases individuals' labor market value. Findings suggest that Spanish-English bilingualism is frequently preferred or required for employment in the US, but that such employment opportunities are less lucrative.

- Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English (Gandara, 2015).

- Ruben Rumbaut found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased.

- Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred bilingual employees if their skills were comparable to those of monolingual employees. This confirmed that in California, bilingual employees are in high demand and have a hiring advantage over those who are monolingual.

- Researchers analyze the early occupational careers of fifty-eight second-generation young adults in Dalton, Georgia, a global carpet-manufacturing center. Researchers find intergenerational occupational mobility, with children of Mexican immigrants deploying human-capital skills to access better jobs than their parents. While bilingual skills play a critical role in the employment paths that members of the second generation have started to chart, their use of bilingualism is also shaped by gender dynamic in the workplace. (Hernandez-Leon & Lakhani, 2013)

- The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries. Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. "In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resource that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage." (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

- Although it is commonly thought that people who are bilingual have an advantage in the labor market, studies on this topic have not borne out this perception. The literature, in fact, has found an earnings penalty is associated with bilingualism—people who are bilingual often make less than people who are monolingual in similar jobs. (Gándara, 2015)

- This article presents the results of a 2014 survey of more than 2,100 U.S. employers on their requirements for multilingual employees. The survey revealed a significant discrepancy: On the one hand, 93% of respondents “value[d] employees who . . . are able to work effectively with customers, clients, and businesses from a range of different countries and cultures.” On the other, 66% of respondents reported identifying foreign language skills in the hiring process, 41% reported giving advantage to multilingual applicants, and only 10% of respondents indicated that new hires “needed to speak at least one language besides English.” In addition, the survey revealed employer characteristics related to demand for language ability: Industries with the greatest demand were government and public administration, information services, educational services, health care, and the administrative sector. Language skills were sought in combination with other skill sets, notably customer service, sales, vendor management, and marketing. The results are critical to educational programs seeking to understand the value of language in the job market. (Damari et al., 2017)

- Using structural topic modeling and critical discourse analysis, this study employs a raciolinguistic perspective to unpack the ideologies underlying the discourses in over 200 DL programs in a new Latinx South state of the United States. Our findings show that DL programs are promoted as a model that brings cognitive and employment benefits to its students. Moreover, private corporate power has a strong existence and influence on
Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage.” (Gándara & Acevedo, 2016)

- Although it is commonly thought that people who are bilingual have an advantage in the labor market, studies on this topic have not borne out this perception. The literature, in fact, has found an earnings penalty is associated with bilingualism—people who are bilingual often make less than people who are monolingual in similar jobs. (Gándara, 2015)

- On the one hand, 93% of respondents “value[d] employees who...are able to work effectively with customers, clients, and businesses from a range of different countries and cultures.” On the other, 66% of respondents reported identifying foreign language skills in the hiring process, 41% reported giving advantage to multilingual applicants, and only 10% of respondents indicated that new hires “needed to speak at least one language besides English.” In addition, the survey revealed employer characteristics (Damari et al., 2017)

- DL programs are promoted as a model that brings cognitive and the establishment, staffing, and promotion of DL programs. (Sun & Wang, 2023)

- **While English proficiency enhances labor market outcomes, its role in minority-language regions remains largely unexplored.** Employing the U.S. Mexico border as a minority-language region, researchers analyzed whether English skills differently affect the earnings and occupational sorting of Mexican Americans along the border relative to their non-border peers. **Researchers found comparable English deficiency earnings penalties for Mexican immigrants, suggesting that this group responds to English-specific regional wage gaps.** US born men, however, have larger earnings penalty along the border, possibly reflecting natives’ relative immobility owing to strong geographic preferences. **Occupational sorting exercises give credence to this interpretation for native Mexican American females.** (Davila & Mora, 2000).

- **English is often assumed to be a key to material success and social inclusion, and this belief commonly works to justify the global dominance of English, glossing over and rationalizing broader social inequalities.** This paper extends the discussion of this fallacy of ‘the promise of English’ to the domain of the South Korean job market, where skills in the English language play a major role in determining one’s access to white-collar jobs. **Since the 1990s, different modes of English language testing have emerged as popular means for evaluating job applicants for Korean corporations, constantly upgrading the criteria for ‘good English’.** (Park, 2011)
employment benefits to its students. Moreover, private corporate power has a strong existence and influence on the establishment, staffing, and promotion of DL programs. (Sun & Wang, 2023)

- Researchers found comparable English deficiency earnings penalties for Mexican immigrants, suggesting that this group responds to English-specific regional wage gaps. US born men, however, have larger earnings penalty along the border, possibly reflecting natives’ relative immobility owing to strong geographic preferences. Occupational sorting exercises give credence to this interpretation for native Mexican American females. (Davila & Mora, 2000).
- Since the 1990s, different modes of English language testing have emerged as popular means for evaluating job applicants for Korean corporations, constantly upgrading the criteria for ‘good English’. (Park, 2011)

Maintaining Home Language

- Maintaining and teaching languages other than English will be key to the success of the nation’s schools in the coming century. “Equally Important, though, is the finding that transitional bilingual instruction that leaves behind the native language is not where the payoff is; it is in maintaining immigrant languages. (Gandara 2015)

Economic Success

- Children of Mexican immigrants face structural challenges that threaten to obstruct their economic success in young adulthood. They activated three resources in mobility promoting ways given the demographic,
structural challenges that threaten to obstruct their economic success in young adulthood. They activated three resources in mobility promoting ways given the demographic, economic, and social characteristics of their community. The resources include parental support, advice and guidance from extrafamilial mentors, and bilingualism in English and Spanish. (Morando, 2013)

- A series of logistic and ordinary least squared regression analyses of the 2011–2015 American Community Survey (ACS) data shows that substantial differences exist across different ethnic groups among Asians. Bilingual advantages appear in most Asian groups when predicting both employment status and personal earnings, and the benefits tend to be more salient in the results of earnings analysis. The findings indicate that native-language literacy skill is a more momentous variable than the other variables in the model and that bilingual advantages stand out among Asian Indians and Chinese/Taiwanese more substantially compared to other Asians. Immense gender gaps also exist between Asian males and females in terms of economic well-being, and such gaps are more conspicuous in personal earnings than in employment status. (Ee, 2019)

- Working from a political economy perspective and drawing from current theoretical approaches to language and labor under neoliberalism, researchers examine the reproduction of the discursive trope of language profit in the corporate world and educational spaces, and then analyze the narratives and trajectories of young Latinx workers in New York. The marginalized position of Latinxs in the social structure and the racialization of their linguistic practice result in a linguistic exploitation that remains unchallenged in the US. Researchers conclude that today’s celebrations of bilingualism, which follow a capitalist logic, perpetuate a hierarchy of languages and speakers that is detrimental to racialized minorities. (Alonso & Villa, 2020)

- The marginalized position of Latinxs in the social structure and the racialization of their linguistic practice result in a linguistic exploitation that remains unchallenged in the US. Researchers conclude that today’s celebrations of bilingualism, which follow a capitalist logic, perpetuate a hierarchy of languages and speakers that is detrimental to racialized minorities. (Alonso & Villa, 2020)

- Substantial differences exist across different ethnic groups among Asians. Bilingual advantages appear in most Asian groups when predicting both employment status and personal earnings, and the benefits tend to be more salient in the results of earnings analysis. Native-language literacy skill is a more momentous variable than the other variables in the model and that bilingual advantages stand out among Asian Indians and Chinese/Taiwanese more substantially compared to other Asians. (Ee, 2019)

Global Economy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Global Economy</th>
<th>• Trimmell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
### Language Diversity and Global Citizenship

- **Trimnell (2005)** points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.
- **Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy.** Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).
- **With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills.** (Rolon, 2005)
- **It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation.** In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. (Close, 2017)
- **Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to...**
- **Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.**
- **Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.**
- **When you devalue home languages by, for instance, using just English with students who speak another language at home, you stifle learning and community engagement. Some language laws, like Arizona’s English-only law and Russia’s law banning instruction in minority languages like Bashkir and Tatar (effective September 1, 2013), silence students and jeopardize the success of entire communities. Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).**
- **With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills.** (Rolon, 2005)
- **Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words language mixing were explored. It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. (Close, 2017)**
- **Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to...**
- **Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.**
- **Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.**
- **When you devalue home languages by, for instance, using just English with students who speak another language at home, you stifle learning and community engagement. Some language laws, like Arizona’s English-only law and Russia’s law banning instruction in minority languages like Bashkir and Tatar (effective September 1, 2013), silence students and jeopardize the success of entire communities. Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).**
- **With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills.** (Rolon, 2005)
- **Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words language mixing were explored. It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. (Close, 2017)**
- **Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to...**
- **Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.**
- **Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.**
- **When you devalue home languages by, for instance, using just English with students who speak another language at home, you stifle learning and community engagement. Some language laws, like Arizona’s English-only law and Russia’s law banning instruction in minority languages like Bashkir and Tatar (effective September 1, 2013), silence students and jeopardize the success of entire communities. Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).**
- **With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills.** (Rolon, 2005)
- **Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words language mixing were explored. It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. (Close, 2017)**
- **Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to...**
- **Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.**
- **Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.**
- **When you devalue home languages by, for instance, using just English with students who speak another language at home, you stifle learning and community engagement. Some language laws, like Arizona’s English-only law and Russia’s law banning instruction in minority languages like Bashkir and Tatar (effective September 1, 2013), silence students and jeopardize the success of entire communities. Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).**
- **With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills.** (Rolon, 2005)
- **Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words language mixing were explored. It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. (Close, 2017)**
- **Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to...**
- **Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.**
- **Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.**
- **When you devalue home languages by, for instance, using just English with students who speak another language at home, you stifle learning and community engagement. Some language laws, like Arizona’s English-only law and Russia’s law banning instruction in minority languages like Bashkir and Tatar (effective September 1, 2013), silence students and jeopardize the success of entire communities. Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).**
- **With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills.** (Rolon, 2005)
- **Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words language mixing were explored. It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. (Close, 2017)**
- **Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to...**
- **Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.**
- **Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language.**
- **When you devalue home languages by, for instance, using just English with students who speak another language at home, you stifle learning and community engagement. Some language laws, like Arizona’s English-only law and Russia’s law banning instruction in minority languages like Bashkir and Tatar (effective September 1, 2013), silence students and jeopardize the success of entire communities. Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).**
- **With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills.** (Rolon, 2005)
- **Here, the researcher reports on an extensive questionnaire in which German–English participants reflected upon their use of languages and the particular benefits as well as the challenges they face. Constructs, such as inhibition, retrieval of words language mixing were explored. It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. (Close, 2017)**
obtain information from a large number of sources and the multilingual world we live in) (Tytus, 2018)

- Now, a growing number of states also see bilingualism as key to accessing the global economy, as evidenced by the surging popularity of the "seal of biliteracy"—a special recognition for graduates who demonstrate fluency in two or more languages. (Corey, 2018)

- Lindholm-Leary (2001) argued that DLI programs have the potential to "eradicate the negative status of bilingualism in the U.S." because they combine "maintenance bilingual education and immersion education models in an integrated classroom composed of both language majority and language minority students with the goal of full bilingualism and biliteracy."

- The benefits of bilingual education have long been characterized in terms of advantages for a global economy (Varghese & Park, 2010)

- Although aware of the pitfalls of this association, many (e.g., Krashen, as cited in Crawford, 2001; MacSwan, 1998; Tse, 2001) have attempted to emphasize the economic advantages of bilingual education by stressing the "great importance of bilingualism in our modern global community" (MacSwan, 1998, p. 9).

- "In an era of globalization, a society that has access to multilingual and multicultural resources is ability to play an important social and economic role on the world stage" (MacSwan, 1998, p. 7).

- Highlighting this perspective, bilingualism and bilingual education can be viewed as a way to serve students and nations in the inevitable move toward an interconnected multilingual world. (MacSwan, 1998).

- The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries. Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. "In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage." (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

- To compete successfully in the global marketplace, both U.S.-based multinational corporations as well as small businesses increasingly need employees with knowledge of foreign languages and cultures to market products to customers around the globe and to work effectively with foreign employees and partners in other countries. Asia Society (2002) and National Geographic-Roper (2002) indicated that, compared with students in nine other industrialized countries, U.S. students lack knowledge of world geography, history, and current events. And shockingly few U.S. students learn languages that large numbers of people speak, such as Chinese (1.3 billion speakers) and Arabic (246 million speakers). The United States must create its own education response to globalization, which should include raising standards, increasing high school and college graduation rates, and modernizing and internationalizing the curriculum. (Stewart, 2006)

- America is so far utterly failing to produce a generation of global citizens. For parents who want to give their children global experience while keeping them safely on the straight and narrow American path of PSATs, SATs, and stellar extracurriculars, there's an ever-growing field of options. Immersion schools have exploded over the past 40 years, growing from none in 1970 to 440 today, according to the Center for Applied Linguistics, and Mandarin, especially, is seen among type-A parents as a twofer: a child who learns Mandarin starting at 5 increases her brain capacity and is exposed to the culture of the future through language. (One mom in San Francisco laughs when she recalls that her daughter learned about Rosa Parks and the Montgomery bus boycott in Chinese.) (Miller et al., 2011)

- “Being a global citizen” is having strong interests in global issues, cultivating the understanding and appreciation of diverse values, and enhancing country’s competitiveness. All this however needs to be realized through communication in English, the world language. (Chen, 2011)

- Through comparative analyses of framing, keywords, spatial and temporal markers, actors, and legislative titles, we illustrate a discursive shift. While Proposition 227 presented bilingual education as a threat to children’s—and, by proxy, the nation’s—well-being (a language as problem orientation), Proposition 58 represents multilingual education as key to students’ future economic success and to the state and nation’s continued global
employees with small businesses, corporations as well as multinational marketplace, both U.S. and global. To compete successfully (MacSwan, 1998), businesses and workers must leverage language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006).

- At a time of semi-globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs.

- On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005).

- Trimmell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture. Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade. Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages. Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include

- To thrive in a global economy and a multicultural society, US students need fluency in at least one language other than English, Research shows that multilingual societies have a competitive advantage over societies in international trade (Hilliwell, 1999). Economic success and security in the US depend on our ability to understand the information we gather. Many Americans need to interact regularly with people who are unlikely to know English. Not only does the omission of language and cultural education leave US students behind their peers in other countries, but also it exacerbates the achievement gap within the US. (Met, 2001)

- It might sound like a no-brainer that being bilingual or multilingual helps students planning engineering and just about any other career. But it is certainly true and is becoming more important the economies of nations become more intertwined. What's more being able to go beyond mere language ability and understand cultural distinctions are extra advantages. Students say that being bilingual gives them more options on campus and off (Galuszka, 2007)

- In the current stumbling economy, job seekers are leveraging every qualification they can think of to sway potential employers. And with immigrants continuing to flood into New York, long the city of immigrants, and its suburbs, speaking a second language is a talent that matters in almost any field. In the global economy, American companies increasingly are realizing the benefits of a multilingual work force (Skomial, 2002)

- Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006).

- The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries. Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. “In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage.” (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

- To compete successfully in the global marketplace, both U.S.-based multinational corporations as well as small businesses increasingly need employees with
knowledge of foreign languages and cultures to market products to customers around the globe and to work effectively with foreign employees and partners in other countries. Asia Society (2002) and National Geographic-Roper (2002) indicated that, compared with students in nine other industrialized countries, U.S. students lack knowledge of world geography, history, and current events. And shockingly few U.S. students learn languages that large numbers of people speak, such as Chinese (1.3 billion speakers) and Arabic (246 million speakers).

The United States must create its own education response to globalization, which should include raising standards, increasing high school and college graduation rates, and modernizing and internationalizing the curriculum. (Stewart, 2006)

- “Being a global citizen” is having strong interests in global issues, cultivating the understanding and appreciation of diverse values, and enhancing country’s competitiveness. All this however needs to be realized through communication in English, the world language. (Chen, 2011)

- To thrive in a global economy and a multicultural society, US students need fluency in at least one language other than English. Research shows that multilingual societies have a competitive advantage over societies in international trade.
Economic success and security in the US depend on our ability to understand the information we gather. Many Americans need to interact regularly with people who are unlikely to know English. Not only does the omission of language and cultural education leave US students behind their peers in other countries, but also it exacerbates the achievement gap within the US. (Met, 2001)

- It might sound like a no-brainer that being bilingual or multilingual helps students planning engineering and just about any other career. But it is certainly true and is becoming more important the economies of nations become more intertwined. What's more being able to go beyond mere language ability and understand cultural distinctions are extra advantages. Students say that being bilingual gives them more options on campus and off (Galuszka, 2007)

- In the current stumbling economy, job seekers are leveraging every qualification they can think of to sway potential employers. And with immigrants continuing to flood into New York, long the city of immigrants, and its suburbs, speaking a second language is a talent that matters in almost any field. In the global economy, American companies increasingly are realizing the benefits of a multilingual work force (Skomial, 2002)

- Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills
and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006).

- At a time of semi-globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs.

- On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005).

- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture. Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade. Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages. Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees.
include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Home language Importance</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The families wanted their children to be bilingual because they believed in the cognitive and economic advantages of bilingualism and that bilingualism would help maintain the families’ roots.</strong> (Rodríguez, 2015)</td>
<td><strong>This article explores the strategies that three Latino families in the U.S. employed in raising their children bilingually in Spanish and English. It also looks at their rationale for bilingualism as well as the challenges the parents failed to anticipate in implementing their strategies. The data were gleaned from comparative case studies over a three-year period. The families wanted their children to be bilingual because they believed in the cognitive and economic advantages of bilingualism and that bilingualism would help maintain the families’ roots.</strong> (Rodríguez, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Although past research has found no real economic benefit for bilinguals in the U.S. labor market, the new research reviewed here comes to the opposite conclusion: Full literacy in another language brings substantial economic benefit. Moreover, the failure to nurture these linguistic skills in the children of immigrants exacts a cost to the earnings of these potentially bilingual/biliterate students.</strong> (Gándara, 2018)</td>
<td><strong>Although past research has found no real economic benefit for bilinguals in the U.S. labor market, the new research reviewed here comes to the opposite conclusion: Full literacy in another language brings substantial economic benefit. Moreover, the failure to nurture these linguistic skills in the children of immigrants exacts a cost to the earnings of these potentially bilingual/biliterate students.</strong> (Gándara, 2018)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
After pulling out the summarized and simplified findings, I removed the right column of the table. This allowed me to see each main idea, with the summarized and simplified findings.

The next step was to find similarities among the findings. To this, I looked for similarities in key words and phrases and highlighted similar key words and phrases the same color, within each of the main ideas.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Theme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Idea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Idea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Idea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Idea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Idea</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

→

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Idea</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Similarity/Overlap</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


→

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Similarity/Overlap</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

→

| Answer to research question |
### How do dual language programs support English Learners in maintaining their first language?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First Language Literacy Development</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Gains in English Abilities</strong> (students in DL programs) (Hammer et al., 2020)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Gains in Spanish language abilities (students in DL programs) (Murphy, 2014)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Gains in verbal expression skills (students in DL programs) (Murphy, 2014)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maintaining Home Language</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Two languages as academic tools/funds of knowledge (Martin-Beltran, 2009)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Oral narrative skills and home language contribute to reading outcomes (Huang et al., 2022)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Maintaining home language is beneficial to English reading development</strong> (Huang et al., 2022)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Home language plays positive role in language learning (Dahm &amp; De Angelis, 2018)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Home language plays positive role in math learning (Dahm &amp; De Angelis, 2018)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingual learners always have all linguistic resources available to them. (Escamilla et al., 2021)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Bilingual education results in significant literacy achievement.</strong> (Escamilla et al., 2021)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In bilingual classrooms children reached age appropriate academic proficiency in both languages (Collins, 2014)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Home Language Importance</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Maintaining and teaching languages other than English is the key to success this century. (Gandara 2015)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Pay off is in maintaining home languages. (Gandara 2015)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingualism results in cognitive and economic advantages (Rodríguez, 2015)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingualism helps maintains family roots (Rodríguez, 2015)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Failure to nurture home language results in potential cost to earnings of bilingual/biliterate students (Gándara, 2018)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How does participation in a dual language program impact the intellectual development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intellectual Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cognitive Skills</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Early Childhood Programs</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Young English Learners benefit most from bilingual programs (Maxwell, 2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Supporting the home language is the best for young ELs (Maxwell, 2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Learners with Disabilities</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- English Learners with disabilities in bilingual programs show gains in linguistic, academic, cognitive growth (Carrasquillo &amp; Rodriguez, 2002; Paneque &amp; Barbeta, 2006; Rodriguez, Parmar, &amp; Signer, 2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>General Cognitive Benefits/Advantages</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingualism results in enhancement of cognitive flexibility, higher cognitive reserve, delay in the onset of dementia (Fox et al, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Cognitive advantages in bilingual children: enhanced executive function, increased short term memory, enhanced problem solving skills (Morales, Calvo, &amp; Bialystok, 2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilinguals have higher cognitive abilities, mental elasticity, and metalinguistic awareness (August, Goldenberg, &amp; Rueda, 2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- DL students perceive cognitive and other benefits of being bilingual (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingual cognitive advantage: increased metalinguistic (Bialystok et al. 2010), executive functions, and cognitive reserve (Schweizer et al. 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Home language use in addition to English expands cognitive skills and higher order thinking/ executive functioning (Pandey, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit superior problem solving skills compared to peers (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingual kindergartens exhibit enhanced memory compared to peers (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit enhanced intercultural and interpersonal skills (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingual specific advantage: metalinguistic awareness and cognitive control (Dillon, 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Early bilingualism can positively influence cognitive development, particularly attentional and executive functioning in children (see reviews in Bialystok, 2005, and in Costa, Hernández, Costa-Fadella &amp; Sebastián- Gallés, 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Positive impact of bilingualism: flexibility in a symbol reorganization task (Peal &amp; Lambert, 1962), superior performance at inhibiting distractors in a number concept task (Bialystok &amp; Codd, 1997), superior symbolic representation and attentional inhibition skills in appearance–reality tasks (Bialystok &amp; Senman, 2004).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed. (Nielson, et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Turkish immigrants have better executive functioning and episodic memory compared to Turkish immigrant monolinguals. (Nielson, et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The bilingual advantage is neither confounded with, nor limited by socioeconomic and cultural factors and, second, that separable aspects of executive functioning are differentially affected by bilingualism (Engel et al., 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lifelong experience with multiple languages produces executive function advantages including enhanced top-down control, improved attention, and greater working memory capacity (Grundy &amp; Timmer, 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingualism affects linguistic and cognitive performance across the lifespan (Bialystok, 2009)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Cognitive Flexibility**
- Bilinguals may be uniquely receptive to growth mindset interventions due to their increased cognitive flexibility. (Grote et al., 2021)
Bilingual advantage is a result of language-switching habits (Barbu et al., 2020)
Executive advantages associated with bilingualism may stem from language switching frequency rather than from bilingualism per se (Prior and Gollan, 2011)

Protection from Dementia/Alzheimer’s
Knowing a second language is: Cognitive/enriching’, which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease, an ability to express oneself in more ways along with an ability to notice/think differently and to widen horizons (Schweizer et al. 2012)
Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit superior problem solving skills compared to peers. These skills are associated with a lower incidence of Alzheimer’s and dementia (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)
Bilinguals revealed patterns that were consistent with interpretation of protection from cognitive reserve when compared with monolinguals (Bialystok, 2021)

Literacy Skills
Bilingual/biliterate students have higher phonological awareness and processing abilities (Bialystok et al., 2005)

Brain Research
Gray matter volume was higher in language and EF regions among bilinguals (Torres et al., 2022)
A bilingual speaker’s brain has two active language systems even when he is using only one language. That creates situations in which one system obstructs the other. This interference forces the brain to resolve internal conflict, which gives the mind a workout that strengthens its cognitive muscles (Bhattacharjee 2012)
Bilingual experience improves the brain’s executive functioning (Bhattacharjee, 2012)

Culture of Intellectualism
Attitudes
DL students had positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language. They perceive benefits from being bilingual (Cho et al., 2023)
Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child (Cardenas, 1986)
Failure to allow sufficient language development before the transition will result in a child being unable to cope with anything but the most shallow levels of learning and will affect that child's future capability for learning. (Cardenas, 1986)
The extent to which a person develops his or her intellectual capacity depends greatly on the extent of language acquisition and use(Cardenas, 1986)

Executive Function of the Brain
Focus and Attention
Cognitive advantages for bilingual children: enhanced executive function of the brain resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001)
Bilinguals show better executive function and metalinguistic awareness (Adesope et al. 2010).

Processing advantage
Studies support a domain-general processing advantage in bilinguals (Barac et al. 2014) with greater accuracy, better reaction times on nonverbal tasks, more fluid switching, and stronger performances on working memory tasks (Ransdell et al. 2001), perhaps developing a specialized form of long-term working memory that can support reading and writing.

Working Memory
No evidence for a bilingual advantage remained after correcting for bias. (Antfolk et al., 2018)
Researchers found no differences between groups in their performance. The evidence presented here indicates that the bilingual advantage might indeed be caused by spurious uncontrolled factors rather than bilingualism per se. (Anton, 2018)
Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions. (Anton, 2018)

Theory of Mind
Being bilingual may also increase “understanding of other people, their mental and knowledge states” (Barac et al. 2014) or what is known as “theory of mind” (Goetz 2003).

Brain Research
Bilinguals have been shown to have “increased density of grey matter in the left inferior parietal cortex” (Bialystok 2009, p. 3)
Simultaneous bilingual brains evidence more white matter density (in the anterior cingulate) than sequential bilinguals (Mohades et al. 2015).

Executive Function Advantage
- Executive functions are positively correlated to both socio-economic status (SES, e.g., Nesbitt et al., 2013) and academic performance (for review, see Serpell & Esposito, 2016).
- The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels (Esposito, 2022).
- The extant research suggests bilingualism is associated with enhanced cognitive effects, most evident in attention and executive functioning (EF). After controlling for demographic variables, balance in bilingualism significantly accounted for 37% of the variance in ratings of children’s task initiation (Weber et al., 2014) (Weber, et al., 2014)
- These findings underscore bilingualism’s power to enrich executive functioning and self-regulatory behaviors, especially among underprivileged children (Hartanto et al., 2019)
- Bilingual children exhibited superior performance on two different measures of visual–spatial memory, as well as measures of inhibitory and attentional control. Bilinguals exhibit broad advantages in executive function during the preschool years, and these advantages are evident within a disadvantaged, low-SES population. (Grote, 2021)
- Bilingual advantages in executive control emerge at an age not previously shown. (Poulin-Dubois, 2010)
- Given that individuals tend to seek out environments and pursuits that best suit their cognitive strengths (Haworth et al., 2010), superior executive functioning might predict which individuals are likely to seek out language learning opportunities in the first place. (Kempe et al., 2015)
- Young bilingual children’s unique experiences lead to greater ability to use cognitive skills to engage in goal-directed behavior, when compared to monolingual children. Therefore, bilingualism may have important influences on cognitive development that can help support children’s success in school and beyond. (Goodrich, 2022)
- Advanced inhibitory control skills have been found in bilingual speakers as compared to monolingual controls (Bialystok, 1999).
- Bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function better than both other groups. Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call for managing conflicting attentional demands (Conflict tasks); there was no advantage on impulse-control (Delay tasks). (Carlson, 2008)

### Executive Function Disadvantage/ No Advantage
- Empirical evidence does not support a bilingual advantage on EF that is distinguishable from zero. This includes new data that compares tests of the bilingual advantage hypothesis based on self-reports of cognitive control to performance-based measures of EF (Paap, 2018)
- For verbal fluency, researchers found a small bilingual disadvantage, possibly reflecting less exposure for each individual language when using two languages in a balanced manner (Antfolk et al.,)
- Researchers conclude that the available evidence does not provide systematic support for the widely held notion that bilingualism is associated with benefits in cognitive control functions in adults. (Antfolk et al.,)
- Researchers found no differences between groups in either of the forward versions of the tasks, but bilinguals systematically outperformed monolinguals in the backward conditions. (Anton, 2018)
- No effects of bilingualism were observed for performance-based measures of working memory or cognitive flexibility. (Goodrich, 2022)

### EF in Bilingual Children with Disabilities
- Our findings indicate that the bilingual advantage in executive functioning may extend to children with neurodevelopmental conditions. (Ratto et al., 2020)
Educational Development

Academic Achievement

Reading Achievement
- Students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized reading and mathematics tests (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)
- Students in DLE programs score similar to their statewide peers by about grade 5-7, if not sooner (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)
- DLE middle and high school students are more likely to pass the high school exit exam (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)
- Students who remained in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake student in English-only programs at about the 5th grade; by high school, they were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured, including English language arts scores and recategorization to English-proficient status (Gandara, 2015)
- In both subjects, DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. These results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. (Torph & Murphy, 2021)
- Students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)
- DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas & Collier, 2012).
- Students who have continuously enrolled in a Dual Language: Two Way Immersion Bilingual Program reveal higher academic achievement than students enrolled in an Early Exit, Transitional Bilingual program, from kindergarten to third grade (Nascimento, 2017)
- Classroom peer grit, not individual grit, was a strong predictor of individual literacy achievement 4 months later among dual language, largely Latina/o elementary school students (O’Neal, 2018)
- Students score statistically significantly higher in reading in 4th grade than their non dual-language peers, a pattern that continues through 8th grade. By 5th grade, dual language students score about the same as their monolingual peers a grade ahead of them, an advantage that lasts through 8th grade. (Thomas & Collier, 2012)
- For English-learners in dual language programs, reading scores in all the tested grades are much higher than for English Learners who are not in a dual-language program, according to the study. (Maxwell, 2015)
- Students randomly assigned to immersion outperformed their peers in English reading by about seven months in fifth grade and nine months in eighth grade. There was no statistically significant benefit, but also no detriment, for math and science performance (RAND)

Math Achievement
- “The evidence that bilingual young people, relative to monolingual controls, show greater cognitive flexibility, creativity, divergent thought and improved problem-solving abilities, is very persuasive” (pp. 192-93). One effect of these cognitive advantages is increased academic achievement, including in mathematics and science (Clarkson, 2007)
- Results show that students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)
- DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas & Collier, 2012).
The results from this natural experiment indicate that students in a DLI program that has been implemented state-wide were able to succeed academically in math (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018). Marian et al. (2013) investigated the academic achievement of students in grades 3, 4, or 5 (approximately ages 8–10 years), a portion of which were enrolled in a two-way dual-language program. They found an advantage in academic performance in math across all three grade levels and reading in 3rd grade. The dual-language students showed greater growth in math achievement across the 4th grade year compared to mainstreamed English students (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018).

### Achievement Gap

| English Learners | close the achievement gap with NES students in English-Only classrooms by about fifth grade (Lindholm-Leary, 2012) |
| DLE middle and high school students are more likely to close the gap with NES peers by the end of high school (Lindholm-Leary, 2012) |
| Ideally, English Learners would learn in communities where their culture and language are valued, such as dual language classrooms where content and language arts are taught both in English and Spanish. The benefits of such models include accelerated academic progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap (Oberg & Phillips, 2014) |
| Research shows that long-term DL programs can close achievement gaps between English-proficient speakers and emergent bilinguals after five years, while short-term bilingual or English-only transitional programs close only about half of that gap (Collier & Thomas, 2017). |

### Academic Achievement Success

| The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels, yet the academic advantage was only present in the intermediate students (Esposito, 2020) |
| Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages (Gandara, 2015) |
| Multiple studies indicate that children in bilingual education models (including dual-language and immersion models) have academic outcomes that match or even exceed those of their peers in mainstream education models, especially in later elementary grades (Esposito, 2020). |
| Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics (Gomez et al., 2005) |
| Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism (Gandara, 2015). |
| The results drawn from both quantitative and qualitative data indicate that bilingual students benefitted from attending a dual language program. It contributes positively to students’ academic achievement, bilingual school identification and commitment to language learning. (Bruitt-Griffier & Jang, 2022) |
| DL programming improves academic outcomes for traditionally under-served groups while fostering diverse learning environments for all learners. Students in DL programs outperform students who participate in non-DL programs (Palencia et al., 2021) |
| Bilinguals entering Head Start with English proficiency showed similar developmental trajectories in vocabulary and math to those of monolinguals. Second, EBs entering Head Start with limited English proficiency presented the lowest baseline skills in vocabulary and math. Whereas the initial vocabulary gaps generally persisted over time, gaps in math between EBs and monolinguals narrowed by kindergarten. Third, no difference was found between bilinguals and EBs in their Spanish vocabulary development (Choi et al., 2018) |
| Findings suggest consistent support for the two-way immersion program over matched control students across all three achievement areas. It appears the greatest effect for native English speakers may be in reading, while native Spanish speakers may benefit more in writing and mathematics. (Cobb et al., 2006) |
| When properly implemented, DLPs are an effective way to improve academic achievement for all students (Lindholm-Leary, 2001). |
| Data has demonstrated that DLPs have benefited both English Learners and native English-speaking students in obtaining higher levels of academic achievement in all areas, as compared to their counterparts in mainstream classrooms (Thomas & Collier, 2012). |
| In states with high numbers of English Learners, such as Arizona, implementing a two-way 50/50 model can be beneficial for the academic achievement of all students involved in such programs. (Gonzalez & Cisneros, 2020) |
| If the number of Latino students in your school is high, dual language programs can increase their academic achievement while also developing their biliteracy and bilingual skills (Gomez, 2005). |

### English Learners with Disabilities

| English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth (Rodriguez, 2009). |

---

*References:
- Oberg & Phillips (2014)
- Marian et al. (2013)
- Collier & Thomas (2017)
- Lindholm-Leary (2012)
- Collier & Thomas (2012)
- Bruitt-Griffier & Jang (2022)
- Palencia et al. (2021)
- Choi et al. (2018)
- Cobb et al. (2006)
- Thomas & Collier (2012)
- Oades-Sese et al. (2011)
- Tharp et al. (2018)
- Marian et al. (2013)
- Lindholm-Leary (2001)
- Collier & Thomas (2006)
- Cisneros (2020)
- Rodriguez (2009)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language Acquisition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Two-way immersion models that support the home language and culture and integrate language majority and minority learners were associated with faster English acquisition, which mediated the link between Two-Way Immersion (TWI) programs and higher GPAs (Serafini et al., 2022).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School/College Readiness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• A statistically significant difference was found in the performance of the participants in the areas of mathematics and science. Overall, DL participants outperformed TB participants. (Garza-Reyna, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A statistically significant difference was found on the t-tests run for the Reading (p &gt; .000) and English (p &gt; .000) portions of the ACT exam. In the area of Reading, the TB comparison group (10.8%) had less than the DL comparison group (51.8%) meet the recommended minimum score outlined in the TUAP. Similar findings were found on the English portion of the ACT exam. By and large, DL participants outperformed the TB participants in this study. (Garza-Reyna et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The benefits of a program include improved college readiness for all students involved -- not just the English Language Learners, who are largely Spanish speakers in the Crossroads, said Alejandro Mojica, the Victoria school districts newly hired Bilingual and ESL Learning director. &quot;Research shows that by the time they reach high school, these students are more college-ready than their peers who didn't participate in an immersion program.&quot; (Astrain, 2014).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elementary School Readiness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Young children learning two languages demonstrate school readiness factors: strong social-emotional development and “executive function” skills, such as listening and following directions (Ford, 2010).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• With a framework of neoliberal linguistic instrumentalism, the preschool conceptualized its DLL as an enriching context for students to obtain a cognitive, social, and academic edge. Cognitive development, social competencies, and school readiness were primary goals while bilingualism/biliteracy was a secondary bonus if achieved. (Chen, 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• DLLs had school readiness difficulties in Japanese language skills and ToM, but not in EF, compared to their Japanese monolingual peers. The positive relationship of language and EF skills with ToM development, which is commonly reported in monolingual children, extended to an understudied population of DLLs in this study. (Sudo &amp; Matsui, 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Results revealed statistically significant relations between teachers’ Spanish talk and DLLs’ social outcomes. Specifically, teachers’ Spanish talk with DLLs and DLLs’ initial English and Spanish skills were positively associated with the latter’s interactive peer play behaviors, whereas DLLs’ initial English skills were negatively associated with their disconnected peer play behaviors. (Limlingan et al., 2022)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preschool Attendance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Achievement gaps are already established when DLLs enter kindergarten without having attended a preschool program, such as being less able to recognize English letters, count to 20, or write their names compared with their English-dominant peers (Ansari, 2018).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Preschool attendance promotes the native or first language (L1) and the target or second language (L2; English) and literacy development (Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016; Phillips et al., 2017).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Academic language and social-behavioral skills also increase when DLLs attend public preschool programs (Ansari &amp; López, 2015).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Attending formalized preschool environments can raise literacy and math scores for DLL children while reducing inequality in kindergarten (Barnett et al., 2020; Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2016).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literacy Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Results showed that Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills. (Hammer et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills. (Murphy, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. These effects remained significant even after controlling for students’ English speaking/writing proficiency. (He et al., 2022)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Language Acquisition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Young children learning two languages demonstrate school readiness factors: strong social-emotional development and “executive function” skills, such as listening and following directions (Ford, 2010).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• With a framework of neoliberal linguistic instrumentalism, the preschool conceptualized its DLL as an enriching context for students to obtain a cognitive, social, and academic edge. Cognitive development, social competencies, and school readiness were primary goals while bilingualism/biliteracy was a secondary bonus if achieved. (Chen, 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• DLLs had school readiness difficulties in Japanese language skills and ToM, but not in EF, compared to their Japanese monolingual peers. The positive relationship of language and EF skills with ToM development, which is commonly reported in monolingual children, extended to an understudied population of DLLs in this study. (Sudo &amp; Matsui, 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Results revealed statistically significant relations between teachers’ Spanish talk and DLLs’ social outcomes. Specifically, teachers’ Spanish talk with DLLs and DLLs’ initial English and Spanish skills were positively associated with the latter’s interactive peer play behaviors, whereas DLLs’ initial English skills were negatively associated with their disconnected peer play behaviors. (Limlingan et al., 2022)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• In all programs, more than 80 percent of English Learners were proficient in English by the end of elementary school, and more than 90 percent were proficient by 7th grade. When possible, invest in high-quality two-language programs. Choose among two-language programs based on community and stakeholder voice. (Umansky 2016)

English Literacy Development
• Spanish-English DLL children made gains in their English abilities while being exposed to Spanish at home. Also, gains in English vocabulary skills were observed when children’s Spanish skills were higher than the English skills. Gains in children’s Spanish language abilities were not realized and children’s English language abilities did not appear to support children’s Spanish skills. (Hammer et al., 2020)
• Both the DLLs and monolingual English speakers in the study showed similar developmental trajectories on receptive vocabulary, story recall, decoding, and letter and word identification from preschool through the 2nd grade. At end of 2nd grade, the 2 groups’ vocabulary, story recall, reading fluency, decoding, and letter and word identification performances were similar and within the normal range for children their age. The study’s findings suggest that a strong preschool language and literacy program can reduce the English language gap between DLLs and monolingual English speakers from low-income families. (Han et al., 2014)
• Results demonstrate plasticity in early childhood through diverse language exposure and suggest that phonemic representation begins to emerge driven by lexical restructuring. (Smith et al., 2022)
• Both Cantonese speaking and writing proficiency had significant main effects on academic competence. (He et al., 2022)
• Children receiving instruction in the CLR bilingual modality had significantly higher posttest scores (than those receiving the ECR English-only instruction) on Spanish and English vocabulary assessments at instruction end and on the Spanish vocabulary assessment at follow-up, even after controlling for pre-instruction scores. The results provide additional evidence of the benefits of strategically combining the first and second language to promote English and Spanish vocabulary development in this population. (Méndez et al., 2015)

Language & Literacy Development
• DLLs have two separate language systems early in life. Differences in some areas of language development, such as vocabulary, appear to exist among DLLs depending on when they were first exposed to their second language. DLLs’ language and literacy development may differ from that of monolinguals, although DLLs appear to catch up over time. Little is known about factors that influence DLLs’ development, although the amount of language exposure to and usage of DLLs’ two languages appears to play key roles. (Hammer et al., 2014)
• Specific literacy-related practices, including availability of books in the home, language read to the child, and parental reading skills were significant predictors of growth in children’s Spanish and English vocabulary knowledge, even after controlling children’s initial level of language skills and family socioeconomic status. (Goodrich et al., 2021)
• Year 2 results were consistent with Year 1, with the TBE classroom exceeding the PE classroom on all Spanish measures of language and literacy development and no significant differences favoring the PE classroom. Year 2 trajectories were conditional on first-year effects, suggesting that sustained growth in dual language learner’s early literacy may depend on early intervention among 3-year-old preschoolers. (Durán et al., 2015)

Language Acquisition

Home Language Proficiency
• Both models produced significant increases in multiple dimensions of Spanish proficiency (alphabet/sight words, reading, writing, listening, and verbal expression). However, second-grade students in dual-language classrooms (who had longer exposure to the instructional model relative to first graders) scored significantly higher in verbal expression skills. (Murphy 2014)
• Dual-language instruction appears to be more effective than transitional-bilingual education, although the advantage is limited to the facilitation of home-language verbal expression associated with the dual-language model (Murphy, 2014)
### English Language Proficiency

- Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. Teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009)

- **TK had moderate to large effects on English proficiency**: smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social-emotional skills or executive function. The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry, as compared to Spanish-speaking dual language learners who do not attend. (Holod et al., 2020)

- The results showed that for dual language learners (DLLs, n = 107) growth rates in their German majority language skills varied over classrooms. Compared to monolingual children, DLLs improved faster in classrooms with higher peer level skills in the majority language than DLLs in classrooms with lower peer-level skills (controlling for socioeconomic status and classroom quality). DLLs showed stronger growth dynamics than monolingual children during later preschool stages. The findings highlight the role of preschool peers in DLLs’ acquisition of the majority language before entering elementary school. (Schmerse, 2021)

### Maintaining Home Language

- Findings demonstrated that the following key contextual factors cultivated a space for languaging (Swain, 2006), and thus enhanced conceptual understanding: 1) the interplay of two languages as academic tools; 2) the recognition of learners’ expertise and distinct linguistic funds of knowledge; 3) opportunities for co-construction; and 4) student and teacher strategies that call attention to language. This study has implications for the education of language-minority students in English-medium classrooms and suggests that teachers should cultivate learning spaces that draw upon their students’ other languages in order to promote a deeper analysis of English. (Martin-Beltran, 2009)

- Young DLL children’s oral narrative skills in English as well as in their home language Spanish contributed to their English reading outcomes. Maintaining young DLL children’s home language skills may be beneficial, rather than harmful, to their English reading development. (Huang et al., 2022)

- Results suggest a positive role of mother tongue literacy in language learning as well as mathematical learning. (Dahm & De Angelis, 2018)

- Adherence to these guidelines in Spanish–English bilingual education settings results in significant language and literacy achievement for Spanish–English Bilingual learners (Hopewell & Escamilla, 2013; Soltero-González et al., 2012, 2016; Sparrow et al., 2014). We cannot and should not teach them as if they were monolingual English speakers and/or if the LOTE is irrelevant to literacy acquisition. (Escamilla et al., 2021)

- Only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education. (Collins, 2014)

### Language Development

- The results also suggest cultural effects on language input and language development in bilingual and bicultural infants. (Ramírez-Esparza et al., 2017)

- Teachers contributed markedly to student reading outcomes when they (1) incorporated student perspectives into instruction; (2) promoted autonomy and responsibility; (3) provided instructional opportunities to support higher level thinking; and (4) applied instruction to real-life applications.

- Developing teachers’ emotional warmth and instructional support is particularly salient for teachers of English Learners, who must possess qualities associated with good teaching, both in general (such as content knowledge and pedagogical skills) and, more specifically, for English Learners (proficiency in bilingual education methods). (Lopez, 2012)
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the personal development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Development</th>
<th>Sense of Identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal Perception</td>
<td>All 92 participants agreed unanimously that knowing a second language is advantageous. Knowing two languages is beneficial in (3) personal (personal development, learning new things and learning additional languages) (Tytus, 2018).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Findings indicate how Roselyn’s shifts in participation lend insight to how she was able to construct identities of herself as a learner in general, and more specifically as a Latina language learner. (Collett, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identity Formation</td>
<td>There is a larger context at play here, and attention to how individua speech events such as this one connects with other speech events across time and space (Wortham &amp; Reyes, 2015) is necessary if we are to more fully understand the itineraries of identity (Bucholtz et al. 2012) that students like Alicia and Malik envision, enact, resist, and pursue in their everyday interactions. Researchers maintain that this particular focus on classroom talk—at this particular level of granularity—is warranted precisely because of how this single classroom interaction both reflects and helps constitute larger interactional patterns and broader social structure. (Martínez et al., 2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>As cross-cultural competence begins with awareness of the self within the socially and culturally diverse classrooms that TWI provides, we assert that scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence. (Feinauer &amp; Howard, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dual language learners are actively constructing ideas about reading, bilingualism/ biliteracy, and whom they are as readers as they learn to read. Framing early reading in an identity perspective presents opportunities to look more holistically at the language and reading practices of dual language learners as they learn to read and navigate two or more languages at home and school. (Collett, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Identity formation is one of the key components of adolescence and linguistic identity is critical to that process. For English learners to reach higher levels of achievement, they had to see themselves as high achievers in the first place—and in their first language. To achieve this, they focused on shifting to an asset based mindset, with the long term goal of turning the transitional bilingual education program into a dual language program Students reported that being bilingual is a big part of their identity. (Barrera et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. Patterns of learning were largely consonant with students’ sociolinguistic positioning in schools as language minority or majority speakers. (A. Kibler et al., 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Data highlights how these students used language in novel ways to assert a level of agency to become active participants in school-based activities. (Collett, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Identities are dynamic, constantly shifting processes of self-understanding mediated by local and institutional repertoires, behaviors, resources and enacted through one’s positioning in practice. Multiple approaches must be used to understand the bidirectional relationship language learning holds with identity development. By triangulating interviews with observations across school-based activities, and in using multiple cycles of analysis, revealed the tensions in Oscar’s identities with learning and language as a fifth-grade, emergent bilingual. (Collett, 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>According to a sociocultural perspective, when African-American students’ emergent bilingual/biliterate identities are affirmed across home and school contexts, by parents, peers, and teachers, like Ms. Padilla, who adopt a heteroglossic ideologies, those identities can flourish. Researchers extend this call by</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
suggesting that DLE programs must carve out space and dedicate resources to address underlying biases and ideologies with their learners as a part of their bilingual/biliterate development. (Bauer et al., 2020)

- Strong family relationships, formal coursework in Spanish, as well as a strong ethnic identity as Mexicans are interrelated factors that contribute to their high multilingual investment. Dual language education is a powerful factor, but formal Spanish courses at the secondary and post-secondary level are also equally strong contributors when dual language education is not available. (Babino & Stewart, 2019)

Personality

- Personality, cognitive strategies, and metalinguistic skills are important factors related to the acquisition and use of language (Michael and Gollan 2005).
- “I am me; my personality does not change depending on the words I speak. Yet, languages act like filters, exaggerating or downplaying different sides of my character. I become more direct or carefree depending on the language I am speaking.” “For me, learning language is not about memorizing a dictionary, it’s a way of building self-confidence, self-awareness, and community” (Hobson, 2021)

Home Language Importance

- Language is the foundation for all learning, including interpersonal communication, reading, writing, and the core content we expect children to know. (Pandey, 2014)
- The MT is the primary means through which a child makes sense of her world and connects with others—learning new words and vital content. (Pandey, 2014)
- Without continued use of the MT, a child feels lost, uprooted Low self-esteem and identity crises are rampant, and often lead to a high drop-out rate—all of which bode badly for a nation with an aging population that is dependent on this generation. So we must make every effort to stop failing our children—and use of the MT and a mathematical language-building-blocks approach could be just the solution (Pandey, 2014)
- Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, positive self-concept, a negative self-concept is detrimental to learning, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child (Caraballo & Martinez, 2019)
- Maintaining home language strengthens students’ sense of self and to increase educational motivation among adolescents (Lee et al., 2021; Zarate, Bhimji, & Reese, 2005)
- In addition to language background, students’ culture must be considered in designing a successful dual language program. In order to support student success, Cummins’ (1979, p. 240) states the school program must be geared to the needs of individual children if they are to attain an additive form of bilingualism involving fluent literacy skills in L1 and L2. If the process of instruction is to be meaningful it must reflect the child’s cultural experiences and build upon his competencies (Tran et al., 2015)

Motivation

Students with a positive future image of their language learning and an intrinsic interest in English culture tended to have better self-regulatory capacity in online learning environments. Learners with positive online learning experiences tended to be more flexible and independent in their self-regulatory learning process. (Magid & Chan, 2012)

Cultural Awareness

- Latinx students’ unique sensitivities developed from their borderland perspectives and experiences; Bilingual students supported their peers, showcasing an awareness of bilingual/linguistic challenges and empathy for others—capabilities not often reciprocated or recognized by their teachers. (Dorner & Cervantes-Soon, 2020)
- Benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)
- The program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. (A. Kibler et al., 2014)
- It is important for teachers to make cultural connections with their students. Teachers perceive cultural awareness knowledge is important to effective teaching as well as interpersonal knowledge as defined by Collinson (“Becoming”). In order to be an effective and successful teacher, that teacher must know her/his students intimately. The teacher must be able to talk about each individual student's strengths and weaknesses and be able and willing to do whatever it takes to ensure that student's academic success (Ellison, 2006)
Bilingual learning affects attitudes and beliefs about language learning and other cultures. Language learners develop a more positive attitude toward the target language and/or the speakers of that language. Lipton’s surveys (2004) comprise a series of studies that demonstrate, among other factors, that children who have studied a world language develop a sense of cultural pluralism (openness to and appreciation of other cultures) and have an improved self-concept and sense of achievement in school. The ability to easily switch between languages makes children feel competent, and it increases self-esteem (Rubio, 2007).

Bilingual learning leads to increasing understanding of oneself and one’s culture, viewing one’s value system through the eyes of others. Monolingual views of the world limit the perspective. There are aspects of one’s life and culture that are accepted as universal truths until another way of thinking has been encountered. (Tochon, 2009)

The subjects showed a positive attitude toward having cultural awareness in their English learning process. The outcomes of the study provide some implications for teachers to increase the students’ cultural awareness and to enhance their positive attitudes about the integration of culturally based resources into language education. (Kamaeva et al., 2022)

Dual-language programs for elementary age students and newcomer centers for recent immigrant arrivals at the secondary level are effective in fostering student academic success, linguistic growth, and multicultural understanding. (Lucido, 2019)

Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000). Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children. (Amorsen, 2015)

### Self Confidence

**Attitudes**
- Positive attitudes included feeling that the English-only policy helped students to improve their English proficiency, prepare them for the high demands of using English proficiency in real-world interaction, and demonstrate respect for other students and teachers who cannot understand their first. Several aspects of the policy were perceived negatively, including the ways teachers dealt with students speaking their L1 outside the classroom, methods of punishment that could impact students’ grades, the unconditional character of the policy that denied learners their agency, and the lack of systematic implementation. (Shvidko, 2017)

**Self Confidence**
- Students avoid the use of the foreign languages they study; have motivation problems; have a fear of being criticized by teachers; have a fear of being teased by classmates; tease their friends; and don't believe in themselves enough. It is therefore necessary to take measures to increase the self-confidence of students; and a more English-speaking environment should be established. (Gumilev, 2020)
- The L2 Spanish learners reported that the experience supported their language acquisition by (1) providing oral language practice outside of class, (2) facilitating linguistic self-confidence, (3) fostering metacognitive reflection, and (4) transforming motivation and attitudes. (Baker, 2018)
- Intrinsic motivation was the strongest determinant of learners’ self-confidence and motivation to learn a second language. It is also found that intrinsic motivation was only indirectly related to second language achievement through the mediating effects of motivation and self-confidence. (Pae, 2008)
- The results confirm the importance of ethnic identity on minority youth’s global self-esteem. Self-confidence with bilingual proficiency has a great effect on Chinese Youth’s global, academic, and social self-esteem. (Wen-shya, 2005)
- The findings show how analyses based on speakers’ self-confidence in bilingual abilities provide a community-friendly tool for describing patterns of language use and explaining the effects of social variables on language proficiency. (Starks, 2005)

### Agency
- There are limits to children’s agency that are not recognized in recent work and in SLS; (b) that identity has an important role to play: children can successfully mask what they cannot do as readers in order to present a particular identity in the mainstream classroom; and (c) that the access some children have to mediators may be limited and can change over time. (Walters, 2011)
- The L2 Spanish learners reported that the experience supported their language acquisition by (1) providing oral language practice outside of class, (2) facilitating linguistic self-confidence, (3) fostering metacognitive reflection, and (4) transforming motivation and attitudes. (Baker, 2018)

### Critical Consciousness

Critical Consciousness
• Researchers call for programs to adopt vernacular forms of Spanish, including translanguaging practices, in bilingual and biliteracy instruction in order to meet the needs of Spanish-speaking students and combat deficit language ideologies and practices. From a critical pedagogical perspective, deliberate inclusion of vernacular Spanish (and translanguaging) in bilingualism and biliteracy is an ideal means to develop critical consciousness for students in DLBE, which can serve to combat deficit language ideologies, and aligns to the proposal of critical consciousness as the fourth goal of DLBE. (Freire & Feinauer, 2022)

• Researchers argue that centering critical consciousness—or fostering among teachers, parents, and children an awareness of the structural oppression that surrounds us and a readiness to take action to correct it—can support increased equity and social justice in TWDL education er et al., 2019)
**Social Development**

**Social Network**

- Bilingual students **have larger social networks** that can help them navigate both school and community contexts (Zhou & Bankston, 1998)
- Benefits of knowing two languages: sociocultural (e.g., ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world) (Tytus, 2018)
- Despite participants’ demographic differences, English Learner and Spanish Language Learner students in the dual-language program reported building new, strengthened, and mutually recognized relationships, particularly with students of different language backgrounds who worked together within long-term collaborative small groups. When students are provided with a carefully designed instructional and ecological context that provides authentic purposes for using language and building peer relationships, this research suggests that both English Learners and SLLs may be able to build linguistically integrated social networks. (A. K. Kibler et al., 2015)
- Students are often in a classroom with children of differing backgrounds. Dual language education can allow teachers to “position” students and families from diverse linguistic backgrounds as language and culture brokers for English-speaking peers and families (DeMatthews, Izquierdo, and Knight 2017; Lee, Hill-Bonnet, and Raley 2011; Palmer 2008).
- Being dual language helps to promote healthy multigenerational, multicultural, and multilingual communities, because it allows schools to connect with a historically marginalized community whose first language is not English as well as the grassroots organizations that are engaged in advocacy and community development work (Fránquiz, Salazar, and DeNicolo 2011; Wiemelt and Welton 2015).
- Dual-language education has the added advantage that the model makes racial and ethnic diversity a classroom asset, which in turn promotes even greater benefits on student learning and socialization. Dual language offers an avenue for districts interested in navigating these obstacles and can be an excellent way to concurrently foster diversity in the classroom and improve a variety of social and academic outcomes for the entire student body. (Kotok & DeMatthews, 2018)
- Results from the analyses provide support for the importance of social network in understanding language choice and cultural and linguistic maintenance. (Lanza & Svendsen, 2007)
- Advantages of being bilingual: Making lifelong friends. Bilingualism increases the number of people with whom one can interact. Interest in other cultures helps one connect deeply with other people around the world. (Tochon, 2009)

**Student Perceptions**

- Overall, DL students had developed language proficiency skills in both languages, rated themselves as somewhat or very bilingual, enjoyed participating in the program, have positive attitudes toward the languages and speakers of the target language, and perceive some cognitive and other benefits from being bilingual. (Lindholm-Leary, 2016)

**Home Language Importance**

- This finding suggests that L1 (Chinese) maintenance can be best supported by the adoption of what has been called a “democratic” pattern of family interaction with regularly and extended L1 intergenerational interaction (Raschka et al., 2002)

**Social Status**

- A survey of Mexican Americans in El Paso, Texas reveals that participation in Spanish-speaking networks lowers the expected level of socioeconomic status, while higher status decreases the expected level of participation in Spanish-speaking networks.
- Despite their lower levels of human capital and lower previous academic performance, recent immigrants who arrive in the United States as adolescents are more likely than those who arrive earlier or those born in the United States to persevere in high school. While recent immigrants are more likely to persevere in
high school, once they leave they are no more likely to pursue additional education than their U.S. born counterparts. (White & Glick, 2000)

**Peer Dynamics**

- Teacher reported practices and observed interaction quality account for a small proportion of the variance in students’ bridging and bonding relationships at the classroom level overall, but with differential effects for EL and non-English Learners. For example, in classrooms with greater reported use of bonding practices, English Learners reported more bonding and fewer bridging friendships in the fall, and showed relatively less fall-to-spring growth in bridging friendships. (Johnson et al., 2020)

**Sociolinguistic Awareness**

- Because bilingual learners often interact with different language providers, they appear to develop sociolinguistic awareness more readily. They may better understand the arbitrary nature of language (Cook 1997) and that users employ language to communicate their mental states in various ways and for different purposes. (Mohr et al., 2018)
- Other advantages of learning another language can include the following: passing on part of one’s heritage to children, bridging generations and improving communication within the family and with the extended family, building international links, experiencing two cultures, being able to compare values and worldviews, and becoming biliterate (Marcos, 1998).

### Relationships with Family and Friends

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Benefits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bilingualism generates social benefits like reduced discrimination, improved self-esteem, and stronger cross-group relationships (Cho, 2000; Wright &amp; Tropp, 2005)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Relationships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Results highlight the different beneficial roles of Cantonese and English proficiency on positive self, peer acceptance, and prosocial behavior (He et al., 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DLLs play and talk with peers less frequently, interact in less sustained and positive ways, and are more reliant on teachers to support their play than their English-speaking peers. Implications for scaffolding DLLs’ play in classrooms and for future research are presented (Dominguez &amp; Trawick-Smith, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual undergraduates may have closer friendships with other bilinguals than with monolinguals (Sebanc et al., 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants rated their friendships with bilinguals to be more secure, closer, and to provide more help and companionship than their friendships with monolinguals. Bilingual friendships also helped bilingual undergraduates navigate a challenging sociopolitical context and have pride in their ethnolinguistic identity (Sebanc et al., 2009)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bilingualism and Autism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age negatively predicted social life quality scores while the number of languages known positively predicted social life quality scores. It provides valuable insight into how autistic people can learn and use a new language, and how their bilingualism experiences shape their social life. (Digard et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Globally, there are more bilingual speakers than monolingual speakers; however, scant research evidence exists regarding social communication development and outcomes for bilingual children with autism spectrum disorder (ASD). Findings support the notion that there is no basis on which to discourage home language use with bilingual children with ASD. (Siyambalapitiya et al., 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant language growth was exhibited by children from both language groups and there was no moderating effect of home language environment. The bilingual home group demonstrated increased gesture use over the course of intervention as compared with the monolingual home group. Preliminary data revealed no basis for concerns regarding negative impact of a bilingual home environment on language or social development in young children with autism spectrum disorder. (Zhou et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The results revealed statistically significant improvement in the developmental skills in both the study groups, but no significance was indicated between the groups. The study indicated that bilingual exposure in children with Autism Spectrum Disorders does not have any negative impact. (Sendhilnathan &amp; Chengappa, 2020)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family Relationships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preserving the home language reduces cultural dissonance between children and parents, reinforcing parental authority and thus reducing behavior problems (Portes &amp; Hao, 2002; Portes &amp; Rumbaut, 2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A crucial step in supporting students who may be put at risk involves an understanding of, and respect for, the literacy activities of the family and communities in which the child lives. Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children. Involve linguistically diverse families in the literacy classroom. (Amorsen, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Competence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Competence</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Effective peer interaction is fundamental to social development, cognitive development, and academic success. Findings indicate statistically significant differences in parent and teacher ratings on the empathy, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for bilingual children and on the empathy, self-control, internalizing, externalizing, and hyperactivity subscales for monolingual English-speaking children. (Baxter et al., 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Host culture has a stronger relationship with social competence than heritage culture, particularly for girls. (Ren &amp; Wyver, 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• All children evaluated moral violations more harshly than conventional violations. Notably, however, bilingual children were more permissive of violations across moral, social, and language domains than monolingual children. Bilinguals’ unique linguistic and social experiences influence their understanding of moral and conventional rules. (Iannuccilli et al., 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Findings revealed profile differences in social competence and a significant relationship between bilingualism and social–emotional development. Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism. (Oades-Sese et al., 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Positive emotion regulation, emotion dysregulation, English skills, and Mandarin skills were associated with different composites of the BASC-2; the relationships between English skills and Behavioral Symptoms were moderated by positive emotion regulation; and English skills and Adaptive Skills were moderated by emotion dysregulation. (Ren et al., 2016)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attitudes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Children and mothers in the English Learner group reported significantly higher ratings of shy behavior in English speaking versus native-language contexts, whereas unsociable ratings did not differ across language contexts. Shyness and unsociability are distinguishable behaviors in English Learner children, and researchers should consider these constructs when examining withdrawal. (Ash et al., 2014)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Flexibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Flexibility</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Only bilingual children adapted their level of ostension selectively between the two puppets. These findings point to the greater skills of bilinguals to adapt their communication accordingly. (Gampe et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Previous work shows that bilinguals have an advantage over monolinguals in cognitive flexibility, the ability to shift between different mental sets. This study reports the first evidence of a social flexibility advantage of bilinguals, and it suggests that as bilinguals alternate between two languages, they might also alternate between two cultural worlds, providing tools to adapt to different social environments and facilitating the frequency of social interactions. (Ikizer &amp; Ramirez-Esparza, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingual children are less influenced than monolinguals by language variety when attributing personality traits to different speakers, which could indicate that bilinguals have fewer in-group biases and perhaps greater social flexibility.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Both monolingual and bilingual children have strong preferences for in-group members who use a familiar language variety, and that bilingualism does not lead to generalized social flexibility. (Souza et al., 2013)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the economic development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Development</th>
<th>Cultural Awareness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Global Cultural Awareness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• With the growing emphasis on a competitive global economy, support is increasing for dual language programs (DLPs) geared toward preparing students in bilingual and multilingual education. (Gomez &amp; Cisneros, 2020)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture. Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A bilingual education program for minority people is essential for equal access to education. It solves conflicts between different ethnic groups and brings happiness to the society. (Ozfidan &amp; Toprak, 2020)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Language Economics |
|• Monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs. On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005). |
|• Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Making travel more feasible and enjoyable. Straying away from tourist centers and exploring the country requires knowing the language. |

| Labor Market |
|• Learning two language is beneficial economically (e.g. better job prospects and ability to grow professionally also in other countries) (Tytus, 2018) |
|• The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019) |
|• Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000). |
|• Multilingualism is often framed as human capital that increases individuals’ labor market value. Findings suggest that Spanish-English bilingualism is frequently preferred or required for employment in the US, but that such employment opportunities are less lucrative. |
Global Economy

Economic Success

- Children of Mexican immigrants face structural challenges that threaten to obstruct their economic success in young adulthood. They activated three resources in mobility promoting ways given the demographic, economic, and social characteristics of their community. The resources include parental support, advice and guidance from extrafamilial mentors, and bilingualism in English and Spanish. (Morando, 2013)

- Substantial differences exist across different ethnic groups among Asians. Bilingual advantages appear in most Asian groups when predicting both employment status and personal earnings, and the benefits tend to be more salient in the results of earnings analysis. Native-language literacy skill is a more momentous variable than the other variables in the model and that bilingual advantages stand out among Asian Indians and Chinese/Taiwanese more substantially compared to other Asian (Ee, 2019)

- The marginalized position of Latinxs in the social structure and the racialization of their linguistic practice result in a linguistic exploitation that remains unchallenged in the US. Researchers conclude that today’s celebrations of bilingualism, which follow a capitalist logic, perpetuate a hierarchy of languages and speakers that is detrimental to racialized minorities. (Alonso & Villa, 2020)

Maintaining Home Language

- Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English. (Gandara, 2015)

- Ruben Rumbaut found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased.

- Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred bilingual employees if their skills were comparable to those of monolingual employees. This confirmed that in California, bilingual employees are in high demand and have a hiring advantage over those who are monolingual (Porras et al., 2014)

- Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. "In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage." (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

- Although it is commonly thought that people who are bilingual have an advantage in the labor market, studies on this topic have not borne out this perception. The literature, in fact, has found an earnings penalty is associated with bilingualism—people who are bilingual often make less than who people who are monolingual in similar jobs. (Gándara, 2015)

- On the one hand, 93% of respondents “value[d] employees who... are able to work effectively with customers, clients, and businesses from a range of different countries and cultures.” On the other, 66% of respondents reported identifying foreign language skills in the hiring process; 41% reported giving advantage to multilingual applicants, and only 10% of respondents indicated that new hires “needed to speak at least one language besides English.” In addition, the survey revealed employer characteristics (Damari et al., 2017)

- DL programs are promoted as a model that brings cognitive and employment benefits to its students. Moreover, private corporate power has a strong existence and influence on the establishment, staffing, and promotion of DL programs. (Sun & Wang, 2023)

- Researchers found comparable English deficiency earnings penalties for Mexican immigrants, suggesting that this group responds to English-specific regional wage gaps. US born men, however, have larger earnings penalty along the border, possibly reflecting natives’ relative immobility owing to strong geographic preferences. Occupational sorting exercises give credence to this interpretation for native Mexican American females. (Davila & Mora, 2000).

- Since the 1990s, different modes of English language testing have emerged as popular means for evaluating job applicants for Korean corporations, constantly upgrading the criteria for ‘good English’. (Park, 2011)
• Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language. Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.

• Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013b).

• With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills. (Rolon, 2005)

• It has been elicited that all participants considered knowledge of two languages to be highly advantageous despite encountering occasional problems in the form of: tip of the tongue states, code switching or relying on literal translation. In general, all participants agreed that the positive aspects of being bilingual greatly outweigh the negatives. (Close, 2017)

• Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to obtain information from a large number of sources and the multilingual world we live in) (Tytus, 2018)

• Now, a growing number of states also see bilingualism as key to accessing the global economy, as evidenced by the surging popularity of the “seal of biliteracy”—a special recognition for graduates who demonstrate fluency in two or more languages (Corey, 2018)

• Lindholm-Leary (2001) argued that DLI programs have the potential to “eradicate the negative status of bilingualism in the U.S.” because they combine “maintenance bilingual education and immersion education models in an integrated classroom composed of both language majority and language minority students with the goal of full bilingualism and biliteracy”

• The benefits of bilingual education have long been characterized in terms of advantages for a global economy (Varghese & Park, 2010)

• Although aware of the pitfalls of this association, many (e.g., Krashen, as cited in Crawford, 2001; MacSwan, 1998; Tse, 2001) have attempted to emphasize the economic advantages of bilingual education by stressing the “great importance of bilingualism in our modern global community” (MacSwan, 1998, p. 9).

• “In an era of globalization, a society that has access to multilingual and multicultural resources is advantaged in its ability to play an important social and economic role on the world stage” (MacSwan, 1998, p. 7).

• Highlighting this perspective, bilingualism and bilingual education can be viewed as a way to serve students and nations in the inevitable move toward an interconnected multilingual world. (MacSwan, 1998).

• The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries. Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. “In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage.” (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

• To compete successfully in the global marketplace, both U.S.-based multinational corporations as well as small businesses increasingly need employees with knowledge of foreign languages and cultures to market products to customers around the globe and to work effectively with foreign employees and partners in other countries. Asia Society (2002) and National Geographic-Roper (2002) indicated that, compared with students in nine other industrialized countries, U.S. students lack knowledge of world geography, history, and current events. And shockingly few U.S. students learn languages that large numbers of people speak, such as Chinese (1.3 billion speakers) and Arabic (246 million speakers). The United States must create its own education response to globalization, which should include raising standards, increasing high school and college graduation rates, and modernizing and internationalizing the curriculum. (Stewart, 2006)

• “Being a global citizen” is having strong interests in global issues, cultivating the understanding and appreciation of diverse values, and enhancing country’s competitiveness. All this however needs to be realized through communication in English, the world language. (Chen, 2011)

• To thrive in a global economy and a multicultural society, US students need fluency in at least one language other than English Research shows that multilingual societies have a competitive advantage over societies in international trade (Hilliwell, 1999). Economic success and security in the US depend on our ability to understand the information we gather. Many Americans need to interact regularly with people who are unlikely to know English. Not only does the omission of language and cultural education leave
US students behind their peers in other countries, but also it exacerbates the achievement gap within the US. (Met, 2001)

- It might sound like a no-brainer that being bilingual or multilingual helps students planning engineering and just about any other career. But it is certainly true and is becoming more important the economies of nations become more intertwined. What's more being able to go beyond mere language ability and understand cultural distinctions are extra advantages. Students say that being bilingual gives them more options on campus and off (Galuszka, 2007)

- In the current stumbling economy, job seekers are leveraging every qualification they can think of to sway potential employers. And with immigrants continuing to flood into New York, long the city of immigrants, and its suburbs, speaking a second language is a talent that matters in almost any field. In the global economy, American companies increasingly are realizing the benefits of a multilingual work force (Skomial, 2002)

- Survey data indicate a correlation between self-reported language skills and self-reported earnings, which matches Bourdieu’s language and cultural capital theory (1991; Grin, 2006).

- At a time of semi globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs.

- On average, bilinguals earn more in the United States and, more recently, in the United Kingdom. This is the trend in Europe and Asia as well. Technology is putting more employees in touch with suppliers, customers, and colleagues abroad (Ghadar & Spindler, 2005).

- Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture. Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade. Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages. Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalán, 2000).

Home language Importance

- The families wanted their children to be bilingual because they believed in the cognitive and economic advantages of bilingualism and that bilingualism would help maintain the families’ roots. (Rodríguez, 2015)

- Although past research has found no real economic benefit for bilinguals in the U.S. labor market, the new research reviewed here comes to the opposite conclusion: "Full literacy in another language brings substantial economic benefit. Moreover, the failure to nurture these linguistic skills in the children of immigrants exacts a cost to the earnings of these potentially bilingual/biliterate students. (Gándara, 2018)
After highlighting similar key words and phrases within each main idea, I removed all findings that were not related. Some main idea headings were removed if there were not multiple similar findings within that category. I also removed the overarching question, how do dual language programs support English Learners in maintaining their first language? This will be further discussed in chapter 4.
How does participation in a dual language program impact the intellectual development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intellectual Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cognitive Skills</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Cognitive Benefits/Advantages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingualism results in <em>enhancement</em> of cognitive <em>flexibility</em>, higher cognitive reserve, delay in the onset of dementia (Fox et al, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Cognitive advantages in bilingual children: enhanced executive function, <em>increased</em> short term memory, enhanced problem solving skills (Morales, Calvo, &amp; Bialystok, 2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilinguals have higher cognitive abilities, mental elasticity, and <em>metalinguistic awareness</em> (August, Goldenberg, &amp; Rueda, 2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingual cognitive advantage: increased metalinguistic (Bialystok et al. 2010), executive functions, and cognitive reserve (Schweizer et al. 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Home language use in addition to English expands cognitive skills and higher order thinking/ executive functioning (Pandey, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit superior problem solving skills compared to peers (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingual kindergartens exhibit enhanced memory compared to peers (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingual specific advantage: metalinguistic awareness and cognitive control (Dillon, 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Early bilingualism can positively influence cognitive development, particularly attentional and executive functioning in children (see reviews in Bialystok, 2005, and in Costa, Hernández, Costa-Faidella &amp; Sebastián- Gallés, 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed. (Nielson, et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Turkish immigrants have better executive functioning and episodic memory compared to Turkish immigrant monolinguals. (Nielson, et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lifelong experience with multiple languages produces executive function advantages including enhanced top-down control, improved attention, and greater working memory capacity (Grundy &amp; Timmer, 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingualism affects linguistic and <em>cognitive performance across the lifespan</em> (Bialystok, 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection from Dementia/Alzheimer’s’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Knowing a second language is: Cognitive/enriching’, which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a <em>lower incidence of Alzheimer’s and dementia</em> (Schweizer et al. 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit superior problem solving skills compared to peers. These skills are associated with a <em>lower incidence of Alzheimer’s and dementia</em> (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Executive Function of the Brain

- Cognitive advantages for bilingual children: enhanced executive function of the brain resulting in better focus and attention (Bialystok, 2001)  
  - Bilinguals show better executive function and metalinguistic awareness (Adesope et al. 2010).

### Processing advantage

- Studies support a domain-general processing advantage in bilinguals (Barac et al. 2014) with greater accuracy, better reaction times on nonverbal tasks, more fluid switching, and stronger performances on working memory tasks (Ransdell et al. 2001), perhaps developing a specialized form of long-term *working memory* that can support reading and writing.
• The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels (Esposito, 2022).

• The extant research suggests bilingualism is associated with enhanced cognitive effects, most evident in attention and executive functioning (EF) After controlling for demographic variables, balance in bilingualism significantly accounted for 37% of the variance in ratings of children’s task initiation (Weber et al., 2014) (Weber, et al., 2014)

• These findings underscore bilingualism’s power to enrich executive functioning and self-regulatory behaviors, especially among underprivileged children (Hartanto et al., 2019)

• Bilingual children exhibited superior performance on two different measures of visual–spatial memory, as well as measures of inhibitory and attentional control. Bilinguals exhibit broad advantages in executive function during the preschool years, and these advantages are evident within a disadvantaged, low-SES population. (Grote, 2021)

• Bilingual advantages in executive control emerge at an age not previously shown. (Poulin-Dubois, 2010)

• Bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function better than both other groups. Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call for managing conflicting attentional demands (Conflict tasks); there was no advantage on impulse-control (Delay tasks). (Carlson, 2008)

EF in Bilingual Children with Disabilities
Our findings indicate that the bilingual advantage in executive functioning may extend to children with neurodevelopmental conditions. (Ratto et al., 2020)
### Educational Development

#### Academic Achievement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reading Achievement</th>
<th>Math Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students in DLE programs [perform at or above grade level on standardized reading](Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
<td>“The evidence that bilingual young people, relative to monolingual controls, show greater cognitive flexibility, creativity, divergent thought and improved problem-solving abilities, is very persuasive” (pp. 192-93). One effect of these cognitive advantages is increased academic achievement, including in mathematics and science (Clarkson, 2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students who remained in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake student in English-only programs at about the 5th grade; by high school, they were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured, including English language arts scores and reclassification to English-proficient status (Gandara, 2015)</td>
<td>DL students [outscored](Thomas &amp; Collier, 2012) their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas &amp; Collier, 2012).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In both subjects, DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. These results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification (Torph &amp; Murphy, 2021)</td>
<td>Students score statistically significantly higher in reading in 4th grade than their non-dual-language peers, a pattern that continues through 8th grade. By 5th grade, dual language students score about the same as their monolingual peers a grade ahead of them, an advantage that lasts through 8th grade. (Thomas &amp; Collier, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests, but the association between program type and mathematics outcomes was more complex. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)</td>
<td>For English-learners in dual language programs, reading scores in all the tested grades are much higher than for English Learners who are not in a dual-language program, according to the study. (Maxwell, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DL students [outscored](Thomas &amp; Collier, 2012) their non-DL counterparts on both reading and mathematics assessments at every grade level (Thomas &amp; Collier, 2012).</td>
<td>The results from this natural experiment indicate that students in a DLI program that has been implemented state-wide were able to succeed academically in math (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The dual-language students showed greater growth in math achievement across the 4th grade year compared to mainstreamed English students (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018)</td>
<td>The dual-language students showed greater growth in math achievement across the 4th grade year compared to mainstreamed English students (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Achievement Gap

- English Learners [close the achievement gap](Lindholm-Leary, 2012) with NES students in English-Only classrooms by about fifth grade (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)
- DLE middle and high school students are more likely to close the gap with NES peers by the end of high school (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)
- Ideally, English Learners would learn in communities where their culture and language are valued, such as dual language classrooms where content and language arts are taught both in English and Spanish. The
• Maintaining Home Language
  • Research shows that long-term DL programs can close achievement gaps between English-proficient speakers and emergent bilinguals after five years, while short-term bilingual or English-only transitional programs close only about half of that gap (Collier & Thomas, 2017).

Academic Achievement Success
• Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages (Gandara, 2015).
• Multiple studies indicate that children in bilingual education models (including dual-language and immersion models) have academic outcomes that match or even exceed those of their peers in mainstream education models, especially in later elementary grades (Esposito, 2020).
• Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following the 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics (Gomez et al., 2005).
• Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism (Oades–Sese et al., 2011).
• The results drawn from both quantitative and qualitative data indicate that bilingual students benefitted from attending a dual language program. It contributes positively to students’ academic achievement, bilingual school identification and commitment to language learning. (Bruitt–Griffler & Jang, 2022).
• DL programming improves academic outcomes for traditionally under-served groups while fostering diverse learning environments for all learners. Students in DL programs outperform students who participate in non-DL programs (Palencia et al., 2021).
• Findings suggest consistent support for the two-way immersion program over matched control students across all three achievement areas. It appears the greatest effect for native English speakers may be in reading, while native Spanish speakers may benefit more in writing and mathematics. (Cobb et al., 2006.)
• When properly implemented, DLPs are an effective way to improve academic achievement for all students (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).
• Data has demonstrated that DLPs have benefited both English Learners and native English-speaking students in obtaining higher levels of academic achievement in all areas, as compared to their counterparts in mainstream classrooms (Thomas & Collier, 2012).
• In states with high numbers of English Learners, such as Arizona, implementing a two-way 50/50 model can be beneficial for the academic achievement of all students involved in such programs. (Gomez & Cisneros, 2020)
• If the number of Latino students in your school is high, bilingual programs can increase their academic achievement while also developing their biliteracy and bilingual skills (Gomez, 2005).

English Learners with Disabilities
• English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth (Rodriguez, 2009).

Language Acquisition
• Two-way immersion models that support the home language and culture and integrate language majority and minority learners were associated with faster English acquisition, which mediated the link between Two-Way Immersion (TWI) programs and higher GPAs (Serafini et al., 2022).

Language Acquisition
• TK had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social–emotional skills or executive function. The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry, as compared to Spanish-speaking dual language learners who do not attend. (Holod et al., 2020)
• The results showed that for dual language learners (DLLs, n = 107) growth rates in their German majority language skills varied over classrooms. Compared to monolingual children, DLLs improved faster in classrooms with higher peer level skills in the majority language than DLLs in classrooms with lower peer-level skills (controlling for socioeconomic status and classroom quality). DLLs showed stronger growth dynamics than monolingual children during later preschool stages. The findings highlight the role of preschool peers in DLLs’ acquisition of the majority language before entering elementary school. (Schmerse, 2021)

Maintaining Home Language
• Only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the personal development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sense of Identity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Identity Formation**
- As cross-cultural competence begins with awareness of the self within the socially and culturally diverse classrooms that TWI provides, we assert that scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence. (Feinauer & Howard, 2014)
- Dual language learners are actively constructing ideas about reading, bilingualism/biliteracy, and whom they are as readers as they learn to read. Framing early reading in an identity perspective presents opportunities to look more holistically at the language and reading practices of dual language learners as they learn to read and navigate two or more languages at home and school. (Collett, 2019)
- Identity formation is one of the key components of adolescence and linguistic identity is critical to that process. For English learners to reach higher levels of achievement, they had to see themselves as high achievers in the first place—and in their first language. To achieve this, they focused on shifting to an asset based mindset, with the long term goal of turning the transitional bilingual education program into a dual language program. Students reported that being bilingual is a big part of their identity. (Barrera et al., 2020)
- According to a sociocultural perspective, when African-American students’ emergent bilingual/biliterate identities are affirmed across home and school contexts, by parents, peers, and teachers, like Ms. Padilla, who adopt a heteroglossic ideologies, those identities can flourish. Researchers extend this call by suggesting that DLE programs must carve out space and dedicate resources to address underlying biases and ideologies with their learners as a part of their bilingual/biliterate development. (Bauer et al., 2020)
- Strong family relationships, formal coursework in Spanish, as well as a strong ethnic identity as Mexicans are interrelated factors that contribute to their high multilingual investment. Dual language education is a powerful factor, but formal Spanish courses at the secondary and post-secondary level are also equally strong contributors when dual language education is not available. (Babino & Stewart, 2019)

**Home Language Importance**
- The MT is the primary means through which a child makes sense of her world and connects with others—learning new words and vital content. (Pandey, 2014)
- Without continued use of the MT, a child feels lost, uprooted. Low self-esteem and identity crises are rampant, and often lead to a high drop-out rate—all of which bode badly for a nation with an aging population that is dependent on this generation. So we must make every effort to stop failing our children—and use of the MT and a mathematical language-building-blocks approach could be just the solution. (Pandey, 2014)
- Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, positive self-concept, a negative self-concept is detrimental to learning, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child. (Caraballo & Martinez, 2019)
**Maintaining home language strengthens students’ sense of self and to increase educational motivation among adolescents** (Lee et al., 2021; Zarate, Bhimji, & Reese, 2005)

**Cultural Awareness**

- Benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)
- The program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. (Kibler et al., 2014)
- **Bilingual learning affects attitudes and beliefs about language learning and other cultures**. Language learners develop a more positive attitude toward the target language and/or the speakers of that language. Lipton’s surveys (2004) comprise a series of studies that demonstrate, among other factors, that children who have studied a world language develop a sense of cultural pluralism (openness to and appreciation of other cultures) and have an improved self-concept and sense of achievement in school. The ability to easily switch between languages makes children feel competent, and it increases self-esteem (Rubio, 2007).
- **Bilingual learning leads to increasing understanding of oneself and one’s culture, viewing one’s value system through the eyes of others**. Monolingual views of the world limit the perspective. There are aspects of one’s life and culture that are accepted as universal truths until another way of thinking has been encountered. (Tochon, 2009)
- The subjects showed a positive attitude toward having cultural awareness in their English learning process. The outcomes of the study provide some implications for teachers to increase the students’ cultural awareness and to enhance their positive attitudes about the integration of culturally based resources into language education. (Kamaeva et al., 2022)
- Dual-language programs for elementary age students and newcomer centers for recent immigrant arrivals at the secondary level are effective in fostering student academic success, linguistic growth, and multicultural understanding. (Lucido, 2019)
- Because culture and learning are so closely linked, any mismatch between home and school culture can mean that linguistically diverse students who are still mastering the language of schooling are put at risk of failing (Gay, 2000; Purcell-Gates, 2000). Respecting and valuing the home language of children and celebrating the diversity of language enriches the classroom experience for all children. (Amorsen, 2015)
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the social development of English Learners?

### Social Development

#### Social Networks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual students have larger social networks that can help them navigate both school and community contexts. (Zhou &amp; Bankston, 1998)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits of knowing two languages: sociocultural (e.g. ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world. (Tytus, 2018)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despite participants’ demographic differences, English Learner and Spanish Language Learner students in the dual-language program reported building new, strengthened, and mutually recognized relationships, particularly with students of different language backgrounds who worked together within long-term collaborative small groups. When students are provided with a carefully designed instructional and ecological context that provides authentic purposes for using language and building peer relationships, this research suggests that both English Learners and SLLs may be able to build linguistically integrated social networks. (Kibler et al., 2014)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being dual language helps to promote healthy multigenerational, multicultural, and multilingual communities, because it allows schools to connect with a historically marginalized community whose first language is not English as well as the grassroots organizations that are engaged in advocacy and community development work (Fránquiz, Salazar, and DeNicolo 2011; Wiemelt and Welton 2015).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual-language education has the added advantage that the model makes racial and ethnic diversity a classroom asset, which in turn promotes even greater benefits on student learning and socialization. Dual language offers an avenue for districts interested in navigating these obstacles and can be an excellent way to concurrently foster diversity in the classroom and improve a variety of social and academic outcomes for the entire student body. (Kotok &amp; DeMatthews, 2018)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results from the analyses provide support for the importance of social network in understanding language choice and cultural and linguistic maintenance. (Lanza &amp; Svendsen, 2007)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advantages of being bilingual: Making lifelong friends. Bilingualism increases the number of people with whom one can interact. Interest in other cultures helps one connect deeply with other people around the world. (Tochon, 2009)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Social Flexibility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Only bilingual children adapted their level of ostension selectively between the two puppets. These findings point to the greater skills of bilinguals to adapt their communication accordingly. (Gampe et al., 2019)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previous work shows that bilinguals have an advantage over monolinguals in cognitive flexibility, the ability to shift between different mental sets. This study reports the first evidence of a social flexibility advantage of bilinguals, and it suggests that as bilinguals alternate between two languages, they might also alternate between two cultural worlds, providing tools to adapt to different social environments and facilitating the frequency of social interactions. (Ikizer &amp; Ramírez-Esparza, 2018)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual children are less influenced than monolinguals by language variety when attributing personality traits to different speakers, which could indicate that bilinguals have fewer in-group biases and perhaps greater social flexibility.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the economic development of English Learners?

**Economic Development**

**Labor Market**

- Learning two languages is beneficial economically (e.g., better job prospects and ability to grow professionally in other countries) (Tytus, 2018).
- The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)
- Trimmell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).
- Multilingualism is often framed as human capital that increases individuals' labor market value. Findings suggest that Spanish-English bilingualism is frequently preferred or required for employment in the US, but that such employment opportunities are less lucrative. (Gandara, 2015)
- Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English. (Gandara, 2015)
- Ruben Rumbaut found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased.
- Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred bilingual employees if their skills were comparable to those of monolingual employees. This confirmed that in California, bilingual employees are in high demand and have a hiring advantage over those who are monolingual (Porras et al., 2014).
- Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. "In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage." (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)
- On the one hand, 93% of respondents “value[d] employees who. . .are able to work effectively with customers, clients, and businesses from a range of different countries and cultures.” On the other, 66% of respondents reported identifying foreign language skills in the hiring process; 41% reported giving advantage to multilingual applicants, and only 10% of respondents indicated that new hires “needed to speak at least one language besides English.” In addition, the survey revealed employer characteristics (Damari et al., 2017)
- DL programs are promoted as a model that brings cognitive and employment benefits to its students. Moreover, private corporate power has a strong existence and influence on the establishment, staffing, and promotion of DL programs. (Sun & Wang, 2023)
Global Economy

- Trimmell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language. Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.
- Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings (Pandey, 2013).
- With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills. (Rolon, 2005)
- Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g., possibility to obtain information from a large number of sources and the multilingual world we live in) (Tytus, 2018)
- Now, a growing number of states also see bilingualism as key to accessing the global economy, as evidenced by the surging popularity of the “seal of biliteracy”—a special recognition for graduates who demonstrate fluency in two or more languages (Corey, 2018)
- The benefits of bilingual education have long been characterized in terms of advantages for a global economy (Varghese & Park, 2010)
- Although aware of the pitfalls of this association, many (e.g., Krashen, as cited in Crawford, 2001; MacSwan, 1998; Tse, 2001) have attempted to emphasize the economic advantages of bilingual education by stressing the “great importance of bilingualism in our modern global community” (MacSwan, 1998, p. 9).
- “In an era of globalization, a society that has access to multilingual and multicultural resources is advantaged in its ability to play an important social and economic role on the world stage” (MacSwan, 1998, p. 7).
- Highlighting this perspective, bilingualism and bilingual education can be viewed as a way to serve students and nations in the inevitable move toward an interconnected multilingual world. (MacSwan, 1998).
- The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries. Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. "In the U.S., we cannot ignore the seismic changes altering our communities. Nor does it make sense to squander the rich linguistic resources that this nation already has. While other nations cultivate the technical and language skills of their workforces to expand on opportunities both in their home markets and here in the U.S., we cannot allow a lack of language proficiency to leave American workers at a competitive disadvantage." (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)
- To compete successfully in the global marketplace, both U.S.-based multinational corporations as well as small businesses increasingly need employees with knowledge of foreign languages and cultures to market products to customers around the globe and to work effectively with foreign employees and partners in other countries. Asia Society (2002) and National Geographic–Roper (2002) indicated that, compared with students in nine other industrialized countries, U.S. students lack knowledge of world geography, history, and current events. And shockingly few U.S. students learn languages that large numbers of people speak, such as Chinese (1.3 billion speakers) and Arabic (246 million speakers). The United States must create its own education response to globalization, which should include raising standards, increasing high school and college graduation rates, and modernizing and internationalizing the curriculum. (Stewart, 2006)
- To thrive in a global economy and a multicultural society, US students need fluency in at least one language other than English Research shows that multilingual societies have a competitive advantage over communities in international trade (Hilliwell, 1999). Economic success and security in the US depend on our ability to understand the information we gather. Many Americans need to interact regularly with people who are unlikely to know English. Not only does the omission of language and cultural education leave US students behind their peers in other countries, but also it exacerbates the achievement gap within the US. (Met, 2001)
- In the current stumbling economy, job seekers are leveraging every qualification they can think of to sway potential employers. And with immigrants continuing to flood into New York, long the city of immigrants, and its suburbs, speaking a second language is a talent that matters almost anywhere in the global economy, American companies increasingly are realizing the benefits of a multilingual work force (Skomjal, 2002)
- At a time of semi globalization (Ghemawat, 2007), monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs.
• Trimmell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Increasing global understanding. Language learners step inside the mind and context of another culture. Intercultural sensitivity builds up trust and understanding, can bridge the gap between peoples, and promote peace and international trade. Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages. Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors (Camenson, 2001; DeGalan, 2000).

Home language Importance
• Although past research has found no real economic benefit for bilinguals in the U.S. labor market, the new research reviewed here comes to the opposite conclusion: 'Full literacy in another language brings substantial economic benefit. Moreover, the failure to nurture these linguistic skills in the children of immigrants exacts a cost to the earnings of these potentially bilingual/biliterate students. (Gándara, 2018)
The next step in the process was to connect all similar findings. I scanned my previous tables for like colors, which signified similar findings and grouped them together. I added main ideas when there were multiple findings related to the same main idea. I placed the main idea as the heading, the finding in the left column, and the references for each finding in the right column. This was the last step in the data analysis process.
How does participation in a dual language program impact the intellectual development of English Learners?

### Intellectual Development

#### Cognitive Abilities

- Bilingualism results in enhancement of cognitive flexibility, higher cognitive reserve (Fox et al., 2019)
- Bilinguals have higher cognitive abilities, mental elasticity (August et al., 2010)
- Bilingual cognitive advantage: increased cognitive reserve (Schweizer et al., 2012)
- Home language use in addition to English expands cognitive skills and higher order thinking (Pandey, 2014)
- Bilingual specific advantage: cognitive control (Dillon, 2009)
- Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed. (Nielsion, et al., 2019)
- Bilingualism affects linguistic and cognitive performance across the lifespan (Bialystok, 2009)
- Knowing a second language is: Cognitive/enriching', which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease, an ability to express oneself in more ways along with an ability to notice/think differently and to widen horizons (Schweizer et al., 2012)
- The evidence that bilingual young people, relative to monolingual controls, show greater cognitive flexibility, creativity, divergent thought and improved problem-solving abilities, is very persuasive (Clarkson, 2007)

### Executive Function

- Cognitive advantages in bilingual children: enhanced executive function (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013)
- Bilingual cognitive advantage: increased executive functions (Schweizer et al. 2012)
- Home language use in addition to English expands executive functioning (Pandey, 2014)
- Early bilingualism can positively influence cognitive development, particularly attentional and executive functioning in children (Bialystok, 2005)
• Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed.  
  
  (Nielson, et al., 2019)

• Lifelong experience with multiple languages produces executive function advantages including enhanced top-down control, improved attention, and greater working memory capacity.

  (Grundy & Timmer, 2016)

• Cognitive advantages for bilingual children: enhanced executive function of the brain resulting in better focus and attention.

  (Bialystok, 2001)

• Bilinguals show better executive function.

  (Adesope et al. 2010).

• The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels.

  (Esposito, 2022).

• The extant research suggests bilingualism is associated with enhanced cognitive effects, most evident in attention and executive functioning (EF). After controlling for demographic variables, balance in bilingualism significantly accounted for 37% of the variance in ratings of children’s task initiation (Weber et al., 2014).

• These findings underscore bilingualism’s power to enrich executive functioning and self-regulatory behaviors, especially among underprivileged children.

  (Hartanto et al., 2019)

• Bilinguals exhibit broad advantages in executive function during the preschool years, and these advantages are evident within a disadvantaged, low-SES population.

  (Grote, 2021)

• Bilingual advantages in executive control emerge at an age not previously shown.

  (Poulin-Dubois, 2010)

• Bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function better than both other groups. Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call for managing conflicting attentional demands (Conflict tasks); there was no advantage on impulse-control (Delay tasks).

  (Carlson, 2008)

• Findings indicate that the bilingual advantage in executive functioning may extend to children with neurodevelopmental conditions.

  (Ratto et al., 2020)

---

**Metalinguistic Awareness**

• Bilinguals have higher metalinguistic awareness.

  (August, Goldenberg, & Rueda, 2010)

• Bilingual cognitive advantage: increased metalinguistic awareness.

  (Bialystok et al. 2010).

• Bilingual specific advantage: metalinguistic awareness.

  (Dillon, 2009)

• Bilinguals show better metalinguistic awareness.

  (Adesope et al. 2010).

---

**Memory**

• Cognitive advantages in bilingual children: increased short term memory.

  (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>• Bilingual kindergartens exhibit enhanced memory compared to peers</th>
<th>(Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed.</td>
<td>. (Nielsen, et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Studies support a domain-general processing advantage in bilinguals with greater accuracy, better reaction times on nonverbal tasks, more fluid switching, and stronger performances on working memory tasks, perhaps developing a specialized form of long-term working memory that can support reading and writing.</td>
<td>(Barac et al. 2014), (Ransdell et al. 2001),</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingual children exhibited superior performance on two different measures of visual–spatial memory, as well as measures of inhibitory and attentional control</td>
<td>(Grote, 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Problem Solving Skills</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Cognitive advantages in bilingual children enhanced problem solving skills</td>
<td>(Morales, Calvo, &amp; Bialystok, 2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit superior problem solving skills compared to peers</td>
<td>(Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The evidence that bilingual young people, relative to monolingual controls, show greater cognitive flexibility, creativity, divergent thought and improved problem-solving abilities, is very persuasive</td>
<td>(Clarkson, 2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Protection from Dementia/Alzheimer’s Disease</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingualism results in delay in the onset of dementia</td>
<td>(Fox et al, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Knowing a second language is: Cognitive/enriching', which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease, an ability to express oneself in more ways along with an ability to notice/think differently and to widen horizons</td>
<td>(Schweizer et al. 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit superior problem solving skills compared to peers. These skills are associated with a lower incidence of Alzheimer’s and dementia</td>
<td>(Carlson and Metzoff, 2008)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How does participation in a dual language program impact the educational development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Development</th>
<th>Academic Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students who remained in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake student in English-only programs at about the 5th grade; by high school, the were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured, including English language arts scores and reclassification to English-proficient status</td>
<td>(Gandara, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One effect of these cognitive advantages is increased academic achievement, including in mathematics and science</td>
<td>(Clarkson, 2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The benefits of dual language classroom models include accelerated academic progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap</td>
<td>(Oberg &amp; Phillips, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages</td>
<td>(Gandara, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple studies indicate that children in bilingual education models (including dual-language and immersion models) have academic outcomes that match or even exceed those of their peers in mainstream education models, especially in later elementary grades</td>
<td>(Esposito, 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics</td>
<td>(Gomez et al., 2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism</td>
<td>(Oades-Sese et al., 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The results drawn from both quantitative and qualitative data indicate that bilingual students benefitted from attending a dual language program. It contributes positively to students’</td>
<td>(Bruitt-Griffler &amp; Jang, 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic Achievement, Bilingual School Identification and Commitment to Language Learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DL programming improves academic outcomes for traditionally under-served groups while fostering diverse learning environments for all learners. Students in DL programs outperform students who participate in non-DL programs. (Palencia et al., 2021)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Findings suggest consistent support for the two-way immersion program over matched control students across all three achievement areas. It appears the greatest effect for native English speakers may be in reading, while native Spanish speakers may benefit more in writing and mathematics. (Cobb et al., 2006.)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When properly implemented, DLPs are an effective way to improve academic achievement for all students. (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data has demonstrated that DLPs have benefited both English Learners and native English-speaking students in obtaining higher levels of academic achievement in all areas, as compared to their counterparts in mainstream classrooms. (Thomas &amp; Collier, 2012).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In states with high numbers of English Learners, such as Arizona, implementing a two-way 50/50 model can be beneficial for the academic achievement of all students involved in such programs. (Gomez &amp; Cisneros, 2020)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If the number of Latino students in your school is high, dual language programs can increase their academic achievement while also developing their biliteracy and bilingual skills. (Gomez, 2005)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth. (Rodriguez, 2009)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two-way immersion models that support the home language and culture and integrate language majority and minority learners were associated with faster English acquisition, which mediated the link between Two-Way Immersion (TWI) programs and higher GPAs. (Serafini et al., 2022)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Reading Achievement**

| Students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized reading tests. (Lindholm-Leary, 2012) |
| In both subjects, DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. These results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. (Torph & Murphy, 2021) |
| Students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests | (Morita-Mullaney, 2021) |
| DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on reading assessments at every grade level | (Thomas & Collier, 2012) |
| Students score statistically significantly higher in reading in 4th grade than their non dual-language peers, a pattern that continues through 8th grade. By 5th grade, dual language students score about the same as their monolingual peers a grade ahead of them, an advantage that lasts through 8th grade. | (Thomas & Collier, 2012) |
| For English-learners in dual language programs, reading scores in all the tested grades are much higher than for English Learners who are not in a dual-language program, according to the study. | (Maxwell, 2015) |
| Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics | (Gomez et al., 2005) |

**Math Achievement**

| Students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized mathematics tests | (Lindholm-Leary, 2012) |
| In both subjects, DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. These results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. | (Torph & Murphy, 2021) |
| DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on mathematics assessments at every grade level | (Thomas & Collier, 2012) |
| One effect of these cognitive advantages is increased academic achievement, including in mathematics and science | (Clarkson, 2007) |
| The results from this natural experiment indicate that students in a DLI program that has been implemented state-wide were able to succeed academically in math | (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018) |
| The dual-language students showed greater growth in math achievement across the 4th grade year compared to mainstreamed English students | (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018) |
- Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics (Gomez et al., 2005)

### Achievement Gap

- English Learners close the achievement gap with NES students in English-Only classrooms by about fifth grade (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)

- DLE middle and high school students are more likely to close the gap with NES peers by the end of high school (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)

- The benefits of dual language classroom models include accelerated academic progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap (Oberg & Phillips, 2014)

- Research shows that long-term DL programs can close achievement gaps between English-proficient speakers and emergent bilinguals after five years, while short-term bilingual or English-only transitional programs close only about half of that gap (Collier & Thomas, 2017).

### Language Proficiency

- TK had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social–emotional skills or executive function. The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry, as compared to Spanish-speaking dual language learners who do not attend. (Holod et al., 2020)

- DLLs showed stronger growth dynamics than monolingual children during later preschool stages. The findings highlight the role of preschool peers in DLLs’ acquisition of the majority language before entering elementary school. (Schmerse, 2021)

- Only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education. (Collins, 2014)
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the personal development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Dual language learners are actively constructing ideas about reading, bilingualism/biliteracy, and whom they are as readers as they learn to read. Framing early reading in an identity perspective presents opportunities to look more holistically at the language and reading practices of dual language learners as they learn to read and navigate two or more languages at home and school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Identity formation is one of the key components of adolescence and linguistic identity is critical to that process. For English learners to reach higher levels of achievement, they had to see themselves as high achievers in the first place—and in their first language. To achieve this, they focused on shifting to an asset based mindset, with the long term goal of turning the transitional bilingual education program into a dual language program. Students reported that being bilingual is a big part of their identity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• According to a sociocultural perspective, when African-American students’ emergent bilingual/biliterate identities are affirmed across home and school contexts, by parents, peers, and teachers, like Ms. Padilla, who adopt a heteroglossic ideologies, those identities can flourish. Researchers extend this call by suggesting that DLE programs must carve out space and dedicate resources to address underlying biases and ideologies with their learners as a part of their bilingual/biliterate development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Strong family relationships, formal coursework in Spanish, as well as a strong ethnic identity as Mexicans are interrelated factors that contribute to their high</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
multilingual investment. Dual language education is a powerful factor.

- The MT is the primary means through which a child makes sense of her world and connects with others—learning new words and vital content. (Pandey, 2014)

- Bilingual learning leads to increasing understanding of oneself and one’s culture, viewing one’s value system through the eyes of others. Monolingual views of the world limit the perspective. There are aspects of one’s life and culture that are accepted as universal truths until another way of thinking has been encountered. (Tochon, 2009)

### Self Esteem

- Without continued use of the MT, a child feels lost, uprooted Low self-esteem and identity crises are rampant, and often lead to a high drop-out rate—all of which bode badly for a nation with an aging population that is dependent on this generation. So we must make every effort to stop failing our children—and use of the MT and a mathematical language-building-blocks approach could be just the solution. (Pandey, 2014)

- Rationale for bilingual education: continued learning in first language while learning second language, need to diminish alienation that children face when they are pushed into an unfamiliar language situation, positive self-concept, a negative self-concept is detrimental to learning, use of language is imperative to the intellectual development of the child. (Caraballo & Martinez, 2019)

- Maintaining home language strengthens students’ sense of self and to increase educational motivation among adolescents (Lee et al., 2021; Zarate, Bhimji, & Reese, 2005)

### Cultural Awareness

- Cross-cultural competence begins with awareness of the self within the socially and culturally diverse classrooms that TWI provides, we assert that scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence. (Feinauer & Howard, 2014)

- Language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)

- The program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of (Kibler et al., 2014)
students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources.

- Bilingual learning affects attitudes and beliefs about language learning and other cultures. Language learners develop a more positive attitude toward the target language and/or the speakers of that language. Lipton’s surveys (2004) comprise a series of studies that demonstrate, among other factors, that children who have studied a world language develop a sense of cultural pluralism (openness to and appreciation of other cultures) and have an improved self-concept and sense of achievement in school. The ability to easily switch between languages makes children feel competent, and it increases self-esteem (Rubio, 2007).

- Dual-language programs for elementary age students and newcomer centers for recent immigrant arrivals at the secondary level are effective in fostering student academic success, linguistic growth, and multicultural understanding (Lucido, 2019).
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the social development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Development</th>
<th>Social Network</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingual students have larger social networks that can help them navigate both school and community contexts</td>
<td>(Zhou &amp; Bankston, 1998)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Benefits of knowing two languages: sociocultural (e.g. ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world)</td>
<td>(Tytus, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Despite participants’ demographic differences, English Learner and Spanish Language Learner students in the dual-language program reported building new, strengthened, and mutually recognized relationships, particularly with students of different language backgrounds who worked together within long-term collaborative small groups. When students are provided with a carefully designed instructional and ecological context that provides authentic purposes for using language and building peer relationships, this research suggests that both English Learners and SLLs may be able to build linguistically integrated social networks.</td>
<td>(Kibler et al., 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Being dual language helps to promote healthy multigenerational, multicultural, and multilingual communities, because it allows schools to connect with a historically marginalized community whose first language is not English as well as the grassroots organizations that are engaged in advocacy and community development work</td>
<td>(Wiemelt &amp; Welton, 2015).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Dual-language education has the added advantage that the model makes racial and ethnic diversity a classroom asset, which in turn promotes even greater benefits on student learning and socialization. Dual language offers an avenue for districts interested in navigating these obstacles and can be an excellent way to concurrently foster diversity in the classroom and improve a variety of social and academic outcomes for the entire student body.</td>
<td>(Kotok &amp; DeMatthews, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Results from the analyses provide support for the importance of social network in</td>
<td>(Lanza &amp; Svendsen, 2007)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
understanding language choice and cultural and linguistic maintenance.

- Advantages of being bilingual: Making lifelong friends. Bilingualism increases the number of people with whom one can interact. Interest in other cultures helps one connect deeply with other people around the world. (Tochon, 2009)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Flexibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Only bilingual children adapted their level of ostension selectively between the two puppets. These findings point to the greater skills of bilinguals to adapt their communication accordingly. (Gampe et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This study reports the first evidence of a social flexibility advantage of bilinguals, and it suggests that as bilinguals alternate between two languages, they might also alternate between two cultural worlds, providing tools to adapt to different social environments and facilitating the frequency of social interactions. (Ikizer &amp; Ramírez-Esparza, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingual children are less influenced than monolinguals by language variety when attributing personality traits to different speakers, which could indicate that bilinguals have fewer in-group biases and perhaps greater social flexibility. (Souza et al., 2013)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the economic development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Development</th>
<th>Labor Market</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Learning two language is beneficial economically (e.g. better job prospects and ability to grow professionally also in other countries)</td>
<td>(Tytus, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)</td>
<td>(Fox et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors</td>
<td>(Trimnell, 2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Multilingualism is often framed as human capital that increases individuals' labor market value. Findings suggest that Spanish-English bilingualism is frequently preferred or required for employment in the US, but that such employment opportunities are less lucrative.</td>
<td>(Gandara, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status</td>
<td>(Gandara, 2015)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English. Ruben Rumbaut found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased. (Gandara, 2015)

Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred bilingual employees if their skills were comparable to those of monolingual employees. This confirmed that in California, bilingual employees are in high demand and have a hiring advantage over those who are monolingual. (Porras et al., 2014)

Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

On the one hand, 93% of respondents “value[d] employees who are able to work effectively with customers, clients, and businesses from a range of different countries and cultures.” On the other, 66% of respondents reported identifying foreign language skills in the hiring process, 41% reported giving advantage to multilingual applicants, and only 10% of respondents indicated that new hires “needed to speak at least one language besides English.” (Damari et al., 2017)

DL programs are promoted as a model that brings cognitive and employment benefits to its students. (Sun & Wang, 2023)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Global Economy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trimnell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages. (Trimnell, 2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings. (Pandey, 2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students' future marketable skills. (Rolon, 2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
obtain information from a large number of sources and the multilingual world we live in

- Now, a growing number of states also see bilingualism as key to accessing the global economy, as evidenced by the surging popularity of the "seal of biliteracy" - a special recognition for graduates who demonstrate fluency in two or more languages. (Corey, 2018)

- The benefits of bilingual education have long been characterized in terms of advantages for a global economy (Varghese & Park, 2010)

- Although aware of the pitfalls of this association, many (e.g., Krashen, as cited in Crawford, 2001; MacSwan, 1998; Tse, 2001) have attempted to emphasize the economic advantages of bilingual education by stressing the "great importance of bilingualism in our modern global community" (MacSwan, 1998, p. 9).

- "In an era of globalization, a society that has access to multilingual and multicultural resources is advantaged in its ability to play an important social and economic role on the world stage" (MacSwan, 1998, p. 7).

- Highlighting this perspective, bilingualism and bilingual education can be viewed as a way to serve students and nations in the inevitable move toward an interconnected multilingual world (MacSwan, 1998).

- The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries. Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

- To compete successfully in the global marketplace, both U.S.-based multinational corporations as well as small businesses increasingly need employees with knowledge of foreign languages and cultures to market products to customers around the globe and to work effectively with foreign employees and partners in other countries. (Stewart, 2006)

- To thrive in a global economy and a multicultural society, US students need fluency in at least one language other than English. Research shows that multilingual societies have a competitive advantage over societies in international trade (Hillwell, 1999). Economic success and security in the US depend on our ability to understand the information we gather. Many Americans need to interact regularly with people who are unlikely to know English. Not only does the omission of language and cultural education leave US students behind their peers in other countries, but also it exacerbates the achievement gap within the US. (Met, 2001)
| In the current stumbling economy, job seekers are leveraging every qualification they can think of to sway potential employers. And with immigrants continuing to flood into New York, long the city of immigrants, and its suburbs, speaking a second language is a talent that matters in almost any field. In the global economy, American companies increasingly are realizing the benefits of a multilingual work force. | (Skomial, 2002) |
| At a time of semi globalization monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs. | (Ghemawat, 2007) |
Chapter 4: Findings and Recommendations

The table of similarities and overlaps within the data is complete and organized by main idea. The next step is to draw conclusions from the similarities and overlaps within the data.
How does participation in a dual language program impact the intellectual development of English Learners?

### Intellectual Development

**Cognitive Abilities**

1. **Bilingualism creates a cognitive advantage, specifically an enhancement of cognitive flexibility and an increased cognitive reserve.**

   - Bilingualism results in enhancement of cognitive flexibility, higher cognitive reserve.  
     - (Fox et al., 2019)
   
   - Bilinguals have higher cognitive abilities, mental elasticity.  
     - (August et al., 2010)
   
   - Bilingual cognitive advantage: increased cognitive reserve.  
     - (Schweizer et al., 2012)
   
   - Home language use in addition to English expands cognitive skills and higher order thinking.  
     - (Pandey, 2014)
   
   - Bilingual specific advantage: cognitive control.  
     - (Dillon, 2009)
   
   - Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed.  
     - (Nielson, et al., 2019)
   
   - Bilingualism affects linguistic and cognitive performance across the lifespan.  
     - (Bialystok, 2009)
   
   - Knowing a second language is: Cognitive/enriching’, which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer's disease, an ability to express oneself in more ways along with an ability to notice/think differently and to widen horizons.  
     - (Schweizer et al., 2012)
   
   - The evidence that bilingual young people, relative to monolingual controls, show greater cognitive flexibility, creativity, divergent thought and improved problem-solving abilities, is very persuasive.  
     - (Clarkson, 2007)

### Executive Function

2. **Bilingualism enhances the executive function of the brain.**

     - (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013)
   
   - Bilingual cognitive advantage: increased executive functions.  
     - (Schweizer et al. 2012)
   
   - Home language use in addition to English expands executive functioning.  
     - (Pandey, 2014)
- Early bilingualism can positively influence cognitive development, particularly attentional and executive functioning in children. (Bialystok, 2005)
- Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed. (Nielson, et al., 2019)
- Lifelong experience with multiple languages produces executive function advantages including enhanced top-down control, improved attention, and greater working memory capacity. (Grundy & Timmer, 2016)
- Cognitive advantages for bilingual children: enhanced executive function of the brain resulting in better focus and attention. (Bialystok, 2001)
- Bilinguals show better executive function. (Adesope et al. 2010).
- The executive functions advantage for TWDL students was present across all grade levels. (Esposito, 2022).
- The extant research suggests bilingualism is associated with enhanced cognitive effects, most evident in attention and executive functioning (EF) After controlling for demographic variables, balance in bilingualism significantly accounted for 37% of the variance in ratings of children’s task initiation. Weber et al., 2014)
- These findings underscore bilingualism’s power to enrich executive functioning and self-regulatory behaviors, especially among underprivileged children. (Hartanto et al., 2019)
- Bilinguals exhibit broad advantages in executive function during the preschool years, and these advantages are evident within a disadvantaged, low-SES population. (Grote, 2021)
- Bilingual advantages in executive control emerge at an age not previously shown. (Poulin-Dubois, 2010)
- Bilingual children performed significantly better on the executive function better than both other groups. Importantly, the relative advantage was significant for tasks that appear to call for managing conflicting attentional demands (Conflict tasks); there was no advantage on impulse-control (Delay tasks.) (Carlson, 2008)
- Findings indicate that the bilingual advantage in executive functioning may extend to children with neurodevelopmental conditions. (Ratto et al., 2020)

### Metalinguistic Awareness

3. **Bilingualism increases metalinguistic awareness.**
- Bilinguals have higher metalinguistic awareness. (August, Goldenberg, & Rueda, 2010)
- Bilingual cognitive advantage: increased metalinguistic awareness. (Bialystok et al. 2010),
- Bilingual specific advantage: metalinguistic awareness. (Dillon, 2009)
- Bilinguals show better metalinguistic awareness. (Adesope et al. 2010)

### Memory


| Cognitive advantages in bilingual children: increased short term memory. | (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013) |
| Bilingual kindergartens exhibit enhanced memory compared to peers. | (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008) |
| Associations between bilingualism and cognitive function were established for five cognitive domains: executive function, memory, language, visuospatial function, and speed. | (Nielson, et al., 2019) |
| Studies support a domain-general processing advantage in bilinguals with greater accuracy, better reaction times on nonverbal tasks, more fluid switching, and stronger performances on working memory tasks, perhaps developing a specialized form of long-term working memory that can support reading and writing. | (Barac et al. 2014) (Ransdell et al. 2001), |
| Bilingual children exhibited superior performance on two different measures of visual–spatial memory, as well as measures of inhibitory and attentional control. | (Grote, 2021) |

### Problem Solving Skills

5. Bilingualism enhances problem solving skills.

| Cognitive advantages in bilingual children enhanced problem solving skills. | (Morales, Calvo, & Bialystok, 2013) |
| Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit superior problem solving skills compared to peers. | (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008) |
| The evidence that bilingual young people, relative to monolingual controls, show greater cognitive flexibility, creativity, divergent thought and improved problem-solving abilities, is very persuasive. | (Clarkson, 2007) |

### Protection from Dementia/Alzheimer’s Disease


| Bilingualism results in delay in the onset of dementia. | (Fox et al, 2019) |
| Knowing a second language is: Cognitive/enriching”, which leads to a positive impact on cognitive abilities, a protection from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease, an ability to express oneself in more ways along with an ability to notice/think differently and to widen horizons. | (Schweizer et al. 2012) |
| Bilingual kindergarteners exhibit superior problem solving skills compared to peers. These skills are associated with a lower incidence of Alzheimer’s and dementia. | (Carlson and Metzoff, 2008) |
How does participation in a dual language program impact the educational development of English Learners?

### Educational Development

#### Academic Achievement

1. **Bilingualism improves academic achievement.**

   - Students who remained in bilingual and two-way dual language programs began to overtake student in English-only programs at about the 5th grade; by high school, they were outperforming the English-only students on all academic outcomes measured, including English language arts scores and reclassification to English-proficient status. (Gandara, 2015)

   - One effect of these cognitive advantages is increased academic achievement, including in mathematics and science. (Clarkson, 2007)

   - The benefits of dual language classroom models include accelerated academic progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap. (Oberg & Phillips, 2014)

   - Recent research has demonstrated that bilingual and two-way dual language instruction produce significant academic achievement advantages. (Gandara, 2015)

   - Multiple studies indicate that children in bilingual education models (including dual-language and immersion models) have academic outcomes that match or even exceed those of their peers in mainstream education models, especially in later elementary grades. (Esposito, 2020)

   - Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics. (Gomez et al., 2005)

   - Findings indicated a significant relationship of early social–emotional development to later academic success and English acquisition, highlighting the role of bilingualism. (Oades-Sese et al., 2011)

   - The results drawn from both quantitative and qualitative data indicate that bilingual students benefitted from attending a dual language program. It contributes positively to students’ academic achievement, bilingual school identification and commitment to language learning. (Bruitt-Griffler & Jang, 2022)

   - DL programming improves academic outcomes for traditionally under-served (Palencia et al., 2021)
groups while fostering diverse learning environments for all learners. Students in DL programs outperform students who participate in non-DL programs.

- Findings suggest consistent support for the two-way immersion program over matched control students across all three achievement areas. It appears the greatest effect for native English speakers may be in reading, while native Spanish speakers may benefit more in writing and mathematics. (Cobb et al., 2006.)

- When properly implemented, DLPs are an effective way to improve academic achievement for all students. (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).

- Data has demonstrated that DLPs have benefited both English Learners and native English-speaking students in obtaining higher levels of academic achievement in all areas, as compared to their counterparts in mainstream classrooms. (Thomas & Collier, 2012).

- In states with high numbers of English Learners, such as Arizona, implementing a two-way 50/50 model can be beneficial for the academic achievement of all students involved in such programs. (Gomez & Cisneros, 2020)

- If the number of Latino students in your school is high, dual language programs can increase their academic achievement while also developing their biliteracy and bilingual skills. (Gomez, 2005)

- English Learners with disabilities participating in bilingual education programs do succeed and show gains in linguistic, academic, and cognitive growth. (Rodriguez, 2009)

- Two-way immersion models that support the home language and culture and integrate language majority and minority learners were associated with faster English acquisition, which mediated the link between Two-Way Immersion (TWI) programs and higher GPAs. (Serafini et al., 2022)

**Reading Achievement**

2. **Dual Language Students outperform non-Dual Language students on ELA tests.**

- Students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized reading tests. (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)

- In both subjects, DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. These results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. (Torph & Murphy, 2021)

- Students who attended a DLBE program rather than an ESL program, scored significantly higher on ELA tests. (Morita-Mullaney, 2021)
- DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on reading assessments at every grade level. (Thomas & Collier, 2012)

- Students score statistically significantly higher in reading in 4th grade than their non-dual-language peers, a pattern that continues through 8th grade. By 5th grade, dual language students score about the same as their monolingual peers a grade ahead of them, an advantage that lasts through 8th grade. (Thomas & Collier, 2012)

- For English-learners in dual language programs, reading scores in all the tested grades are much higher than for English Learners who are not in a dual-language program, according to the study. (Maxwell, 2015)

- Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of academic proficiency in reading and mathematics. (Gomez et al., 2005)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Math Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

3. **Dual Language Students outperform non-Dual Language students on math tests.**

- Students in DLE programs perform at or above grade level on standardized mathematics tests. (Lindholm-Leary, 2012)

- In both subjects, DL students outperformed GE students on two of four yearly test administrations following reclassification, and for ELA averaged across the four, with single-test effects stronger in math than ELA. GE students did not outperform DL students on any of eight tests. These results underscore the efficacy of continuing to use students’ home language in instruction following reclassification. (Torph & Murphy, 2021)

- DL students outscored their non-DL counterparts on mathematics assessments at every grade level. (Thomas & Collier, 2012)

- One effect of these cognitive advantages is increased academic achievement, including in mathematics and science. (Clarkson, 2007)

- The results from this natural experiment indicate that students in a DLI program that has been implemented state-wide were able to succeed academically in math. (Watzinger-Tharp et al., 2018)

- The dual-language students showed greater growth in math achievement across the 4th grade year compared to mainstreamed English students. (Watzinger-Tharp et. al., 2018)

- Authors of this article also report results of standardized tests, administered in English, that indicate that students in schools following this 50:50 model are achieving high levels of (Gomez et al., 2005)
academic proficiency in reading and mathematics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Achievement Gap</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. English Language Learners in Dual Language programs are more likely to narrow the achievement gap than English Language Learners in non-Dual Language programs.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- English Learners close the achievement gap with NES students in English-Only classrooms by about fifth grade.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- DLE middle and high school students are more likely to close the gap with NES peers by the end of high school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Lindholm-Leary, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The benefits of dual language classroom models include accelerated academic progress and a narrowing of the achievement gap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Oberg &amp; Phillips, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Research shows that long-term DL programs can close achievement gaps between English-proficient speakers and emergent bilinguals after five years, while short-term bilingual or English-only transitional programs close only about half of that gap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Collier &amp; Thomas, 2017).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language Proficiency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. Dual Language programs accelerate majority language proficiency compared to non-Dual Language programs.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- TK had moderate to large effects on English proficiency; smaller but statistically significant effects on language, literacy, and math skills; and no effects on social–emotional skills or executive function. The transitional kindergarten program provides participating Spanish-speaking dual language learners with an academic advantage at kindergarten entry, as compared to Spanish-speaking dual language learners who do not attend.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Holod et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- DLLs showed stronger growth dynamics than monolingual children during later preschool stages. The findings highlight the role of preschool peers in DLLs’ acquisition of the majority language before entering elementary school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Schmerse, 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Only in classrooms where both Spanish and English were used did children reach age-appropriate levels of academic proficiency in both languages. Home language use was also significantly associated with dual language gains as was maternal Spanish vocabulary knowledge before controlling for maternal education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Collins, 2014)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the personal development of English Learners?

### Personal Development

#### Identity

1. **It is important to affirm and foster bilingual and biliterate identities of bilingual students.**

   - Scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence.  
     - (Feinauer & Howard, 2014)

   - Dual language learners are actively constructing ideas about reading, bilingualism/biliteracy, and whom they are as readers as they learn to read. Framing early reading in an identity perspective presents opportunities to look more holistically at the language and reading practices of dual language learners as they learn to read and navigate two or more languages at home and school.  
     - (Collett, 2019)

   - Identity formation is one of the key components of adolescence and linguistic identity is critical to that process. For English learners to reach higher levels of achievement, they had to see themselves as high achievers in the first place—and in their first language. To achieve this, they focused on shifting to an asset based mindset, with the long term goal of turning the transitional bilingual education program into a dual language program. Students reported that being bilingual is a big part of their identity.  
     - (Barrera et al., 2020)

   - According to a sociocultural perspective, when African-American students’ emergent bilingual/biliterate identities are affirmed across home and school contexts, by parents, peers, and teachers, like Ms. Padilla, who adopt a heteroglossic ideologies, those identities can flourish. Researchers extend this call by suggesting that DLE programs must carve out space and dedicate resources to address underlying biases and ideologies with their learners as a part of their bilingual/biliterate development.  
     - (Bauer et al., 2020)

   - Strong family relationships, formal coursework in Spanish, as well as a strong ethnic identity as Mexicans are interrelated factors that contribute to their high multilingual investment. Dual language education is a powerful factor.  
     - (Babino & Stewart, 2019)
- The MT is the primary means through which a child makes sense of her world and connects with others—learning new words and vital content. (Pandey, 2014)

- Bilingual learning leads to increasing understanding of oneself and one’s culture, viewing one’s value system through the eyes of others. Monolingual views of the world limit the perspective. There are aspects of one’s life and culture that are accepted as universal truths until another way of thinking has been encountered. (Tochon, 2009)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Self Esteem</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Maintaining home language strengthens positive self esteem.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Without continued use of the MT, a child feels lost, uprooted Low self-esteem and identity crises are rampant, and often lead to a high drop-out rate—all of which bode badly for a nation with an aging population that is dependent on this generation. So we must make every effort to stop failing our children—and use of the MT and a mathematical language-building-blocks approach could be just the solution. (Pandey, 2014)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Cultural Awareness</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Bilingual learning impacts cross-cultural awareness, specifically attitudes and beliefs about other cultures.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Cross-cultural competence begins with awareness of the self within the socially and culturally diverse classrooms that TWI provides, we assert that scholarly attention should be paid to the ways that TWI programs support identity development as an aspect of achieving the third goal of cross-cultural competence. (Feinauer &amp; Howard, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence. (Fox et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The program provided opportunities for adolescents’ recognition and ratification of peer ethnolinguistic identities, understanding of language-in-use as an ethnolinguistic phenomenon, awareness of language learning through language-in-use and appreciation of students’ own and others’ ethnolinguistic resources. (Kibler et al., 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingual learning affects attitudes and beliefs about language learning and other cultures. Language learners develop a more positive attitude toward the target language and/or the speakers of that language. Lipton’s surveys (2004) comprise a series of studies that demonstrate, among other factors, that children who have studied a world language develop a sense of cultural pluralism (openness to and appreciation of other cultures) and have an improved self-concept and sense of achievement in school. The ability to easily switch between languages makes children feel competent, and it increases self-esteem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Dual-language programs for elementary age students and newcomer centers for recent immigrant arrivals at the secondary level are effective in fostering student academic success, linguistic growth, and multicultural understanding.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How does the participation in a dual language program impact the social development of English Learners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Development</th>
<th>Social Network</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. <strong>Bilinguals have larger social networks and are able to interact with more people around the world.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Bilingual students have larger social networks that can help them navigate both school and community contexts.</td>
<td>(Zhou &amp; Bankston, 1998)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Benefits of knowing two languages: sociocultural (e.g. ability to get to know new cultures, travel as well as interact and socialize with more people from around the world.</td>
<td>(Tytus, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Despite participants’ demographic differences, English Learners and Spanish Language Learners in the dual-language program reported building new, strengthened, and mutually recognized relationships, particularly with students of different language backgrounds who worked together within long-term collaborative small groups. When students are provided with a carefully designed instructional and ecological context that provides authentic purposes for using language and building peer relationships, this research suggests that both English Learners and SLLs may be able to build linguistically integrated social networks.</td>
<td>(Kibler et al., 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Being dual language helps to promote healthy multigenerational, multicultural, and multilingual communities, because it allows schools to connect with a historically marginalized community whose first language is not English as well as the grassroots organizations that are engaged in advocacy and community development work.</td>
<td>(Wiemelt &amp; Welton, 2015).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Dual-language education has the added advantage that the model makes racial and ethnic diversity a classroom asset, which in turn promotes even greater benefits on student learning and socialization. Dual language offers an avenue for districts interested in navigating these obstacles and can be an excellent way to concurrently foster diversity in the classroom and improve a variety of social and academic outcomes for the entire student body.</td>
<td>(Kotok &amp; DeMatthews, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Results from the analyses provide support for the importance of social network in</td>
<td>(Lanza &amp; Svendsen, 2007)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
understanding language choice and cultural and linguistic maintenance.

- Advantages of being bilingual: Making lifelong friends. Bilingualism increases the number of people with whom one can interact. Interest in other cultures helps one connect deeply with other people around the world. (Tochon, 2009)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Flexibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. <strong>Bilinguals have greater social flexibility.</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| - Only bilingual children adapted their level of ostension selectively between the two puppets. These findings point to the greater skills of bilinguals to adapt their communication accordingly. (Gampe et al., 2019) |
| - This study reports the first evidence of a social flexibility advantage of bilinguals, and it suggests that as bilinguals alternate between two languages, they might also alternate between two cultural worlds, providing tools to adapt to different social environments and facilitating the frequency of social interactions. (Ikizer & Ramírez-Esparza, 2018) |
| - Bilingual children are less influenced than monolinguals by language variety when attributing personality traits to different speakers, which could indicate that bilinguals have fewer in-group biases and perhaps greater social flexibility. |
Economic Development

Labor Market

1. **Bilingualism is beneficial economically as it offers employment opportunities.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Learning two language is beneficial economically (e.g. better job prospects and ability to grow professionally also in other countries.)</strong></th>
<th>(Tytus, 2018)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The 21st century has seen a strong upward trajectory in empirical research on the multiple benefits that foreign language/world language learning and bilingualism can afford to both individuals and society. Six overarching themes emerged: cognitive abilities and benefits, aging and health, employability, academic achievement, communicative and intercultural competence, and enhanced creativity. Additional results stress the benefits of foreign/world language skills relating to employability and academic achievement and propose that the accumulation of years of language learning positively impacts the development of cross-cultural awareness and communicative competence.</strong></td>
<td>(Fox et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Trimmell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Improving employment potential. Learning how to deal with other cultures on their own terms facilitates employment. Areas of the workforce in need of language proficient employees include government agencies, the travel industry, engineering, communications, education, international law, economics, public policy, publishing, advertising, entertainment, scientific research, and a broad array of service sectors.</strong></td>
<td>(Trimmell, 2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Multilingualism is often framed as human capital that increases individuals’ labor market value. Findings suggest that Spanish-English bilingualism is frequently preferred or required for employment in the US, but that such employment opportunities are less lucrative.</strong></td>
<td>(Gandara, 2015)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Bilinguals, who can read and write in English and their native language, drop out of high school at lower rates, enter higher-status occupations, and can earn more than those from immigrant backgrounds who only speak English.  
  (Gandara, 2015)

• Ruben Rumbaut found that bilingualism reduced dropout rates, raised occupational status (higher ranks in their jobs) and increased earnings. As the level of bilingualism increased, the benefits also increased.  
  (Gandara, 2015)

• Across all labor sectors, two-thirds of employers responded that they preferred bilingual employees if their skills were comparable to those of monolingual employees. This confirmed that in California, bilingual employees are in high demand and have a hiring advantage over those who are monolingual.  
  (Porras et al., 2014)

• Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English.  
  (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016)

• On the one hand, 93% of respondents “value[d] employees who are able to work effectively with customers, clients, and businesses from a range of different countries and cultures.” On the other, 66% of respondents reported identifying foreign language skills in the hiring process, 41% reported giving advantage to multilingual applicants, and only 10% of respondents indicated that new hires “needed to speak at least one language besides English.”  
  (Damari et al., 2017)

• DL programs are promoted as a model that brings cognitive and employment benefits to its students.  
  (Sun & Wang, 2023)

### Global Economy

2. **Bilingualism gives access to participation in the global economy.**

• Trimmell (2005) points at several social, economic, professional, and personal reasons why people should learn a language: Economic partnerships, diplomacy, and international contacts require strong comprehension of the cultural values and belief systems of the partners abroad. Global citizenship is characterized by proficiency in other languages.  
  (Trimmell, 2005)

• Language diversity is, as most of us know, a child’s passport to participation in the global economy. Different languages allow us to appreciate and convey unique culture-specific meanings.  
  (Pandey, 2013)

• With the expanding global economy seeking workers with multilingual and intercultural skills, dual language programs are the best promise for building your students’ future marketable skills.  
  (Rolon, 2005)
| Learning two language is beneficial (4) global adaptability, that is, a category directly related to the process of globalization and the fact that English is a lingua franca (e.g. possibility to obtain information from a large number of sources and the multilingual world we live in.) | (Tytus, 2018) |
| Now, a growing number of states also see bilingualism as key to accessing the global economy, as evidenced by the surging popularity of the “seal of biliteracy” -a special recognition for graduates who demonstrate fluency in two or more languages. | (Corey, 2018) |
| The benefits of bilingual education have long been characterized in terms of advantages for a global economy. | (Varghese & Park, 2010) |
| Although aware of the pitfalls of this association, many (e.g., Krashen, as cited in Crawford, 2001; MacSwan, 1998; Tse, 2001) have attempted to emphasize the economic advantages of bilingual education by stressing the “great importance of bilingualism in our modern global community” | (MacSwan, 1998, p. 9). |
| “In an era of globalization, a society that has access to multilingual and multicultural resources is advantaged in its ability to play an important social and economic role on the world stage.” | (MacSwan, 1998, p. 7). |
| Highlighting this perspective, bilingualism and bilingual education can be viewed as a way to serve students and nations in the inevitable move toward an interconnected multilingual world. | (MacSwan, 1998). |
| The transformation of the global economy has enabled countries and businesses to provide American consumers with products and services in English without leaving their home countries. Many American workers miss out on global business opportunities because they are competing against an increasingly skilled global workforce that is both multilingual and fluent in English. | (Gandara & Acevedo, 2016) |
| To compete successfully in the global marketplace, both U.S.-based multinational corporations as well as small businesses increasingly need employees with knowledge of foreign languages and cultures to market products to customers around the globe and to work effectively with foreign employees and partners in other countries. | (Stewart, 2006) |
| To thrive in a global economy and a multicultural society, US students need fluency in at least one language other than English. Research shows that multilingual societies have a competitive advantage over societies in international trade (Hilliwell, 1999). Economic success and security in the US depend on our ability to understand the information we gather. Many Americans need to interact regularly with people who are unlikely to know English. Not only does the | (Met, 2001) |
omission of language and cultural education leave US students behind their peers in other countries, but also it exacerbates the achievement gap within the US.

| • In the current stumbling economy, job seekers are leveraging every qualification they can think of to sway potential employers. And with immigrants continuing to flood into New York, long the city of immigrants, and its suburbs, speaking a second language is a talent that matters in almost any field. In the global economy, American companies increasingly are realizing the benefits of a multilingual work force. | (Skomial, 2002) |
| • At a time of semi globalization monolingual speakers are at competitive disadvantage for a growing number of jobs. | (Ghemawat, 2007) |
### Conclusions

#### Intellectual Development

1. Bilingualism creates a cognitive advantage, specifically an enhancement of cognitive flexibility and an increased cognitive reserve.
2. Bilingualism enhances the executive function of the brain.
5. Bilingualism enhances problem solving skills.

#### Educational Development

1. Bilingualism improves academic achievement.
2. Dual language students outperform non-dual language students on ELA tests.
3. Dual language students outperform non-dual language students on math tests.
4. English Learners in dual language programs are more likely to narrow the achievement gap than English Learners in non-dual language programs.
5. Dual language programs accelerate majority language proficiency compared to non-dual language programs.

#### Personal Development

1. It is important to affirm and foster bilingual and biliterate identities of bilingual students.
2. Maintaining the home language strengthens positive self-esteem.
3. Bilingual learning impacts cross-cultural awareness, specifically attitudes and beliefs about other cultures.

#### Social Development

1. Bilinguals have larger social networks and are able to interact with more people around the world.
2. Bilinguals have greater social flexibility.

#### Economic Development

1. Bilingualism is beneficial economically as it offers employment opportunities.
2. Bilingualism allows access to participation in the global economy.
Conclusions were made based on the similarities and overlaps in the findings. The last step of this process is determining whether these conclusions answer the research questions.
Discussion

The conclusions in the previous table were related to each of the five research questions:

1. How does participation in a dual language program impact the intellectual development of English Learners?

2. How does participation in a dual language program impact the educational development of English Learners?

3. How does the participation in a dual language program impact the personal development of English Learners?

4. How does the participation in a dual language program impact the social development of English Learners?

5. How does the participation in a dual language program impact the economic development of English Learners?

Intellectual Development

Participation in a dual language program positively impacts the intellectual development of English Learners. Based on the conclusions from my research, bilingualism creates a cognitive advantage, specifically enhanced cognitive flexibility and an increased cognitive reserve. Bilingualism enhances the executive function of the brain and problem solving skills, as well as increases metalinguistic awareness. The cognitive advantages of bilingualism have been found to protect from dementia/Alzheimer’s disease.

Educational Development

Participation in a dual language program positively impacts the educational development of English Learners. Based on the conclusions from my research, dual language students outperform non-dual language students on both English Language Arts (ELA) tests and math tests. Dual language programs accelerate majority language proficiency compared to non-dual programs. Overall, participation in dual language programs benefit English Learners and
non-English learners, as bilingualism improves academic achievement. English Learners in dual language programs are more likely to narrow the achievement gap than English Learners in non-dual language programs.

**Personal Development**

Participating in a dual language program impacts the personal development of English Learners. Based on the conclusions from my research, it is important to maintain home language because it strengthens positive self-esteem. Dual language programs maintain home language while learning the majority language. The focus on the home language is important for bilingual and biliterate identity development and positive self-concept. Bilingual learning impacts cross-cultural awareness, specifically attitudes and beliefs about other cultures.

**Social Development**

Participating in a dual language program impacts the social development of English Learners in that it creates larger social networks and allows them the ability to interact with people around the world. Bilinguals have greater social flexibility. This means that bilinguals have the ability to adapt between different social environments easily and are able to read social cues in the environment.

**Economic Development**

Participating in a dual language program positively impacts the economic development of English Learners in that it opens employment opportunities and gives access to participation in the global economy.

**First Language Maintenance**

The overarching research question is: How do dual language programs support English Learners in maintaining their first language? The conclusions from my research show that participation in a dual language program has intellectual, educational, personal, social, and economic benefits. This positive impact of whole child development within dual language...
programs is one way that dual language programs support English Learners in maintaining their first language. However, much more research needs to be conducted in order to determine all the factors that determine how dual language programs support English Learners in maintaining their first language. This area needs continued study and more research on the connection of the benefits of dual language to maintenance of first language.

**Recommendations**

**Intellectual Development**

The intellectual advantages of being enrolled in any type of bilingual program are extensive. Unfortunately, the United States is known for monolingual public education. If the United States prioritizes and expands bilingual education, the cognitive and executive functioning advantages of being bilingual could make a major impact. I think the intellectual impact would be seen in just a few short years if we start when students are young.

**Educational Development**

Narrowing the achievement gap is a major focus in education in the United States. Unfortunately, we have not made much progress in this area. As the number of English Learners in public education in the United States continues to rise, it is critical that we look at dual language programs as the most effective program for English Learners to achieve academically and narrow the achievement gap. Expanding dual language programs will benefit non-English Learner students, as well, because of the academic benefits of being bilingual. The educational benefits greatly outweigh the challenges.

**Personal Development**

As a teacher in a school with a high EL population, but not enough spaces in our dual language program to serve all students, I have seen far too many cases of students in the intermediate grades being unable to communicate with their families because they were no longer proficient in their home language. This is detrimental to students’ personal development and well-
being. The focus on home language in dual language programs is important for students to maintain their identity, culture, and a positive self-concept. With so many mental health challenges and general concerns facing our young students today I believe we need to consider expanding dual language opportunities for our students.

**Social Development**

Most people in the United States speak one language. This is not the norm around the world. Being monolingual in the United States greatly limits our ability to interact with the rest of the world. Bilinguals have larger social networks and greater social flexibility. We have much room to grow in this area.

**Economic Development**

Employers prefer a bilingual candidate compared to a monolingual candidate. This results in bilinguals having more job opportunities, not only in the United States but also around the world. In addition, through the great increase in remote work opportunities now being utilized, being bilingual opens many more careers world-wide.

When possible, English Learners should be enrolled in a dual language program rather than a traditional English as a Second Language program. The research shows extensive positive benefits for students participating in dual language programs. As schools and systems continue work to close the achievement gap, dual language programming should be part of the system wide approach and planning. However, most importantly, the benefits to individual students’ learning and well-being make it clear that dual language programs make a significant and positive difference for our students.
References

https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654310368803

https://doi.org/10.1080/09658416.2021.1933507

https://doi.org/10.1080/03004430.2017.1400541

https://doi.org/10.52462/jlls.48

https://doi.org/10.1080/00405841.2019.1569400


https://doi.org/10.3102/0028332118800986

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0206770


https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecresq.2014.02.003. PMID: 25284958; PMCID: PMC4180217.

https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2018.1543691


Barrera, A., Keppler, L., & Becker, M. (2020). *For one high school, shifting to an asset-based approach to encourage bilingualism required cultural as well as academic changes.*

https://doi.org/10.1080/02702711.2020.1783136

https://doi.org/10.1080/03004430.2019.1630830


https://doi.org/10.14507/epaa.28.4680

https://doi.org/10.1080/15235882.2005.10162828


https://doi.org/10.1044/2018_JSLHR-L-17-0320


https://doi.org/10.1177/13670069211034922


https://doi.org/10.1177/13670069211034922


https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cogdev.2018.08.010


Lucido, F. (2019). *Revisiting educational programs that develop linguistic and cultural awareness for all students.*


https://doi.org/10.1044/2014_JSLHR-L-12-0221


https://www.ascd.org/el/articles/why-language-learning-matters


http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jecp.2012.09.002


https://doi.org/10.1111/tsq.12019


https://doi.org/10.1080/19313152.2020.1753930


Ph.D Student (External Candidate), Head, Speech and Language – Pathology Dept. Cerebral Palsy Alliance Singapore, Singapore 519 529,, Sendhilnathan, S., Chengappa, S. K., & (Retd.), Professor in Language Pathology, Dept. of Speech and Language Pathology, All India Institute of Speech and Hearing, Mysuru – 570 006. (2020). Cognitive, Social Communication and Social Skills Development in Monolingual and Bilingual Children with Autism Spectrum Disorders in a Multi Ethnic-Lingual Context – A Comparative Study. *Journal of Psychosocial Research, 15*(1), 47–68. https://doi.org/10.32381/JPR.2020.15.01.4


Porras, D., Ee, J. & Gándara, P. (2014). Employer preferences: Do bilingual applicants and employees experience an advantage?. In R. Callahan & P. Gándara (Ed.), *The Bilingual*


Rolon, C. A. (2005). *The key to success for Latino students is a school environment that regards their language and culture as assets rather than deficits.*


https://doi.org/10.1017/S0305000920000768


https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.00269

https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2013.00953

https://www.ascd.org/el/articles/becoming-citizens-of-the-world

https://doi.org/10.1177/0013124510380720


https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.13558


https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654308325898


https://doi.org/10.1017/S1366728918000123

https://doi.org/10.1177/002205741619600105

https://doi.org/10.1177/1468798417739668

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9817.2010.01440.x


https://doi.org/10.1017/S1366728915000553


