Captain America: The Delicate Masculinity of an American Icon

Lauren Rezac
laurenrezac@unomaha.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.unomaha.edu/university_honors_program

Part of the Gender and Sexuality Commons

Please take our feedback survey at: https://unomaha.az1.qualtrics.com/jfe/form/SV_8cchtFmpDyGfBLE

Recommended Citation
https://digitalcommons.unomaha.edu/university_honors_program/273

This Dissertation/Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the University Honors Program at DigitalCommons@UNO. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses/Capstones/Creative Projects by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@UNO. For more information, please contact unodigitalcommons@unomaha.edu.
Captain America: The Delicate Masculinity of an American Icon

A Thesis in Sociology

by

Lauren Rezac

Presented to the
Department of Sociology & Anthropology

in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirement for the Degree

Bachelor of Science

University of Nebraska at Omaha

December 2023
ABSTRACT

What makes a good man? For this research, I examine the ways that Captain America, also known as Steve Rogers, portrays masculinity in the highest grossing movie franchise of all time — The Marvel Cinematic Universe. I propose that the ways in which an American icon who represents the ideal man behaves reflects larger cultural expectations of masculinity, specifically the expectations for white men. In addition to holding up a mirror to society’s expectations for a ‘good man’, the social messaging about masculinity in these films should be examined to understand what American men of every generation are idolizing. I examined every scene that Steve Rogers as Captain America appeared in during his story arc in the Marvel Cinematic Universe. Throughout these appearances, I tracked different traits and behaviors that society would deem as masculine, including romantic relationships and usage of violence. I found that this character mainly reinforces traditional ideals of hegemonic masculinity that aligns with decades of research. In addition, I found that Captain America had the potential to be a more progressive pillar of masculinity in a queer relationship that was never fully played out on screen for assumedly monetary reasons. Despite the groundwork being laid for this character arc, Captain America ultimately chooses to go back to the past and embrace traditional masculinity over moving on to a new life.
INTRODUCTION

Captain America is an emblem of American masculinity that has been seen by millions of people globally. This character is recognizable for his strong moral compass and ability to lead. Spanning over eight films that have grossed billions of dollars in the global box office, the character of Captain America reflects what Marvel Studios believes American men should aspire to be.

Why the Marvel Cinematic Universe?

Marvel films have some of the highest earning box office numbers of all time — with the Marvel Cinematic Universe being the highest earning franchise of all time. These numbers alone speak to the importance of this film franchise to the cultural zeitgeist. Any piece of media with an audience that large should have its social messaging analyzed.

Why Captain America?

Captain America is the leader of the Avengers. While other characters in this franchise have established faults, Captain America is supposed to be the best a man can possibly be. This character archetype gives us a unique opportunity to understand what Marvel Studios, a billion-dollar company, believes masculinity in its highest form constitutes.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The Avengers and Their Influence

Marvel Studios’ domination of the global box office is no secret. Since the studio’s first major film — Iron Man (2008) — Marvel Studios has grossed over 29 billion dollars from films set within the Marvel Cinematic Universe (Statista 2023). This makes the Marvel Cinematic Universe, or MCU, the highest-grossing film franchise of all time, surpassing the likes of Harry Potter, Star Wars, and James Bond (IGN 2023). At the center of this lucrative universe are six
icons — Iron Man, Captain America, Thor, Black Widow, Hulk, and Hawkeye. Together, they make up the Avengers, a team of superheroes who have continuously dominated the cultural zeitgeist.

Typically, when a group of characters is first imagined they are each written with a specific paradigm to fit into. An example of this is the brains, the beauty, and the brawn trope which plays out in classic films like *Charlie’s Angels* (Scapple 2002). This is the case within the Avengers as well. Captain America is the first Avenger in the Marvel Cinematic Universe, being given the super soldier serum in 1941. Fittingly, Captain America’s role within the Avengers is their leader. The other Avengers look to him for instructions on the best courses of action or techniques in battle. Though it may seem on the surface that Captain America fits perfectly into the leader role, analysis of Captain America’s behaviors throughout each film in the Marvel Cinematic Universe suggests that his character is much more complex than initially presented in his first two appearances — *Captain America: The First Avenger* and *The Avengers* (2012). These complexities of character — complete with personal insecurities and selfish decision making — ensure that Captain America resonates with audience members who are more likely to be inspired when a figure seems realistic and attainable (Lockwood and Kunda 1997).

*The Blueprint for American Masculinity*

There is a joke among Marvel fans that Iron Man is a character for male viewers to have a crush on, Spiderman is a character for female viewers to have a crush on, and Captain America is a character for everyone to have a crush on. In this way, the character of Captain America also known as Steve Rodgers, is meant to be the man that men look to be like, and the man that women look to marry. Obviously, this is a generalization of audiences, but it abides by the status quo that Marvel Studios practices — which is heteronormativity.
In 1987, Raewyn Connell contrived the ever-popular concept of hegemonic masculinity (Messerschmidt 2019). This concept is a generalized ideal of what men are pressured to embody or become. There are some gaps in terms of the application of this concept, as expectations for men can vary based on factors like race or generation. Still, the core of this concept remains central to the socialization of men today. Hegemonic masculinity describes a man who personifies confidence, sexual prowess, self-reliance, and invulnerability (Smith et al. 2022). In a broader social context, hegemonic masculinity is about the ways in which men wield power through domination — both of other men and women (Vallerga and Zurbriggen 2022).

In defining what hegemonic masculinity was, he also defined what hegemonic masculinity was not — specifically listing those with complicit, subordinate, marginalized, and/or protest masculinities as distinctly non-desirable (Messerschmidt 2019). Despite being formulated so long ago, these same traits are still found to be non-masculine in some sense. The fascinating double-jeopardy of this attitude is that if a man is to be complicit in the outlined expectations for masculinity, then he is also being non-masculine. In order to be masculine, a man has to both abide by what others’ expectations are of him while also not listening to what others tell him to do. This is the type of tightrope walking that can only be performed perfectly by fictional characters, and Captain America manages quite well.

*Patriotism and When it is Honorable to Defy Orders*

Despite being made by the American government for pro-American military propaganda, more often than not Captain America is seen defying the American government, or other outside authoritative bodies like the United Nations. This once again is a testament to his rejection of complicitness and conformity. Instead of trusting formal authoritative bodies to be just and moral, Rodgers operates on his own moral compass. This way of behaving is practically
foundational to American masculinity — just think of the Sons of Liberty and the Boston Tea Party. Yet, there is a thin line between defying orders in a way that betters the lives of civilians and defying orders in a way that serves one’s personal interest. The former is selfless and charitable — the desirable ‘soft side’ of masculinity, while the latter is evidence of someone becoming corrupt with the power they have been given (Farmer and Farrelly 2021).

How does that line get drawn? Is the line the same for everyone? Does the line change based on the people who are in power? These are questions that the Captain America writers and filmmakers had to keep in mind as they wrote Captain America’s character throughout his eight appearances in the Marvel Cinematic Universe. There are points where he chooses to ignore orders in favor of protecting his personal interests — such as choosing not to kill Bucky Barnes in Captain America: The Winter Soldier. That being said, the writers purposefully made this defiance more reasonable to the audience by having Captain America preserve the life of his childhood best friend and emphasizing his loyalty to the person he has known the longest (Ghorbanzadeh 2021). Because the audience knows that Bucky Barnes is someone that Steve Rodgers cares for, they are inclined to reject the authority of those who want Bucky Barnes dead. In making these seemingly small writing choices, the writers shifted the FBI into the position of corrupt with power, while Captain America fills the role of being selfless, even though he is actually acting on his own self-interest. All of this aids in the audience’s perception of Captain America as a real stand-up guy who people should look up to.

Rationale

Though Captain America is a fictional character, the impact of the character is far-reaching. As the leader of the Avengers, the legacy of Captain America has been cemented through physical means such as t-shirts and coffee mugs, in additional to media relevance as
what USA Today describes as the ‘heart of the MCU’ (Jhaveri 2019). In Captain America: The First Avenger, the creator of the super soldier serum tells Steve Rogers before his transformation that he should aim to be ‘not a perfect soldier, but a good man’. Throughout eight movies and over sixty in-universe years, the character of Steve Rogers always comes back to that — being a good man. In that case, it is vital that we thoroughly examine the messaging of characters that are promoted as archetypes of masculinity, heroism, and leadership. All of this is exemplified by the times we are living in, where young boys are finding guidance in media figures like Andrew Tate and Elon Musk.

METHODS

Sample Collection

For this research, I choose to analyze every appearance of Steve Rogers as Captain America in the Marvel Cinematic universe. These appearances spanned eight films over nine years. I found it important to watch each appearance rather than a random sample of scenes because each film contained unique character development and relationships.

Though there are technically three characters who play Captain America in the Marvel Cinematic Universe — Steve Rogers, Peggy Carter, and Sam Wilson — I chose to only include Steve Rodger’s portrayal of this character. The first reason for this was that his rendition of Captain America was the first within the universe, with the others only being Captain America much later in the franchise. Additionally, his version of Captain America is distinct for examining masculinity as a white man. Peggy Carter’s version of Captain America as a white woman and Sam Wilson’s version of Captain America as a Black man would yield different results that would be best examined in their own analysis.
Coding Procedure

A scene was defined as a section of story that concluded by change of location or passage of time. Montages were counted as one scene. An example coding sheet will be included underneath the Figures. The traits and behaviors that I tracked were displays of physical strength, use of violence, fighting methods, heteronormative romance, apparel, response to authority, display of emotion, aggression towards government agents, displays of leadership, relationships with other men, clothing fit, facial hair, hair length, and response to physical threat. Displays of physical strength were separated into usage of upper body, lower body, or core. This included violence, as well as other non-violent uses of strength, such as bending a railing out of the way to jump from a bridge. Use of violence was separated into defensive and offensive violence, where Captain America attacking his opposition first would constitute offensive violence. Fighting methods included hand-to-hand combat, use of government weapons, and use of civilian objects. Heteronormative romance and relationships with other men were tracked using the same behaviors — extended eye contact, verbal flirting, hugging/dancing, and kissing. Apparel was tracked by color and fit. Response to authority was categorized as either obeying commands or disobeying commands. Displays of emotion included both verbal and physical expressions of care. Aggression towards government agents and displays of leadership were both tracked as they occurred, counting both verbal and physical displays. Lastly, response to physical threat was tracked by Captain America’s response to either run towards or away from the threat.

RESULTS

Physical Appearance
Throughout his appearances, Captain America was wearing tight clothing 99.7% of the time [See Figure 1]. The only instances of this character not showing off his body were in the time before he took the super soldier serum. Once Rodgers had transformed into a super soldier, the filmmakers wanted to highlight his transformation by showing off his new body. Throughout Captain America’s many outfits, the muscles that were most commonly emphasized were those of the upper body — specifically the biceps and abs. This is true for both the in-battle Captain America costumes and Steve Rogers’ civilian clothing.

Captain America was also most commonly seen being clean shaven, only having facial hair in 1 of the 8 films he appears in. His facial hair in *Avengers: Infinity War* was a result of being on the run following his disobedience of the Sokovia Accords issued by the United Nations. He is never seen struggling with growing facial hair, only ever being fully clean shaven or having a fully grown out beard. Captain America’s first appearance in *Avengers: Endgame* shows him shaving off his short-lived beard, returning back to the clean-cut look that is the character’s norm.

All of the Captain America costumes contain at least one of the United States colors — red, white and blue. However, the amount of color and saturation of the color depends on Captain America’s relationship to his role at the time. In *Captain America: The First Avenger*, his costume is bright red, white, and blue with a bold white star on the chest. At this point in the franchise, Steve Rogers is proud of his role of Captain America and feels a duty to lead US army to victory. On the other hand, the Captain America costume in *Avengers: Infinity War* is a dark navy blue with muted white and red accents. The star on his chest is a darker gray leather material that is stretched.

*Rejection of Authority*
In the first scene that Steve Rogers appears in within the Marvel Cinematic Universe, he is begging with a government official to let him enlist in the army to fight in World War Two despite his numerous health problems. When he is turned away, he goes to various other precincts and lies about his residency in an attempt to enlist. While he knows that lying on enlistment forms is illegal, Steve’s internal sense of duty to serve his country supersedes his respect for law and authority. This is the beginning of a reoccurring predicament for Steve Rodgers as he becomes Captain America.

No situation better encapsulates this than the Winter Soldier project. In Captain America: The Winter Soldier, Steve Rodgers had no qualms about obeying the orders to go after the Winter Soldier, a man responsible for more the fifty assassinations. Once Rogers discovered that the Winter Soldier is none other than his childhood best friend and war buddy Bucky Barnes, he suddenly was unwilling to fight the Winter Soldier. Even in the climatic fight scene between Captain America and the Winter Soldier, Steve only ever was fighting to get past Bucky into the control panel, never actually trying to engage in combat.

Types of Violence

Most Avengers had some prop or weapon that they brandish as they walk into battle. On top of their combat usefulness, these props also served as symbols for the characters they belong to. For Ironman, it is a shiny suit loaded with lasers and automatic weapons. For Thor, it is a hammer that channels lightning. For Hawkeye, it is a bow and arrow. For Captain America, it is a shield. This is indicative of Captain America’s preference to defensive violence. That is, very rarely did Captain America ever throw the first punch. Instead, he was often blocking bullets and lasers with his shield before throwing it as a projectile.
The simplicity of this weaponry should not be overlooked. The majority of Captain America’s combat scenes were hand-to-hand combat, with the addition of his shield. This was a stark contrast to the flashy magic of characters like Loki or high-tech weapons of Ironman. Instead, Captain America’s violence was only as damaging as he was physically capable of. This self-reliance was core to the character, as he taunted Tony in *The Avengers* — “Big man in a Suit of armor — take that off and what are you?”

**Morality**

As his creator, Dr. Erskine told Steve Rogers that he must promise him to stay who he is — “not a perfect soldier, but a good man.” As he died, Dr. Erskine took his last moment to point to Steve’s heart and instill the message that he must use this new power for good. In each movie, Steve had to grapple with understanding what being good truly meant. In the first movie, the bad guy was obvious — it was the Nazis. In *Captain America: The Winter Soldier*, Steve had to navigate the complexities of good people doing bad things. As his character continued to develop, he learned that it is impossible for everyone to view him as good and instead he had to focus on being able to find peace with himself.

As previously mentioned, the character that caused Steve to question his morality the most was Bucky Barnes. In describing his own goals, Captain America admitted that he tries to save as many people as he can in order to make the world a safer place. Yet, he was unable to hold Bucky Barnes accountable for the atrocities he committed as the Winter Soldier. This all came to a head in *Captain America: Civil War*, where Steve goes against Tony Stark, King T’Challa, the United States government, and the United Nations because he believes that Bucky is innocent.

**Romance**
Captain America has several romantic interests throughout his time in the Marvel Cinematic Universe. In determining romance by tracking extended eye contact, verbal flirting, hugging/dancing, and kissing, Captain America had four serious romantic relationships — three of which were women and one was male.

Agent Peggy Carter is whom Captain America referred to as his first love. In *Captain America: The First Avenger*, after being sent to division 1A, Agent Carter was the first woman to ever flirt with Steve Rogers. He was especially moved that she was interested in him before he took the super soldier serum. They kissed before Steve jumped on the plane he would come to freeze for seventy years on. As he is going down with the plane, they talked about dancing with one another. At the end of that film, when Captain America awoke in modern times, he was still thinking about that date with Peggy. Steve saw Peggy again in *Captain America: The Winter Soldier*, where he sat at her bedside as she had dementia and was not in good health. There was no kissing or dancing, just mournful eye contact and verbal reassurances as Steve watched her suffer. In *Captain America: Civil War*, Steve Rogers cried as he held Peggy’s casket. Throughout every film, Peggy’s photo was in Captain America’s compass, though it is only highlighted in *Captain America: The First Avenger* and *Avengers: Endgame*. The next time he saw Peggy Carter was in *Avengers: Endgame*, when he travelled back in time and saw her desk in an underground S.H.I.E.L.D base. After beating Thanos and returning the Infinity Stones, Steve chooses to go back to the fifties to have his dance and live a ‘normal’ life with Peggy.

Natasha Romanov, also known as Black Widow, was another love interest of Steve Rogers. Their romance was short lived, only being relevant in *Captain America: The Winter Soldier*. In this film, Natasha was constantly bugging Steve about finding a girlfriend, even during their missions. Steve pinned Natasha against a wall, as well as made out with her in a
mall. This was the most sexual interest we saw Captain America exhibit. At the end of this film, however, Natasha encouraged Steve to contact Sharon Carter and their relationship was never built upon again.

Sharon Carter was Peggy Carter’s niece that worked for S.H.I.E.L.D as an undercover agent. Steve first met her when she was keeping an eye on him undercover as his neighbor in Captain America: The Winter Soldier. They verbally flirted in this film, but never had anything physical. Their relationship continued in Captain America: Civil War, where they reunited at Peggy Carter’s funeral. They shared a charged kiss when Sharon Carter stole their gear from authorities and returned it to them. After this, Sharon Carter went on the run and their relationship was never further built upon.

Captain America’s fourth love interest was Bucky Barnes. By screen-time, this was the longest lasting relationship for Captain America [See Figure 2], though it was never shown as romantic in the same way that the heterosexual relationships were. The first appearance of Bucky Barnes was in Captain America: The First Avenger. He saved Steve from getting beat up in an alley, with them walking out arms wrapped around Steve’s shoulders telling him they were going on a double date. In this film, Steve disobeyed his orders to stay at the US army camp and dropped behind enemy lines once he heard that Bucky’s division had been captured. He rescued Bucky’s division with a charming callback to their first scene together, where Steve was now the one with his arms wrapped around Bucky’s shoulders. Once rescued, Bucky became Steve’s sniper as their new squad, The Howling Commandos, wiped out the remaining Hydra camps. When on a high-speed train to defeat the main villain, a shot blew a hole in the train, sucking Bucky outside. As he held onto the outside of the train, he dangled over a snowy cliff. Steve reached out to grab his hand, but Bucky fell and Steve experienced failing at a mission for the
first time. Following these events, Steve is at a bar with red eyes, as if he had been crying when Agent Peggy Carter came to verbally comfort Steve over his loss.

Their relationship was not over, as Bucky Barnes survived his fall and was captured by HYDRA, the in-universe evil German scientists. Through excruciating mind control and torture, Bucky Barnes back an assassin known as The Winter Soldier. When Steve found out that Bucky was the Winter Soldier, he was unable to continue trying to take him down — telling Natasha “even when I had nothing, I had Bucky.” In their final fight scene, Captain America backed down from a fight for the first time, refusing to hurt Bucky even though it went against his previously established moral code of saving civilians to let the Winter Soldier back out into society. Still, Captain America dropped his shield and told Bucky to kill him if that was the Winter Soldier’s mission, calling back to a flashback by telling Bucky “Then finish it because I’m with you til the end of the line.” This expression of care broke over seventy years of mind control for Bucky, as he saved Steve’s life pulling him out of the river before going on the run. At the end of the film, Steve got information about the Winter Soldier project and began his personal mission of finding Bucky again.

They are reunited again in *Captain America: Civil War*, when Steve was the only person to believe that Bucky did not bomb the UN. He put himself in danger by following Bucky as he ran from Germany authorities, eventually being arrested together. As they traveled together towards Siberia to defeat the villain, Bucky expressed that he didn’t think he was worth Steve going against Iron Man and the authorities, but Steve reassured him that he was worthy. The continued to reassure each other throughout the mission verbally and non-verbally. When Iron Man discovered that Bucky had killed his parents during his time as the Winter Soldier, Captain America takes Bucky’s side, despite this once again betraying his previously established moral
code of protecting civilians. At the end of the film, Steve once again leaves the shield behind as we put his arm around Bucky and left Tony Stark behind. Steve and Bucky went to Wakanda, where Bucky went back on the ice to undo the years of mind control that was lying dormant in him, able to be taken advantage of.

Steve and Bucky are once again reunited in Avengers: Infinity War, though it was brief. When Steve returned to Wakanda and saw Bucky, they exchanged a quick hug and pleasantries. Though they were fighting in the same battle, they did not interact much. Their last interaction was when Bucky called out to Steve before dusting away after Thanos snapped his fingers.

They saw each other once again in Avengers: End Game, when everyone who had dusted returned though they did not interact with one another until after the battle. When Captain America was preparing to go back in time and put the Infinity Stones back in their place, Bucky and Steve hugged again, calling back to when Bucky was leaving for the war in Captain America: The First Avenger. This is the last direct interaction these characters had, with their remaining shared screen-time being Bucky staring at Steve.

DISCUSSION

My analysis showed that Captain America both adheres to traditional masculinity, while also vaguely alluding to a more progressive form of masculinity that has not be previously been showcased by a superhero on the same scale. In terms of portraying strength, the character of Captain America emphasizes physical strength more than anything else. As seen by his wardrobe, his muscles were almost always on display. Additionally, the majority of his combat scenes were hand-to-hand combat, as opposed to using advanced weaponry or special powers as other Avengers did. This leads back to the idea that 'real men' are willing to get their hands dirty,
instead of letting something or someone else so the hard work for them. When analyzing romantic behaviors, I was not shocked to see that even though there was a larger percentage of scenes that contained queer romance opposed to heterosexual romance, the character ended his time in the Marvel Cinematic Universe by going back to his first heterosexual love interest. This shows that ultimately Marvel Studios valued the traditional masculine traits and behaviors of Captain America more than the progressive masculine identity that was most clear in Captain America: The Winter Soldier and Captain America: Civil War. This decision makes sense from a monetary viewpoint, as queer romance in a heteronormative society is viewed as a scandalous choice, some even going so far as to call it grooming.

Despite the ending of the character, the amount of allusions to queer romance for a character as hypermasculine as Captain America shows a shift in what society is willing to acknowledge as masculine. Still, I was shocked by the choice of ending for this character, as it retroactively made his relationship with Sharon Carter highly concerning. Additionally, it leaves a lot of questions about how Bucky ever escaped Hydra is Steve never broke him out of the mind control. Unfortunately, all of these relationships that were important to Captain America’s character were abandoned in the end and do not seem to have answers coming as the character of Steve Rogers has been retired.
REFERENCES


FIGURES

Figure 1: Time Shown Wearing Loose Clothing vs. Tight Clothing

![Pie chart showing time wearing loose clothing vs. tight clothing](chart1.png)

Figure 2: Percentage of Scenes with Heterosexual Romance vs. Queer Romance Over Time

![Bar chart showing percentage of scenes with heteronormative and queer romance](chart2.png)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Movie</th>
<th>Location/Scene</th>
<th>Timestamp</th>
<th>NOTES:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Display of Physical Strength</td>
<td>Upper Body</td>
<td>Lower Body</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Use of Violence</td>
<td>Aggressive Violence</td>
<td>Defensive Violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fighting Methods</td>
<td>Hand-to-Hand</td>
<td>Use of Government Weapons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Heteronormative Romance</td>
<td>Extended Eye Contact</td>
<td>Verbal Flirting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wearing USA Colors</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Response to Authority</td>
<td>Obeying Commands</td>
<td>Disobeying Commands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Display of Emotion</td>
<td>Verbal Expression of Care (telling someone)</td>
<td>Physical Expression of Care (crying, hugging)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aggression Towards Government Agents</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Display of Leadership with Avengers</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Queer Romance</td>
<td>Extended Eye Contact</td>
<td>Verbal Flirting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clothing Style</td>
<td>Tight</td>
<td>Loose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Facial Hair</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hair Length</td>
<td>Short</td>
<td>Long</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faced with Threat</td>
<td>Running</td>
<td>Fighting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>